

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-14762-0 - The Shaping of Art History: Wilhelm Vöge, Adolph Goldschmidt, and the Study of Medieval Art

Kathryn Brush

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

The Shaping of Art History examines art history's formation in the German academy in the late nineteenth century. Focusing on the work of Wilhelm Vöge and Adolph Goldschmidt, two influential scholars of medieval art, Kathryn Brush analyzes their methods and particularly those scholarly projects that were critical to the development of their approaches. Her work combines intellectual and institutional history with the study of artistic monuments and biography. It is the first to consider how the study of the pioneering scholarship in the field of medieval art is critical to an understanding of the formulation of art historical method as a whole. Drawing on a range of published and unpublished sources, this study also demonstrates how a variety of factors, such as nationalism, scientific paradigms and personality, helped to shape the discipline, and how many of the investigative procedures developed in turn-of-the-century Germany were only selectively understood when later transmitted to Europe and America.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-14762-0 - The Shaping of Art History: Wilhelm Voge, Adolph Goldschmidt, and the Study of Medieval Art

Kathryn Brush

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

The Shaping of Art History

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-14762-0 - The Shaping of Art History: Wilhelm Vöge, Adolph Goldschmidt, and the Study of Medieval Art

Kathryn Brush

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

The Shaping of Art History

Wilhelm Vöge, Adolph Goldschmidt,
and the Study of Medieval Art

KATHRYN BRUSH

University of Western Ontario



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
 978-0-521-14762-0 - The Shaping of Art History: Wilhelm Vöge, Adolph Goldschmidt, and the
 Study of Medieval Art
 Kathryn Brush
 Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
 Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore,
 São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press
 The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org
 Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521147620

© Cambridge University Press 1996

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
 and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
 no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
 permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1996
 First paperback printing 2010

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Brush, Kathryn.

The shaping of art history : Wilhelm Vöge, Adolph Goldschmidt, and
 the study of medieval art / Kathryn Brush.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references.

ISBN 0-521-47541-4 (hc)

1. Art, Medieval. 2. Art – Historiography. 3. Vöge, Wilhelm,
 1868–1952 – Criticism and interpretation. 4. Goldschmidt, Adolph,
 1863–1944 – Criticism and interpretation. I. Title.

N5970.B78 1996

709'.02'0722 – dc20

95-9680

CIP

ISBN 978-0-521-47541-9 Hardback
 ISBN 978-0-521-14762-0 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or
 accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in
 this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is,
 or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-14762-0 - The Shaping of Art History: Wilhelm Voge, Adolph Goldschmidt, and the Study of Medieval Art

Kathryn Brush

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

For my parents

Contents

<i>List of Illustrations</i>	<i>page</i> ix
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xi
Introduction	i

Part I Mentalités

Chapter 1	Art History and Cultural History during the 1880s: The Discursive Range	19
-----------	--	----

Part II “Monumental Styles” in Medieval Art History

Chapter 2	Wilhelm Vöge and <i>The Beginnings of the Monumental Style in the Middle Ages</i> (1894)	57
Chapter 3	Thematic and Methodological Range in the Scholarship of Goldschmidt and Vöge to ca. 1905	88

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-14762-0 - The Shaping of Art History: Wilhelm Voge, Adolph Goldschmidt, and the
Study of Medieval Art
Kathryn Brush
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CONTENTS

Part III Resonances

Chapter 4	German and International Responses at the Turn of the Century	115
Chapter 5	Implications for Later Discourse in Medieval Art History	132
	<i>Notes</i>	155
	<i>Bibliography</i>	231
	<i>Index</i>	255

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-14762-0 - The Shaping of Art History: Wilhelm Vöge, Adolph Goldschmidt, and the Study of Medieval Art

Kathryn Brush

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Illustrations

1. Wilhelm Vöge	<i>page</i> 6
2. Adolph Goldschmidt	7
3. Anton Springer, etching by Albert Krüger	25
4. Wilhelm Vöge as a university student	34
5. Aby Warburg as a university student	34
6. Paul Clemen	35
7. Carl Justi, bronze bust by Gisela Zitelmann	36
8. Henry Thode	37
9. Karl Lamprecht	38
10. Tracings by Wilhelm Vöge of individual figures and motifs in Ottonian manuscripts	46
11. Drawing by Wilhelm Vöge of Saint Gregory and his scribe after the <i>Registrum Gregorii</i> , Trier	47
12. Hubert Janitschek	48
13. Letter from Wilhelm Vöge to Adolph Goldschmidt	60
14. Royal Portal, west facade, Chartres Cathedral, as illustrated in <i>Die Anfänge des monumentalen Stiles</i>	64
15. Royal Portal, west facade, Chartres Cathedral	65
16. Figures from the left jamb, central portal, west facade, Chartres Cathedral	66

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-14762-0 - The Shaping of Art History: Wilhelm Vöge, Adolph Goldschmidt, and the Study of Medieval Art

Kathryn Brush

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

ILLUSTRATIONS

17.	Figures from the right jamb, central portal, west facade, Chartres Cathedral	67
18.	Detail of figure from the left jamb, central portal, west facade, Chartres Cathedral	70
19.	Archivolt figures of the Liberal Arts, south portal, west facade, Chartres Cathedral	71
20.	Postcard from Wilhelm Vöge to Adolph Goldschmidt	75
21.	Adolph Goldschmidt	96
22.	Adolph Goldschmidt with students from the University of Halle	98
23.	Adolph Goldschmidt with students at the University of Berlin	99
24.	Postcard from Wilhelm Vöge to Adolph Goldschmidt	108
25.	Postcard from Wilhelm Vöge to Adolph Goldschmidt	109
26.	Arthur Kingsley Porter	145
27.	Adolph Goldschmidt in front of the Fogg Art Museum, Harvard University	150
28.	Adolph Goldschmidt with Kuno Francke in the Germanic Museum, Harvard University	151

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-14762-0 - The Shaping of Art History: Wilhelm Voge, Adolph Goldschmidt, and the Study of Medieval Art

Kathryn Brush

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Acknowledgments

IN WRITING THIS BOOK, I have benefited from the help and support of many institutions and individuals whom I now wish to thank.

Preliminary research in European libraries and archives during the summers of 1989, 1990 and 1991 was supported by grants from the Deutscher Akademischer Austauschdienst (DAAD), the University of Western Ontario and also from the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada. An Andrew W. Mellon Faculty Fellowship in the Humanities at Harvard University provided me with the ideal circumstances in which to complete my research and undertake the task of writing. A research grant and research time stipend from the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada enabled me to conduct further work in Europe and to continue writing at Harvard as a Visiting Scholar in Fine Arts during 1992–93.

I am very grateful to the staffs of the following archives for facilitating access to the unpublished materials on which this study is based: Archives Départementales du Bas-Rhin, Strasbourg; Historisches Archiv der Stadt Köln; Rheinisches Amt für Denkmalpflege, Abtei Brauweiler; Staatsarchiv Hamburg; Staatsbibliothek Preussischer Kulturbesitz, Berlin, Autographenabteilung; Universitätsarchiv der Rheinischen Friedrich-Wilhelms-Universität, Bonn; Universitätsbibliothek Bonn, Handschriftenabteilung;

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-14762-0 - The Shaping of Art History: Wilhelm Vöge, Adolph Goldschmidt, and the Study of Medieval Art

Kathryn Brush

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Universitätsbibliothek Basel, Handschriftenabteilung; Universitätsarchiv der Albert-Ludwigs-Universität, Freiburg im Breisgau; and the Warburg Institute, University of London.

A number of individuals who provided assistance with other archival resources deserve special mention. Wilhelm Schlink, Director of the Kunstgeschichtliches Institut at the Albert-Ludwigs-Universität, Freiburg im Breisgau – the art history institute founded by Wilhelm Vöge – was extremely generous in his support of this project. He enabled me to examine the extensive documentation pertaining to Vöge in the institute archives, arranged for photographs and responded to my innumerable questions with exemplary speed. I am equally indebted to Hans-Joachim Krause, Chief Conservator, Landesamt für Denkmalpflege Sachsen-Anhalt, Halle, who accommodated my research by recalling the papers of Wilhelm Vöge from long-term storage at a particularly busy moment in the history of the Landesamt. Dr. Krause and his colleagues kindly assisted with photographs as well. I am very grateful to Marie Roosen-Runge-Mollwo for making unpublished materials relating to Adolph Goldschmidt available to me. The great-nephews and great-nieces of Wilhelm Vöge, especially Klaus Dziobek and Ursula Hausen, followed this project with great interest and graciously gave me access to family letters and photographs. Thanks are also due to Günter Hess who reviewed my transcriptions from documents.

The staffs of the Zentralinstitut für Kunstgeschichte and the Fine Arts and Widener libraries at Harvard University are to be commended for much efficient and sympathetic assistance. Roger Gardiner and the other staff members of the D. B. Weldon Library, University of Western Ontario, also provided valuable help on numerous occasions.

Many colleagues in North America and Europe significantly aided my research. I acknowledge with gratitude the suggestions of Heinrich Dilly, William Heckscher, Willibald Sauerländer, John Shearman and the late Kurt Weitzmann, with whom I discussed specific aspects of my project. I also wish to thank Jaynie Anderson, Roger Chickering, Robert Dushman, Richard Hunt and Bryce Lyon for answering the queries I directed to them. Liliane Châtelet-Lange and Amata Niedner provided special aid with photographs. Peter Nisbet and Emilie Norris of the Busch-Reisinger Museum also helped with photographs and shared my enthusiasm for research on German art and culture during my stay at Harvard. My friends

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-14762-0 - The Shaping of Art History: Wilhelm Voge, Adolph Goldschmidt, and the
Study of Medieval Art
Kathryn Brush
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

in Germany, especially Holly and Markus Richardson-Streese and Editha and Joachim Deeters, helped track down elusive citations and assisted in countless other practical ways.

I am particularly indebted to Pamela M. Jones and Joanna Ziegler, who read the text in draft and responded with challenging suggestions. They acted as important sounding boards for many of the ideas contained in this book. Thanks are also due to Corine Schleif and Elizabeth Sears for their constructive suggestions as readers of my manuscript. During the writing stage Elisabeth Dunn carefully text-edited the manuscript. Her professional sensitivity to matters of form and content helped me to refine the text. It was also a great pleasure to work with Beatrice Rehl, Fine Arts Editor, Cambridge University Press, who oversaw the publication with dedication and dispatch. Other members of the Cambridge University Press production staff, especially Holly Johnson, Christie Lerch and Alan Gold, offered valuable assistance as well.

I owe a fundamental debt to Kermit Champa of Brown University. Some years ago he suggested that my work on medieval art could be enriched and extended by studying the nineteenth- and twentieth-century historiography of art history. The present project has profited immeasurably from his scholarly generosity, extraordinary conceptual range and un-failing encouragement.

Finally, I owe my oldest and deepest debt to my parents, who have always been unwavering in their support of my work.

*London, Canada
July 1994*