

MEDICINE AND PHILOSOPHY IN CLASSICAL ANTIQUITY

This work makes available for the first time in one dedicated volume Philip van der Eijk's selected papers on the close connections that existed between medicine and philosophy throughout antiquity. Medical authors such as the Hippocratic writers, Diocles, Galen, Soranus and Caelius Aurelianus elaborated on philosophical methods such as causal explanation, definition and division, applying concepts such as the notion of nature to their understanding of the human body. Similarly, philosophers such as Plato and Aristotle were highly valued for their contributions to medicine. This interaction was particularly striking in the study of the human soul in relation to the body, as illustrated by approaches to topics such as intellect, sleep and dreams, and diet and drugs. With a detailed introduction surveying the subject as a whole and a new chapter on Aristotle's treatment of sleep and dreams, this wide-ranging collection is essential reading for students and scholars of ancient philosophy and science.

PHILIP J. VAN DER EIJK is Professor of Greek at the University of Newcastle upon Tyne. He has published widely on ancient philosophy, medicine and science, comparative literature and patristics. He is the author of Aristoteles. De insomniis. De divinatione per somnum (Berlin: Akademie Verlag, 1994) and of Diocles of Carystus. A Collection of the Fragments with Translation and Commentary (2 vols., Leiden: Brill, 2000–1). He has edited and co-authored Ancient Histories of Medicine. Essays in Medical Doxography and Historiography in Classical Antiquity (Leiden: Brill, 1999) and co-edited Ancient Medicine in its Socio-Cultural Context (2 vols., Amsterdam and Atlanta: Rodopi, 1995).



MEDICINE AND PHILOSOPHY IN CLASSICAL ANTIQUITY

Doctors and Philosophers on Nature, Soul, Health and Disease

PHILIP J. VAN DER EIJK

Professor of Greek at the University of Newcastle upon Tyne





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo

Cambridge University Press
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521142977

© Philip van der Eijk 2005

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2005 Reprinted 2005, 2006 This digitally printed version 2010

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Eijk, Ph. J. van der (Philip J.)

Medicine and philosophy in classical antiquity: doctors and philosophers on nature, soul, health and disease / Philip J. van der Eijk.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and indexes. ISBN 0 521 81800 1 (hardback)

1. Medicine, Greek and Roman. 2. Medicine, Ancient.

3. Medicine – Philosophy. 4. Soul. 5. Nature. I. Title.

R135.E36 2005

610′.938 – dc22 2004056141

ISBN 978-0-521-81800-1 Hardback ISBN 978-0-521-14297-7 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For Arachne



Contents

	rnowledgements te on translations	page ix
	te on translations te on abbreviations	xiii xiv
Int	roduction	I
	HIPPOCRATIC CORPUS AND DIOCLES CARYSTUS	
I	The 'theology' of the Hippocratic treatise <i>On the Sacred Disease</i>	45
2	Diocles and the Hippocratic writings on the method of dietetics and the limits of causal explanation	74
3	To help, or to do no harm. Principles and practices of therapeutics in the Hippocratic Corpus and in the work of Diocles of Carystus	IOI
4	The heart, the brain, the blood and the <i>pneuma</i> : Hippocrates, Diocles and Aristotle on the location of cognitive processes	119
ΙΙ	ARISTOTLE AND HIS SCHOOL	
5	Aristotle on melancholy	139
6	Theoretical and empirical elements in Aristotle's treatment of sleep, dreams and divination in sleep	169
7	The matter of mind: Aristotle on the biology of 'psychic' processes and the bodily aspects of thinking	206

vii



viii	Contents	
8	Divine movement and human nature in <i>Eudemian Ethics</i> 8.2	238
9	On Sterility ('Hist. an. 10'), a medical work by Aristotle?	259
III	LATE ANTIQUITY	
Ю	Galen's use of the concept of 'qualified experience' in his dietetic and pharmacological works	279
II	The Methodism of Caelius Aurelianus: some epistemological issues	299
Bib	liography	328
Index of passages cited		379
General index		396



Acknowledgements

Since the original publication of these papers I have taken the opportunity to make some, mostly minor, revisions to some chapters, mainly on points of style and presentation, in order to enhance accessibility. Thus quotations from Greek and Latin are now accompanied by English translations or paraphrase, and in several cases words in Greek script have been transliterated. I have also in a number of cases taken account of publications that have come out since the paper was first published; there have, however, been no changes to the substance, and all revisions have been clearly marked by square brackets; in some cases I have presented them in the form of a postscript at the end of the relevant chapter, so as to facilitate reference to the original publication.

Chapter I was first published in *Apeiron* 23 (1990) 87–II9, and is reprinted (with slight, mainly stylistic alterations) with the kind permission of Academic Printing and Publishing.

Chapter 2 was first published in R. Wittern and P. Pellegrin (eds.), *Hippokratische Medizin und antike Philosophie* (Medizin der Antike, Band 1), Hildesheim: Olms, 1996, 229–57, and is reprinted here with the kind permission of Olms Verlag; but the numeration of the Diocles fragments, and the translation of fr. 176 printed here have been modified in accordance with the relevant sections in my *Diocles of Carystus*, Leiden, 2000, which are reprinted here with the kind permission of Brill Academic Publishers.

Chapter 3 is a slightly expanded version of a paper published under the title 'The systematic status of therapy in the Hippocratic Corpus and in the work of Diocles of Carystus', in I. Garofalo, D. Lami, D. Manetti and A. Roselli (eds.), *Aspetti della terapia nel Corpus Hippocraticum*, Florence: Olschki, 1999, 389–404, reprinted with the kind permission of Olschki Editore; an abbreviated version in Dutch appeared under the title 'Helpen, of niet schaden. Enkele uitgangspunten van therapeutisch handelen in de klassieke Griekse geneeskunde' in *Hermeneus* 71 (1999) 66–71.



X

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-14297-7 - Medicine and Philosophy in Classical Antiquity: Doctors and Philosophers on Nature, Soul, Health and Disease Philip J. van der Eijk Frontmatter More information

Acknowledgements

Chapter 4 was first published in Dutch under the title 'Hart en hersenen, bloed en pneuma. Hippocrates, Diocles en Aristoteles over de localisering van cognitieve processen' in *Gewina* 18 (1995) 214–29, and has been translated (and slightly adapted) for the present volume by Arachne van der Eijk-Spaan.

Chapter 5 was first published in German under the title 'Aristoteles über die Melancholie' in *Mnemosyne* 43 (1990) 33–72, and has been translated (and slightly adapted) for the present volume by Arachne van der Eijk-Spaan.

Chapter 6 is in its present form a new paper, although it is based on material published in my book *Aristoteles*. *De insomniis*. *De divinatione per somnum*, Berlin: Akademie Verlag, 1994, and in three articles: 'Theorie und Empirie in Aristoteles' Beschäftigung mit dem Traum und mit der Weissagung im Schlaf', in K. Döring and G. Wöhrle (eds.), *Antike Naturwissenschaft und ihre Rezeption*, vol. IV, Bamberg: Collibri Verlag, 1994, 31–46; 'Aristotle on "distinguished physicians" and on the medical significance of dreams', in P. J. van der Eijk, H. F. J. Horstmanshoff and P. H. Schrijvers (eds.), *Ancient Medicine in its Socio-Cultural Context* (Clio Medica/The Wellcome Institute Series in the History of Medicine 28–9), Amsterdam and Atlanta: Rodopi, 1995, vol. II, 447–59; and 'Aristotle on cognition in sleep', in T. Wiedemann and K. Dowden (eds.), *Sleep* (Nottingham Classical Literature Series / Midlands Classical Series 8), Bari: Levante Editori, 2003, 25–40.

Chapter 7 was first published in W. Kullmann and S. Föllinger (eds.), *Aristotelische Biologie. Intentionen, Methoden, Ergebnisse* (Philosophie der Antike, vol. v1), Stuttgart: Steiner Verlag, 1997, 221–58, and is reprinted with the kind permission of Steiner Verlag.

Chapter 8 was first published in *Hermes* 117 (1989) 24–42, and is reprinted (with alterations in presentation) with the kind permission of Steiner Verlag.

Chapter 9 was first published in *The Classical Quarterly* 49 (1999) 490–502, and is reprinted with the kind permission of Oxford University Press.

Chapter 10 was first published in A. Debru (ed.), *Galen on Pharma-cology. Philosophy, History and Medicine* (Studies in Ancient Medicine 15), Leiden: Brill, 1997, 35–57, and is reprinted with the kind permission of Brill Academic Publishers.

Chapter II was first published in P. Mudry (ed.), *Le traité des Maladies aiguës et des Maladies chroniques de Caelius Aurelianus: nouvelles approches*, Nantes: Institut Universitaire de France, 1999, 47–83, and is reprinted with the kind permission of the Institut Universitaire de France.



Acknowledgements

I should further like to express my gratitude to the institutions, colleagues and friends who have provided financial, professional and personal support and encouragement during the many years in which the papers collected in this volume were produced. The earlier papers were written when I held a research assistantship, and subsequently a post-doctoral research fellowship, at the Classics Department of Leiden University. I am grateful to Leiden University for its institutional support, to the University Library for providing excellent resources, to the Leiden colleagues for their departmental support, and to the Netherlands Organisation for Scientific Research (NWO) for awarding the post-doctoral research fellowship.

The more recent papers date from my tenure of a Wellcome Trust University Award in the History of Classical Medicine at the University of Newcastle upon Tyne. I am grateful to the Governors of the Wellcome Trust for awarding me this fellowship, to Newcastle University for its institutional support in general – and for offering me a Personal Chair in Greek in particular – to the Newcastle University Arts and Humanities Research Fund for providing financial assistance towards the translation of chapters 4 and 5, to the Robinson Library for its support, and to my colleagues in the Newcastle Classics Department for providing a most congenial academic and social environment. I should further like to express my thanks to the Royal Netherlands Academy of Arts and Sciences (KNAW) for awarding me a fellowship at the Netherlands Institute for Advanced Study (NIAS) in 2000/1, which allowed me to pursue the study of ancient medicine in comparative context.

The papers collected here have greatly benefited from the comments made on oral presentations by audiences at a number of European and American universities, and from the many colleagues and friends who generously offered critical advice and encouragement on drafts. I should like to express a particular word of thanks to Jochen Althoff, Egbert Bakker, Lesley Dean-Jones, Armelle Debru, Jeanne Ducatillon, Sophia Elliott, Klaus-Dietrich Fischer, Hellmut Flashar, Sabine Föllinger, Elisabeth Foppen, Bill Fortenbaugh, Ivan Garofalo, Mark Geller, Hans Gottschalk, Mirko Grmek, Frans de Haas, Jim Hankinson, Donald Hill, Manfred Horstmanshoff, David Langslow, Charles van Leeuwen, Geoffrey Lloyd, James Longrigg, Daniela Manetti, Jaap Mansfeld, Phillippe Mudry, Vivian Nutton, Jan van Ophuijsen, Dobrinka Parusheva, Peter Pormann, Jonathan Powell, Marlein van Raalte, Amneris Roselli, Thomas Rütten, Trevor Saunders,

© in this web service Cambridge University Press

www.cambridge.org

хi



xii

Acknowledgements

Mark Schiefsky, Piet Schrijvers, Chris Sicking, Wesley Smith, Richard Sorabji, Heinrich von Staden, Michael Stokes, Gisela Striker, Wim Verdenius, Henk Versnel, Jürgen Wiesner and Han Zuilhof.

I am grateful to Michael Sharp from Cambridge University Press for the interest he has taken in this volume and for his patience, to the anonymous referees for the Press for their comments on the proposal, and to the editorial staff at CUP for their care in bringing this publication to completion. I am also indebted to Sarah Francis (Newcastle) for her assistance with the technical preparation of the copy.

Finally, I owe a very special word of thanks to my wife Arachne, who translated two of the chapters for this volume and who has provided invaluable support and encouragement throughout all my academic work. I dedicate this volume to her with profound gratitude and affection.



Note on translations

All translations of Greek and Latin texts are my own, except in those cases where I have used the following:

the translations of the Hippocratic writings by W. H. S. Jones and P. Potter (quoted in the introduction and throughout part one), published by Harvard University Press in the Loeb Classical Library as *Hippocrates*, volumes 2/148 (1923), 4/150 (1931), 5/472 (1988) and 6/473 (1988);

the translation of Theophrastus' *On the Causes of Plants* by B. Einarson and G. K. K. Link (quoted in chapter 2), published by Harvard University Press in the Loeb Classical Library as Theophrastus, *De causis plantarum*, volumes 1/471 (1976) and 3/475 (1990);

the translation of Aristotle's *History of Animals*, Book 10, by D. M. Balme (quoted in chapter 9), published by Harvard University Press in the Loeb Classical Library as Aristotle, *History of Animals, Books VII-X*, volume 11/439 (1991);

the translation of Theophrastus' fragments by W. W. Fortenbaugh et al. (quoted in chapter 2), published by Brill in 1992;

the translation of Theophrastus' *Metaphysics* by M. van Raalte (quoted in chapter 2), published by Brill in 1993;

the translation of Galen's *On Medical Experience* by R. Walzer (quoted in chapter 2), published by Oxford University Press in 1944 and reprinted by Hackett in 1985;

the translation of Caelius Aurelianus' On Acute Affections by I. Drabkin (quoted in chapter 4), published by the University of Chicago Press in 1950; and the translation of Plato's *Republic* by G. Grube and D. Reeve (quoted in chapter 6), published by Hackett in 1997.



Note on abbreviations

Abbreviations of authors' names and works follow those used in the *Oxford Classical Dictionary*, ed. S. Hornblower and A. Spawforth (3rd edn, Oxford, 1999), apart from works of Galen, which follow G. Fichtner, *Corpus Galenicum* (Tübingen, 1990) and are explained in the text.

Hippocratic texts are normally cited by reference to the volume and page numbers of the Littré edition (L.): E. Littré, Œuvres complètes d'Hippocrate (10 vols., Paris, 1839–61). Thus 4.270 L. refers to vol. IV, p. 270, of Littré's edition.

Works of Galen are referred to according to the volume and page numbers of the edition by Kühn (K.): C. G. Kühn, *Claudii Galeni opera omnia*, 22 vols. (Leipzig, 1821–33, reprinted Hildesheim, 1964–5). Thus 5.244 K. refers to vol. v, p. 244, of Kühn's edition.