

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-13856-7 - Smart Solutions to Climate Change: Comparing Costs and Benefits

Edited by Bjorn Lomborg

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Smart Solutions to Climate Change

The failure of the Copenhagen climate conference in December 2009 revealed major flaws in the way the world's policy makers have attempted to prevent dangerous levels of increases in global temperatures. The expert authors in this specially commissioned collection focus on the likely costs and benefits of a very wide range of policy options, including geoengineering; mitigation of CO₂, CH₄, and "black carbon"; expanding forest Carbon Sequestration; R&D of low-carbon energy; and encouraging green technology transfer. For each policy, the authors outline all of the costs, benefits, and likely outcomes, in fully referenced, clearly presented chapters accompanied by shorter, critical alternative Perspective papers. To further stimulate debate, an Expert Panel of economists, including three Nobel laureates, evaluates and ranks the attractiveness of the policies.

This authoritative and thought-provoking book will challenge readers to form their own conclusions about the best ways to respond to global warming.

BJØRN LOMBORG is Director of the Copenhagen Consensus Center and Adjunct Professor in the Department of Management, Politics and Philosophy at Copenhagen Business School. He is the author of the controversial bestseller, *The Skeptical Environmentalist* (Cambridge, 2001), and was named as one of the top 100 intellectuals by *Foreign Policy* and *Prospect* magazines in 2008.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-13856-7 - Smart Solutions to Climate Change: Comparing Costs and Benefits

Edited by Bjorn Lomborg

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Smart Solutions to Climate Change

Comparing Costs and Benefits

Edited by

BJØRN LOMBORG



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-13856-7 - Smart Solutions to Climate Change: Comparing Costs and Benefits
Edited by Bjorn Lomborg
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore,
São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521138567

© Copenhagen Consensus Center 2010

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2010

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-0-521-76342-4 Hardback
ISBN 978-0-521-13856-7 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or
accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to
in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such
websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

List of figures vii
List of tables x
List of contributors xiv
Acknowledgments xix
List of abbreviations and acronyms xx

Introduction 1
Bjørn Lomborg

PART I THE SOLUTIONS

1 Climate Engineering 9
J. Eric Bickel and Lee Lane
ALTERNATIVE PERSPECTIVES
1.1 *Roger A. Pielke, Jr.* 52
1.2 *Anne E. Smith* 62

2 Carbon Dioxide Mitigation 74
Richard S.J. Tol
ALTERNATIVE PERSPECTIVES
2.1 *Onno Kuik* 106
2.2 *Roberto Roson* 109

3 Forestry Carbon Sequestration 114
Brent Sohngen
ALTERNATIVE PERSPECTIVE
3.1 *Sabine Fuss* 133

4 Black Carbon Mitigation 142
*Robert E. Baron, W. David Montgomery,
and Sugandha D. Tuladhar*
ALTERNATIVE PERSPECTIVE
4.1 *Milind Kandlikar, Conor C.O.
Reynolds, and Andrew P. Grieshop* 159

5 Methane Mitigation 172
Claudia Kemfert and Wolf-Peter Schill
ALTERNATIVE PERSPECTIVES
5.1 *David Anthoff* 198

5.2	<i>Daniel J.A. Johansson and Fredrik Hedenus</i>	208
6	Market- and Policy-Driven Adaptation <i>Francesco Bosello, Carlo Carraro, and Enrica De Cian</i>	222
	ALTERNATIVE PERSPECTIVES	
6.1	<i>Samuel Fankhauser</i>	277
6.2	<i>Frank Jotzo</i>	284
7	Technology-Led Climate Policy <i>Isabel Galiana and Christopher Green</i>	292
	ALTERNATIVE PERSPECTIVES	
7.1	<i>Valentina Bosetti</i>	340
7.2	<i>Gregory Nemet</i>	349
8	Technology Transfer <i>Zili Yang</i>	360
	ALTERNATIVE PERSPECTIVE	
8.1	<i>David Popp</i>	371
PART II RANKING THE OPPORTUNITIES		
	Expert Panel Ranking <i>Nancy L. Stokey, Vernon L. Smith, Thomas C. Schelling, Finn E. Kydland, and Jagdish N. Bhagwati</i>	381
	Conclusion <i>Bjørn Lomborg</i>	395
	Index	397

Figures

1.1	NC temperature changes with the deployment of SRM (2005–2205)	<i>page 30</i>	1.2.3	Decision tree for SRM decision made with improved information from R&D	68
1.2	Difference in temperature (a) relative to NC and (b) the equivalent equilibrium radiative forcing (2005–2205)	31	2.1	The fourteen estimates of the global economic impact of climate change	77
1.3	OC temperature changes with the deployment of SRM (2005–2205)	32	2.2	Average reduction in GDP due to climate policy aiming at three alternative stabilization targets for atmospheric GHGs (2020–2100)	87
1.4	(a) Optimal emissions controls and (b) carbon taxes with the use of SRM (2005–2205)	32	2.3	Average carbon tax needed for three alternative stabilization targets for atmospheric GHGs (2020–2100)	88
1.5	Difference in SRM CO ₂ concentrations compared to OC and NC (2005–2205)	33	2.4	Gross world income for the no-policy and five alternative policy scenarios (2000–2100)	91
1.6	OC temperature changes with 2055 deployment of SRM (2005–2205)	34	2.5	Global CO ₂ emissions from fossil fuel combustion and industrial processes for the no-policy and five alternative policy scenarios (2000–2100)	92
1.7	Temperature changes with the deployment of SRM under a 2°C temperature constraint (2005–2205)	35	2.6	Atmospheric concentration of CO ₂ for the no-policy and five alternative policy scenarios (2000–2100)	92
1.8	(a) Optimal emissions rates and (b) carbon taxes under a 2°C constraint (2005–2205)	35	2.7	Monetized impact of climate change for the no-policy and five alternative policy scenarios (2000–2100)	93
1.9	OC temperature changes with the deployment of AC (2005–2205)	38	2.8	Monetized and normalized benefit of the five alternative policy scenarios (2000–2100)	94
1.10	(a) Optimal emissions controls and (b) carbon taxes with the use of AC (2005–2205)	38	2.9	Normalized cost of the five alternative policy scenarios (2000–2100)	94
1.11	Difference in AC and SRM CO ₂ concentrations compared to OC (2005–2205)	39	2.10	BCR of the five alternative policy scenarios (2000–2100)	95
1.1.1	Radiative forcing in context	56			
1.2.1	Representation of deterministic analysis of chapter 1 as a decision tree	65			
1.2.2	Representation of SRM decision as a decision under uncertainty	65			

viii List of figures

3.1	Marginal cost functions for carbon sequestration (2030)	119	6.4	Technical change and optimal abatement in the presence of mitigation and adaptation	231
3.2	Carbon price paths under three scenarios ($r = 5\%$) (2010–2100)	122	6.5	Equilibrium (a) mitigation and (b) adaptation in the non-cooperative scenario (2010–2100)	235
3.3	Carbon price paths under three scenarios ($r = 3\%$) (2010–2100)	124	6.6	Residual damage in the non-cooperative scenario (2010–2100)	236
3.4	Global marginal cost curve (2030) with and without transaction costs	127	6.7	Residual damage in the non-cooperative scenario: high damage low discount rate (2010–2100)	237
4.1	Uncertainty in temperature sensitivity	143	6.8	Optimal (a) mitigation and (b) adaptation in a cooperative scenario (2010–2100)	238
4.2	Contribution of black carbon to increases in average global temperature	146	6.9	Effects of (a) mitigation on (b) adaptation (2010–2100)	239
4.3	Black carbon emissions (1900–2000)	147	6.10	CO ₂ emissions (2010–2100)	240
4.4	Regional share of black carbon emissions (2000)	147	6.11	Global welfare (2010–2100)	240
4.5	Black carbon emissions, by region (2000)	148	6.12	Scale and timing of adaptation investments, (a) cooperative, (b) non-cooperative (2010–2100)	243
4.6	MACs for black carbon	151	6.13	Adaptation expenditures in (a) non-OECD and (b) OECD countries (2010–2100)	244
5.1	Global anthropogenic GHG emissions, by gas (2005)	173	6.14	The structure of an integrated impact assessment exercise	249
5.2	Global anthropogenic CH ₄ emissions, by source (2005)	174	6.15	Direct vs. final climate change costs as percentage of regional GDP (2050)	250
5.3	CH ₄ emissions, different regions (1970–2005)	175	6.16	Role of impact interaction: percentage difference between GDP costs of all climatic impacts implemented jointly and the sum of GDP costs associated with each impact implemented individually	250
5.4	Global CH ₄ emissions: baseline and economic mitigation potentials (2020)	186	6.17	Final climate change impact as percentage of regional GDP (2050)	251
5.1.1	Temperature for BAU and solution A (2000–2100)	199	6.18	Economic cost of climate change including market-driven adaptation	252
5.1.2	Temperature	201	6.19	Climate change damage with and without market-driven adaptation (2005–2100)	252
5.2.1	Temperature response following emission pulses of CO ₂ and CH ₄	210			
6.1	Temperature estimates of the IPCC SRES (IIASA), the WITCH model and the AD-WITCH baseline scenario (2010–2100)	224			
6.2	Climate change damages as a function of global mean temperature increase (above preindustrial levels)	225			
6.3	Mitigation and adaptation impacts: a schematic “decision space”	231			

6.20	(a) Non-OECD and (b) OECD climate change damage with and without market-driven adaptation (2005–2100)	253	7.5	Technology return to R&D (2005–2105)	319
6.21	Total protection expenditure (2010–2100)	253	7.6	Emissions, by baseline/policy (2020–2200)	323
6.22	Temperature change in the four scenarios (2010–2100)	259	7.7	Carbon intensity return to R&D: alternative profiles (2020–2160)	323
6.23	Residual damages from climate change in the four scenarios (2005–2100)	260	7.8	CIO, by scenario (2020–2200)	324
6.A1.1	Adaptation tree in the AD-WITCH model	264	7.1.1	Carbon stored	345
6.A3.1	Adaptation tree in the AD-WITCH model: an alternative specification	270	7.2.1	Private and social rates of return to R&D (1970–95)	350
6.A3.2	(a) and (b) Adaptation expenditure (2010–2100)	271	7.2.2	Size of a market for a low-carbon energy technology with and without carbon price caps	351
6.1.1	Benefit of low-cost adaptation in agriculture	280	7.2.3	US private sector energy R&D and crude oil prices (1970–2010)	352
7.1	World energy use, by fuel type (1990–2030)	294	7.2.4	Estimates of the value of air-quality co-benefits	357
7.2	Assumptions of the effects of technological change on future emissions in the SRES scenarios and IPCCV AR4	296	8.1	Optimal transfer amounts (2000–2100)	367
7.3	Energy efficiency–carbon-free power tradeoff	297	8.2	Flows of benefits and costs (scenario 1) (2000–2100)	367
7.4	Future carbon and technology prices (2010–2070)	310	8.3	Flows of benefits and costs (scenario 2) (2000–2100)	368
			8.1.1	Number of EPO patent applications for renewables, by type of technology (1978–2006)	372
			8.1.2	Low-hanging fruit and knowledge spillovers	374

Tables

1.1	Benefit of SRM under NC with 2025 start	<i>page</i> 30	2.1	Estimates of the welfare loss due to climate change	75
1.2	Benefit of SRM under OC with 2025 start	33	2.2	The SCC of carbon	82
1.3	Benefit of SRM under OC with 2055 start	34	2.3	NPV of abatement costs and benefits for the five scenarios	93
1.4	Benefit of SRM under 2°C constraint with 2025 start	36	A2.1	Parameters of the CH ₄ and N ₂ O emission reduction cost curve	97
1.5	Benefit of SRM under low-discount-rate scenario with 2025 start	37	A2.2	Determinants of SF ₆ emissions	98
1.6	Benefit of AC under OC	39	A2.3	Parameters of (A1.11)	98
1.7	Summary of SRM benefits	40	3.1	Average annual potential net emissions reductions through forestry (2020–50)	120
1.8	Required injection rate for marine stratiform cloud albedo enhancement	41	3.2	Carbon sequestration pathways for combined forestry and DICE model for the optimal scenario and a maximum 2°C temperature change (2010–2100)	121
1.9	BCRs for marine stratiform cloud albedo enhancement	41	3.3	B/C estimates for the optimal scenario and the scenario that limits temperature increase to 2°C, with interest rate ($r = 5\%$); and the same two scenarios with lower interest rates ($r = 3\%$), both assuming no transaction costs	121
1.10	Stratospheric aerosol BCRs (naval rifles)	43	3.4	Cumulative abatement and proportion from forests and energy sectors under the two scenarios	123
1.11	Summary of BCRs for SRM (market and low-discount-rate cases)	44	3.5	Method of sequestration in temperature and tropical forests under the two policies	123
1.1.1a	Cost of AC as a percentage of global GDP, assuming 2.9% global GDP growth to 2100	57	3.6	B/C estimates for the cases with transaction costs equaling 20% of the total cost of abatement	128
1.1.1b	Cost of AC as a percentage of global GDP, assuming 2.5% global GDP growth to 2100	58	4.1	Comparison of global emission estimates of black carbon (1980–2000)	149
1.2.1	Expected cost savings of SRM strategy compared to a no-SRM strategy	66	4.2	Level of black carbon under two different scenarios	150
1.2.2	VOI results (assuming probability of false positive, $s = 0$)	69			
1.2.3	VOI results (assuming probability of false positive, $s = 0.25$)	70			
1.2.4	VOI for societal decision (assuming probability of false positive, $s = 0.25$)	72			

4.3	Costs of various black carbon control technologies	152	5.10	Summary of absolute economic mitigation potentials at or below different CO ₂ prices	185
4.4	Areas where MFIs can respond to climate change	154	5.11	Summary of relative economic mitigation potentials at or below different CO ₂ prices	186
4.5	Portfolio of black carbon reduction programs	154	5.12	BCRs for different solution categories, mitigation levels, and assumptions on SCC values	187
4.6	Overview table of costs and benefits	155	5.13	BCRs for selected technologies and different assumptions on SCC values	188
4.1.1	Intervention cost ranges	164	5.14	Portfolio 1: total abatement level, costs, and BCRs for SCC of 13\$/tCO ₂ -eq	191
4.1.2	Health impact and climate mitigation cost-effectiveness values for two potential stove interventions in developing Asia	165	5.15	Portfolio 1: total abatement level, costs, and BCRs for SCC of 46\$/tCO ₂ -eq	191
4.1.3	Health impact and climate mitigation cost-effectiveness values for three potential interventions to reduce black carbon from heavy-duty transport in China and India	167	5.16	Portfolio 2: total abatement level, costs, and BCRs for SCC of 13\$/tCO ₂ -eq	191
4.1.4	BCRs for the proposed black carbon reduction options	168	5.17	Portfolio 2: total abatement level, costs, and BCRs for SCC of 46\$/tCO ₂ -eq	192
5.1	Livestock and manure: projected baseline emissions and economic mitigation potentials at different CO ₂ prices	181	5.1.1	Benefits and costs of solution A	199
5.2	Livestock and manure: MACs of selected technologies	181	5.1.2	Benefits and costs of solution B	200
5.3	Rice: projected baseline emissions and economic mitigation potentials at different CO ₂ prices	182	5.1.3	Benefits and costs of solution C	200
5.4	Solid waste: projected baseline emissions and economic mitigation potentials at different CO ₂ prices	182	5.1.4	Benefits and costs of solution D	200
5.5	Solid waste: breakeven costs and mitigation potentials for selected technologies	183	5.1.5	Net benefits	200
5.6	Coal mining: projected baseline emissions and economic mitigation potentials at different CO ₂ prices	183	5.1.6	Costs (2010–19)	202
5.7	Coal mining: breakeven costs and emission reductions for selected technologies	184	5.1.7	BCRs for solutions A–D	202
5.8	Natural gas: projected baseline emissions and economic mitigation potentials at different CO ₂ prices	184	5.2.1	The cost-benefit case	211
5.9	Natural gas: breakeven costs and emission reductions for selected natural gas mitigation technologies	185	5.2.2	The cost-effectiveness case	212
			5.2.3	The social cost of methane (CH ₄) through its effect on non-climate impacts of tropospheric O ₃	214
			5.2.4	Reductions in beef meat consumption due to a beef tax in the OECD countries, and the greenhouse gas (GHG) mitigation expressed in GWP calculated over 100 years	216
			6.1	Regional climate change impacts as a percentage of GDP corresponding to a temperature increase of 2.5°C	226
			6.2	Climate change impacts in different world regions under a	

2.5°C increase in global temperature above preindustrial levels	227	6.20	Most cost-effective strategies against malaria in SSA	256
6.3 Adaptation: possible criteria for classification	228	6.21	Most cost-effective strategies against malnutrition	256
6.4 BCRs of adaptation in four scenarios (non-cooperative scenario with mitigation and adaptation)	237	6.22	PV of benefits and costs and IRR under three ENSO frequency scenarios	257
6.5 Strategic complementarity between mitigation and adaptation (2035–2100)	241	6.23	Share of damage reduction in the optimal policy mix	259
6.6 Timing of mitigation and adaptation in the cooperative scenario (2035–2100)	241	6A1.1	Different adaptation strategies	264
6.7 Damage reduction due to different strategies (2050–2100)	241	6A1.2	Adaptation costs in response to a doubling of CO ₂ concentration in absolute values and as percentage of GDP	265
6.8 BCR of adaptation and of joint mitigation and adaptation	242	6A1.3	Effectiveness of adaptation (1 = 100% damage reduction) against doubling of CO ₂ concentration	266
6.9 Sensitivity analysis: BCR of mitigation and adaptation in the cooperative scenario	242	6A1.4	Total climate change costs (residual damages and adaptation cost) for a doubling of CO ₂ concentration	267
6.10 Expenditure composition of the adaptation mix	242	6A2.1	Climate change impacts (2000–50)	268
6.11 BCR of the adaptation strategy mix in the cooperative scenario	242	6A3.1	Benefits and costs of adaptation without mitigation (non-cooperative)	272
6.12 Mitigation and adaptation in the OECD and non-OECD regions in the cooperative scenario	245	7.1	The IPCC B2 scenario (1990–2100)	297
6.13 Sensitivity analysis: BCR of adaptation and of joint mitigation and adaptation in the cooperative scenario – OECD regions	246	7.2	Carbon tax equivalents	309
6.14 Sensitivity analysis: BCR of adaptation and of joint mitigation and adaptation in the cooperative scenario – non-OECD regions	246	7.3	Projected changes in physical output of intensive sectors (2020)	314
6.15 Marginal contribution of specific policy-driven strategies	246	7.4	Early return to R&D	324
6.16 Impacts analyzed with the ICES model	249	7.5	Mid-return to R&D	325
6.17 Regional and sectoral disaggregation of the ICES model	249	7.6	Late return to R&D	325
6.18 BCR of policy-driven adaptation in the presence of market-driven adaptation	254	7.7	Cumulative emissions comparisons	326
6.19 Most cost-effective strategies against diarrheal disease	256	7.8	Cumulative emissions: a policy comparison	326
		7.9	Technology-led vs. “brute force” BCRs	329
		7.1.1	Increase in climate policy costs without an R&D program aimed at breakthrough in low-carbon technologies	342
		7.1.2	Technological parameters for traditional coal and IGCC–CCS power plants	345
		7.1.3	CBA of R&D in a CCS technologies program	346

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-13856-7 - Smart Solutions to Climate Change: Comparing Costs and Benefits
Edited by Bjorn Lomborg
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

7.1.4	BCRs for R&D in a CCS technologies program	346	8.2	PV of total global benefits and costs of TT in 100 years (the second measurement)	366
7.2.1	Implications for BCRs	358			
8.1	PV of total global benefits and costs of TT in 100 years (the first measurement)	366	8.3	PV of total global benefits and costs of TT in 100 years (the third measurement)	366

Contributors

Experts

Jagdish N. Bhagwati is University Professor at Columbia University and Senior Fellow in International Economics at the Council on Foreign Relations. He has been Economic Policy Adviser to Arthur Dunkel, Director General of GATT (1991–3), Special Adviser to the United Nations on Globalization, and External Adviser to the WTO. He has served on the Expert Group appointed by the Director General of the WTO on the Future of the WTO and the Advisory Committee to Secretary General Kofi Annan on the NEPAD process in Africa, and was also a member of the Eminent Persons Group under the chairmanship of President Fernando Henrique Cardoso on the future of UNCTAD. Five volumes of his scientific writings and two of his public policy essays have been published by MIT Press. The recipient of six Festschriften in his honor, he has also received several prizes and honorary degrees, including awards from the governments of India (Padma Vibhushan) and Japan (Order of the Rising Sun, Gold and Silver Star). Professor Bhagwati’s latest book is *In Defense of Globalization* (2004).

Finn E. Kydland is the Henley Professor of Economics at the University of California, Santa Barbara, and Director of The Laboratory for Aggregate Economics and Finance. Professor Kydland was awarded the 2004 Nobel Prize in Economics jointly with Edward C. Prescott of Arizona State University, “for their contribution to dynamic macroeconomics: the time consistency of economic policy and the driving forces behind business cycles.” Their analysis of economic policy and the driving forces behind business cycles transformed economic research and greatly influenced the practice of economic policy in general, and monetary policy

in particular. In two joint papers, in 1977 and 1982, Kydland and Prescott offered new approaches to the analysis of macroeconomic developments. Kydland joined the UC Santa Barbara faculty on July 1, 2004. He previously taught at Carnegie Mellon University, where he earned his PhD. He is also an Adjunct Professor at NHH, Norway, and consults as a Research Associate at the Federal Reserve Bank of Dallas

Thomas C. Schelling is Distinguished University Professor, Emeritus at the University of Maryland. For twenty years he was the Lucius N. Littauer Professor of Political Economy at the John F. Kennedy School of Government. Schelling was awarded the Nobel Memorial Prize in Economic Sciences jointly with Robert Aumann in 2005 for “having enhanced our understanding of conflict and cooperation through game-theory analysis.” He has been elected to the National Academy of Sciences, the Institute of Medicine, and the American Academy of Arts and Sciences. In 1991, he was President of the American Economic Association, of which he is a distinguished fellow. He was the recipient of the Frank E. Seidman Distinguished Award in Political Economy and the National Academy of Sciences award for Behavioral Research Relevant to the Prevention of Nuclear War. He served in the Economic Cooperation Administration in Europe, and has held positions in the White House and Executive Office of the President, Yale University, the RAND Corporation and the Department of Economics and Center for International Affairs at Harvard University. He has published on military strategy and arms control, energy and environmental policy, climate change, nuclear proliferation, terrorism, organized crime, foreign aid and international trade, conflict and bargaining theory, racial segregation and integration, the military draft, health policy, tobacco

and drugs policy, and ethical issues in public policy and in business.

Vernon L. Smith was awarded the Nobel Prize in Economic Sciences in 2002 for his groundbreaking work in experimental economics. Smith has joint appointments with the Argyros School of Business and Economics, and the School of Law at Chapman University, and he is part of a team that will create and run the new Economic Science Institute at Chapman. Smith has authored or co-authored more than 250 articles and books on capital theory, finance, natural resource economics, and experimental economics. He serves or has served on the board of editors of the *American Economic Review*, *The Cato Journal*, the *Journal of Economic Behavior and Organization*, the *Journal of Risk and Uncertainty*, *Science*, *Economic Theory*, *Economic Design*, *Games and Economic Behavior*, and the *Journal of Economic Methodology*. Smith is a distinguished fellow of the American Economic Association, an Andersen Consulting Professor of the Year, and the 1995 Adam Smith Award recipient conferred by the Association for Private Enterprise Education. He was elected a member of the National Academy of Sciences in 1995, and received CalTech's Distinguished Alumni Award in 1996. He has served as a consultant on the privatization of electric power in Australia and New Zealand and participated in numerous private and public discussions of energy deregulation in the USA. In 1997 he served as a Blue Ribbon Panel Member, National Electric Reliability Council. Smith completed his undergraduate degree in electrical engineering at CalTech, his master's degree in economics at the University of Kansas, and his PhD in economics at Harvard University.

Nancy L. Stokey is the Frederick Henry Prince Distinguished Service Professor of Economics at the University of Chicago. She earned her BA in economics from the University of Pennsylvania in 1972 and her PhD from Harvard University in 1978. Stokey has published significant research in the areas of economic growth and development, as well as papers on economic history ("A Quantitative Model of the British Industrial Revolution: 1780–1850," 2001) and economic theory ("Dynamic Pro-

gramming with Homogeneous Functions," 1998, co-authored with Fernando Alvarez). She is the co-developer, with Paul Milgrom, of the no-trade theorem, a counter-intuitive proposition in financial economics, and offered the first rigorous proof of the Coase conjecture on durable goods pricing by a monopolist. She co-authored, with Nobel Prize laureates Robert Lucas, Jr. and Edward Prescott, a book on recursive methods in economic dynamics that is widely used by research economists and graduate students. Stokey is a member of the National Academy of Sciences and of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences, and she was a vice-president of the American Economic Association between 1996 and 1997. She has served as co-editor of *Econometrica* and the *Journal of Political Economy*.

Chapter Authors

Robert E. Baron is a senior consultant at Charles River Associates International. He has thirty years' experience in the energy industry, related to natural gas, petroleum, and electric utilities. Previously he was vice-president at ICF Consulting, a principal at DRI/McGraw-Hill, a manager at British Petroleum, and a research scientist at the MIT Energy Laboratory.

J. Eric Bickel is an assistant professor in the Graduate Program in Operations Research and Industrial Engineering at The University of Texas at Austin and a fellow in the Center for International Energy and Environmental Policy.

Francesco Bosello is a researcher at the Department of Economics, Business and Statistics, University of Milan, Italy, and senior researcher at the Fondazione Eni Enrico Mattei in Milan. He graduated in economics at the University Ca'Foscari of Venice, then achieved the title of Master of Science in Economics from University College, University of London (UK) and a PhD in Economics from the University of Venice. Previously he has been Visiting Scientist at the International Center for Theoretical Physics Abdus Salam in Trieste and Research Assistant at the University of Venice.

Carlo Carraro is Professor of Environmental Economics at the University of Venice. He holds a PhD from Princeton University and has been Vice-Provost for Research Management and Policy of the University of Venice (2000–6) and Chairman of the Department of Economics (2006–8). Carraro is Director of the Sustainable Development Programme of the Fondazione Eni Enrico Mattei and Director of the Climate Impacts and Policy Division of the Euro Mediterranean Centre for Climate Change (CMCC).

Enrica De Cian is a junior researcher at the Fondazione Eni Enrico Mattei in Venice. In 2008 she graduated in Economics and Organization at the School of Advanced Studies in Venice. In 2006–7, she was Visiting Student at the MIT Joint Program on the Science and Policy of Global Change, at MIT. Her main research interests are technological change and the environment; mitigation and adaptation policies; and climate coalitions.

Isabel Galiana is a PhD candidate in the Department of Economics at McGill University, Montreal, specializing in modeling of climate change policy and international economics.

Christopher Green is a professor of economics in the Department of Economics at McGill University. His main teaching and research fields are industrial organization; public policies toward business; and environmental economics, in particular the economics of climate change.

Claudia Kemfert is Head of the Department of Energy, Transportation, Environment at the German Institute of Economic Research (DIW, Berlin), and Professor of Energy Economics and Sustainability at the Hertie School of Governance (HSoG). From 2004 to 2009, she was Professor of Environmental Economics at Humboldt-University Berlin. She is an expert in the areas of energy and climate economics.

Lee Lane is a resident fellow at AEI and co-director of AEI’s geoengineering (GE) project. Lane has been a consultant to CRA International, and Executive Director of the Climate Policy Center.

W. David Montgomery is Vice-President at Charles River Associates International. He is an internationally recognized expert on economic issues associated with climate change policy, and his work on these topics has been published frequently in peer-reviewed journals. He was a principal lead author of the Second Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC, 1995), Working Group III, and he has authored a number of peer-reviewed publications on climate policy over the past twenty years.

Wolf-Peter Schill is Research Associate at the Department of Energy, Transportation, Environment at the German Institute of Economic Research (DIW, Berlin). His fields of interest are economics of climate change, renewable energy, and electricity markets.

Brent Sohngen is Professor at The Ohio State University’s Department of Agricultural, Environmental, and Development Economics, and University Fellow at Resources for the Future. Professor Sohngen develops economic models of land-use and land-cover change for climate policy analysis, and he studies the economics of non-point-source pollution control.

Richard S.J. Tol is a research professor at the Economic and Social Research Institute (Dublin) and the Professor of the Economics of Climate Change at the Free University of Amsterdam. An economist and statistician, his work focuses on impacts of climate change, international climate policy, tourism, and land and water use. He is ranked among the 200 best economists in the world. His recent publications include *Environmental Crisis: Science and Policy* (2007) and *Economic Analysis of Land Use in Global Climate Change* (2008).

Sugandha D. Tuladhar is an associate principal at Charles River Associates International. He specializes in computable general equilibrium (CGE) model development and its application. As a general equilibrium modeler with extensive econometric and programming skills, Tuladhar’s work focuses on the global impact of environmental and climate policy changes.

Zili Yang is Professor of Economics at the State University of New York at Binghamton. His focus is on resource and environmental economics, energy economics, and public economics.

Perspective Paper Authors

David Anthoff is an environmental economist working on climate change. He is a postdoctoral associate of the Economic and Social Research Institute, Dublin, and a freelance consultant on climate change issues. He holds a PhD in Economics from Hamburg University and the International Max Planck Research School on Earth System Modelling, a MSc in Environmental Change and Management from the University of Oxford and a MPhil in Philosophy from LMU, Munich. In the autumn of 2008, he was a visiting research fellow at the Smith School of Enterprise and the Environment, University of Oxford.

Valentina Bosetti holds a PhD in Computational Mathematics and Operation Research from the Università Statale of Milan and a Masters Degree in Environmental and Resources Economics from University College, University of London. At FEEM since 2003, she works as a modeler for the Sustainable Development Program, leading the Climate Change topic and coordinating a research group on numerical analysis of carbon mitigation options and policies. She has also collaborated with a number of other institutes such as the Euro-Mediterranean Center on Climate Change, the NOAA, and Italian Universities. Her main research interest is socio-economic modeling of climate change, with particular emphasis on innovation, uncertainty, and irreversibility.

Samuel Fankhauser is a principal fellow at the Grantham Research Institute on Climate Change and the Environment at the London School of Economics. He also serves as Chief Economist for Globe International, the international legislators' forum, and is a member of the Committee on Climate Change, an independent public body that advises the UK government on its carbon targets. Dr. Fankhauser served on the 1995, 2001, and 2007

assessments of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC).

Sabine Fuss is a research scholar at the Forestry Program of the International Institute of Systems Analysis (IIASA) in Laxenburg, Austria.

Andrew P. Grieshop is a postdoctoral research fellow at the Institute for Resources, Environment, and Sustainability at the University of British Columbia, where he works at the intersection of energy consumption, atmospheric sciences, and public policy, focusing on issues in developing countries. His doctoral research, completed as part of the Center for Atmospheric Particle Studies at Carnegie Mellon University, examined the properties and atmospheric evolution of carbonaceous aerosols.

Fredrik Hedenus is a researcher at the Department of Physical Resource Theory at Chalmers University of Technology. His research interests include greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions from food, energy system modelling, energy security, and technological change.

Daniel J.A. Johansson is a postdoctoral student at the Division of Physical Resource Theory, Department of Energy and Environment at Chalmers University of Technology, Gothenburg. Johansson's main research interests are related to energy and climate change economics and policy.

Frank Jotzo is Research Fellow at the College of Asia and the Pacific, Australian National University, and Deputy Director of the ANU Climate Change Institute. He specializes in the economics and policy of climate change. He has worked and published on these topics and other aspects of international and development economics since 1998, and has advised several governments on climate policy.

Milind Kandlikar is an associate professor at the Liu Institute for Global Issues, University of British Columbia, Vancouver, Canada. His work focuses on the intersection of technology innovation, human development, and the global

environment. He has published extensively on the science and policy of climate change.

Onno Kuik is a researcher at the Institute for Environmental Studies, Vrije Universiteit, Amsterdam. He has worked for the past twenty years on the economic analysis of environmental policy. He received the *Energy Journal*'s 2003 Best Paper Award for the paper "Trade Liberalization and Carbon Leakage," co-authored by Reyer Gerlagh.

Gregory Nemet is an assistant professor at the University of Wisconsin in the La Follette School of Public Affairs and the Nelson Institute for Environmental Studies. He is also a member of the University's Energy Sources and Policy Cluster and a senior fellow at the University's Center for World Affairs and the Global Economy. His research and teaching focus on improving understanding of the environmental, social, economic, and technical dynamics of the global energy system. A central focus of his research involves empirical analysis of the processes of innovation and technological change.

Roger A. Pielke, Jr. is a professor in the Environmental Studies Program at University of Colorado and a Fellow of the Cooperative Institute for Research in Environmental Sciences. In 2006, he received the Eduard Brückner Prize for outstanding achievement in interdisciplinary climate research.

David Popp is Associate Professor of Public Administration in the Center for Policy Research of the Maxwell School at Syracuse University. He is also a research associate of the National Bureau for

Economic Research (NBER). He is an economist with research interests in environmental policy and the economics of technological change. Much of his research focuses on the links between environmental policy and innovation. He is particularly interested in how environmental and energy policies shape the development of new technologies that may be relevant for combating climate change.

Conor C.O. Reynolds is a doctoral candidate at the Institute for Resources, Environment and Sustainability at the University of British Columbia. He conducts research on the climate and air-quality impacts of transportation. Reynolds' doctoral dissertation assesses strategies to reduce transportation emissions in rapidly industrializing countries, such as the use of alternative fuels.

Roberto Roson has been a visiting fellow at the Free University of Amsterdam, at the University of Warwick, and at S. Francisco Xavier University (Sucre, Bolivia). He is currently Associate Professor at Ca'Foscari University, Venice, where he teaches industrial organization, international and antitrust economics. He is currently collaborating with the Euro-Mediterranean Centre for Climate Change, IEFEBocconi University and the World Bank.

Anne E. Smith is Vice-President and Practice Leader of Climate & Sustainability at Charles River Associates International. She is an expert in environmental policy assessment and corporate compliance strategy planning and has made major analysis contributions to most major air quality policy issues. She has a PhD in economics from Stanford University.

Acknowledgments

This book presents research and findings from the Copenhagen Consensus on Climate project which was made possible by funding from the Danish government. I am grateful for the commitment of current and past staff members at the Copenhagen Consensus Center: Cecilie Olsen, Gabriela Garza de Linde, Henrik Meyer, Katja Johansen, Kristine Ohrt, Maria Jakobsen, Tommy Petersen, and Zenia Stampe. I would particularly like to thank the members of the project team for their exceptional dedication and enthusiasm: Anders Møller, Anita Overholt Nielsen, David Young, Kasper Thede Anderskov, Maja Makwarth, Sasha Larsen Beckmann, Ulrik Larsen, and Zsuzsa Horvath. And I would especially like to express my sincere appreciation to the authors of the outstanding research in this volume, and to the remarkable members of the Copenhagen Consensus Expert Panel.

Abbreviations and acronyms

ABC	Atmospheric Brown Clouds	EMF	Energy Modeling Forum
ABI	Association of British Insurers	ENSO	El Niño-southern oscillation
AC	air capture	EPA	Environmental Protection Agency (USA)
AC	average cost	EPO	European Patent Office
ACEI	Autonomous Carbon Efficiency Improvement	EST	environmentally sound technologies
AEEI	Autonomous Energy Efficiency Improvement	ETS	emission trading scheme
AETG	advanced energy technology gap	ETS	Emission Trading System
APP	Asia Pacific Partnership	FDI	foreign direct investment
B/C	benefit-cost	FEEM	Fondazione Eni Enrico Mattei
BAU	business-as-usual	FSU	former Soviet Union
BCA	benefit-cost analysis	FUND	Climate Framework for Uncertainty, Negotiation, and Distribution
BCR	benefit-cost ratio	G4M	Global Forest Model
CBA	cost-benefit analysis	GAINS	Greenhouse Gas and Air Pollution Interactions and Synergies
CCN	cloud condensation nucleae	GCC	global climate change
CCS	carbon capture and storage	GCM	general circulation model
CCSP	Climate Change Science Program	GCP	Global Carbon Project
CDM	clean development mechanism	GDP	gross domestic product
CE	climate engineering	GE	geoengineering
CES	constant elasticity of substitution	Gg	giga-gram
CFC	chlorofluorocarbon	GHG	greenhouse gas
CGE	computable general equilibrium	GLOBIOM	Global Biomass Optimization Model
CIO	carbon intensity of output	GtC	gigatons of carbon
CIR ³ D	carbon intensity-reducing return to R&D investment	GTP	Global Temperature Potential
CIS	Commonwealth of Independent States	GWe	giga-watt electric
CNG	compressed natural gas	GWP	global warming potential
COP	Conference of Parties	GWP	gross world product
CRP	Conservation Reserve Program (USA)	HDDV	heavy-duty diesel vehicles
CV	current value	HFC	hydrofluorocarbon
DALY	disability adjusted life year	IA	impact assessment
DICE	Dynamic Integrated model of Climate and the Economy	IA	integrated assessment
EDF	Environmental Defense Fund	IAM	integrated assessment model
EI	energy intensity of output	ICES	Intertemporal Computable Equilibrium System
EJ	exajoules	IEA	international environmental agreement

IEA WEO	International Energy Agency World Energy Outlook	OHI	other high-income countries
IFR	integral fast reactor	OLS	ordinary least squares
IGCC–CCS	integrated coal gasification combined cycle power plant	PDF	probability density function
IIASA	International Institute for Applied Systems Analysis	PFC	perfluorocarbons
IPCC	Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change	PM	particulate matter
IRR	internal interest rate	PPP	purchasing power parity
ISM	Indian summer monsoon	ppb	parts per billion
ITC	induced technological change	ppm	parts per million
LBD	learning-by-doing	ppmv	parts per million by volume
LBR	learning-by-researching	PV	present value
LDC	least developed country	QALY	quality of life
LFG	landfill gas	R&D	research and development
LLF	long-lived fluorinated gases	RCIO	rate of decline in the carbon intensity of output
LNG	liquefied natural gas	REDD	Reducing Emissions from Deforestation and Forest Degradation (avoided deforestation)
LPG	liquefied petroleum gas	RICE	Regional Dynamic Integrated model of Climate and the Economy
MAC	marginal abatement cost	SCC	social costs of carbon
MC	marginal costs	SF ₆	sulfur hexafluoride
MEF	Major Economies Forum	SLF	short-lived fluorinated gases
MER	market exchange rates	SPM	Summary for Policy Makers (IPCC)
MFI	micro-finance institution	SRES	Special Report on Emission Scenarios
MMV	measurement, monitoring, and verification	SRM	solar radiation management
MT	million ton	SSA	sub-Saharan Africa
MTC	metric ton of carbon	SYR	Synthesis Report (IPCC)
NAPA	National Adaptation Programmes of Action	TFP	total factor productivity
NAS	National Academy of Sciences	Tg	teragram
NC	No Controls	THC	Thermohaline Circulation
NCAR	The National Center for Atmospheric Research	TOA	top of the atmosphere
NGO	non-governmental organization	TT	technology transfer
NIS	newly independent states	TW	terawatt
NPV	net present value	UNFCCC	United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change
NRTEE	National Roundtable on the Environment and the Economy (Canada)	UV	ultraviolet
O&M	operation and maintenance	VOC	volatile organic compounds
OC	Optimal Controls	VOI	value of information
OC	organic carbon	VSL	value of a statistical life
ODA	overseas development aid	WHO	World Health Organization
OECD	Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development	WM	Waxman–Markey (bill)
		WTAC	willingness to accept compensation
		WTP	willingness-to-pay
		YLD	years lost due to disability
		YLL	years of life lost