

Index

a priori argument. See ontological argument confirmation of matters of faith, theistic academic discipline, philosophy/philosophy of proofs used as, 95 religion as. See philosophy/philosophy contemporary opposition to, 163 of religion context accessibility and immediacy of sacred texts, 101, monastic life as central to, 166-8, 172-4 158-9, 173, 176, 300-1 tendency to separate Anselm's ontological Adams, John, 22, 25, 292 argument from, 165-9 Adams, William, 257 theistic proofs, context-specific nature of, 81 Addison, Joseph devotional nature of Proslogion, 164, 168 congruity of natural and human history The Fool, role of, 173-4 for, 251-3, 258, 261 God addressed by, 169 expressive-explanatory use of design argument knowledge of God as aim of, 174-6 by, 282-3 Other, theistic proof not aimed at, 174 'The Spacious Firmament', 84, 97, 156, 172, otherness of Anselm from modern world, 162-4 252, 272, 282, 313 Advaitins. See Vedanta otherness of God in perception of, agamas, 45 161-3, 176 America. See also Jefferson, Thomas, and natural piety reflected in theistic proofs of, 10, 84, 97 European Enlightenment's manifestation in, Psalm recitation and development of 17-20 ontological argument, 173-4 First Amendment of US Constitution, purpose of ontological argument for, 169, 22-3, 60 172-5, 299 relationship of Proslogion to other liberalism in, origins of, 60 'pluralism' in eighteenth-century America, writings of, 168 sacred texts, embeddedness in, 173-4, 301 what constituted, 29, 64 Puritans in, 317 on sufficiency of reason for knowledge of God, 247 separation of church and state in, 22-3, 60, 292 theologian, not to be understood as, 167-9 special relationship between Britain and, 19 theology as understood by, 173 suspicion of public role for religion in, 60 Western learning and scholarship, American Indians, University of Virginia chair Proslogion predating birth of modes for mission to, 24 of, 164-5 analytical philosophy, Clayton on, 129-31 apologetical use of theistic proofs, 169 Christian (pre-modern) apologetics, 92-4 Anaxagoras, 191 Anselm design argument in Britain, modern survival audience of, 176 of, 272-5 Barth on, 166-9 al-Ghazali's proofs interpreted as belief and reason in, 175 apologetic, 137 by Udayana, 154 Cartesian proofs viewed as variations on, 196 Whewell as apologist, 275 Clayton's thought on, xv, 100



Index

355

Thomas Aquinas, 6-7, 82-3, 91, 92, 191, 196, seventeenth-century obsession with, 209-10, 247, 300 184-8, 212 Aristodemus, 9, 172, 220 Spinozism equated with, 127, 187 Aristotle, 213 theism of opponents entailing, 218 atheistic conclusions drawn from early theistic proofs used as disproofs, 178, 302, 314 modern critique of, 214 unbelief or infidelity in Catholic countries as dialogic comparison with Nagarjuna atheism, but in Protestant countries as suggested by Halbfass, 102 theism, 292 Indian versus Aristotelian syllogism, 113, 157 Voltaire's concerns regarding, 200 Islamic and Jewish philosophers influenced atman doctrine of self in Vedic philosophy, by, 7, 141, 170, 171 38-40 Jesuit Aristotelians versus Cartesians and Atmatattvaviveka (Udayana), 146, 148, 158 Jansenists in early-modern French Augsburg, Diet of (1555), 225 philosophy, 194-9 Augustine of Hippo, 247 localized context-specific rationalities for, 308 Austin, J. L., 131 Averroes (Ibn Rushd), 89, 90, 91, 171, 246 Ramanuja on causality compared, 126 Strato and, 8, 95, 170 awe or wonder, theistic proofs used to express, theistic proofs, influence on, 82, 90, 91, 93, 94, 96-8, 172, 316 (See also expressive-explanatory use of design argument in Britain) 95, 170 Thomist-Aristotelian versus Cartesian Ayodhya, Islamic/Hindu accommodations in, 65 method, 209-10 a-theism of Eastern religions. See non-theism Bacon, Francis, 18, 275 atheism, Western Barrington, Shute, 265 Anselm, as kind of square-circle for, 162 Barrow, Isaac, 204 Barth, Karl, xii, 166-9, 172 Bayle's Dictionnaire, presumption against theism created by, 188-94 Batinites, 157 British apologetic theology's attitude Baumgarten, Alexander Gottlieb, 228, 234 toward, 264 Bayle, Pierre, 127, 185, 188-94, 200, 206, 222, 223 cultural possibility of, 218-21 Bergier, Nicolas-Sylvestre, 207 of Diderot, 203-5, 206-8 Berman, David, 213 Bhagavadgita, 106, 155 educational institutions creating audience for, 215-18 bhasyas, 8 false belief viewed as greater threat than, 94 body-soul model, Ramanuja's rejection of, 125 German philosophy and, 228, 238, 240-4 Bonaventura, 2, 10, 171 of d'Holbach, 203, 205-8 Boyle, Robert, 24 Hume shocked by, 115, 212 Boyle Lectures. See Clarke, Samuel Jansenists, Jesuits and Cartesians, problematic Brahmanas, 44 Brahmasutrabhasya (Ramanuja), 103 effects of dispute between, 194-9 Brahma-Sutras, 8 Jefferson on sectarian religion as encouraging, 25, 26 Brhadaranyaka Upanisad, 44 Kant and Atheismusstreit, 240-4 Bridgewater Treatise (Whewell), 275, 288 natural theology and, 26 Britain and America, special relationship Other, atheists as between, 19 classical authors, materialism and 'atheism' British philosophy, early-modern debate about of, 213 God in, 245 cultural possibility of atheists, 218-21 atheism, seventeenth-century obsession in debate, 214-15 educational system paving way for, 215-18 Catholic versus Protestant cultures, effects of foreign travel and exploration, 213-14 theistic arguments on, 221 as reason for seventeenth-century obsession design argument with atheism, 212 Addison's use of (See Addison, Joseph) physics (sciences) as best antidote to, 207 continuing popularity despite Hume's Priestley on, 260-4, 285 refutation, 248-9, 267, 268 Darwin's theory of natural selection and, providence, combated by doctrine of, 252-3 reasons for modern rise of, 210-12 268, 269-75



356 Index

British philosophy, early-modern debate about God in (cont.) embeddedness in religious tradition, 277 expressive-explanatory use of (See expressiveexplanatory use of design argument in Hammon on, 264 Hayter on, 256, 259, 260 Hume on (See under Hume, David) Milner on, 256, 259-60, 283-4 modern survival of, 272-5, 277 Paley's classical statement of, 249-50, 265-9 (See also Paley, William) popularity in Britain compared to France or Germany, 208, 224 Priestley on, 256, 259, 260-4, 284-5 providence (human social history and natural history interwoven), doctrine of (See providence, doctrine of) Ray on, 250-1, 276 science and religion, Clayton's use of Brooke's theories on British tendency to mix, 278–80 distinctive cultural features compared to Germany or France, 224 education in science in, 217 Mendelssohn influenced by, 232 religious pluralism, rise of, 30-2, 65 special relationship between America and, 19 Brockliss, L. W. B., 215-18 Brooke, John Hedley, 11, 269, 276, 278–80, 290 Buckley, Michael, 211, 218 Budde, Johann Franz, 228 Buddhism. See also vada-tradition of Indian philosophical debate; specific proponents and theories intra-traditional context of theistic proofs and, 114 intra-traditional use of vada-tradition by, neo-Vedantan philosophy ignoring, 131 non-theistic nature of, 40, 87-9, 149 origins of vada-tradition in, 44-5 Sa-skya Pandita (Sa-pan), doxological treatise of, 51, 53, 74 self, Buddhist versus Hindu understanding of, 38-40, 51, 53-6 theistic disproofs in, 87-9 as traditional nastika system, 46 Udayana's refutation of, 143-6, 152, 158 Buffier, Claude, 197 Butler, Bishop Joseph, 105, 249

Adams and Jefferson on, 25 Bayle influenced by, 192, 193 Campbell, George, 257, 264, 287 Candide, Voltaire, 201 canons, philosophical, 107-8 Cartesians. See also Descartes, René Bayle as, 189, 192 in early-modern French philosophy, 188 educational institutions, Cartesian method in, 215, 217 d'Holbach's use of Cartesian proofs, 206 versus Jansenists and Jesuits, 194-9 Kant on Cartesian proofs, 234, 235 Leibniz's connection to, 226, 227, 234 Rousseau's inversion of Cartesian method, 202 Thomist-Aristotelian versus Cartesian method, 209-10 Wolff's systematization of philosophy as emblematic of, 229 Carvaka/Lokayata intra-traditional context of theistic proofs and, 114 non-theism of, 149 vada-tradition and, 45, 46, 52, 72, 73 (See also vada-tradition of Indian philosophical debate) Castillon, Johann von, 207 categorical imperative, 297 Catholicism power struggle between Cartesians, Jesuits and Jansenists, 195 theistic proofs affecting Protestant and Catholic cultures differently, 221 unbelief or infidelity in Catholic countries as atheism, but in Protestant countries as theism, 292 causality. See also motion or change, argument from Aristotle and Ramanuja on, 126 Bayle on, 192 Chandogya Upanisad, 2 change, argument from. See motion or change, argument from Chaudon, Louis-Mayeul, 207 China, Western exposure to culture and theology of, 93, 213, 228 Christian, William, 5 Christianity. See also Catholicism; Protestantism; specific proponents and theories debate tradition in, 70-1 'Enlightenment project' and 133 inter-religious accommodations in popular practice of, 66 Islam's influence on theistic proofs of, 91

Calvin, Jean, 93-4, 247

Calvinism



Index

357

Jeffersonian universal natural religion, Protestant/Western/Enlightenment bias of, 29-30, 64 kalam tradition and, 70-1 Psalm 19, 312 Psalms generally in worship of, 311-12 scholasticism, intra-traditional rather than inter-religious discourse of, 44 theistic proofs as used in, 91-8 Cicero, 93, 104 Clarke, Samuel, 26, 105, 199, 201, 204, 205-6, 211, 248, 314 classical world, early-modern encounter with 'atheism' and materialism of, 213 Clayton, John, life and thought of, ix-xiii, xv Cleanthes in Dialogues concerning Natural Religion. See Hume, David; Ramanuja and Hume compared Cleanthes the Stoic, 10, 127, 172 Clinton, Bill, 16, 59 Clooney, Frank, 109 Code, Lorraine, xiii Collins, Anthony, 26, 211, 314, 317 'common ground' in religion, problems with concept of, 58-9 community solidarity contribution of diversity to, 61 privatization of religious belief and religious diversity affecting, 61 religious rationality as expression of, 10-11 theistic proofs, edificatory uses of, 10-11, 154, tolerance, advantages of, 220 comparative philosophy of religion Clayton's use of, 100 dialogic comparison, 101-3 Halbfass on nature and requirements of, 129-32 theistic proofs as comparative grammar, 305-6 competence, presumption of, 2-3 concept of God/s. See God/s Confucianism, 213, 228 consensus, argument from, 191, 194, 200 conservative religious movements, modern rise of, 58 accessibility to texts complicated by, 101 of Anselm (See Anselm) Clayton's preoccupation with, x-xiii, 183 for defensible difference (See defensible

inter-religious context of rationality in religion, 5, 70-4 intra-traditional context of rationality in religion, 5, 68-70, 113-14 of theistic proofs, 5, 6-11, 157-8 localized context-specific rationalities, diverse religions viewed as, 66-8, 307-9 piety and proofs (See piety and theistic proofs) rationality, diversity of religious contexts of, theistic proofs, context of, 81-3, 133-4, 156 contingency, proof from. See cosmological argument correspondence theories of truth, xiii, 3 cosmological argument dependency on ontological argument, 231 al-Ghazali's, 136–7 Kant's naming of, 116, 134, 231, 234 Leibniz's proof from contingency, 227 in non-Western religious traditions, 85 piety reflected in, 83, 134 Wolff's systematization of, 230 creation, argument from. See causality; design argument; motion or change, argument from Crusius, Christian August, 232-3 cuius regio eius religio, German principle of, 225 cultural difference and location. See context; otherness Daniel, Gabriel, 196 darsanas, 36 Darwin, Charles, 268, 269-75 Davidson, Donald, 2 Dawkins, Richard, 178, 271, 272, 302 Déclaration des droits de l'homme et du citoyen, 77 Declaration of Independence, 22, 76, 77 defensible difference as appropriate method of dealing with modern pluralism, 74 in Christianity, 70–1 Clayton's thought on, xiv common ground, problems with concept of, human-rights discourse and, 75-9 inter-religious systems of, 70-4 intra-traditional systems of, 68–70 Islamic kalam tradition of, 68-9, 70-1 Jeffersonian/Enlightenment view of diversity versus concept of, 59-65 jurisprudential nature of, 67 localized context-specific rationalities, diverse religions viewed as, 66-8 political imbalance and, 70-1, 72

human-rights discourse in Enlightenment

tradition, non-neutral and context-specific

difference)

nature of, x-xiii



358 Index

defensible difference (cont.) popular religion, strategies arising from accommodation of diversity in, 65-6 vada-tradition of Indian philosophical debate, 69-70 value of clarifying, 59 denial of ultimate religious difference, quantifier-shift fallacy of, 32-4 Descartes, René, 186-7, 189. See also Cartesians Anselm and, 165 defensible difference and, 64 German philosophy and, 222, 229 Hume and Ramanuja compared, 102, 108, 117 design argument artisan-artifact analogy, 118, 124 British fondness for (See under British philosophy, early-modern debate about God in) Darwin's theories and, 268, 269-75 dependency on ontological argument, 231 Diderot on, 203-5 disparate groups, mediating between, 11 edificatory uses of, 10 expressive-explanatory use of (See expressiveexplanatory use of design argument in Britain) in Greek philosophical tradition, 10 d'Holbach's attack on, 192 Hume on (See Hume, David) Indian context, 116 Jefferson on, 25, 292 Kant on, 297 Leibniz's rejection of, 227 Luther's attraction to, 98 modern survival of, 272-5, 277 in non-Western religious traditions, 85 piety reflected in, 83, 84 providence (See providence, doctrine of) Ramanuja and Hume compared, 8, 115-20, 121-8 Rousseau's use of, 201, 202 Saunderson's blindness and, 204 scientific discovery, adaptability to, 272 social history and natural history interwoven, doctrine of (See providence, doctrine of) Voltaire's use of, 201 Wolff's systematization of, 230 Desmond, Adrian, 270, 271 determinate or positive religions Enlightenment project distinguishing between natural religion and, 223, 292-4, 306 Jeffersonian project's denial of public space to, 21, 23, 24, 25-6, 61, 292-4

devotional nature of Anselm's Proslogion, 164 devotional practice and theistic proof. See piety and theistic proofs devotional use of theistic proof, 152-5, 156, 171 Dharmakirti, 45, 70, 116, 132 dialectical Other, atheist as, 214-15 dialogic comparison, 101-3. See also Ramanuja and Hume compared Dialogues concerning Natural Religion, Hume, 103-6, 253-65 (See also Hume, David; Ramanuja and Hume compared) Diderot, Denis, 25, 189, 199 Diet of Augsburg (1555), 225 difference and location, cultural and historical. See context; otherness Digha Nikaya, 45 Dignaga, 45 discipline, philosophy/philosophy of religion as. See philosophy/philosophy of religion diversity of religion and public life Clayton's life and thought and, xiii-xiv common consensus, collapse of, 292-4, 306-7 community, contribution of diversity to, 61 debate as way of mediating (See defensible difference) displacement of Enlightenment project of religion, rationality and God with religions, reasons and gods, 41-2 Enlightenment assumptions regarding, 292-4, Indian vada-tradition and (See vada-tradition of Indian philosophical debate) in Jeffersonian universe denial of public space for sectarian religious claims, 21, 23, 24, 25-6, 61, 292-4 'pluralism' in eighteenth-century America, what constituted, 29, 64 Protestant/Western/Enlightenment bias of natural religion envisaged by, 29-30, 64 ultimate rejection of diversity in, 60-5 Kantian construction of public and private, 294-8 localized context-specific rationalities, diverse religions viewed as, 66-8, 307-9 modern pluralism, rise and consequences of, 30-2, 65 popular religion, strategies arising from accommodation of diversity in, 65-6 quantifier-shift fallacy of 'same Ultimate Reality' argument, 32-4 respect for the Other combined with possibility of public discourse, 35-6, 43 theistic proofs used as mediators of, 11, 305-6 tolerance, concept of, 43, 220

Deus sive natura, 127, 204, 239



Index

in Udayana's India, 151 ultimate rejection of diversity as irrational in Jeffersonian/Enlightenment/liberal thought, 63–4, 306 Wittgensteinian approach isolating religious

Wittgensteinian approach isolating religious discourse from public contestability, 34–5 Don Juan, Molière, 185

Eadmer, 162, 179 Edict of Nantes, revocation of, 191 edificatory uses of theistic proofs, 10, 154, 156 education

academic discipline, philosophy/philosophy of religion as (*See* philosophy/philosophy of religion)

British education in science and fondness for design argument, 217

France, educational institutions creating audience for Enlightenment in, 215–18

Germany, effects of principle of *cuius regio* eius religio on education in, 225

institutional requirements for rejuvenated study of philosophy of religion, 42

Edwards, Jonathan, 156, 172, 272, 275

Emerson, Ralph Waldo, 66

Emile, Rousseau, 201-2

empathy, practice of, 2-3

Encyclopédie Méthodique, Jefferson's contributions to, 19

England. See British philosophy, early-modern debate about God in

Enlightenment thought

Age of Enlightenment, not limited to, 223–4 assumptions about public and private religion essential to, 292–4, 306

Clayton on, 182-3

common acceptance of natural religion envisaged by, 293, 306–7

concept of 'Enlightenment project', 21, 63, 133-4, 182-3, 222-5

displacement of Enlightenment project of religion, rationality and God with religions, reasons and gods, 41–2

diversity ultimately rejected as irrational by, 63-4, 306

educational institutions creating audience for, 215–18

European manifestation in America and Jefferson as embodiment of, 17–20

human-rights discourse in tradition of, non-neutral and context-specific nature of, 76–7

modern pluralism, inability of Enlightenment concepts of reason to cope with, 30–2, 65, 74

natural religion and (*See* natural religion/natural theology) piety, theistic proofs cut off from, 133–4, 156

Protestant/Western bias of natural religion envisaged by, 29–30, 64

359

vada-tradition of philosophical debate in India differentiated from thought of, 40, 56-7

Enquiry concerning Human Understanding, Hume, 110, 112, 117, 254

epistemology theistic (*See* knowability of God(s)) *vada*-tradition of Indian philosophical debate, 53

European Enlightenment's manifestation in America, 17–20

European liberal thinking and beginnings of American Republic, 60

European mediaeval mentality, origins of modernity in, 245–6

evil, problem of

Hammon on, 264

Ramanuja and Hume compared, 118 evolution, Darwin's theory of, 268, 269–75 existence of God(s). *See also* theistic proofs evidence for God's existence, development of

evidence for God's existence, development of proofs as, 199–200,

220, 254

Findlay's ontological proof for necessary non-existence of God, 178

modern use and misuse of theistic proofs regarding, 176–80

purposes of theistic proofs and, 80, 169–72

Ramanuja and Hume not questioning, 114, 121 rise of atheism, reasons for, 210–12

theistic proofs contributing to doubts about, 26, 211, 314, 317

Udayana on, 149–51

experimental argument *a posteriori*. See design argument

expressive-explanatory use of design argument in Britain

Brooke, John Hedley, Clayton's use of theories of, 278–80

modern survival of argument attributed to, 272–5

before Paley, 280–8

Whewell, William, 275, 288–91 external versus internal relationship of God and world in Ramanuja and

Hume, 115, 127

extra-religious context of rationality in religion, 5

360 Index

falasifa (Islamic scholastic philosophy), 89-91, 94 rise of atheism, reasons for, 210-12 al-Farabi, 90, 138, 171 Rousseau's rational deism, 200, 201-2 Thomist-Aristotelian versus Cartesian Fénélon, François, 198 Fichte, Johann Gottlieb, 238, 241-3 method, 209-10 Fieser, James, 256, 257 Voltaire's rational deism, 200-1 Findlay, J. N., 178 Frost, Robert, 79 First Amendment of US Constitution, 22-3, 60 Funkenstein, Amos, 247 Flew, Anthony, 130, 131, 132 flower metaphor used by Udayana, 153-4 game theory and theistic proofs Clayton's thought on, 14-15 Forberg, Friedrich, 242-3 foreign travel and exploration language-game approach to philosophy atheism, seventeenth-century Western of religion, 34-5, 305-6 obsession with, 213-14 Ganeri, Jonardon, 131 China, Western exposure to culture and Gargi, 44 theology of, 93, 213, 228 Gaunilo, 163 'form of life', Clayton's concept of. See piety and general consensus, argument from, 191, 194, 200 theistic proofs generic God of theism, 41, 248 foundationalism. See also theistic proofs George III, 256 essential problem of, 245, 314 German philosophy, early-modern debate about Kant's thought and, 294-8 God in, 222-5 mediaeval versus modern mentality on Atheismusstreit, 228, 238, 240-4 sufficiency versus necessity of reason for Clayton's interest in, xi belief, 247-8 cuius regio eius religio, principle of, 225 purpose(s) of theistic proofs and, 298-300 distinctive cultural features compared to Francke, Auguste Hermann, 228 France or Britain, 224 Franklin, Benjamin, 18 Hume and, 256 Kant (See Kant, Immanuel) Frederick II, 228 freedom of religion leading to triumph of Leibniz and, 226-7 natural theology, fallacy of, 26-9, 213 lowered expectations regarding theistic proofs freethinking, 252 French philosophy, early-modern debate about Mendelssohn (See Mendelssohn, Moses) God in, 184 Pantheismusstreit, 238, 239-40 Bayle's Dictionnaire, presumption against pietism (See pietism in German philosophy) theism created by, 188-94 rationalism (See rationalism in German Catholic versus Protestant cultures, effects of philosophy) theistic arguments on, 221 scholasticism, pietistic and rationalist cultural possibility of atheism, 218-21 challenges to, 225-7 dialectical Other, atheist as, 214-15 University of Halle, debate between pietism and rationalism at, 228-31 Diderot, rational atheism of, 203-5, 206-8 distinctive cultural features compared to Wolff, classification and systematization of Germany or Britain, 224 philosophy and natural theology by, 228-31 educational institutions creating audience for, al-Ghazali apologetic interpretation by, 137 establishment of modern tension between rebiographical information, 134, 135-6 full name of, 135 ligion and science at end of Enlightenment, localized context-specific rationalities evidence, development of treatment of proofs as, 199–200, 220 nature of God according to, 141-2 d'Holbach, rational atheism of, 203, 205-8 rationality in religious contexts and, 7, 8, 10 Jansenists, Jesuits and Cartesians, problematic sacred texts, primary importance of, 136, effects of dispute between, 194-9 142-3, 158-9, 171 obsession with atheism in the seventeenth Sufi experience of, 136 theistic proofs century, 184-8, 212 cosmological argument used by al-Ghazali, pre-Enlightenment period, proofs redirected

136-7

at atheism in, 184-8



Index 361

historical survey of Islam's use of, 90, 91, 94 Green, T. H., 255 minor importance assigned to, 136, 142-3 Greene, Jack, 17 Griswold, Charles, 61 piety reflected in, 91, 135-43, 155-9 purpose of, 137-8, 142-3, 170, 171, 299 Grose, T. H., 255 rational proof alone not sufficient, 142 Udayana compared, 155-9 Habermas, Jürgen, 21 'unbelief' (takfir) of scholastic philosophers Hacker, Paul, 101 addressed by, 137-41 Halbfass, Wilhelm, 101-3, 108, 129-32 Gibbon, Edward, 259, 263 ha-Levi, 299-300 Giddens, Anthony, 301 Halle, debate between pietism and rationalism at University of, 228-31 Gitabhasya (Ramanuja), 106 God/s. See also atheism; non-theism; theism; Hamann, Johann Georg, 256 theistic proofs Hammon, William, 264, 285 Hanafi, 69 Anselm God addressed by, 169 Hanbali, 69 knowledge of God as aim of, 174-6 Haribhadra, 48-50, 51 otherness of God in perception of, 161-3, 176 Hartley, David, 261, 284 Aristotle, Islamic philosophers' concepts of Hartshorne, Charles, 166 God adapted from, 141 Hayter, Thomas, 256, 259, 260, 283 Enlightenment project of religion, rationality Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich, 244 and God displaced with religions, reasons Herder, Johann Gottfried, 21, 244 and gods, 41-2 hermeneutical use of theistic proofs, 8-9, 156, existence (See existence of God(s)) 158–9, 170–1 external versus internal relationship of Hick, John, 32-3, 131 God and world in Ramanuja and Hinduism. See also specific proponents and Hume, 115, 127 theories generic God of theism, 41, 248 apologetic use of Thomistic proofs by al-Ghazali, nature of God according to, 141-2 Christians against, 93 Indian beliefs and debates about, 149-51 Ayodhya, Islamic/Hindu accommodations in, Kant's use of theistic proofs to refine understanding of concept and nature of, 100, Hume's low esteem for, 109, 130, 132 178-80, 236, 302-5 origins of vada-tradition of Indian knowability of (See knowability of God(s)) philosophical debate in, 44-5 (See also Ramanuja and Hume compared vada-tradition of Indian philosophical conceptions of God, 114-15, 122 existence of God not questioned by either, self, Hindu versus Buddhist understanding of, 114, 121 38-40, 51, 53-6 external versus internal relationship of God theistic proofs as used in, 86-7 and world, 115, 127 Trinitarianism in, 295 on knowability of God, 113-14, 121-8 historical difference and location. See context; Udayana's concept of God, 146-8 otherness Goethe, Johann Wolfgang von, 241 d'Holbach, Paul-Henri Thiry, Baron, 189, 198, Gosthipurna, 107 199, 203, 205-6, 211, 314 Great Britain. See British philosophy, Holyoake, George, 271 early-modern debate about God in Home, Henry, Lord Kames, 105 Greek philosophical tradition Houtteville, Claude-François, 197 early-modern encounter with 'atheism' and Huguenots materialism of, 213 Bayle as, 191 sceptical fideism of, 186 Indian versus Aristotelian syllogism, 113, 157 prominence of theistic proofs in Hulse, John, 310-11 Western religions not solely attributable Hulsean Sermon, 310-11 human history and natural history, conflation of. to, 84-5 Shi'ite interest in, 137, 138 See providence, doctrine of human-rights discourse, 75-9 specifically religious ends of theistic proofs in, 9-10, 219, 220 Humboldt, Alexander von, 19

Hume, David

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-12627-4 - Religions, Reasons and Gods: Essays in Cross-Cultural Philosophy of Religion John Clayton Index More information

institutional requirements for rejuvenated study

of philosophy of religion, 42

362 Index

atheism as shocking to, 115, 212

on design argument internal versus external relationship of alternative analogy, Hume's failure to God and world in Ramanuja and provide, 268, 273 Hume, 115, 127 artisan-artifact analogy, 118 inter-religious context of rationality in religion, context of, and responses to, Hume's 5, 70-4 Enquiry and Dialogues, 253-65, 283-7 intra-traditional context continuing popularity in Britain despite, of rationality in religion, 5, 6, 248–9, 267, 268 69-70, 113-14 evil, problem of, 118 of theistic proofs, 5, 6-11, 157-8 natural theology as belief system Islam. See also specific proponents and theories undermined by, 26 apologetic use of Thomistic proofs against, 92 Ramanuja compared, 8, 115-20, 121-8 Ayodhya, Islamic/Hindu accommodations refutation of, 116-20, 248-9 survival despite critique of, 11 influence on Judaism and Christianity, 91 dialogue format used by, 103-5 kalam tradition, 44, 68-9, 70-1, 90, 95 Dialogues concerning Natural Religion, law's importance to, 135 103-6, 253-65 motion or change, argument from, 82, 83 Enquiry concerning Human Understanding, as nomocracy, 135 110, 112, 117, 254 Shi'ite belief, al-Ghazali's concerns regarding, existence of God not questioned by, 114, 121, 137-8 Sufism, 90, 136 identification of characters in dialogues theistic proofs as used in, 89-91, 94 of, 104-5 Israelis and Palestinians and 'common ground' India, Hume's low esteem for culture and fallacy, 59 thought of, 109, 130, 132 Jefferson's knowledge of, 25, 292 Jacobi, Friedrich Heinrich, 237, 239-40, 244 'On Miracles', 112, 256-8, 265 Jagannatha, 143 Ramanuja compared (See Ramanuja and Iaina Hume compared) non-theism of, 49, 149 on scepticism, 120 vada-tradition of, 45, 46, 47, 48-50, traditional Christian doctrines, attacks on, 212 69, 72 (See also vada-tradition of Huxley, Thomas Henry, 255, 271, 272 Indian philosophical debate) Hymn to Zeus, Cleanthes the Stoic, 127, 172 James II, 279 Jansenists, 186, 187, 188, 194, 198 Ibn Rushd (Averroes), 89, 90, 91, 171, 246 Japan, inter-religious accommodations in, 66 Ibn Sa'di, 70-1 Jayanta, 47–8, 51, 116, 132 Jefferson, Thomas, and natural religion, 16-17, Ibn Sina, 90, 91, 137, 138, 157, 171 ijma, 68, 69, 135 292-4 Clayton's thought on, xiii-xiv immediacy and accessibility of sacred texts, 101, 158-9, 173, 176, 300-1 Declaration of Independence, 22, 76, 77 on design argument, 25, 292 India. See also Buddhism; Hinduism diversity of religion (See under diversity of apologetic use of Thomistic proofs by religion and public life) Christians in, 93 Aristotelian versus Indian syllogism, 113, 157 early views, 19 Ayodhya, Islamic/Hindu accommodations in, European Enlightenment, Jefferson as embodiment of, 17–20 design argument in context of, 116 Jeffersonian project, 20-3 Hume's low esteem for culture and thought market forces theory of triumph of natural of, 109, 130, 132 religion, 26-9, 61-3 vada-tradition of philosophical debate personal religious views, validation of, (See vada-tradition of Indian philosophical 27-9, 62 debate) pluralism' in eighteenth-century America, value of studying philosophy of, 129-32 what constituted, 29, 64



> Index 363

positive or determinate religions versus biographical information and early life, 231, natural religion, denial of public space to, 21, 23, 24, 25-6, 61, 292-4 private nature of personal belief, 22-3 public space for religion (See under diversity of religion and public life) separation of church and state, 22-3, 60, 293 slavery, inconsistencies regarding, 20, 76-7 theistic proofs, 24, 25 tombstone, 22 'universal' religion, Protestant/Western/ 234-7 Enlightenment bias of concept of, 29-30, 64 University of Virginia, study of religion at, 23-5 vada-tradition of Indian philosophical debate in India differentiated from thought of, 40, 56-7 Virginia Statute for Religious Freedom, 22-3, 27, 65 Jerusalem Tract (Kitab ar-Risalah al-Qudsiyyah), al-Ghazali, 136, 142, 171 Jesuits in France, 187, 188, 192, 194-9, 201 Judaism. See also specific proponents and theories apologetic use of Thomistic proofs against, 92 Christian debate, pitfalls of, 71 'Enlightenment project' and, 133 Islam's influence on theistic proofs of, 91 kalam tradition and, 70-1 Mendelssohn and, 231, 237-8 Psalm 19, 312 Psalms in worship, 311-12 theistic proofs as used in, 91-8 jurisprudence 233-4 defensible difference in religious contexts resembling, 67 Islam, importance to, 135 kalam tradition and, 68-9 Psalm 19's praise of Law, 313 shari²a, 68–9, 140 justification. See also apologetical use of theistic proofs design argument in Britain, modern survival of, 272-5 rationality in religious contexts associated Kautiliya, 52 with function of, 3-6 kalam tradition in Islam, 44, 68-9, al-Kindi, 90 70-I, 90, 95 Kames, Lord (Henry Home), 105 Kant, Immanuel

on Cartesian proofs, 234, 235 categorical imperative, 297 classification and analysis of theistic proofs by, 234-7, 294-8 Clayton's thought on, xi, xv concept and nature of God, theistic proofs used to refine understanding of, 100, 178-80, 236, 302-5 development of thought on theistic proofs, different Kantian and anti-Kantian philosophical schools associated with, 240-4, 294 Enlightenment as defined by, 222 Enlightenment project, contributions to moving beyond, 294-8 Hume read by, 256 Jefferson's lack of knowledge of, 292 Mendelssohn and (See Mendelssohn, Moses) moral argument, 85 naming of proofs by, 116, 134, 165, 231, 234 ontological argument concept and nature of God, used to refine understanding of, 100, 178-80, 236 dependency of design and cosmological arguments on, 231 named by Kant, 165, 231, 234 refuted by, 177, 234, 235, 242, 244 Pantheismusstreit, 240 pietism and German expectations regarding theistic proofs, 226 Prussian Royal Academy essay competition, Psalm 19 and, 97, 316 public and private, Kantian construction of, rationality in religious contexts, 3 religious enthusiasts, suspicion of, 117 Schleiermacher on, 244 on transcendental proof, 235, 236 Whewell compared, 277 Wolff's influence on, 230, 231 *karma*, 88, 126, 147, 150 Kennedy, John, 17, 19 Kierkegaard, Søren, 11 Kirwan, Richard, 257 Kitab ar-Risalah al-Qudsiyyah (Jerusalem Tract), al-Ghazali, 136, 142, 171 Klimt, Gustav, xv

Atheismusstreit, 240-4



> Index 364

knowability of God(s). See also ontological argument Anselm on, 174-6 Bayle on, 192 Descartes on, 192 Halbfass and, 108 Ramanuja and Hume compared, 113-14, 121-8 sufficiency versus necessity of reason for, 247-8 Knutzen, Martin, 232 Köhnke, Klaus Christian, 294 Kors, Adam Charles, 211

La Méttrie, Julien Offray de, 201 Lamy, François, 196 Lanfranc, 166, 173 Lange, Joachim, 228 language-game approach to philosophy of religion, 34-5, 305-6 Laplace, Pierre-Simon, Marquis de, 204 Lash, Nicholas, 1 law. See jurisprudence Leibniz, Gottfried Wilhelm, 165, 193, 201, 213, 226-7, 229

Leland, John, 257 Lessing, Gotthold Ephraim, 238, 239-40 Lessius, Leonard, 185 l'Herminier, Nicolas, 197, 198

liberalism American liberalism, origins of, 60 common ground, problems with concept of,

diversity ultimately rejected as irrational by, secular nature of liberal state, 61

liberty in religion leading to triumph of natural theology, fallacy of, 26-9, 213 libraries, Hume on, 110

localized context-specific rationalities, diverse religions viewed as, 66-8, 307-9

location and difference, cultural and historical. See context; otherness

Locke, John, 6, 18, 76-7, 117, 199, 226, 232, 246-7, 250, 269 Lokayata. See Carvaka/Lokayata

Louis XIV, 191

Low Countries in pre-Enlightenment period, theistic proofs in, 184-8

Luther, Martin, 1, 98, 172, 247

M'Ewen, Bruce, 255 MacIntyre, Alasdair, 13, 21, 224, 293, 294 Madhva, 87, 150 Madhyamikas, 69, 70 Maimonides (Moses ben Maimon), 82, 91, 231

Major, John, 58 Malcolm, Norman, 166 Malebranche, Nicolas, 213 Maliki, 69 market forces theory of triumph of natural religion, 26-9, 61-3 Marty, Martin, 22 Mather, Cotton, 314, 317 Matilal, Bimal Krishna, 131 Mayhew, Henry, 271 mediaeval European mentality, origins of modernity in, 245-6 Mendelssohn, Moses

atheism, French obsession with, 188 biographical information and early life, 23I-2 Enlightenment according to, 222 Judaism of, 231, 237-8

Kant and comparison of, 233

Morgenstunden as counter-achievement to Critique, 240

Prussian Royal Academy essay competition, review of Kant's monograph by

Mendelssohn, 234 ontological proof of, 240, 244 pantheism controversy, 238, 239-40 Prussian Royal Academy essay competition,

on revealed religion and natural theology, 237-8

Wolffian classification of proofs used by, 231 Mersenne, Minim Marin, 185 Meslier, Jean, 188, 198-9, 200, 205, 210 Milbank, John, 5, 6–11

Milinda, 2, 72 Milner, Joseph, 256, 259–60, 283–4 Mimamsa

intra-traditional context of theistic proofs and, 114 non-theism of, 150

Ramanuja's refutation of, 106, 115, 122, 126 Udayana's refutation of, 149, 150, 152, 157 vada-tradition and, 46, 52, 73 (See also vada-tradition of Indian philosophical debate)

Mirabaud, Jean-Baptiste de, 207 miracles, Hume's attack on, 112, 256-8, 265 Mo Tzu, 85

modernity, origins of, 245-6 Molière, 185

monastic life in understanding of Anselm, contextual importance of, 166-8 Monroe, James, 20 Moore, James, 270, 271



Index

365

moral argument 'universal' concepts, Protestant/Western/ Anselm and, 172 Enlightenment bias of, 29-30, 64 Kant's version of, 85 Wolff's systematization and classification in non-Western religious traditions, 85 piety reflected in, 83, 84 natural selection, Darwin's theory of, 268, Mossner, Ernest Campbell, 105 motion or change, argument from natural world. See design argument; Psalm 19 nature of God/s. See God/s Bayle's rejection of, 192 context-specific nature of, 82-3 neo-Vedantan philosophy, 130-1 d'Holbach's attack on, 192 Nepal, inter-religious accommodations in, 66 Netherlands in pre-Enlightenment period, Rousseau's use of, 201, 202 Mu²adh, 68 theistic proofs in, 184-8 al-Mulk, Nizam, 135 Newton, Isaac, and Newtonian physics, 18, 116, mutakallimun (Islamic scholastic theology), 199, 204, 205-6, 217, 232 Nobili, Roberto de, 93, 94 89-91, 95 nomocracy, Islam as, 135 Nagarjuna, 102 non-theism of Buddhism, 40, 87-9, 149 Nagasena, 2, 72 Nahmanides (Moses ben Nahman), 71 of Carvaka/Lokayata, 149 Naigeon, Jacques-André, 208 Jainas, non-theism/transtheism of, 49, 149-50 Nantes, revocation of Edict of, 191 of Mimamsa, 150 Napoleon I, 208 Ramanuja and Hume compared regarding, nastika systems. See Buddhism; Carvaka/ 113–14, 115 Lokayata; Jaina; non-theism of Samkhya, 150 Native Americans, University of Virginia chair in Udayana's India, 149–51 for mission to, 24 of Yoga (philosophical school), 150 The Natural History of Religion (David Hume), Nyayakusumanjali. See Udayana Nyaya/Naiyayika. See also Udayana; 109, 117 natural religion/natural theology vada-tradition of Indian philosophical debate Clayton's thought on, xiii analytical philosophy as Western common acceptance, Enlightenment assumption of, 293, 306-7 Nyaya, 129 Darwin's theories and, 269-75 on design argument, 116 d'Holbach's denial of, 205-6 intra-traditional context of theistic proofs and, displacement of Enlightenment project of religion, rationality and neo-Vedantan philosophy ignoring, 131 God with religions, reasons and Ramanuja's refutation of, 106, 115 gods, 41 theism of, 149-51 diverse groups, as mediator between, 11 vada-tradition and, 38-40, 46, 47-8, 52, 73 Hume's Dialogues on (see Hume, David; Ramanuja and Hume compared) objectivism, 11 Jeffersonian (see Jefferson, Thomas, and Ogilvie, John, 286-7 natural religion) O'Neill, Onora, 294, 295 localized context-specific rationalities, diverse ontological argument. See also knowability religions viewed as, 307 of God/s market forces theory of triumph of, Anselm's version (See Anselm) Cartesian version, 192, 206 26-9, 61-3 for Mendelssohn, 238 context-specific nature of, 81 positive or determinate religions versus continuing potency of, 242, 244 Enlightenment project distinguishing dependency of design and cosmological between, 223, 292-4, 306 arguments on, 231 Findlay's ontological proof for necessary Jeffersonian project's denial of public space to positive religions, 21, 23, 24, 25-6, 61, non-existence of God, 178 292-4 Hegel's, 244

d'Holbach's use of, 206

Psalm 19 as early form of, 97



366 Index

ontological argument (cont.) Kant on (See Kant, Immanuel) Leibniz's proof from possibility, 227, 234 Mendelssohn's, 240, 244 named by Kant, 165, 231, 234 in non-Western religious traditions, 85 piety reflected in, 83, 84, 97 Wolff's systematization of, 230 order, argument from. See design argument Origin of Species, Darwin, 268, 269-75 otherness Anselm otherness of Anselm from modern world, otherness of God in perception of, 161-3, 176 atheism and (See atheism) Clayton's preoccupation with concepts of, x of God in Anselm, 161-3, 176 Jeffersonian natural theology viewed as eventually overcoming, 26 past, sense of otherness of, x-xi practice of philosophy/philosophy of religion and, 2 respect for the Other combined with possibility of public discourse, 35-6, 43 in vada-tradition of Indian philosophical discourse, 35-6, 40, 44 Outram, Dorinda, 280 Palestinians and Israelis and 'common-ground' fallacy, 59 Paley, William Anselm and, 178 belief that natural order requires explanation, classical statement of design argument by, 249-50, 265-9 Darwin's fondness for, 269-71 German philosophy and, 238 reasons for success of position on design argument, 274 social order and natural order interwoven

canons, philosophical, 107-8 Clayton's interest in integrating with historical sociology, 183 comparative (See comparative philosophy of religion) displacement of Enlightenment project of religion, rationality, and God with religions, reasons, and gods, 41-2 Enlightenment project and aims of, 224 Greek tradition (See Greek philosophical tradition) history and development as academic disciplines, xiv-xvi Indian vada-tradition of philosophical debate (See vada-tradition of Indian philosophical institutional requirements for rejuvenated study of, 42 localized context-specific rationalities, use of, 66-8, 308-9 professionalization of, 229 systematization of, 229-31 'universal' concepts, Protestant/Western/ Enlightenment bias of, 29-30, 64 window cleaning, principles akin to, 1-3 Wittgensteinian approach isolating religious discourse from public contestability, 34-5 physico-theology, 116, 127, 227, 231, 275, 297, 298. See also design argument physics (sciences) as best antidote to atheism, 207 British tendency to mix science and religion, Clayton's use of Brooke's theories on, Cartesians versus Aristotelians regarding, 195 design argument's adaptability to, 272 educational institutions creating audience for Enlightenment, 215-18 establishment of modern tension between religion and science at end of Enlightenment, 206–8 Newtonian, 18, 116, 199, 204, 205-6, 217 pietism in German philosophy Jacobi, 237, 239-40, 244 Kantian theory, interest in, 242 principles and origins, 225 Schleiermacher's self-stylization, 244 scholasticism challenged by, 225-7 University of Halle, debate between pietism and rationalism at, 228-31 piety and theistic proofs, 133-5 Clayton's interest in, 100 'Enlightenment project' divorcing theistic proofs from spiritual context, 133-4, 156

analytical philosophy, Clayton on, 129-31

by, 265-9, 315

Whewell compared, 275

Parisuddhi (Udayana), 145

Patanjali, 146

Paul (apostle), 247

Vince narrowly preceding, 257

Pascal, Blaise, 186-7, 193, 197, 203

Peace of Westphalia (1648), 225

philosophy/philosophy of religion accessibility of texts, 101

pantheism, 187, 206, 227, 238, 239-40



Index

367

al-Ghazali, 91, 135-43, 155-9 (See also Wittgensteinian approach isolating religious al-Ghazali) discourse from public contestability, 34-5 in Islam, 91 property-location logic versus subject-predicate strong relationship between, 83-4 logic, 113 Proslogion. See Anselm Udayana, 10, 143–59 (See also Udayana) pitakas, 45, 69 Protestantism Plantinga, Alvin, 167 Calvinism Platonic dialogue, 103-4 Adams and Jefferson on, 25 pluralism, religious. See diversity of religion and Bayle influenced by, 192, 193 public life Huguenots polemics (correction of deviant or defective Bayle as, 191 beliefs within a community), 7-8, 94, 170 sceptical fideism of, 186 political events encouraging particularly British Jeffersonian universal natural religion, approach to natural theology, 279 Protestant/Western/Enlightenment political expression of rational deism/atheism in bias of, 29-30, 64 France, 208 theistic proofs affecting Protestant and political imbalance and defensible difference, Catholic cultures differently, 221 unbelief or infidelity in Catholic countries as 70-I, 72 political order, ramifications of Paley's atheism, but in Protestant countries as explication of design argument for, 267 theism, 292 political separation of church and state in providence (human history and natural history Jeffersonian project, 22-3, 60, 293 interwoven), doctrine of political theology, natural theology for Darwin's observations refuting, 269-75 Mendelssohn as type of, 238 Hammon on, 264 Pope, Alexander, Kant's attribution of Cartesian Paley's espousal of, 252-3, 265-9 proof a priori to, 234 Psalm 19 and, 315 Porter, Roy, 279 Psalm 8, 312 positive or determinate religions Psalm 19 Enlightenment project distinguishing between Anselm and, 172 natural religion and, 223, edited together from two separate hymns, 292-4, 306 312-14 Jeffersonian project's denial of public space to, Hulsean Sermon, as focus of, 311 Hulsean Sermon on, 312-17 21, 23, 24, 25-6, 61, 292-4 possibility, argument from. See ontological in Jewish and Christian worship, 312 argument Law portion, 313 Powell, Enoch, 30 modern perspectives contrasted with pragmatism, 3, 11 Psalmist's vision, 314–17 pramanas, 53 as praise hymn, 312 presumption of theism The Spacious Firmament (Addison), 84, 97, Bayle's Dictionnaire overturning, 188-94 156, 172, 252, 272, 282, 313 early-modern British shift away from, 285 sun/nature/creation portion, 313 Enlightenment destruction as theistic theistic proofs using, 83, 84, 96-8 proof, 191 Psalm 51, 312 Leibniz's argument from, 227 Psalm 89, 312 Rousseau's preservation of, 202 Psalm 90, 96 Priestley, Joseph, 28, 104, 256, 259, 260-4, 284-5 Psalm 104:24, 281 privatization of religious belief Psalm 119, 312 community, effect on, 61 Psalm 148, 312, 313 Enlightenment assumptions regarding, Psalms generally 292-4, 306 Anselm's development of ontological Jeffersonian project of, 22-3, 292-4 argument and recitation of, 173-4 for Mendelssohn, 238 in Jewish and Christian worship, 311-12 ʻpseudo-Samkara', 50−1 origins and history of, 59-62 personal belief, Jefferson's contribution to public space and religious pluralism. See diversity concept of privacy of, 22-3 of religion and public life

> Index 368

Puritans, 317 Purva-Mimamsa, 52, 73

quantifier-shift fallacy of 'same Ultimate Reality' argument, 32-4

Radhakrishnan, Sarvepalli, 130, 131 Ramanuja

causality as analysed by, 126 Clayton's interest in, xv

presentation of alternative views by, 106

rhetorical strategies of, 105-7

theistic proofs

body-soul model, 125

design argument, 121-8

intra-traditional context of, 113-14

opposition to, 85, 86, 103, 112, 299-300 used to aid proper interpretation of sacred

texts by, 8-9, 170

Udayana and, 114, 116, 149

Yamuna tradition, writing within constraints of, 106

Ramanuja and Hume compared, 100

anticipation of Hume by Ramanuja, 8, 132

on belief, 112, 115

canonical status, 107-8

conceptions of God, 114-15, 122

on design argument, 8, 115-20, 121-8

dialogic comparison method, 101-3

dialogues engaged in by, 103-6

differences in historically dominant religious models for, 113-14

ends, reasons in sense of, 112, 128

evil, problem of, 118

existence of God not questioned by either,

external versus internal relationship of God

and world, 115, 127

grounds, reasons in sense of, 112, 128

on inference and experience, 110-12

on knowability of God, 113-14, 121-8

non-theism/atheism, 113-14, 115

purposes and ends of each, 103-12

suspicion of theistic proofs by rational means

alone, 103, 112

syllogism, Indian versus Aristotelian, 113 ratio anselmi. See Anselm; ontological argument rational atheism of Diderot and d'Holbach,

rational deism of Voltaire and Rousseau,

rational religion. See natural religion rationalism in German philosophy

Leibniz's rationalism, 226-7 scholasticism challenged by, 225-7

University of Halle, debate between pietism and rationalism at, 228-31

rationalism in pre-Enlightenment France and Netherlands, 186

rationality in religious contexts

Bayle's suspicions as to power of reason to settle religious questions, 192, 193

community solidarity, expressing, 10-11

displacement of Enlightenment project of religion, rationality and God with reli-

gions, reasons and gods, 41

diverse contexts of religious claims,

importance of considering, 4-7

diversity ultimately rejected as irrational in Jeffersonian/Enlightenment/liberal model,

63-4, 306

'Enlightenment project' and, 21, 182-3, 222-5

extra-religious context, 5 inter-religious context, 5

intra-traditional context, 5, 6-11

Jansenist doubts about, 195

justification, association with, 3-6

Kantian view of, 294-8

localized context-specific rationalities,

diverse religions viewed as, 66-8, 307-9

Locke's principles of, 246-7

modern pluralism, inability of Enlightenment concepts of reason to cope with, 30-2, 65,

Ramanuja and Hume compared, 110-12, 128 sufficiency versus necessity of reason for belief,

syllogism, Indian versus Aristotelian,

113, 157

theistic proofs (See theistic proofs)

Raven, Charles, 250, 281

Rawlsians, 58

Ray, John, 156, 250-1, 272, 275, 278, 280-2, 283

reason. See rationality in religious contexts

regularity in nature, argument from. See design argument

Reinbeck, Johann Gustav, 232

Reinhold, Karl Leonard, 241, 242

relativism, 11, 77

religious belief and human rights, perceived

disconnection between, 75-6

religious freedom leading to triumph of natural theology, fallacy of, 26-9, 213

religious life and experience. See piety and theistic proofs

reticence, maxim of, 2-3

revealed religion. See also sacred texts

for Kant, 236

Locke versus Thomas Aquinas on, 246-7



Index 369

for Mendelssohn, 237–8	of Pascal, 186–7
Psalm 19, modern perspectives contrasted	in pre-Enlightenment France and
with Psalmist's vision in, 314–17 (See also	Netherlands, 186, 190
Psalm 19)	Rousseau's inversion of, 202
Ricci, Matteo, 93, 213	Schleiermacher, Friedrich, 244
rights discourse, 75–9	scholasticism, Christian
Robespierre, Maximilien de, 208	Cartesians versus, 195
Roman Catholicism. See Catholicism	German philosophy, pietistic and
Rorty, Richard, xiii, 10, 23, 171, 224, 294	rationalist challenges to scholasticism in,
Rousseau, Jean-Jacques, 200, 201–2	225-7
	intra-traditional rather than inter-religious
Saadya Gaon (Saadya ben Joseph), 7, 94, 95–6,	discourse of, 44
170, 308	metaphysics dominated through eighteenth
sacred texts	century by, 195
accessibility and immediacy of texts, 101,	Wolff's systematization of philosophy as
158–9, 173, 176, 300–1	emblematic of, 229
Anselm's ontological proof and Psalms,	scholasticism, Islamic
173–4, 301	takfir ('unbelief') of scholastic
al-Ghazali, primary importance to, 136, 142–3,	philosophers as main concern of
158–9, 171	al-Ghazali, 137–41
for Kant, 236	theistic proofs as used by, 89–91, 94
Mather on book of nature and book of	sciences. See physics
scripture, 314, 317	secular nature of liberal state, 61
for Mendelssohn, 237–8	self, Buddhist versus Hindu understanding of,
modern disembeddedness from, 300-1	38–40, 51, 53–6
theistic proofs used to aid proper	separation of church and state in Jeffersonian
interpretation of (hermeneutics), 8-9, 156,	project, 22–3, 60, 293
158–9, 170–1	al-Shafi²i, 69, 135
Udayana, primary importance to, 145,	Shankara. See Samkara
148–9, 158–9, 301	Shapiro, Barbara J., 253
salvific purpose of argument for Udayana,	shari'a, 68–9, 140
151–2, 154	Shi'ite belief, al-Ghazali's concerns regarding,
'same Ultimate Reality' argument,	137–8
quantifier-shift fallacy of, 32-4	slavery, 20, 76–7
Samkara	Sloane, Sir Hans, 251
Anselm and, 170	Smart, Ninian, 81, 131
Jefferson and, 50–1	Smith, Adam, 61–3, 254
piety and theistic proofs, 150	Smith, Norman Kemp, 108
Ramanuja and Hume compared, 102, 108, 121,	Smithers, Peter, 251
122, 123, 127	social order and natural order, conflation of.
rationality in religious contexts and, 9	See providence, doctrine of
Samkhya	Socrates, 1, 9, 10, 172, 219, 220
non-theism of, 150	Socratic dialogue, 103–4
vada-tradition and, 46, 52, 73 (See also vada-	The Spacious Firmament (Addison), 84, 97, 156
tradition of Indian philosophical debate)	172, 252, 272, 282, 313
Sankara. See Samkara	special relationship between Britain and
Sarvasiddhantasamgraha, 50–1	America, 19
Sa-skya Pandita (Sa-pan), 51, 53, 74, 104	Spinoza, Benedict, 187–8, 190–1
Saunderson, Nicholas, 203-4	atheism, Spinozism equated with, 127, 187,
Sautrantikas, 70	I90-I
sceptical fideism, 186	Bayle and, 190–1
scepticism	Deus sive natura, 127, 204, 239
Bayle and, 190, 193	Diderot and d'Holbach, 204, 206
Hume on, 120	Leibniz and, 226, 227
of Jansenists, 197	pantheism and, 187, 206, 227, 239-40



370

Spinoza, Benedict (cont.) parallels drawn between Chinese and, 214-15 Schleiermacher on, 244 spirituality. See piety and theistic proofs Sribhasya. See Ramanuja Srivaisnavas, 107 Stanton Lectures, ix-x, 209 Stewart, M. A., 105 Stoics, 9 Strato, 8, 95, 170 subject-predicate logic versus property-location logic, 113 Sufism, 90, 136 syllogism, Indian versus Aristotelian, 113, 157 systematization of philosophy/philosophy of religion, 229-31

takfir ('unbelief') of scholastic philosophers as main concern of al-Ghazali, 137–41 teleological argument. See design argument Tennant, F. R., 274 Texas Securities Act, 42 theism in philosophy of religion, need to displace, 4I–2

unbelief or infidelity in Catholic countries as atheism, but in Protestant countries as theism, 292 theistic disproofs

in Buddhism, 87–9

proofs subverted as, 178, 302, 314

theistic proofs. *See also* specific types, e.g. design argument

all major religious traditions featuring, 84–5 apologetics (*See* apologetical use of theistic proofs)

Aristotle's influence on, 82, 90, 91, 93, 94, 95, 170

awe or wonder, used to express, 96–8, 172, 316 (*See also* expressive-explanatory use of design argument in Britain)

in British philosophy (*See* British philosophy, early-modern debate about God in)

Buddhist a-theism, 87–9

in Christianity, 91–8

as comparative grammar, 305-6

concept and nature of God, Kant's use of theistic proofs to refine understanding of, 100, 178–80, 236, 302–5

as confirmation of matters of faith, 95-6, 171, 175

context, importance of, 81–3, 133–4, 156 as correction of deviant or defective beliefs within a community (polemics), 7–8, 94, 170

Index

devotional use of, 152-5, 156, 171 disproofs, used as, 178, 302, 314 doubts about existence of God/s created by, 26, 211, 314, 317 edificatory (community solidarity) uses of, 10-11, 154, 156, 171 evidence for God's existence, development of proofs as, 199-200, 220, 254 in French philosophy (See French philosophy, early-modern debate about God in) in German philosophy (See German philosophy, early-modern debate about God in) al-Ghazali's use of (See al-Ghazali) in Greek philosophical tradition, 9–10, 219, 220 Hindu versus Buddhist understanding of self in Hinduism, 86-7 historical survey of religious traditions making use of, 85-98 intra-traditional context of, 5, 6-11, 157-8 in Islam, 89-91 Jefferson and, 24, 25 in Judaism, 91-8 of Leibniz, 227 localized context-specific rationalities, diverse religions viewed as, 66-8, 307-9 modern use and misuse of, 176-80, 247-8, 301-2, 305-6 modern versus pre-modern understanding of, 10-11, 14, 91, 133-4, 159-60, 169, 182-3 as moves within religious language games (See game theory and theistic proofs) opposition to use of, 85, 103, 112, 299-300 pietism and lowered expectations regarding, 225 piety reflected in (See piety and theistic proofs) purposes of, 80, 169-72, 298-300 for Anselm, 169, 172-5 British use of design argument, 272-5 for al-Ghazali, 137-8, 142-3, 170, 171 Kant's use of theistic proofs to refine understanding of concept and nature of God, 100, 178-80, 236, 302-5 modern use and misuse, 176-80 pre-modern versus modern approaches to, 10-11, 14, 91, 133-4, 159-60, 169 for those endorsing use, 299 for those repudiating use, 299-300 for Udayana, 151-5, 154, 171 Ramanuja and (See Ramanuja) sacred texts, proper interpretation of (hermeneutics), 8-9, 156, 158-9, 170-1 specifically religious significance of, 80-5



Index

vada-tradition of Indian philosophical debate sufficiency versus necessity of reason for belief, contestability rather than neutrality as price of Udayana and (See Udayana) entry into, 40, 72 Wolff's systematization and classification of, devotional nature of argument for Udayana, 229-31, 230 152-5 thinkability of God/s. See knowability of God/s; epistemology of, 35-41, 43-4, 53 as inter-traditional discourse system, 71-4 ontological argument Thomas Aquinas, 6-7, 82-3, 91, 92, 191, 196, as intra-religious discourse system, 69-70 209-10, 247, 300 Thomasius, Christian, 228 Tillich, Paul, 12 origins of, 44-5 Tocqueville, Alexis de, 17 tolerance, concept of, 43, 220 Tournemine, René-Joseph, 198 151-2, 154 transcendental proof of Kant, 235, 236 Trinitarianism 38-40, 51, 53-6 Jefferson's rejection of, 27-9 Kantian appeal to, 295 India, 44 Troeltsch, Ernst, xii correspondence theories of, xiii, 3 lefferson on, 19 winners and losers in, 72 practice of philosophy/philosophy of religion Vaisesika and, 2, 3 theism of, 149–51 Udayana Vasubandhu, 45 beliefs and concept of God, 146-8 biographical information, 134, 143-6 Vedanta existence of God in India of, beliefs and debates about, 149–51 flower metaphor used by, 153-4 theism of, 150 legends associated with, 143-6 Udayana and, 146 Ramanuja and, 114, 116, 149 religious pluralism in India of, 151 philosophical debate) sacred texts, primary importance of, 145, 148-9, 158-9, 301 Vedanta-Sutras, 8, 121-8 theistic proofs Vince, Samuel, 257 apologetic purpose, 154 devotional nature of, 152-5, 156, 171 27, 65 for edification of faithful, 154, 156 Visuddhimagga, 33 endorsement of use of, 299 Voltaire, 189, 199, 200–1 al-Ghazali compared, 155-9 historical survey of proofs in India, 85, 86 Weigel, Erhard, 227 piety reflected in, 10, 143-59 salvific purpose of, 151-2, 154 types of proofs used by Udayana, 148-9

Jeffersonian/Enlightenment thought differentiated from, 40, 56-7 otherness as treated in, 35-6, 40, 44 salvific purpose of argument for Udayana, self, Buddhist versus Hindu understanding of, sustained experience of religious pluralism in tradition-constituted nature of, 53-6 tradition-constituting nature of, 45-53, 73-4 Udayana and, 38-40, 53-6, 151-2 vada-tradition and, 46, 52, 73 (See also vadatradition of Indian philosophical debate) neo-Vedantan philosophy, 130–1 Ramanuja and, 106, 115, 121–8 vada-tradition and, 38-40, 46, 47, 50-1, 52, 53-6, 73 (See also vada-tradition of Indian Virginia Statute for Religious Freedom, 22-3, Westphalia, Peace of (1648), 225 Whewell, William, 249, 275–7, 288–91, 299 Whiston, William, 252 Wilkins, John, 253 window cleaning, principles of practising philosophy/philosophy of religion akin to, 1-3 Wittgensteinian philosophy of religion Clayton's thought and, xiii, 14, 15 isolation of religious discourse from public contestability by, 34-5 theistic proofs, aversion to, 81

vada-tradition and, 38-40, 53-6, 151-2

Unitarianism, Jefferson's attraction to, 27-9

Universal Declaration of Human Rights, 77

'universal' religious concepts, Protestant/

Western/Enlightenment bias of,

universal consensus, argument from, 191, 194, 200

United States. See America

Upanisads, 8, 44, 112, 121-8

29-30, 64

37I



372

Wolff, Christian, 228–31, 239 wonder or awe, theistic proofs used to express, 96–8, 172, 316 (*See also* expressive-explanatory use of design argument in Britain)

Xenophon, 10, 220

Index

Yamuna, 106, 107 Yandell, Keith, 131 Yoga (philosophical school) non-theism of, 150 vada-tradition and, 46, 52, 73 (See also vada-tradition of Indian philosophical debate)