Private Health Insurance

Can private health insurance fill gaps in publicly financed coverage? Does it enhance access to health care or improve efficiency in health service delivery? Will it provide fiscal relief for governments struggling to raise public revenue for health? This book examines the successes, failures and challenges of private health insurance globally through country case studies written by leading national experts. Each case study considers the role of history and politics in shaping private health insurance and determining its impact on health system performance. Despite great diversity in the size and functioning of markets for private health insurance, the book identifies clear patterns across countries, drawing out valuable lessons for policymakers while showing how history and politics have proved a persistent barrier to effective public policy.

This title is also available as Open Access on Cambridge Core.

Sarah Thomson is a Senior Health Financing Specialist at the WHO Barcelona Office for Health Systems Strengthening.

Anna Sagan is a Research Fellow at the European Observatory on Health Systems and Policies.

Elias Mossialos is Brian Abel-Smith Professor of Health Policy, Head of the Department of Health Policy and Director of LSE Health at the London School of Economics and Political Science.
European Observatory on Health Systems and Policies

The volumes in this series focus on topical issues around the transformation of health systems in Europe, a process being driven by a changing environment, increasing pressures and evolving needs.

Drawing on available evidence, existing experience and conceptual thinking, these studies aim to provide both practical and policy-relevant information and lessons on how to implement change to make health systems more equitable, effective and efficient. They are designed to promote and support evidence-informed policy-making in the health sector and will be a valuable resource for all those involved in developing, assessing or analysing health systems and policies.

In addition to policy-makers, stakeholders and researchers in the field of health policy, key audiences outside the health sector will also find this series invaluable for understanding the complex choices and challenges that health systems face today.

Series Editors

JOSEP FIGUERAS Director, European Observatory on Health Systems and Policies

MARTIN MCKEE Co-Director, European Observatory on Health Systems and Policies, and Professor of European Public Health at the London School of Hygiene & Tropical Medicine

ELIAS MOSSIALOS Co-Director, European Observatory on Health Systems and Policies, and Brian Abel-Smith Professor of Health Policy, London School of Economics and Political Science

REINHARD BUSSE Co-Director, European Observatory on Health Systems and Policies, and Head of the Department of Health Care Management, Berlin University of Technology
Private Health Insurance

History, Politics and Performance

Edited by

SARAH THOMSON
WHO Barcelona Office for Health Systems Strengthening

ANNA SAGAN
European Observatory on Health Systems and Policies, London School of Economics and Political Science, London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine

ELIAS MOSSIALOS
London School of Economics and Political Science
The European Observatory on Health Systems and Policies supports and promotes evidence-based health policy-making through comprehensive and rigorous analysis of health systems in Europe. It brings together a wide range of policy-makers, academics and practitioners to analyse trends in health reform, drawing on experience from across Europe to illuminate policy issues.

The European Observatory on Health Systems and Policies is a partnership hosted by the World Health Organization Regional Office for Europe, which includes the Governments of Austria, Belgium, Finland, Ireland, Norway, Slovenia, Spain, Sweden, Switzerland, the United Kingdom, and the Veneto Region of Italy; the European Commission; the World Bank; UNCAM (French National Union of Health Insurance Funds); the Health Foundation; the London School of Economics and Political Science; and the London School of Hygiene & Tropical Medicine. The Observatory has a secretariat in Brussels and it has hubs in London (at LSE and LSHTM) and at the Berlin University of Technology.
Copyright © World Health Organization (acting as the host organization for, and secretariat of, the European Observatory on Health Systems and Policies) (2020).

All rights reserved.

The European Observatory on Health Systems and Policies welcomes requests for permission to reproduce or translate its publications, in part or in full. Contact us at contact@obs.who.int

The designations employed and the presentation of the material in this publication do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the European Observatory on Health Systems and Policies concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. The mention of specific companies or of certain manufacturers’ products does not imply that they are endorsed or recommended by the European Observatory on Health Systems and Policies in preference to others of a similar nature that are not mentioned. Errors and omissions excepted, the names of proprietary products are distinguished by initial capital letters.

All reasonable precautions have been taken by the European Observatory on Health Systems and Policies to verify the information contained in this publication. However, the published material is being distributed without warranty of any kind, either express or implied. The responsibility for the interpretation and use of the material lies with the reader. In no event shall the European Observatory on Health Systems and Policies be liable for damages arising from its use. The views expressed by authors, editors, or expert groups do not necessarily represent the decisions or the stated policy of the European Observatory on Health Systems and Policies or any of its partners.

A catalogue record of this book is available from the British Library.
Contents

List of Figures page ix
List of Tables xi
List of Boxes xiii
Acknowledgements xiv
List of Contributors xv

1 Why private health insurance?
   Sarah Thomson, Anna Sagan, Elias Mossialos 1

2 Private finance publicly subsidized: the case of Australian health insurance
   Jane Hall, Denzil G. Fiebig and Kees van Gool 41

3 Private health insurance in Brazil, Egypt and India
   Maria Dolores Montoya Diaz, Noah Haber, Philipa Mladovsky, Emma Pitchforth, Wael Fayek Saleh and Flavia Mori Sarti 65

4 Private health insurance in Canada
   Jeremiah Hurley and G. Emmanuel Guindon 99

5 Regulating private health insurance: France’s attempt at getting it all
   Agnès Couffinhal and Carine Franc 142

6 Statutory and private health insurance in Germany and Chile: two stories of coexistence and conflict
   Stefanie Ettelt and Andres Roman-Urrestarazu 180

7 Uncovering the complex role of private health insurance in Ireland
   Brian Turner and Samantha Smith 221
Contents

8 Integrating public and private insurance in the Israeli health system: an attempt to reconcile conflicting values
Shuli Brammli-Greenberg and Ruth Waitzberg 264

9 Private health insurance in Japan, Republic of Korea and Taiwan, China
Soonman Kwon, Naoki Ikegami and Yue-Chune Lee 304

10 The role of private health insurance in financing health care in Kenya
David Muthaka 325

11 Private health insurance in the Netherlands
Hans Maarse and Patrick Jeurissen 349

12 The challenges of pursuing private health insurance in low- and middle-income countries: lessons from South Africa
Di McIntyre and Heather McLeod 377

13 Undermining risk pooling by individualizing benefits: the use of medical savings accounts in South Africa
Heather McLeod and Di McIntyre 414

14 Consumer-driven health insurance in Switzerland, where politics is governed by federalism and direct democracy
Luca Crivelli 446

15 Regression to the increasingly mean? Private health insurance in the United States of America
Lawrence D. Brown and Sherry A. Glied 494

16 Health savings accounts in the United States of America
Sherry A. Glied, Dan P. Ly and Lawrence D. Brown 525

Index 552
Figures

1.1 Voluntary private health insurance as a share (%) of current spending on health globally by country income group, 2017

1.2 Countries globally in which voluntary and compulsory private health insurance accounts for at least 10% of current spending on health, 2017

1.3 Relationship between out-of-pocket payments as a share of current spending on health and voluntary private health insurance and public spending on health globally, 2017

1.4 Share (%) of the population covered by private health insurance in the countries in this volume by role, latest year available

3.1 Number of beneficiaries of private health insurance plans in Brazil by type of insurance provider, 2011–2016

3.2 Beneficiaries of health care plans in Brazil by type of contract, 2009–2016

3.3 Private health insurance coverage rates in Brazil, by state (% of population), September 2016

7.1 Consumer attitudes to private health insurance in Ireland, 2009–2015 (selected years)

7.2 Composition of health care resource allocation for different entitlement groups in Ireland, 2004

8.1 Public and private health insurance coverage in Israel, 2016

8.2 Sources of health care funding in Israel (percentage of total), 2015

8.3 Expenditure on private health insurance in Israel in per capita purchasing power parity US$ (2006 = 100), 2006–2013
List of Figures

8.4 Household expenditure on private health insurance in Israel (premiums and co-payments) as a share of total household expenditure on health, 2000–2014

8.5 Public expenditure on health and confidence in the health system in Israel and selected OECD countries, 2012

10.1 Cost-sharing revenue as a share (%) of total expenditure of Kenyan Ministry of Health, 2001/2002 to 2008/2009

10.2 Breakdown of private expenditure on health in Kenya, 2004–2015

11.1 Health insurance in the Netherlands after the 2006 reform

11.2 Number of insurers in the Netherlands, 1994–2016

11.3 Average growth rates in health care expenditure in the Netherlands, 2000–2015

13.1 Generic benefit design in medical schemes in South Africa in the mid-2000s

13.2 Number of beneficiaries in open and restricted medical schemes in South Africa, 1997–2015

13.3 Personal medical savings account expenditures in South Africa by benefit category, 2014

14.1 Health care financing in Switzerland in 2014

14.2a Change in net premiums as a percentage of disposable income (Swiss average and cantons with lowest and highest incidence), 1998–2014

14.2b Shape of the 2011 net insurance premium incidence for a couple living in Ticino

14.3a Number of sickness funds in Switzerland, 1915–2015

14.3b Market share of the largest insurers and holdings in Switzerland, 1996–2015

14.4 Correlation of cantonal results in the 2007 and 2008 popular ballots in Switzerland
### Tables

1.1 Private health insurance (PHI) roles  
1.2 Overview of spending on health in the countries in this volume, 2017  
1.3 Examples of measures to ensure voluntary private health insurance is accessible, affordable and offers quality coverage  
3.1 Private health insurance claims ratios and average monthly revenues in Brazil according to insurer size, 2009 and 2016  
3.2 Private health insurance coverage among Brazilian population by income quintile, 1998–2013  
3.3 Regional private health insurance coverage rates in Brazil by region (% of regional population), 2000–2016 (selected years)  
4.1 Health care spending in Canada by source of funds, 2013  
4.2 Private health spending in Canada, 2012  
4.3 Private health insurance products in Canada, 2014  
5.1 User charges for publicly financed health care in France, 2016  
5.2 Health care financing by source of funds in France, 2015  
5.3 Key features of the French private health insurance market, 2014  
6.1 Development and regulation of private health insurance in Germany and Chile, 1970–2016  
6.2 Health status and health care use among the publicly and privately insured in Germany, 2006  
6.3 Characteristics, health status and health care use among the publicly and privately insured in Chile, 2006  
7.1 Maximum permitted waiting periods for private health insurance benefits in Ireland before 2015  
8.1 Breakdown of private health care expenditure in Israel, 2013
List of Tables

8.2 Key features of the National Health Insurance and private health insurance in Israel, 2017 272
8.3 Share of the adult population (22+) with private health insurance in Israel, 1999–2016 275
8.4 Development of supplemental and commercial insurance markets in Israel, 1933–2017 285
9.1 Health financing indicators in Japan, Republic of Korea and Taiwan, China, 2015 305
9.2 Organization of the health systems in Japan, Republic of Korea and Taiwan, China, 2016 306
9.3 Key features of the private health insurance markets in Japan, Republic of Korea and Taiwan, China, 2016 308
10.1 Total expenditure on health in Kenya, 2001/2002 to 2012/2013 327
10.2 National Hospital Insurance Fund revenues from contributions and benefits paid out in Kenya, 2008/2009 to 2014/2015 331
10.3 Distribution of insured people by the type of health insurance coverage and region in Kenya, 2013 335
10.4 Private health insurance market structure and regulation in Kenya, 2016 338
10.5 Range of premiums for private health insurance charged by selected insurance companies in Kenya, 2016 342
11.1 Health insurance population shares in the Netherlands (%), 1990–2005 (selected years) 354
11.2 Overview of policy changes in the 1990s introducing some competition in statutory health insurance in the Netherlands 358
11.3 Trends in consumer behaviour in the Netherlands, 2006–2015 363
11.4 The development of nominal premium and income-related contribution rates in the Netherlands, 2008–2015 366
13.1 Benefit expenditure by registered medical schemes in South Africa, 2014 432
14.1 History of popular ballots and legislative reforms in the field of federal health insurance in Switzerland, 1900–2014 454
14.2 Main differences between statutory health insurance and private voluntary insurance in Switzerland 461
Boxes

1.1 From voluntary to compulsory private health insurance in five countries  page 5
1.2 Major developments in markets for private health insurance in this volume, 1960–2017  15
1.3 Selected examples of risk segmentation linked to private health insurance  28
4.1 Canada Health Act national standards for full federal transfer  102
4.2 Québec's mixed public–private universal drug plan  107
10.1 Affordable private health insurance scheme by Kenya Women Finance Trust  345
12.1 Overview of the South African health system  380
12.2 Key developments in the market for private health insurance in South Africa, 1889–2015  387
13.1 Key developments in benefit design and the market for medical savings accounts in South Africa, 1986–2016  419
Acknowledgements

The editors are indebted to the many national experts who contributed to writing and reviewing the chapters in this volume. They are listed below. We thank them for their patience in seeing the book through to publication. We are also grateful to Bob Evans (University of British Columbia) for his contribution to the planning of the book, Joe Kutzin (WHO headquarters) for his feedback on the overview chapter and Camilo Cid (Pan American Health Organization), Valeria de Oliveira Cruz (WHO Regional Office for South-East Asia), Awad Mataria (WHO Regional Office for the Eastern Mediterranean), Grace Kabaniha (WHO Regional Office for Africa) and Peter Cowley (WHO Western Pacific Region) for their comments on selected country-based chapters and Jonathan North and Caroline White (European Observatory on Health Systems and Policies) for preparing the manuscript for publication. The editors alone are responsible for any mistakes.

We dedicate this book to the memory of Revital Gross and Alan Maynard, who contributed to an early draft. Revital Gross was Associate Professor at the School of Social Work, Bar-Ilan University and a Senior Researcher at the Smokler Center for Health Policy Research, Myers-JDC-Brookdale Research Institute. Alan Maynard was Professor of Health Economics at the University of York and the founding director of the Centre for Health Economics.
Contributors

Shuli Brammli-Greenberg: Faculty member, Department of Health Administration and Economics, Braun School of Public Health, Faculty of Medicine, the Hebrew University of Jerusalem, and Senior Research Scholar, Smokler Center for Health Policy Research, Myers-JDC-Brookdale Institute, Jerusalem, Israel.

Lawrence D. Brown: Professor of Health Policy and Management, Mailman School of Public Health, Columbia University, New York, New York, United States.


Luca Crivelli: Head, Department of Business Economics, Health and Social Care, University of Applied Sciences and Arts of Southern Switzerland, Manno, Switzerland, and Vice-Director Swiss School of Public Health, Professor at Università della Svizzera italiana, Lugano, Italy.

Maria Dolores Montoya Diaz: Professor, School of Economics, Business and Accounting, University of São Paulo, São Paulo, Brazil.

Stefanie Ettelt: Associate Professor in Health Policy, Department of Health Services Research and Policy, London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine, London, United Kingdom.

Denzil G. Fiebig: Professor, School of Economics, University of New South Wales, Sydney, Australia.

Carine Franc: Senior Health Economist Research, INSERM, National Institute for Biomedical and Human Health Research, and Associate
List of Contributors

Researcher, Institute for Research and Information in Health Economics (IRDES), Paris, France.

Sherry A. Glied: Dean, Professor of Public Service, Robert F. Wagner Graduate School of Public Service, New York University, New York, New York, USA.

Kees van Gool: Deputy Director and Professor, Centre for Health Economics Research and Evaluation, University of Technology Sydney, Australia.

G. Emmanuel Guindon: Centre for Health Economics and Policy Analysis (CHEPA)/Ontario Ministry of Health and Long-Term Care Chair in Health Equity, Associate Professor in the Department of Health Research Methods, Evidence, and Impact (HEI), associate member of the Department of Economics, McMaster University, Hamilton, Ontario, Canada.

Noah Haber: Postdoctoral fellow, Meta-research Innovation Center at Stanford (METRICS), Stanford University, Stanford, California, USA.

Jane Hall: Distinguished Professor of Health Economics, University of Technology Business School, and Director of Strategy, Centre for Health Economics Research and Evaluation, University of Technology, Sydney, Australia.

Jeremiah Hurley: Dean of Social Sciences, Professor at the Department of Economics and the Centre for Health Economics and Policy Analysis, McMaster University, Hamilton, Ontario, Canada.

Naoki Ikegami: Professor Emeritus, Keio University, and adjunct researcher, Japan Medical Association Research Institute, Tokyo, Japan.

Patrick Jeurissen: Professor in Fiscal Sustainability of Health Care Systems, Radboud University Medical Centre, Nijmegen, the Netherlands.

Soonman Kwon: Professor of Health Economics and Policy, School of Public Health, Seoul National University, Seoul, South Korea.
List of Contributors

Yue-Chune Lee: Professor, Institute of Health and Welfare Policy and Masters program on Trans-disciplinary Long-Term Care and Management, National Yang-Ming University, Taipei, Taiwan, China.

Dan P. Ly: PhD candidate in Health Policy, Harvard University, Cambridge, Massachussetts, USA.

Hans Maarse: Emeritus Professor of Health Policy Science, University of Maastricht, Maastricht, Netherlands.

Di McIntyre: Emeritus Professor, Health Economics Unit, University of Cape Town, Cape Town, South Africa.

Heather McLeod: Extraordinary Professor, Department of Statistics and Actuarial Science, University of Stellenbosch, Stellenbosch, South Africa, and Honorary Senior Research Fellow, School of Nursing, University of Auckland, Auckland, New Zealand.

Philipa Mladovsky: Assistant Professor, Department of International Development, London School of Economics and Political Science, London, United Kingdom.

Elias Mossialos: Co-Director, European Observatory on Health Systems and Policies, and Brian Abel-Smith Professor of Health Policy, London School of Economics and Political Science, London, United Kingdom.


Emma Pitchforth: Senior Lecturer and Senior Research Fellow in Primary Care, University of Exeter, Exeter, United Kingdom.

Andres Roman-Urrestarazu: Assistant Professor, International Health Department, Maastricht University, Maastricht, the Netherlands, and Harkness Fellow 2020–2021, University of Cambridge, Cambridge, United Kingdom.
Anna Sagan: Research Fellow, European Observatory on Health Systems and Policies, London School of Economics and Political Science, London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine, London, United Kingdom.

Wael Fayek Saleh: Assistant Professor, Faculty of Medicine, Cairo University, Cairo, Egypt.

Flavia Mori Sarti: Professor, School of Arts, Sciences and Humanities, University of São Paulo, São Paulo, Brazil.

Samantha Smith: Research Fellow, Centre for Health Policy and Management, Trinity College, Dublin, Ireland.

Sarah Thomson: Senior Health Financing Specialist, WHO Barcelona Office for Health Systems Strengthening, Barcelona, Spain.

Brian Turner: Lecturer, Department of Economics, Cork University Business School, University College Cork, Cork, Ireland.

Ruth Waitzberg: Research Scholar, Smokler Center for Health Policy Research, Myers-JDC-Brookdale Institute, Jerusalem, Israel; PhD Fellow, Department of Health Systems Management, School of Public Health, Faculty of Health Sciences, Ben-Gurion University of the Negev, Beer-Sheva, Israel; and Fellow researcher, Department of Health Care Management, Faculty of Economics and Management, Technical University Berlin, Berlin, Germany.