

IMPERIALISM, ART AND RESTITUTION

This book is about the repatriation, or not, of great works of art and antiquity taken during the Age of Imperialism and held today by European and American museums. The Elgin Marbles are the most famous example, but there are thousands of others. The nations of origin, supported by UNESCO, want these cultural treasures returned, while the museums unsurprisingly prefer to keep them. Public interest in the outcome runs high. In this volume prominent museum and government officials and leading scholars consider the ultimate disposition of the Elgin Marbles in the British Museum, the bust of Nefertiti in Berlin, and American Indian artifacts and human remains in American museums.

John Henry Merryman is the Sweitzer Professor of Law, Emeritus, and Affiliated Professor in the Department of Art, Emeritus, as Stanford University.



IMPERIALISM, ART AND RESTITUTION

Edited by

JOHN HENRY MERRYMAN

Stanford University







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521123877

© John Henry Merryman 2006

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2006

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-0-521-85929-5 Hardback ISBN 978-0-521-12387-7 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate. Information regarding prices, travel timetables, and other factual information given in this work is correct at the time of first printing but Cambridge University Press & Assessment does not guarantee the accuracy of such information thereafter.



CONTENTS

Contributors		page vii
For	eword, by John O. Haley	ix
	INTRODUCTION John Henry Merryman	1
1	VIEW FROM THE UNIVERSAL MUSEUM James Cuno	15
2	FROM GLOBAL PILLAGE TO PILLARS OF COLLABORATION Talat Halman	37
3	MUSEUMS AS CENTERS OF CULTURAL UNDERSTANDING Willard L. Boyd	47
4	IMPERIAL APPROPRIATIONS OF THE PARTHENON William St Clair	65
5	WHITHER THE ELGIN MARBLES? John Henry Merryman	98
6	THE BEAUTIFUL ONE HAS COME — TO RETURN: THE RETURN OF THE BUST OF NEFERTITI FROM BERLIN TO CAIRO Kurt G. Siehr	114

 \mathbf{v}



vi		Contents
7	THE BEAUTIFUL ONE HAS COME – TO STAY Stephen K. Urice	135
	Appendix I: The Bust of Nefertiti: An Annotated Bibliography <i>Tracy Musacchio</i>	166
	Appendix II: A New Translation of Selected Egyptian Antiquities Laws (1881–1912) Adrienne L. Fricke	175
8	NAGPRA FROM THE MIDDLE DISTANCE: LEGAL PUZZLES AND UNINTENDED CONSEQUENCES Michael F. Brown and Margaret M. Bruchac	193
9	FINDERS KEEPERS AND DEEP AMERICAN HISTORY: SOME LESSONS IN DISPUTE RESOLUTION David Hurst Thomas	218
Index		255



CONTRIBUTORS

Willard L. Boyd, Rawlings–Miller Professor of Law and President Emeritus University of Iowa and The Field Museum of Chicago, **Willard-boyd@uiowa.edu**

Michael F. Brown, Lambert Professor of Anthropology and Latin American Studies, Williams College, **Michael. F. Brown@williams.edu**

Margaret M. Bruchac, Abenaki, Repatriation Research Liaison for the Five College Repatriation Committee in the Connecticut Valley of Massachusetts, and Ph.D. candidate in anthropology at the University of Massachusetts Amherst

James Cuno, President and Director, The Art Institute of Chicago, **jcuno@artic.edu**

John O. Haley, Wiley B. Rutledge Professor of Law and Director, The Whitney R. Harris Institute for Global Legal Studies, School of Law, Washington University in St. Louis, **johaley@wulaw.wustl.edu**

Talat Halman, Turkey's First Minister of Culture, turkedeb@bilkent.edu.tr

John Henry Merryman, Sweitzer Professor of Law, Emeritus, and Affiliated Professor in the Department of Art, Emeritus, Stanford University, merry@stanford.edu

Kurt G. Siehr, M. C. L. (Ann Arbor), Dr. iur. (Hamburg), Ph.D. (Zürich), kssiehr@compuserve.com or kurt.siehr@rwi.unizh.ch

William St Clair, Fellow of Trinity College, Cambridge, ws214@hermes.cam. ac.uk

vii



viii Contributors

David Hurst Thomas, Curator, Division of Anthropology, American Museum of Natural History, **thomasd@amnh.org**

Stephen K. Urice, Director, Project for Cultural Heritage Law and Policy, Philadelphia Museum of Art, and Lecturer-in-Law at the University of Pennsylvania Law School, urice@heritagepolicy.org



FOREWORD

The articles collected in this volume were first presented at a conference held at the Washington University School of Law on March 26–27, 2004. The conference was the fourth in a series of annual symposia organized and sponsored by the Whitney R. Harris Institute for Global Legal Studies. The complete proceedings, including the original presentation of each article in this volume with the discussion that followed, remain available in the Institute's electronic archive of all of its principal conferences at http://law.wustl.edu/igls(Conferences/2003–2004/ ImperialismArtRestitutionConfo4.html.

The topic and title of the conference – Imperialism, Art and Restitution – originated with John Henry Merryman. His intellectual vision and organizing acumen made the event possible. Without his efforts neither the conference nor this volume could have been realized. Others also share credit. First and foremost are those who participated in the symposium as principal presenters, whose contributions are collected here, as well as the moderators and discussants: Michael Cosmopoulos (University of Missouri-St. Louis), Steven Gunn (Washington University), Michael Kelly (Creighton University), Serena Stier and Pamela Trimpe (University of Iowa), Susan Rotoff and Sarantis Symeonoglou (Washington University), Frederike Seligman and Mark Weil (Washington University).

A special note of appreciation needs to be extended to the Washington University School of Art, which with the support of its Dean, Jeffrey Pike, cosponsored the event. Others whose guidance, support and various forms of assistance require mention here include Joel Seligman, currently President of the University of Rochester, whose leadership and enthusiasm have been vital to the life of the Harris Institute since its founding during his tenure as Dean of the School of Law. Whitney and Anna Harris were active participants and from inception enthusiastic supporters of the conference.

ix



x John O. Haley

Robert Archibald, President of the Missouri Historical Society, provided useful advice. No program of this magnitude could have been successful, however, without the energy and dedication of Linda McClain, the Harris Institute's especially able conference coordinator.

I would like to extend a final word of appreciation to the editors of Cambridge University Press, who by making this volume possible have given permanence to the presentations in St. Louis, thereby enabling the ideas and intellectual contributions of the authors to reach a broader audience in both place and time.

John O. Haley