NEW CAMBRIDGE SHAKESPEARE STUDIES AND SUPPLEMENTARY TEXTS

The Problem of The Reign of King Edward III: A Statistical Approach

The Reign of King Edward III (1596) is a little-known Elizabethan play of uncertain authorship, some or all of which has long been considered possibly to have been Shakespeare’s work. In assessing the origins of King Edward III, Slater’s book is pioneering in its use and extension of vocabulary tests to solve problems of authorship. The author reviews the debate regarding the creation of Edward III. Following a survey of applications of quantitative methods to literary problems, he examines the authorship of Edward III by means of a statistical study of the play’s rare words, and their links with rare words in Shakespeare’s canonical plays. This is a technique developed by Slater himself and is of particular interest to literary scholars and stylometricists. The investigation indicates that the play was written by Shakespeare. The book therefore provides important new evidence to suggest that an exciting and much-neglected play should be admitted into the canon of Shakespeare’s early history plays.

The rewards of Slater’s research range beyond the provenance of only one work. He offers a persuasive set of adjustments to the traditional chronological order of Shakespeare’s plays, based on his study of the rare-word links between them. The word lists and appendices assemble invaluable raw materials from which further tests can be carried out on Shakespeare’s plays, poems, and apocrypha, to help resolve questions of chronology and authorship.

Dr Eliot Slater enjoyed an internationally eminent career in psychiatry and for many years served as Editor-in-Chief of the British Journal of Psychiatry. In retirement he pursued his longstanding interest in Shakespeare, publishing in Notes and Queries and The Bard before bringing his research into a book-length study.
NEW CAMBRIDGE SHAKESPEARE
STUDIES AND SUPPLEMENTARY TEXTS SERIES

Titles in this series

Peter W. M. Blayney, The Texts of King Lear and their Origins
Volume I: Nicholas Okes and the First Quarto

Forthcoming

T. H. Howard-Hill, editor, Shakespeare and Sir Thomas More:
Essays on the Play and its Shakespearian Interest
The Problem of
The Reign of King Edward III:
A Statistical Approach

ELIOT SLATER
It was sad that Cambridge University Press should have accepted this work for publication shortly after my father’s death in May 1983. Since he was not able to see the book through the press himself, it has been reproduced from his original doctoral dissertation without alteration, save for the excision of one chapter of general literary criticism of Edward III, and the addition of an appendix on word links between Edmund Ironside, Edward III, Henry VI Parts 1 to 3, and Titus Andronicus. This appendix is drawn from a letter published by The Times Literary Supplement on 18 March 1983, and a corrected word list found among my father’s papers after his death.

Ann Pasternak Slater
Contents

List of tables

List of figures

Preface by Richard Proudfoot

Acknowledgements

The Raigne of King Edward the third

2 The statistical study of literary vocabulary

3 The advent of the computer

4 Style and stylometry
   Stylistic analysis
   Stylometry and the scholars
   Modern stylometry
   Conclusion
   Summary

5 The statistical work of Alfred Hart
   Hart’s work on Edward III
   Summary

6 Rare words and Shakespeare’s chronology
   Introductory
   The card index
   Interrelationships between plays
   Summary and conclusions

7 The rare-word vocabulary of King Edward III
   What is a ‘word’?
   The use of the text of The Reign of King Edward III
   Links between Edward III and works of Shakespeare
   Links with part A of Edward III
   Links with part B, and a comparison
   The distribution of Shakespeare’s rare words
   A second trial: rare words in a rare-word context
Direct comparison of part A and part B
Provisional conclusions
Marlowe and the 948 link words
Once-only nouns in Edward III
Summary and conclusions

Appendix I The card indexed link words
Appendix II Interrelationships between Shakespeare’s plays as revealed by the link words
Appendix III The 940 (948) words, linking Edward III with the works of Shakespeare, in the order of their appearance
Appendix IV Alphabetical key to Appendix III with further data
Appendix V Edward III’s once-only nouns with their relationships to Tamburlaine and Henry VI
Appendix VI Rare words from Edward III and their links with Parts 1, 2 and 3 of Henry VI, Titus and Edmund Ironside

References
Bibliography
Index

viii
# Tables

| 2.1 | Distribution of nouns in *De Imitatione Christi* | page 14 |
| 2   | Vocabulary analysis (Yule) for *Imitatio*, Bunyan, Macaulay, Shakespeare | 17 |
| 3   | Vocabulary analysis (Hart) for Shakespeare (4 epochs) | 19 |
| 4   | Shakespeare: the 43 commonest concordance words | 21 |
| 5   | Shakespeare: concordance words with 2999 to 1001 appearances | 21 |
| 6   | Shakespeare: the commonest nouns | 22 |
| 7   | Shakespeare: analysis (after Yule) of concordance words in a 1 in 20 sample | 22 |

| 3.1 | 'Filler' words in the *Federalist* papers | 31 |
| 2   | Values of Yule's *K* in *Julius Caesar* and *As You Like It* | 34 |

| 4.1 | *them* and *'em* in Fletcher and Shakespeare | 43 |
| 2   | Shakespeare: repetition of the first word in the line | 44 |
| 3   | Change in habits in Sir Walter Scott | 50 |
| 4   | Differences in habits: *Caesar, Pericles, Titus* | 51 |
| 5   | Differences in punctuation: *Titus, Caesar, Pericles* | 52 |
| 6   | Spedding and Merriam on *Henry VIII* | 53 |
| 7   | Fletcher/Shakespeare: *Henry VIII* and *Winter's Tale* | 54 |

| 5.1 | Shakespeare: vocabulary analysis (Hart–Slater) | 60 |
| 2   | Marlowe/Shakespeare: words per 100 lines | 65 |
| 3   | Communities of vocabulary between pairs of plays (Hart) | 67 |
| 4   | Communities of vocabulary: differences between pairs | 69 |
| 5   | Frequency of certain prefix words in Shakespeare and Marlowe plays: counts by Hart | 69 |
| 6   | Prefix words in *Tamburlaine* and *Henry VI*: $\chi^2$ values | 70 |
| 7   | *Tamburlaine, Henry VI* and *Edward VIII*: occurrences of prefix words in *en-, en-, im-, in-* (count by present writer) | 71 |
| 8   | *Tamburlaine* and *Henry VI*: frequencies of 6 prefix words | 74 |
| 9   | *Tamburlaine* and *Henry VI*: prefix words, *t* values | 74 |
| 10  | *Tamburlaine*, *Henry VI*, *Edward III*: frequency of certain suffix words (Hart), three parts of speech combined | 75 |
| 11  | Comparisons between *t* *Henry VI*, *Edward III, Edward II* | 77 |
6.1 Expected and observed mean lengths of interval between two appearances of a rare word, in named play and in others 89
2 Expected and observed mean lengths of interval between two appearances of a rare word: classification by degree of rarity of word 90
3 Shakespeare: link words by category, correlation 93
4 Shakespeare’s plays: matrix of interconnections 94

7.1 Distribution of link words, by class, with numbers of appearances in Edward III 107
2A Word links between Edward III part A and works of Shakespeare 108
2B The same: Edward III part B 109
3 Distribution of links between part A of Edward III and Shakespeare’s plays, chronologically grouped in sets of six 111
4 Shakespeare’s plays: richness in rare words 115
5 Links between Edward III and Shakespeare’s plays, with rare words only as base and as counters. Words with 11–12 links excluded 117
6 Distribution of links with Shakespeare: parts A and B of Edward III compared 119
7 Distribution of link words by individual word category: parts A and B compared 120
8 Direct comparison of part A and part B links with Shakespeare 121
9 Links made by the catch words with Marlowe and Shakespeare 126
10 Frequencies of occurrences of catch words, Marlowe and Shakespeare correlated 128
11Appearances of 516 nouns from Edward III in Marlowe and Shakespeare, correlated 129
12 Once-only nouns in Edward III: frequencies of appearances in the two Tamburlaine plays and the three Henry VI plays 131
Figures

5.1 Drop out of words with time: fate of 100 consecutive words appearing first in _Henry VI_ page 63

6.1 Shakespeare: distribution of card index link words, by category 85
2 Shakespeare’s plays: chronological order by standard authorities and by rare-word links 99

7.1 Shakespeare’s plays: variation in richness in rare words, by play order 114
2 The same, converted into a cumulative sum (‘cusum’) curve 114
3 _Edward III_: linkage with Shakespeare’s plays, part A and part B contrasted 123
4 Shakespeare’s plays in serial order: relative abundance of links with part A and part B of _Edward III_: cusum curve 124
Preface

DR ELIOT TREvor OAKESHOTT SLATER

The late Dr Eliot Slater registered as a postgraduate student in the Department of English at King’s College, London in the autumn of 1977. He was awarded the London PhD in February 1982 for his statistical work on the vocabulary of the anonymous Elizabethan play *The Reign of King Edward III* (1596). These facts might seem unremarkable, were it not that this graduate student entered professional English studies in his seventy-fourth year and in his retirement from an internationally eminent career in psychiatry.

Dr Slater’s interest in Shakespeare was sustained and deeply personal. Before he came to King’s he had already published articles and notes in *Notes and Queries* and in *The Bard* on the subject of the chronology of Shakespeare’s works, based on analysis of the rarer elements in their vocabulary. With the encouragement of the late James Maxwell, then editor of *Notes and Queries*, Dr Slater decided to devote himself to more sustained study in his retirement. Unlike many other amateurs of Shakespearean scholarship, he resolutely set on one side his deep curiosity about the personality and psychology of Shakespeare and asked to be given a useful job to do. On my suggestion, he turned back to the work of Alfred Hart on the vocabulary of plays attributed to Shakespeare. He soon decided that the authorship of *Edward III* offered a suitable case for his treatment.

With increasing difficulty as his health deteriorated and in face of a number of disappointments and set-backs – most dauntingly, his reluctant acceptance that computer-aided analysis of vocabulary could not alone determine the chronology of Shakespeare’s works – Eliot Slater completed his PhD thesis, ‘The Problem of *The Reign of King Edward III* (1596): a Statistical Approach’. He took his own line of enquiry as far as it could go. His findings, though in the nature of the case they could not be decisive in favour of Shakespeare’s authorship of the play, will remain an important point of reference for future investigators. His study bears the print of a rare personality, whose sharp observation and dry wit impart life to the dry bones of a statistical argument. Not least, it offers a trenchant critique of some earlier methods used in the attempt to solve the question of attribution.

As a final, personal note I wish to record my gratitude to a remarkable student for his patient forbearance with a supervisor many years his junior in years, experience and wisdom. Guiding, and following, his work was an educative experience I should have been sorry to miss.

Richard Proudfoot
King’s College, London
26 October 1987

xiii
Acknowledgements

My first thanks go to my Supervisor at King’s College, Dr. Richard Proudtoot, who has guided my progress throughout (apart from the more purely statistical work). His comments, based on a scholarship to which the writer can lay no claim, though silently accepted as a rule, have been subjoined in footnotes to the text, where that was called for. I have received indispensable help from the Computer Unit at King’s College, and especially from Miss Margaret Skinner and Mrs Christine Brown. I have had much help from the London Library and the Senate House Library of the University of London. Lastly my daughter, Dr. Ann Pasternak of St Anne’s College, Oxford, has given me unfailing support, in assembling sources, reading and commenting on the text, and correcting lapses or errors in the written word.