

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11997-9 - The Law, Economics and Politics of Retaliation in WTO Dispute Settlement

Edited by Chad P. Bown and Joost Pauwelyn

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE INTERNATIONAL TRADE  
AND ECONOMIC LAW

As the processes of regionalisation and globalisation have intensified, there have been accompanying increases in the regulations of international trade and economic law at the levels of international, regional and national laws.

The subject matter of this series is international economic law. Its core is the regulation of international trade, investment and cognate areas such as intellectual property and competition policy. The series publishes books on related regulatory areas, in particular human rights, labour, environment and culture, as well as sustainable development. These areas are vertically linked at the international, regional and national level, and the series extends to the implementation of these rules at these different levels. The series also includes works on governance, dealing with the structure and operation of related international organisations in the field of international economic law, and the way they interact with other subjects of international and national law.

*Series editors:*

Dr Lorand Bartels, *University of Cambridge*  
Professor Thomas Cottier, *University of Berne*  
Professor William Davey, *University of Illinois*

*Books in the series:*

*Trade Policy Flexibility and Enforcement in the WTO: A Law and Economics Analysis*

Simon A. B. Schropp

*The Multilateralization of International Investment Law*

Stephan W. Schill

*The Law, Economics and Politics of Retaliation in WTO Dispute Settlement*

Edited by Chad P. Bown and Joost Pauwelyn

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11997-9 - The Law, Economics and Politics of Retaliation in WTO Dispute Settlement

Edited by Chad P. Bown and Joost Pauwelyn

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

THE LAW, ECONOMICS AND  
POLITICS OF RETALIATION IN  
WTO DISPUTE SETTLEMENT

Edited by

CHAD P. BOWN

JOOST PAUWELYN



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11997-9 - The Law, Economics and Politics of Retaliation in WTO Dispute Settlement

Edited by Chad P. Bown and Joost Pauwelyn

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore,  
São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo

Cambridge University Press  
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9780521119979](http://www.cambridge.org/9780521119979)

© Cambridge University Press 2010

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2010

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data*

The law, economics and politics of retaliation in WTO dispute settlement / [editors] Chad P. Bown, Joost Pauwelyn.

p. cm. – (Cambridge international trade and economic law)  
ISBN 978-0-521-11997-9 (hardback)

1. World Trade Organization—Rules and practice. 2. Dispute resolution (Law)
3. Foreign trade regulation. 4. Dumping (International trade) 5. Tariff—Law and legislation. 6. Import quotas. I. Bown, Chad P. (Chad Philips), 1972–  
II. Pauwelyn, Joost.

K4610.L39 2010

382'.5—dc22 2009035292

ISBN 978-0-521-11997-9 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11997-9 - The Law, Economics and Politics of Retaliation in WTO Dispute Settlement

Edited by Chad P. Bown and Joost Pauwelyn

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## CONTENTS

List of tables and figures ix

Contributors xi

Introduction: trade retaliation in WTO dispute settlement: a multi-disciplinary analysis 1

CHAD P. BOWN AND JOOST PAUWELYN

**PART I Background and goal(s) of WTO retaliation 21**

## 1 The nature of WTO arbitrations on retaliation 23

GIORGIO SACERDOTI

## 2 The calculation and design of trade retaliation in context: what is the goal of suspending WTO obligations? 34

JOOST PAUWELYN

## Comment on chapter 2 66

JOHN H. JACKSON

## Comment on chapter 2 70

ALAN O. SYKES

## 3 Extrapolating purpose from practice: rebalancing or inducing compliance 73

GREGORY SHAFFER AND DANIEL GANIN

**PART II A legal assessment after ten arbitration disputes 87**

## 4 The law of permissible WTO retaliation 89

THOMAS SEBASTIAN

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11997-9 - The Law, Economics and Politics of Retaliation in WTO Dispute Settlement

Edited by Chad P. Bown and Joost Pauwelyn

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

vi

## CONTENTS

- Comment on chapter 4 128  
NICOLAS LOCKHART
- 5 From *Bananas* to *Byrd*: damage calculation coming of age? 135  
YVES RENOUF
- PART III An economic assessment after ten arbitration disputes 147**
- 6 The economics of permissible WTO retaliation 149  
CHAD P. BOWN AND MICHELE RUTA
- Comment on chapter 6 194  
L. ALAN WINTERS
- 7 Sticking to the rules: quantifying the market access that is potentially protected by WTO-sanctioned trade retaliation 198  
SIMON J. EVENETT
- PART IV The domestic politics and procedures for implementing trade retaliation 233**
- 8 The United States' experience and practice in suspending WTO obligations 235  
SCOTT D. ANDERSEN AND JUSTINE BLANCHET
- 9 The European Community's experience and practice in suspending WTO obligations 244  
LOTHAR EHRING
- 10 The politics of selecting trade retaliation in the European Community: a view from the floor 267  
HÅKAN NORDSTRÖM
- 11 Canada's experience and practice in suspending WTO obligations 277  
VASKEN KHABAYAN
- 12 Is retaliation useful? Observations and analysis of Mexico's experience 281  
JORGE A. HUERTA-GOLDMAN

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11997-9 - The Law, Economics and Politics of Retaliation in WTO Dispute Settlement

Edited by Chad P. Bown and Joost Pauwelyn

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## CONTENTS

vii

- 13 Procedures for the design and implementation of trade retaliation in Brazil 297  
LUIZ EDUARDO SALLES
- 14 Retaliation in the WTO: the experience of Antigua and Barbuda in *US–Gambling* 310  
MARK E. MENDEL
- PART V Problems and options for reform 317**
- 15 Evaluating the criticism that WTO retaliation rules undermine the utility of WTO dispute settlement for developing countries 319  
HUNTER NOTTAGE
- 16 Optimal sanctions in the WTO: the case for decoupling (and the uneasy case for the *status quo*) 339  
ALAN O. SYKES  
Comment on chapter 16 355  
PETROS C. MAVROIDIS
- 17 Sanctions in the WTO: problems and solutions 360  
WILLIAM J. DAVEY
- 18 WTO retaliatory measures: the case for multilateral regulation of the domestic decision-making process 373  
RETO MALACRIDA
- 19 The WTO Secretariat and the role of economics in panels and arbitrations 391  
CHAD P. BOWN  
Comment on chapter 19 434  
RETO MALACRIDA
- 20 The equivalence standard under Article 22.4 of the DSU: a ‘tariffic’ misunderstanding? 446  
SIMON SCHROPP  
Comment on chapter 20 503  
FRITZ BREUSS

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11997-9 - The Law, Economics and Politics of Retaliation in WTO Dispute Settlement

Edited by Chad P. Bown and Joost Pauwelyn

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

viii

CONTENTS

- PART VI New frontiers and lessons from other fields 513**
- 21 Cross-retaliation and suspension under the GATS and TRIPS agreements 515  
WERNER ZDOUC
- 22 Cross-retaliation in TRIPS: issues of law and practice 536  
FREDERICK M. ABBOTT
- 23 Preliminary thoughts on WTO retaliation in the services sector 589  
ARTHUR E. APPLETON
- 24 Compensation assessments: perspectives from investment arbitration 623  
GABRIELLE KAUFMANN-KOHLER
- 25 Reforming WTO retaliation: any lessons from competition law? 641  
SIMON J. EVENETT
- Index 648

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11997-9 - The Law, Economics and Politics of Retaliation in WTO Dispute Settlement

Edited by Chad P. Bown and Joost Pauwelyn

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## LIST OF TABLES AND FIGURES

## Tables

|            |  |     |
|------------|--|-----|
| Table 2.1  | The possible goals of WTO suspension   | 38  |
| Table 6.1  | WTO DSU, Article 22.6 arbitrations, 1995–2007  | 151 |
| Table 6.2  | Does Bagwell–Staiger describe dispute arbitration?   | 197 |
| Table 7.1  | Calculating the amount of non-actionable exports for each country  | 208 |
| Table 7.2  | Calculating the proportion of exports that are ‘actionable’ by country   | 211 |
| Table 7.3  | Growth of actionable exports varies greatly across countries: 1990s  | 214 |
| Table 7.4  | Identifying the number of potential ‘enforcers’ that each nation faces   | 217 |
| Table 7.5  | Can only OECD nations play a credible enforcement role? No   | 221 |
| Table 7.6  | What percentage of each economy’s imports come from the potential enforcers?                                   | 225 |
| Table 12.1 | Level of sensitivity of the products subject to the dispute  | 292 |
| Table 19.1 | The arbitrators in the disputes  | 406 |
| Table 19.2 | WTO members, disputes, and the distribution of Secretariat staff positions within various divisions, 2000–2007 | 414 |
| Table 23.1 | Modes of supply  | 594 |

## Figures

|            |  |     |
|------------|--|-----|
| Figure 6.1 | Reciprocity compensation when the respondent implements a WTO-inconsistent tariff  | 158 |
| Figure 6.2 | Reciprocity compensation when the respondent implements a WTO-inconsistent quota and/or implements an inconsistent licensing scheme                                  | 162 |
| Figure 6.3 | Reciprocity compensation when the respondent imposes a WTO-inconsistent non-tariff measure on a trading partner’s exports (for example violating national treatment) | 171 |



Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11997-9 - The Law, Economics and Politics of Retaliation in WTO Dispute Settlement

Edited by Chad P. Bown and Joost Pauwelyn

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

x

## TABLES AND FIGURES

|             |   |     |
|-------------|---|-----|
| Figure 6.4  | Reciprocity compensation when the respondent implements a WTO-inconsistent production subsidy to an import-competing industry                       | 174 |
| Figure 6.5  | Reciprocity compensation when the respondent imposes a WTO-inconsistent export subsidy (three-country model)  | 179 |
| Figure 6.6  | Reciprocity compensation when the respondent imposes a WTO-inconsistent export subsidy (two-country model)  | 184 |
| Figure 6.7  | Reciprocity compensation when the respondent implements a WTO-inconsistent tariff after a supply shock  | 189 |
| Figure 7.1  | Not all exports are sanctionable and the proportions vary considerably across countries   | 213 |
| Figure 7.2  | Although most nations saw a growth in actionable exports in the 1990s, the variation across countries is substantial                                | 215 |
| Figure 7.3  | There is little evidence of convergence in the percentage of actionable exports in the 1990s  | 215 |
| Figure 7.4  | Countries differ in the number of trading partners that can act as 'enforcers'  | 219 |
| Figure 7.5  | Non-actionable exports tend to erode deterrent value of the DSU more than exports to lesser markets   | 223 |
| Figure 7.6  | Imports from nations that are potential enforcers, or the amount of each nation's market access that can be defended through WTO dispute settlement | 227 |
| Figure 7.7  | Are developing economies exposed to greater potential sanctions than the United States?   | 228 |
| Figure 7.8  | Are developing economies exposed to greater potential sanctions than India?   | 229 |
| Figure 10.1 | Splitting the bill for <i>US-Steel Safeguards</i>   | 269 |
| Figure 10.2 | Splitting the bill for <i>US-Foreign Sales Corporations</i>   | 270 |
| Figure 12.1 | Time-line for <i>US-Brooms Safeguards</i>   | 285 |
| Figure 19.1 | Page length of DSU, Article 22.6 arbitration reports, 1999–2007   | 421 |
| Figure 20.1 | Reliance damages as baseline for the calculation of NoI   | 458 |
| Figure 20.2 | Restitution damages as baseline for the calculation of NoI  | 460 |
| Figure 20.3 | Expectation damages as baseline for the calculation of NoI  | 462 |
| Figure 20.4 | Comparing reliance ( <i>I</i> ), restitution ( <i>II</i> ) and expectation damages ( <i>III</i> )   | 462 |
| Figure 20.5 | Different standards of measuring the intensity of NoI   | 470 |
| Figure 20.6 | The calculation baseline according to WTO arbitrators' practice   | 481 |

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11997-9 - The Law, Economics and Politics of Retaliation in WTO Dispute Settlement

Edited by Chad P. Bown and Joost Pauwelyn

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## CONTRIBUTORS

FREDERICK ABBOTT  
 Damon House, Room 203  
 Edward Ball Eminent Scholar  
 Florida State University College of  
 Law  
 425 W. Jefferson Street  
 Tallahassee, FL 32306-1601  
 USA

SCOTT ANDERSEN  
 Managing Partner, Geneva Office  
 Sidley Austin LLP  
 139 rue de Lausanne  
 CH-1202 Geneva  
 Switzerland

ARTHUR E. APPLETON  
 Appleton Luff International Lawyers  
 17 rue de Contamines  
 CH-1206 Geneva  
 Switzerland

JUSTINE BLANCHET  
 International Trade Analyst  
 Sidley Austin LLP  
 139 rue de Lausanne  
 CH-1202 Geneva  
 Switzerland

CHAD P. BOWN  
 Department of Economics

Brandeis University  
 MS 021, 415 South Street  
 Waltham, MA 02454-9110  
 USA

FRITZ BREUSS  
 Research Institute for European  
 Affairs  
 Vienna University of Economics  
 and Business Administration  
 Europainstitut  
 WU-Wien  
 Althanstrasse 39–45  
 A-1090 Vienna  
 Austria

WILLIAM J. DAVEY  
 University of Illinois College of Law  
 504 E Pennsylvania Avenue  
 Champaign, IL 61820  
 USA

LOTHAR EHRLING  
 European Commission  
 Directorate-General for Trade  
 Unit for Legal Aspects of Trade  
 Policy  
 European Commission  
 CHAR 9/46  
 BE-1049 Brussels  
 Belgium

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11997-9 - The Law, Economics and Politics of Retaliation in WTO Dispute Settlement

Edited by Chad P. Bown and Joost Pauwelyn

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xii

## CONTRIBUTORS

SIMON EVENETT

SIAW-HSG

Universität St. Gallen

Bodanstrasse 8

9000 St. Gallen

Switzerland

DANIEL GANIN

University of Minnesota–Twin

Cities

420 Delaware St. SE

Minneapolis, MN 55455

USA

JORGE A. HUERTA-GOLDMAN

Mission of Mexico to the WTO

Mexican Ministry of Trade

c/o Misión de México ante la OMC

Av. de Budé 16

CH-1202 Geneva

Switzerland

JOHN JACKSON

Georgetown University Law Center

McDonough Hall, Room 456

600 New Jersey Avenue, NW

Washington, DC 20001

USA

GABRIELLE KAUFMANN-KOHLER

University of Geneva Faculty

of Law

102 Bd Carl-Vogt

CH-1205 Geneva

Switzerland

VASKEN KHABAYAN

Department of Foreign Affairs and

International Trade Canada

125 Sussex Drive, C6-189 (JLT)

Ottawa

Ontario K1A 0G2

Canada

NICOLAS LOCKHART

Sidley Austin LLP

139 rue de Lausanne

CH-1202 Geneva

Switzerland

RETO MALACRIDA

Legal Affairs Division

World Trade Organization

154 rue de Lausanne

CH-1211 Geneva 21

Switzerland

PETROS C. MAVROIDIS

Edwin B. Parker Professor of Law at

Columbia Law School

Professor of Law at the University  
of Neuchatel

Research Fellow at CEPR

4 Chemin de la Riaz

CH-1291 Commugny (VD)

Switzerland

MARK E. MENDEL

Mendel Blumenfeld, LLP

21 Cook Street, 2nd Floor

Cork

Co. Cork

Ireland

HÅKAN NORDSTRÖM

National Board of Trade

(Kommerskollegium)

Box 6803

113 86 Stockholm

Sweden

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11997-9 - The Law, Economics and Politics of Retaliation in WTO Dispute Settlement

Edited by Chad P. Bown and Joost Pauwelyn

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## CONTRIBUTORS

xiii

HUNTER NOTTAGE

Counsel, Advisory Centre on WTO  
Law

Avenue Giuseppe-Motta 31–33

C.P. 132

CH-1211 Geneva 20

Switzerland

JOOST PAUWELYN

Professor of International Law

Co-Director Centre for Trade and  
Economic Integration (CTEI)Graduate Institute of International  
and Development Studies

Rue Richard Wagner 1

CH-1202 Geneva

Switzerland

YVES RENOUF

Legal Affairs Division

World Trade Organization

154 rue de Lausanne

CH-1211 Geneva 21

Switzerland

MICHELE RUTA

Economic Research and Statistics  
Division

World Trade Organization

154 rue de Lausanne

CH-1211 Geneva 21

Switzerland

GIORGIO SACERDOTI

Bocconi University, Milan  
and Appellate Body, World Trade  
Organization

Via Albricci 10

I-20122 Milan

Italy

LUIZ EDUARDO RIBEIRO SALLES

Graduate Institute of International  
and Development Studies

Rua Joaquim Floriano, 209,

apto 103

Bairro Itaim Bibi

São Paulo–SP

Brazil

CEP 04534-010

SIMON SCHROPP

Sidley Austin LLP

3 rue du 1er Juin

CH-1207 Geneva

Switzerland

THOMAS SEBASTIAN

Allen &amp; Overy LLP

1 Bishop's Square

London E1 6AD

United Kingdom

GREGORY SHAFFER

Melvin C. Steen Professor

University of Minnesota Law  
School

N230 Mondale Commons

229-19th Avenue South

Minneapolis, MM 55455

USA

ALAN O. SYKES

James and Patricia Kowal Professor  
of Law

Stanford University

Stanford Law School

559 Nathan Abbott Way

Stanford, CA 94305-8610

USA

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11997-9 - The Law, Economics and Politics of Retaliation in WTO Dispute Settlement

Edited by Chad P. Bown and Joost Pauwelyn

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

xiv

CONTRIBUTORS

L. ALAN WINTERS

Professor of Economics

Department for International

Development (DFID) and

University of Sussex

School of Social Sciences

University of Sussex

Falmer

Brighton BN1 9QN

UK

WERNER ZDOUC

Appellate Body

World Trade Organization

154 rue de Lausanne

CH-1211 Geneva 21

Switzerland