The civil justice system supports social order and economic activity, but a number of factors over the last decade have created a situation in which the value of civil justice is being undermined and the civil courts are in a state of dilapidation.

For the 2008 Hamlyn Lectures, Dame Hazel Genn discusses reforms to civil justice in England and around the world over the last decade in the context of escalating expenditure on criminal justice and vanishing civil trials. In critically assessing the claims and practice of mediation for civil disputes, she questions whether diverting cases out of the public courts and into private dispute resolution promotes access to justice, looks critically at the changed expectations of the judiciary in civil justice and points to the need for a better understanding of how judges ‘do justice’.

Dame Hazel Genn is Dean of Laws, Professor of Socio-Legal Studies and Co-director of the Centre for Empirical Legal Studies in the Faculty of Laws at University College London, where she is also an Honorary Fellow. In 2006, she was appointed an Inaugural Commissioner of the new Judicial Appointments Commission, established under the Constitutional Reform Act 2005. She was also a member of the Committee on Standards in Public Life from 2003 to 2008. She worked with the Judicial Studies Board for twelve years, serving as a member of the main board and the tribunals committee, closely involved in the design and delivery of training for the judiciary at all levels. A leading authority on access to justice, she has published widely in the field.
JUDGING CIVIL JUSTICE

HAZEL GENN

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
In memory of my dear sisters
Rosemary and Angela
CONTENTS

List of illustrations [viii]
The Hamlyn Trust [ix]
The Hamlyn Lectures [xii]
Acknowledgements [xv]

1 Introduction: what is civil justice for? [1]
2 Civil justice: how much is enough? [27]
3 ADR and civil justice: what's justice got to do with it? [78]
4 Judges and civil justice [126]
5 Conclusion [181]

Bibliography [189]
Index [204]
ILLUSTRATIONS

2.1 Writs issued in QBD  [34]
2.2 Trials started QBD 1958–98  [34]
2.3 Trials as a per cent of proceedings initiated QBD  [35]
2.4 Claims issued in county court  [35]
2.5 County court trials  [36]
2.6 Expenditure on Legal Aid (2005 prices) (cash)  [42]
4.1 Percentage who describe their judiciary/legal system as corrupt  [146]
4.2 Which of these professions would you generally trust to tell the truth?  [147]
THE HAMLYN TRUST

The Hamlyn Trust owes its existence today to the will of the late Miss Emma Warburton Hamlyn of Torquay, who died in 1941 at the age of 80. She came of an old and well-known Devon family. Her father, William Bussell Hamlyn, practised in Torquay as a solicitor and JP for many years, and it seems likely that Miss Hamlyn founded the trust in his memory. Emma Hamlyn was a woman of strong character, intelligent and cultured, well versed in literature, music and art, and a lover of her country. She travelled extensively in Europe and Egypt, and apparently took considerable interest in the law and ethnology of the countries and cultures that she visited. An account of Miss Hamlyn by Professor Chantal Stebbings of the University of Exeter may be found, under the title ‘The Hamlyn Legacy’, in volume 42 of the published lectures.

Miss Hamlyn bequeathed the residue of her estate on trust in terms which it seems were her own. The wording was thought to be vague, and the will was taken to the Chancery Division of the High Court, which in November 1948 approved a Scheme for the administration of the trust. Paragraph 3 of the Scheme, which follows Miss Hamlyn’s own wording, is as below:

The object of the charity is the furtherance by lectures or otherwise among the Common People of the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland of
THE HAMLYN TRUST

the knowledge of the Comparative Jurisprudence and Ethnology of the Chief European countries including the United Kingdom, and the circumstances of the growth of such jurisprudence to the Intent that the Common People of the United Kingdom may realise the privileges which in law and custom they enjoy in comparison with other European Peoples and realising and appreciating such privileges may recognise the responsibilities and obligations attaching to them.

The Trustees are to include the Vice-Chancellor of the University of Exeter, representatives of the Universities of London, Leeds, Glasgow, Belfast and Wales and persons co-opted. At present there are eight Trustees:

Professor N. Burrows, The University of Glasgow
Professor I.R. Davies, Swansea University
Ms Clare Dyer
Professor K.M. Economides [representing the Vice-Chancellor of the University of Exeter] (Chairman)
Professor R. Halson, University of Leeds
Professor J. Morison, Queen’s University, Belfast
The Rt Hon. Lord Justice Sedley
Professor A. Sherr, University of London
Clerk; Ms Sarah Roberts, University of Exeter

From the outset it was decided that the objects of the Trust could be best achieved by means of an annual course of public lectures of outstanding interest and quality by eminent lecturers, and by their subsequent publication and distribution to a wider audience. The first of the Lectures were delivered by the Rt Hon. Lord Justice Denning (as he then was) in 1949. Since
then there has been an unbroken series of annual Lectures published until 2005 by Sweet & Maxwell and from 2006 by Cambridge University Press. A complete list of the Lectures may be found on pages xii to xiv. In 2005 the Trustees decided to supplement the Lectures with an annual Hamlyn Seminar, normally held at the Institute of Advanced Legal Studies at the University of London, to mark the publication of the Lectures in printed book form. The Trustees have also, from time to time, provided financial support for a variety of projects which, in various ways, have disseminated knowledge or have promoted to a wider public understanding of the law.

This, the 60th series of Lectures, was delivered by Professor Dame Hazel Genn at University College London and the University of Edinburgh. The Board of Trustees would like to record its appreciation to Professor Genn and also the two university law schools, which generously hosted these Lectures.

January 2008

KIM ECONOMIDES

Chairman of the Trustees
### THE HAMLYN LECTURES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Title and Author</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1949</td>
<td>Freedom under the Law by the Rt Hon. Lord Denning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1950</td>
<td>The Inheritance of the Common Law by Richard O'Sullivan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1951</td>
<td>The Rational Strength of English Law by Professor F. H. Lawson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1952</td>
<td>English Law and the Moral Law by Professor A. L. Goodhart</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1953</td>
<td>The Queen's Peace by Sir Carleton Kemp Allen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1954</td>
<td>Executive Discretion and Judicial Control by Professor C. J. Hamson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1955</td>
<td>The Proof of Guilt by Professor Glanville Williams</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1956</td>
<td>Trial by Jury by the Rt Hon. Lord Devlin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1957</td>
<td>Protection from Power under English Law by the Rt Hon. Lord MacDermott</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1958</td>
<td>The Sanctity of Contracts in English Law by Professor Sir David Hughes Parry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1959</td>
<td>Judge and Jurist in the Reign of Victoria by C. H. S. Fifoot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1960</td>
<td>The Common Law in India by M. C. Setalvad</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1961</td>
<td>British Justice: The Scottish Contribution by Professor Sir Thomas Smith</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1962</td>
<td>Lawyer and Litigant in England by the Rt Hon. Sir Robert Megarry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1963</td>
<td>Crime and the Criminal Law by the Baroness Wootton of Abinger</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1964</td>
<td>Law and Lawyers in the United States by Dean Erwin N. Griswold</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1965</td>
<td>New Law for a New World? by the Rt Hon. Lord Tanley</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1966</td>
<td>Other People's Law by the Rt Hon. Lord Kilbrandon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1968</td>
<td>Justice in the Welfare State by Professor H. Street</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1969</td>
<td>The British Tradition in Canadian Law by the Hon. Bora Laskin</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
THE HAMLYN LECTURES

1970 The English Judge by Henry Cecil
1971 Punishment, Prison and the Public by Professor Sir Rupert Cross
1972 Labour and the Law by Professor Sir Otto Kahn-Freund
1973 Maladministration and its Remedies by Sir Kenneth Wheare
1974 English Law – the New Dimension by the Rt Hon. Lord Scarman
1975 The Land and the Development; or, The Turmoil and the Torment by Sir Desmond Heap
1976 The National Insurance Commissioners by Sir Robert Micklethwait
1977 The European Communities and the Rule of Law by Lord Mackenzie Stuart
1978 Liberty, Law and Justice by Professor Sir Norman Anderson
1979 Social History and Law Reform by Professor Lord McGregor of Durrus
1980 Constitutional Fundamentals by Professor Sir William Wade
1982 The Quest for Security: Employees, Tenants, Wives by Professor Tony Honoré
1983 Hamlyn Revisited: The British Legal System Today by Lord Hailsham of St Marylebone
1984 The Development of Consumer Law and Policy – Bold Spirits and Timorous Souls by Sir Gordon Borrie
1985 Law and Order by Professor Ralf Dahrendorf
1986 The Fabric of English Civil Justice by Sir Jack Jacob
1987 Pragmatism and Theory in English Law by Professor P. S. Atiyah
1988 Justification and Excuse in the Criminal Law by Professor J. C. Smith
1989 Protection of the Public – A New Challenge by the Rt Hon. Lord Justice Woolf
1990 The United Kingdom and Human Rights by Dr Claire Palley
1991 Introducing a European Legal Order by Gordon Slynn
1992 Speech and Respect by Professor Richard Abel
1993 The Administration of Justice by Lord Mackay of Clashfern
THE HAMLYN LECTURES

1994 Blackstone's Tower: The English Law School by Professor William Twining
1995 From the Test Tube to the Coffin: Choice and Regulation in Private Life by the Hon. Mrs Justice Hale
1996 Turning Points of the Common law by the Rt Hon. The Lord Cooke of Thorndon
1997 Commercial Law in the Next Millennium by Professor Roy Goode
1998 Freedom Law and Justice by the Rt Hon. Lord Justice Sedley
1999 The State of Justice by Professor Michael Zander QC
2000 Does the United Kingdom still have a Constitution? by Professor Anthony King
2001 Human Rights, Serious Crime and Criminal Procedure by Professor Andrew Ashworth QC
2002 Legal Conundrums in our Brave New World by Baroness Kennedy of the Shaws
2003 Judicial Activism by the Hon. Justice Michael Kirby AC CMG
2004 Rights at Work: Global, European and British Perspectives by Sir Bob Hepple QC, FBA
2005 Can Human Rights Survive? by Professor Conor Gearty
2006 The Sovereignty of Law: The European Way by Sir Francis Jacobs KCMG, QC
2007 The Prisoners' Dilema by Professor Nicola Lacey
Acknowledgements

When Kim Economides, Chair of the Hamlyn Trustees, invited me to deliver the 2008 Hamlyn Lectures, I was honoured and daunted by the challenge of following such a distinguished list of predecessors. I am therefore very grateful to Kim for his support during the process of preparing the lectures. I am also grateful to Nicola Lacey, the 2007 Hamlyn Lecturer, for her encouragement and reassurance during the planning phase and to Sir Stephen Sedley for his advice. The first and last lectures were given at UCL and the second at Edinburgh University. I would like to thank Lady Hale for chairing the first lecture and Lord Clarke for chairing the final lecture. I am grateful to Professor Malcolm Grant, President and Provost of UCL, for making the time to preside over the final lecture, for his warm support throughout and for hosting the excellent final dinner. I am enormously indebted to Lisa Penfold of the Faculty of Laws at UCL for masterminding all of the invitations, replies, room bookings, receptions, menus and the thousand other things that needed to be done to ensure that everything ran smoothly. Lisa’s quiet and calm efficiency was always reassuring, and her kindness hugely appreciated. Professor Sir Timothy O’Shea, Principal of Edinburgh University, graciously chaired the second lecture and hosted an excellent and enjoyable dinner. I would also like to thank Professor Douglas Brodie and Alison Stirling of Edinburgh Law School for taking charge of arrangements...
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

there and for organizing the lecture in the beautiful Playfair Library.

I took over as Dean of the UCL Law Faculty a couple of months before the lectures and could not have completed the writing without the support and encouragement of my Dean’s Team, in particular John Lowry, Joanne Scott and Andrew Lewis. I also had valuable help from Rob Williams and Marc Mason. Edie Browne at Hong Kong University provided me with equipment, support and much printing out of articles and I am grateful to her and to Pauline Tang for being so accommodating. Neil Andrews kindly sent me material and I benefited from comments on the book manuscript from Judith Resnik, Peter Graham Harris, Lord Woolf and Tony Allen. In June 2009 a seminar was held at UCL to discuss the issues raised in the lectures with a distinguished panel comprising: Lord Woolf, Professor Michael Zander, Tony Allen, Professor Richard Moorhead and Professor Judith Resnik. I am grateful to the panellists for taking the time to offer their own perspectives on the lectures.

Finally, I want to pay tribute to Bea and Matt Appleby for instilling a sense of proportion at demanding times and to my husband Daniel Appleby for his rock-like support and willingness, as ever, to read and comment on drafts in the middle of the night.

August 2009

HAZEL GENN
University College London

xvi