

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11883-5 - Explaining Institutional Change: Ambiguity, Agency, and Power

Edited by James Mahoney and Kathleen Thelen

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## Explaining Institutional Change

### *Ambiguity, Agency, and Power*

This book contributes to emerging debates in political science and sociology on institutional change. Its introductory essay proposes a new framework for analyzing incremental change that is grounded in a power-distributional view of institutions and that emphasizes ongoing struggles within but also over prevailing institutional arrangements. Five empirical essays then bring the general theory to life by evaluating its causal propositions in the context of sustained analyses of specific instances of incremental change. These essays range widely across substantive topics and across times and places, including cases from the United States, Africa, Latin America, and Asia. The book closes with a chapter reflecting on the possibilities for productive exchange in the analysis of change among scholars associated with different theoretical approaches to institutions.

James Mahoney is the Fitzgerald Professor of Economic History and a professor of political science and sociology at Northwestern University. He is the author of *The Legacies of Liberalism: Path Dependence and Political Regimes in Central America* (2001), which received the Barrington Moore Jr. Prize of the Comparative and Historical Section of the American Sociological Association. He is also coeditor of *Comparative Historical Analysis in the Social Sciences* (Cambridge University Press, 2003), which received the Giovanni Sartori Book Award of the Qualitative Methods Section of the American Political Science Association. His most recent book is *Colonialism and Postcolonial Development: Spanish America in Comparative Perspective* (Cambridge University Press, 2010).

Kathleen Thelen is a Ford Professor of Political Science at the Massachusetts Institute of Technology. She also holds appointments at the Max Planck Institute for the Study of Societies in Germany and at Oxford University, and she is an elected member of the Berlin-Brandenburg Academy of Sciences and Humanities. She is the author, most recently, of *How Institutions Evolve* (Cambridge University Press, 2004), co-winner of the Woodrow Wilson Foundation Award of the American Political Science Association and winner of the Mattei Dogan Award of the Society for Comparative Research. She has served as chair of the Council for European Studies (Columbia University), as president of the Politics and History Section of the American Political Science Association, and as president of the Society for the Advancement of Socio-Economics.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11883-5 - Explaining Institutional Change: Ambiguity, Agency, and Power

Edited by James Mahoney and Kathleen Thelen

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

# Explaining Institutional Change

*Ambiguity, Agency, and Power*

Edited by

**JAMES MAHONEY**

*Northwestern University*

**KATHLEEN THELEN**

*Massachusetts Institute of Technology*



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11883-5 - Explaining Institutional Change: Ambiguity, Agency, and Power

Edited by James Mahoney and Kathleen Thelen

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore,  
São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo

Cambridge University Press

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9780521134323](http://www.cambridge.org/9780521134323)

© Cambridge University Press 2010

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written  
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2010

Printed in the United States of America

*A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

*Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data*

Explaining institutional change : ambiguity, agency, and power / edited by James  
Mahoney, Kathleen Thelen.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-11883-5 (hardback) – ISBN 978-0-521-13432-3 (pbk.)

I. Organizational change. 2. Institutional economics. I. Mahoney, James.

II. Thelen, Kathleen Ann. III. Title.

JF1525.O73E97 2009

352.3'67 – dc22

2009009398

ISBN 978-0-521-11883-5 Hardback

ISBN 978-0-521-13432-3 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or  
accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in  
this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is,  
or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11883-5 - Explaining Institutional Change: Ambiguity, Agency, and Power

Edited by James Mahoney and Kathleen Thelen

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## Contents

<i>List of Illustrations</i>	<i>page</i> vi
<i>Contributors</i>	vii
<i>Preface</i>	xi
1 A Theory of Gradual Institutional Change <i>James Mahoney and Kathleen Thelen</i>	1
2 Infiltrating the State: The Evolution of Health Care Reforms in Brazil, 1964–1988 <i>Tulia G. Falletti</i>	38
3 The Contradictory Potential of Institutions: The Rise and Decline of Land Documentation in Kenya <i>Ato Kwamena Onoma</i>	63
4 Policymaking as Political Constraint: Institutional Development in the U.S. Social Security Program <i>Alan M. Jacobs</i>	94
5 Altering Authoritarianism: Institutional Complexity and Autocratic Agency in Indonesia <i>Dan Slater</i>	132
6 Rethinking Rules: Creativity and Constraint in the U.S. House of Representatives <i>Adam Sheingate</i>	168
7 Historical Institutionalism in Rationalist and Sociological Perspective <i>Peter A. Hall</i>	204
<i>Index</i>	225
	v

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11883-5 - Explaining Institutional Change: Ambiguity, Agency, and Power

Edited by James Mahoney and Kathleen Thelen

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## List of Illustrations

### Tables

1.1. Types of Gradual Change	<i>page</i> 16
1.2. Contextual and Institutional Sources of Institutional Change	19
1.3. Types of Change Agents	23
1.4. Contextual and Institutional Sources of Change Agents	28
1.5. Coalitional Alignments	30
4.1. Key Institutional Developments in Social Security Financing, 1935–1983	107
6.1. Size, Workload, and Rules in the U.S. House of Representatives, 1st–46th Congresses	175

### Figures

1.1. Framework for Explaining Modes of Institutional Change	15
5.1. A Dynamic Typology of Authoritarian Institutions	135
5.2. Dynamics of Authoritarian Institutions in Indonesia	139
6.1. Rules and Precedents of the U.S. House of Representatives	178

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11883-5 - Explaining Institutional Change: Ambiguity, Agency, and Power

Edited by James Mahoney and Kathleen Thelen

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

## Contributors

**Tulia G. Falletti** is an assistant professor of political science at the University of Pennsylvania. She is the author of *Decentralization and Subnational Politics in Latin America* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2010), as well as several articles and book chapters on federalism and decentralization. Her article “A Sequential Theory of Decentralization: Latin American Cases in Comparative Perspective” (*American Political Science Review*, vol. 99, no. 3, August 2005) won the 2006 Gregory Luebbert Award from the Comparative Politics section of the American Political Science Association for the best article in comparative politics.

**Peter A. Hall** is Krupp Foundation Professor of European Studies at Harvard University and codirector of the Program on Successful Societies for the Canadian Institute for Advanced Research. He is the author of *Governing the Economy: The Politics of State Intervention in Britain and France* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1986) and more than seventy articles on European politics and policymaking. His edited books include *The Political Power of Economic Ideas: Keynesianism across Nations* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1989), *Varieties of Capitalism: The Institutional Foundations of Comparative Advantage* (with David Soskice; Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001), and *Successful Societies: How Institutions and Culture Affect Health* (with Michèle Lamont; Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009).

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11883-5 - Explaining Institutional Change: Ambiguity, Agency, and Power

Edited by James Mahoney and Kathleen Thelen

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

viii

*Contributors*

**Alan M. Jacobs** is an assistant professor of political science at the University of British Columbia. He is the author of several articles and chapters on comparative public policy, including “The Politics of When: Redistribution, Investment, and Policymaking for the Long Term” (*British Journal of Political Science*, 38:2, 2008), which won the 2009 Mary Parker Follett Award from the Politics and History Section of the American Political Science Association. Jacobs is currently completing a book, under contract with Cambridge University Press, about how elected governments make policy trade-offs between short-term and long-term social consequences.

**James Mahoney** is the Fitzgerald Professor of Economic History and a professor of political science and sociology at Northwestern University. He is the author of *The Legacies of Liberalism: Path Dependence and Political Regimes in Central America* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2001) and coeditor with Dietrich Rueschemeyer of *Comparative Historical Analysis in the Social Sciences* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2003). His work also includes articles on small-N and comparative-historical methods. Mahoney’s most recent book is *Colonialism and Postcolonial Development: Spanish America in Comparative Perspective* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2010).

**Ato Kwamena Onoma** is an assistant professor of political science at Yale University. He received his BA in philosophy from the University of Ghana, Legon, and his PhD in political science from Northwestern University in 2006. He is the author of a book from Cambridge University Press, *The Politics of Property Rights Institutions in Africa* (2010). He is currently studying relations between refugees and host populations in postcolonial Africa.

**Adam Sheingate** is an associate professor of political science at Johns Hopkins University. He is the author of *The Rise of the Agricultural Welfare State: Institutions and Interest Group Power in the United States, France, and Japan* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2001), as well as several articles and book chapters on American politics and comparative public policy. He is a former Robert Wood Johnson Foundation Scholar in Health Policy at the University of California-Berkeley and was a Prize Research Fellow in Politics at Nuffield College, Oxford.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11883-5 - Explaining Institutional Change: Ambiguity, Agency, and Power

Edited by James Mahoney and Kathleen Thelen

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

*Contributors*

ix

**Dan Slater** is an assistant professor of political science at the University of Chicago. He is a coeditor of *Southeast Asia in Political Science: Theory, Region, and Qualitative Analysis* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2008) and is currently completing a book manuscript examining how divergent historical patterns of contentious politics have shaped variation in state power and authoritarian durability in seven Southeast Asian countries. His articles have appeared in such journals as the *American Journal of Political Science*, *American Journal of Sociology*, *Comparative Politics*, *International Organization*, and *Studies in Comparative International Development*.

**Kathleen Thelen** is a Ford Professor of Political Science at the Massachusetts Institute of Technology; Permanent External Member of the Max Planck Institute for the Study of Societies in Cologne, Germany; and Senior Research Fellow at Nuffield College, Oxford University. Her two most recent books are *How Institutions Evolve: The Political Economy of Skills in Germany, Britain, the United States, and Japan* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2004) and *Beyond Continuity: Institutional Change in Advanced Political Economies* (coedited with Wolfgang Streeck; Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005).



Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11883-5 - Explaining Institutional Change: Ambiguity, Agency, and Power

Edited by James Mahoney and Kathleen Thelen

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## Preface

Until recently, gradual institutional change has not been a central focus of explanation in the social sciences. Instead, most institutional analysts have considered change during moments of abrupt, wholesale transformation. Yet it is not clear that such episodes of institutional upheaval capture the most common ways through which political institutions change over time. A growing body of work suggests that important changes often take place incrementally and through seemingly small adjustments that can, however, cumulate into significant institutional transformation. These forms of gradual institutional change call for more attention than they have received so far.

The present volume seeks to respond to this call. In the introduction, we propose a theory of gradual institutional change grounded in a power-distributional view of institutions that emphasizes ongoing struggles within but also over prevailing institutional arrangements. On this view, analyses of stability and change are intimately linked. Institutional stability is a function not simply of positive feedback but of active, ongoing political mobilization, and institutions are vulnerable to change not just in moments of crisis but on a more ongoing basis. Features of the overarching context and the properties of the institutions themselves hold the key to understanding the processes through which such change can be accomplished. We emphasize in particular that institutional rules are subject to varying interpretations and levels of enforcement and therefore exhibit ambiguities that provide space for interested agents to exploit in their effort to alter them. We use

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11883-5 - Explaining Institutional Change: Ambiguity, Agency, and Power

Edited by James Mahoney and Kathleen Thelen

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

these orientations to develop causal propositions about the connections among particular types of institutions, strategies for change, and modes of gradual institutional transformation.

The five empirical essays that follow the introduction bring these propositions to life in the context of sustained analyses of specific instances of incremental change. These chapters span a wide spectrum of substantive topics and political contexts. The authors examine instances of institutional change in Africa, Southeast Asia, and Latin America as well as in the United States, and they consider changes in diverse institutions, from the rules governing the conduct of business within the U.S. Congress to the system of property rights in postcolonial Kenya. Even as they develop their own insights about the specific cases under study, the authors also apply and elaborate the general theoretical framework presented in the introduction.

Our point of departure for thinking about institutional change builds on insights coming out of a body of work broadly associated, as we are, with historical institutionalism. However, the theory we develop in this book, and the specific propositions we lay out, can be fruitfully taken up by scholars associated with any of the various “isms” in institutional analysis. In this spirit, the book concludes with an essay by Peter A. Hall reflecting on the possibilities for productive exchange in the analysis of change between historical-institutionalist scholars and scholars associated with rational-choice and sociological approaches to institutions.

It is our great pleasure to be able now to acknowledge formally those individuals and organizations that made this book possible. This volume grew out of a conference at Northwestern University in October 2007. Our largest debt is to the participants in that conference, for many of the insights contained in the pages to follow came out of the stimulating discussions we had over two days together. In conceiving the project, we sought to gather together some of the best recent work on institutional change undertaken by a new generation of institutional analysts. We are grateful to these authors, who brought fresh insights and original empirical material from their respective fields of study to provide a rich foundation for the discussion. We were also extremely fortunate to have secured the participation of a distinguished group of more senior scholars to serve as discussants at the conference.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11883-5 - Explaining Institutional Change: Ambiguity, Agency, and Power

Edited by James Mahoney and Kathleen Thelen

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

*Preface*

xiii

Anna Grzymala-Busse, Peter A. Hall, Desmond S. King, Paul Pierson, Theda Skocpol, and Sven Steinmo provided detailed comments on the individual papers but also shaped this volume (and our own thinking) through their broad commentary on the project as a whole. We thank Peter A. Hall especially for going a step further to deliver a characteristically insightful and synthetic concluding chapter to round out the volume.

We are enormously grateful to the Roberta Buffett Center for International and Comparative Studies of Northwestern University for funding this conference. The Buffett Center is home to Northwestern's Program in Comparative Historical Social Science, a tight-knit group of faculty and graduate students from sociology and political science that provides the core intellectual community out of which this project grew. The center's past and current directors – Andrew Wachtel and Hendrik Spruyt – and its associate director – Brian Hanson – offered their encouragement and provided support of all varieties from the inception of the project to its completion. The center's staff, and in particular Diana Snyder, made the conference logistics easy for us.

It is always a real pleasure to work with Lewis Bateman at Cambridge University Press, who was immediately enthusiastic about this project and who oversaw the book's production with his characteristic efficiency and good humor. Finally, working together on this project has been a wonderful intellectual and personal experience for us. It gave the two of us a reason for bringing together different generations of institutional analysts and an opportunity to think together about problems of institutional change.

James Mahoney  
Kathleen Thelen

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11883-5 - Explaining Institutional Change: Ambiguity, Agency, and Power

Edited by James Mahoney and Kathleen Thelen

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

**Explaining Institutional Change**  
*Ambiguity, Agency, and Power*