

## Liszt as Transcriber

Franz Liszt's colleagues considered him to be one of the most accomplished and innovative practitioners in the field of musical reproduction, a reputation for which he is still admired today. Yet, while his transcriptions are widely performed, few studies have investigated the role that transcriptions played in Liszt's artistry, to say nothing of the impact they had on the music-making experience of his day. Using a host of interdisciplinary methods and primary source materials, this book provides a comprehensive survey of Liszt's lifelong involvement with the transcription, in which he assumed the roles of composer, collaborator, propagandist, commemorator, philosopher, and artist while simultaneously disseminating – often critically – the music of Beethoven, Berlioz, Schubert, Wagner, and other eighteenth- and nineteenth-century composers. By recognizing transcription as an extraordinarily flexible tool for Liszt and his contemporaries, *Liszt as Transcriber* provides numerous musical, cultural, and historical contexts for this fundamentally important practice of the period.

JONATHAN KREGOR is Assistant Professor of Music at the College-Conservatory of Music, University of Cincinnati. He specializes in music of the long nineteenth century, and his articles and reviews have appeared in many publications, including *The Musical Quarterly*, *Nineteenth-Century Music Review*, and *The Journal of Musicology*. He has edited volumes of C. P. E. Bach's keyboard music for *C. P. E. Bach: The Complete Works* and is preparing an edition of Clara Schumann's unpublished piano transcriptions.

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-11777-7 - Liszt as Transcriber  
Jonathan Kregor  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

# Liszt as Transcriber

—  
JONATHAN KREGOR



Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-11777-7 - Liszt as Transcriber  
Jonathan Kregor  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore,  
São Paulo, Delhi, Dubai, Tokyo, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press  
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9780521117777](http://www.cambridge.org/9780521117777)

© Jonathan Kregor 2010

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2010

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

*A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data*

Kregor, Jonathan, 1978–

Liszt as transcriber / Jonathan Kregor.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and indexes.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-11777-7 (hardback)

1. Liszt, Franz, 1811–1886 – Adaptations – History and criticism. 2. Piano music, Arranged – History and criticism. 3. Arrangement (Music) I. Title.

ML410.L7K84 2010

786.2'138092 – dc22 2010038763

ISBN 978-0-521-11777-7 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

## Contents

*List of examples* [page vi]

*List of figures* [ix]

*List of tables* [x]

*Acknowledgments* [xi]

*Notes on the text* [xiii]

Introduction: The visible transcriber [1]

1 Models and methods [9]

2 Collaboration and content [41]

3 Compositional fantasies [75]

4 Monuments and mythologies [112]

5 Opera and drama [149]

6 Stylistic reconstructions [186]

*Notes* [220]

*Bibliography* [275]

*Index* [291]

## Examples

- 1.1 Mozart/Czerny, “Lacrimosa,” mm. 1–3, 22–30. [page 21]  
 1.2 Leo, “Ave maris stella,” mm. 1–4, with Fétis’s piano reduction. [24]  
 1.3 Mozart/Thalberg, “Lacrimosa,” mm. 3–6, 21–22. [26]  
 1.4 Mozart/Liszt, “Lacrimosa,” mm. 22–26. [31]  
 2.1 Berlioz/Liszt, *Symphonie fantastique*, I, mm. 22–25. [47]  
 2.2a Berlioz/Liszt, *Symphonie fantastique*, I, mm. 72–86. [48]  
 2.2b Berlioz/Liszt, *Symphonie fantastique*, II, mm. 120–124. [48]  
 2.2c Berlioz/Liszt, *Symphonie fantastique*, III, mm. 90–95. [49]  
 2.3 Berlioz/Liszt, *Symphonie fantastique*, II, mm. 131–146. [53]  
 2.4 Berlioz/Liszt, *Francs-juges* Overture, earlier version of mm. 116–134 [D-WRgs, GSA 60/U 57, p. 16, underside of collette]. [55]  
 2.5 Berlioz/Liszt, *Roi Lear* Overture, earlier version of mm. 164–168 [D-WRgs, GSA 60/U 43, p. 10, beneath collette]. [56]  
 2.6 Berlioz/Liszt, *Symphonie fantastique*, II, mm. 163–170. [65]  
 2.7 Berlioz/Liszt, *Symphonie fantastique*, V, mm. 293–296. [66]  
 2.8 Berlioz/Liszt, *Symphonie fantastique*, II, mm. 346–350. [67]  
 2.9a Berlioz/Liszt, *Symphonie fantastique*, IV, mm. 114–122 (1834). [68]  
 2.9b Berlioz/Liszt, *Symphonie fantastique*, IV, mm. 226–234 (1866). [69]  
 3.1a Schubert/Liszt, “Ständchen,” mm. 71–74. [77]  
 3.1b Schubert/Liszt, “Ständchen,” mm. 87–92. [77]  
 3.2 Schubert, “Rast,” mm. 6–10. [88]  
 3.3 Schubert, “Frühlingstraum,” mm. 36–38. [89]  
 3.4 Schubert/Liszt, “Wasserflut,” mm. 1–4 (= 14–17, 29–32). [90]  
 3.5 Schubert/Liszt, “Der Lindenbaum,” mm. 61–73, without ossia. [91]  
 3.6 Schubert/Liszt, “Täuschung,” mm. 55–58. [93]  
 3.7a Schubert/Liszt, “Erstarrung,” mm. 63–69, with autograph emendations [f. 9r.]. [94]  
 3.7b Schubert/Liszt, “Erstarrung,” mm. 74–81. [95]

- 3.8 Schubert/Liszt, “Gute Nacht,” mm. 61–65. [96]
- 3.9 Schubert/Liszt, “Mut,” mm. 5–7, with autograph emendations [f. 7r.]. [97]
- 3.10 Schubert/Liszt, “Gute Nacht,” mm. 1–11. [98]
- 3.11 Schubert/Liszt, “Gute Nacht,” mm. 111–115. [99]
- 3.12 Czerny, *Drei brillante Fantasien über die beliebtesten Motive aus Franz Schuberts Werken*, op. 339, no. 1, mm. 335–351. [105]
- 3.13a Schubert/Czerny, “Gruppe aus dem Tartarus,” mm. 31–33. [109]
- 3.13b Schubert/Czerny, “Gruppe aus dem Tartarus,” mm. 44–57. [110]
- 4.1 Selected arrangements of Beethoven, Fifth Symphony, mm. 1–9.  
 A. Otto Dresel B. Percy Goetschius C. Franz Liszt D. W. Watts.  
 [116]
- 4.2 Liszt, “Un soir dans les montagnes,” mm. 97–99 (1836). [125]
- 4.3a Liszt, “Un soir dans les montagnes,” mm. 142–149 (1836). [126]
- 4.3b Beethoven/Liszt, Sixth Symphony, IV, mm. 103–111 (1840).  
 [127]
- 4.4a Beethoven/Liszt, Sixth Symphony, IV, mm. 146–155 (1840).  
 [128]
- 4.4b Liszt, “Un soir dans les montagnes,” mm. 281–296 (1836). [128]
- 4.5 Liszt, “Un soir dans les montagnes,” mm. 92–96 (1836). [129]
- 4.6 Rossini/Liszt, *Guillaume Tell* Overture, mm. 48–53. [130]
- 4.7 Rossini/Liszt, *Guillaume Tell* Overture, mm. 92–95, without ossia.  
 [130]
- 4.8 Beethoven/Liszt, Fifth Symphony, IV, mm. 1–37 (1840). [139]
- 4.9 Thalberg, *Souvenir de Beethoven*, op. 39, mm. 470–486. [142]
- 4.10 Beethoven/Liszt, Third Symphony, II, mm. 69–72 (1842). [147]
- 4.11 Beethoven/Liszt, Third Symphony, II, mm. 200–202 (1842).  
 [147]
- 5.1a Weber, *Oberon* Overture, mm. 23–34, arr. Weber. [157]
- 5.1b Weber/Liszt, *Oberon* Overture, mm. 23–34. [158]
- 5.2 Weber, *Oberon* Overture, mm. 23–34. [160]
- 5.3 Schubert, Impromptu, D899/3, mm. 55–57, Liszt edition,  
 fingering omitted. [165]
- 5.4 Weber, Piano Sonata in C Major, op. 20, I, mm. 42–49. [166]
- 5.5 Wagner/Liszt, “O du mein holder Abendstern,” mm. 104–115.  
 [169]
- 5.6 Wagner/Liszt, *Tannhäuser* Overture, earlier version of mm.  
 227–239 [D-EI, Richard-Wagner-Museum, pp. 18–19].  
 Bracketed portion reconstructed by analogy with adjacent  
 measures. [176]

- 5.7 Wagner/Liszt, *Tannhäuser* Overture, earlier version of mm. 300–307 [D-EI, Richard-Wagner-Museum, p. 24]. [178]
- 5.8 Wagner/Liszt, *Isoldens Liebestod*, mm. 1–4. [181]
- 5.9 Earlier introductions to Wagner/Liszt, *Isoldens Liebestod* [D-WRgs, GSA 60, U32, p. 1]. A. Earliest version. B. Subsequent version. [182]
- 6.1a Development of the “Glocken” motive in Wagner/Liszt, *Feierlicher Marsch zum heiligen Gral*, mm. 1–23. [188]
- 6.1b Wagner/Liszt, *Feierlicher Marsch zum heiligen Gral*, mm. 153–159. [188]
- 6.2 Liszt, first *Apparition*, mm. 1–4. [194]
- 6.3 Liszt, *Harmonies poétiques et religieuses*, mm. 1–4 (1834). [196]
- 6.4 Liszt, *Harmonies poétiques et religieuses*, mm. 121–124 (1834). [196]
- 6.5 Saint-Saëns, *Danse macabre*, op. 40, main theme. [204]
- 6.6 Saint-Saëns/Liszt, *Danse macabre*, mm. 655–670. [204]
- 6.7a Saint-Saëns/Liszt, *Danse macabre*, mm. 231–240. [204]
- 6.7b Liszt, *Via Crucis*, Station XII, mm. 116–124. [205]
- 6.8 Augmented sixth chord in the *Danse macabre*, and the generated “Gypsy” scale. [205]
- 6.9 Saint-Saëns/Liszt, *Danse macabre*, mm. 608–623. [206]
- 6.10a Cui, *Tarantelle*, op. 12, mm. 5–8. [209]
- 6.10b Cui/Liszt, *Tarantelle*, mm. 229–234. [209]
- 6.11 Cui/Liszt, *Tarantelle*, mm. 613–650. [210]
- 6.12 Cui/Liszt, *Tarantelle*, mm. 686–695. [211]
- 6.13a Liszt, third *Apparition*, mm. 12–18. [212]
- 6.13b Liszt, third *Apparition*, mm. 172–188. [213]
- 6.14 Verdi/Liszt, “Agnus Dei,” first version, m. 56ff. [D-WRgs, GSA 60/Y12]. [214]
- 6.15 Verdi/Liszt, “Agnus Dei,” second version, m. 56ff. [D-WRgs, GSA 60/Y12]. [215]
- 6.16 Verdi/Liszt, “Agnus Dei,” published version, m. 56ff. [216]
- 6.17 Liszt, “Nun ruhen alle Wälder,” mm. 24–43. [217]

## Figures

- 1.1 Mozart/Liszt, “Lacrimosa,” autograph, detail [US-Wc, ML96.L58 S550, f. 2v.]. [page 34]
- 3.1 Schubert/Liszt, *Winterreise*, autograph, title page, detail [H-BI, Ms. mus. L8, f. 1r.]. [79]
- 3.2 Trichords in Schubert/Liszt, *Winterreise*. [85]
- 3.3 Schubert/Liszt, “Der Leiermann,” autograph, detail [f. 10r.]. [100]
- 3.4 Schubert/Liszt, “Täuschung,” autograph, detail [f. 10v.]. [100]
- 4.1 Josef Danhauser, *Liszt am Flügel*. [113]



## Tables

- 2.1 Print genealogy of Berlioz/Liszt, *Symphonie fantastique* and related items, 1834–1877. [page 58]
- 2.2 Liszt's public performances of his arrangement of the *Symphonie fantastique*. [60]
- 3.1 Clara Wieck's anticipated programs for two Berlin concerts (1839). [80]
- 3.2 Manuscript sources for Schubert/Liszt, *Schwanengesang*, in suspected order of completion. [82]
- 3.3 Harmonic structure of Schubert/Liszt, *Winterreise*. [84]
- 3.4 Schubert arrangements as listed in Liszt's 1877 catalog. [102]
- 5.1 Permutations of the Pilgrims' Chorus accompaniment in Wagner/Liszt, *Tannhäuser* Overture. [172]
- 6.1 Liszt's arrangements of foreign material for solo piano (1869–1886), excluding revisions, ordered according to nationality of source composer and titled after LW. [201]

## Acknowledgments

I am privileged and humbled to recognize those who have offered help, encouragement, and insight over the years. Foremost thanks go to Alexander Rehding, who from the beginning has offered impeccable guidance and vigorous support with a mixture of professionalism and friendship that I can only hope to emulate. Casual or concentrated exchanges with Kofi Agawu, Carolyn Abbate, Aaron Allen, David Black, Reinhold Brinkmann, Mauro Calcagno, Megan Durbin, Ellen Exner, Sean Gallagher, Richard Giarusso, Kenneth Griffiths, Thomas Forrest Kelly, Zoë Lang, Amy Lewkowitz, Evan MacCarthy, Balázs Mikusi, Karen Painter, Gina Rivera, Matthias Röder, Anne Schreffler, Christoph Wolff, and Susan Youens helped refine my material immeasurably.

In the model of their spiritus rector, Lisztians far and wide generously offered advice, expertise, and aid. I sincerely thank Detlef Altenburg, David Cannata, Anna Celenza, James Deaville, Zsuzsanna Domokos, Mária Eckhardt, Christopher Gibbs, Dana Gooley, Klára Hamburger, Kenneth Hamilton, Jeffrey Kallberg, Matthew Kregor, Alicia Levin, Evelyn Liepsch, Ralph Locke, Shay Loya, Bruno Moysan, Rena Mueller, Simon Obert, Judith Picard, Michael Saffle, Jim Samson, László von Szentpály, Götz Traxdorf, David Trippett, Gerhard Winkler, and this book's anonymous readers. All have been invaluable sources of knowledge and encouragement. A special note of gratitude must go to the late Violet Lustig Berger, my former piano teacher, whose stories about Liszt enraptured me during our lessons and compelled me to learn more about him and his music.

This study would have been unthinkable without the help of the many libraries and archives that granted me access to their holdings and promptly responded to queries: Staatsbibliothek zu Berlin – Preussischer Kulturbesitz; Liszt Ferenc Zeneművészeti Főiskola, Könyvtár (Budapest); Országos Széchényi Könyvtár (Budapest); Eda Kuhn Loeb Music Library (Cambridge, MA); CCM Library and Archives and Rare Books Library (Cincinnati, OH); Thüringer Museum (Eisenach); Burgenländisches Landesmuseum (Eisenstadt); Robert Lienau Musikverlag/Musikverlag Zimmermann (Frankfurt/Main); Bibliothek des Händel-Hauses (Halle an der Saale);

Gesellschaft der Musikfreunde (Vienna); Österreichische Nationalbibliothek (Vienna); Wiener Stadt- und Landesbibliothek (Vienna); Library of Congress (Washington, DC); Goethe- und Schillerarchiv (Weimar). Zsuzsanna Domokos of the Liszt Ferenc Zeneművészeti Főiskola, Könyvtár, kindly granted me permission to reproduce the figures in Chapter 3.

At Cambridge University Press, Vicki Cooper, Rebecca Jones, and Rosina Di Marzo patiently guided me through every aspect of the publication process, their keen editorial eyes further improving the text along the way. I am indebted to Andrew Shackleton for careful readings and helpful suggestions during the copy-editing stage. Earlier versions of Chapters 2 and 6 were published respectively in *The Journal of Musicology* 24, no. 2 (2007): 195–236, and *The Musical Quarterly* 91, nos. 3–4 (2008): 200–239.

My parents, brothers, parents-in-law, *Familie Lange*, and extended family have been unfailing in their support, checking in with genuine interest and cheering with genuine relief when I passed this or that compositional milestone. My wife Emily has been encouraging me from the start, and our son Isaac, born as this project was nearing completion, has been an infinite source of joy. To them I lovingly dedicate this book.

## Notes on the text

The following abbreviations are used in the notes:

---

CCL	Kenneth Hamilton, ed., <i>The Cambridge Companion to Liszt</i> (Cambridge University Press, 2005).
CG	Hector Berlioz, <i>Correspondance générale</i> , gen. ed. Pierre Citron. 8 vols. (Paris: Flammarion, 1972–2003).
FLHW	Dana Gooley and Christopher H. Gibbs, eds., <i>Franz Liszt and His World</i> (Princeton, NJ and Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2006).
Liszt/d'Agoult, <i>Correspondance</i>	Franz Liszt and Marie d'Agoult, <i>Correspondance</i> , ed. Serge Gut and Jacqueline Bellas (Paris: Fayard, 2001).
Liszt/Wagner, <i>Briefwechsel</i>	Franz Liszt and Richard Wagner, <i>Briefwechsel</i> , ed. Hanjo Kesting (Frankfurt am Main: Insel Verlag, 1988).
Liszt, <i>Artist's Journey</i>	Franz Liszt, <i>An Artist's Journey: Lettres d'un bachelier ès musique, 1835–1841</i> , ed. and trans. Charles Suttoni (University of Chicago Press, 1989).
Liszt, <i>Briefe</i>	Franz Liszt, <i>Briefe</i> , ed. La Mara. 8 vols. (Leipzig: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1893–1902).
Liszt, SS	Franz Liszt, <i>Sämtliche Schriften</i> , gen. ed. Detlef Altenburg. 9 vols. (Wiesbaden: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1989–).
LW	Rena Charnin Mueller and Mária Eckhardt, <i>Thematisches Verzeichnis der Werke Franz Liszts</i> (Munich: Henle, in preparation); preliminary listing in “Liszt, Franz,” in <i>The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians</i> , 2nd edn., ed. Stanley Sadie (London: Macmillan, 2001), 14:785–872.
NLA	Franz Liszt, <i>Neue Ausgabe sämtlicher Werke</i> , ed. Imre Mező <i>et al.</i> (Budapest: Editio Musica Budapest, 1970–).
Walker, <i>Liszt</i>	Alan Walker, <i>Franz Liszt</i> , rev. edn. 3 vols. (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1987–1997).

---

References to Liszt's piano works follow the bar numbering established by the *NLA*.

The orthography of proper names (e.g. “Liszt,” “Beethoven,” etc.) and other archaic spellings as given in primary sources, including music examples, have not been corrected.

Unless otherwise noted, all translations are by the author.