

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11762-3 - The Rise of Heritage: Preserving the Past in France, Germany and England, 1789–1914

Astrid Swenson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

## THE RISE OF HERITAGE

Where does our fascination for ‘heritage’ originate? This groundbreaking comparative study of preservation in France, Germany and England looks beyond national borders to reveal how the idea of heritage emerged from intense competition and collaboration in a global context. Astrid Swenson follows the ‘heritage-makers’ from the French Revolution to the First World War, revealing the importance of global networks driving developments in each country. Drawing on documentary, literary and visual sources, the book connects high politics and daily life and uncovers how, through travel, correspondence, world fairs and international congresses, the preservationists exchanged ideas, helped each other campaign and dreamed of establishing international institutions for the protection of heritage. Yet, these heritage-makers were also animated by fierce rivalry as international tension grew. This mixture of international collaboration and competition created the European culture of heritage, which defined preservation as integral to modernity, and still shapes current institutions and debates.

ASTRID SWENSON is Lecturer in European History at Brunel University, London. Her previous publications include *From Plunder to Preservation: Britain and the Heritage of Empire, c. 1800–1940* (co-edited with Peter Mandler, 2013).

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11762-3 - The Rise of Heritage: Preserving the Past in France, Germany  
and England, 1789–1914

Astrid Swenson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

NEW STUDIES IN EUROPEAN HISTORY

*Edited by*

PETER BALDWIN, University of California, Los Angeles

CHRISTOPHER CLARK, University of Cambridge

JAMES B. COLLINS, Georgetown University

MIA RODRÍGUEZ-SALGADO, London School of Economics and  
Political Science

LYNDAL ROPER, University of Oxford

TIMOTHY SNYDER, Yale University

The aim of this series in early modern and modern European history is to publish outstanding works of research, addressed to important themes across a wide geographical range, from southern and central Europe, to Scandinavia and Russia, from the time of the Renaissance to the Second World War. As it develops, the series will comprise focused works of wide contextual range and intellectual ambition.

*A full list of titles published in the series can be found at:*  
[www.cambridge.org/newstudiesineuropeanhistory](http://www.cambridge.org/newstudiesineuropeanhistory)

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11762-3 - The Rise of Heritage: Preserving the Past in France, Germany  
and England, 1789–1914

Astrid Swenson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

# THE RISE OF HERITAGE

*Preserving the Past in France, Germany and  
England, 1789–1914*

ASTRID SWENSON

*Brunel University*



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-11762-3 - The Rise of Heritage: Preserving the Past in France, Germany  
and England, 1789–1914  
Astrid Swenson  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of  
education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9780521117623](http://www.cambridge.org/9780521117623)

© Astrid Swenson 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written  
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2013

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd. Padstow, Cornwall

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

ISBN 978-0-521-11762-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of  
URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication,  
and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain,  
accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11762-3 - The Rise of Heritage: Preserving the Past in France, Germany  
and England, 1789–1914

Astrid Swenson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

*To my parents*

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11762-3 - The Rise of Heritage: Preserving the Past in France, Germany  
and England, 1789–1914

Astrid Swenson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11762-3 - The Rise of Heritage: Preserving the Past in France, Germany  
and England, 1789–1914

Astrid Swenson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Contents*

<i>List of illustrations</i>	<i>page</i> viii
<i>List of tables</i>	xiii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xiv
<i>Abbreviations</i>	xvii
Introduction	I
PART I NATIONAL HERITAGE MOVEMENTS	23
1 In search of origins	25
2 The heritage-makers	66
PART II INTERNATIONAL MEETING-POINTS	145
3 Exhibition mania	147
4 ‘Peace and goodwill among nations’	187
PART III TRANSNATIONAL CAMPAIGNS	237
5 ‘A Morris Dance Round St Mark’s’	239
6 ‘A yardstick for a people’s cultural attainment’	273
Conclusion	329
<i>Glossary of foreign terms</i>	337
<i>Bibliography</i>	341
<i>Index</i>	400

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11762-3 - The Rise of Heritage: Preserving the Past in France, Germany and England, 1789–1914

Astrid Swenson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Illustrations*

Cover: Albert René, 'Le Maître-Imagier Albert Robida, créateur du Vieux-Paris', *L'Exposition comique*, no. 4, 5 May 1900, cover. By permission of the Association des Amis d'Albert Robida, Laurent Antoine, [www.robida.info/documents/oeuvres\\_historien/texte\\_historien.html](http://www.robida.info/documents/oeuvres_historien/texte_historien.html).

- |     |   |         |
|-----|---|---------|
| 1.1 | Pierre Joseph Lafontaine, 'Alexandre Lenoir défend les tombeaux des rois a Saint-Denis contre des revolutionnaires (1793)' © Musée Carnavalet Paris/Roger-Viollet.  | page 26 |
| 1.2 | Benjamin Zix, 'Visite de personnages étrangers dans le Museum National'. Paris, Musée du Louvre, D.A.G. © RMN (Musée du Louvre)/Thierry Le Mage.  | 41      |
| 1.3 | Benjamin Zix, 'Monsieur Denon visiting the Cabinet des Antiques Berlin', 1807. © The Trustees of the British Museum. All rights reserved.   | 42      |
| 1.4 | 'Der Wunsch der Berliner', anonymous coloured etching, 1814. © Stiftung Stadtmuseum Berlin.   | 43      |
| 1.5 | E.E. Viollet-le Duc, 'Pignons de l'Eglise de Vézelay', in F. Ducuing, <i>L'Exposition universelle de 1867 illustrée</i> (Paris, 1867), I, p. 373. Heidelberg University Library, K 7195 A Folio.                    | 49      |
| 1.6 | Anonymous late nineteenth-century drawing of the Historic Monuments Commission. Paris, Médiathèque de l'Architecture et du Patrimoine. © Ministère de la Culture – Médiathèque du Patrimoine, Dist. RMN/image RMN.  | 50      |
| 1.7 | Luc Olivier Merson, 'Notre Dame de Paris', wood engraving published in Alfred Barbou, <i>Victor Hugo and his time</i> (London 1882), p. 200. By permission of the Syndics of Cambridge University Library, Oo.5.63. | 64      |
| 2.1 | Thomas Rowlandson, 'An Antiquarian', 1789. Hand-coloured etching. By permission of the Society of Antiquaries of London.  | 68      |



Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11762-3 - The Rise of Heritage: Preserving the Past in France, Germany and England, 1789–1914

Astrid Swenson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*List of illustrations*

ix

- 2.2 George Cruickshank, 'The Antiquarian Society', 1812, Coloured engraving. By permission of Derrick Chivers and the Society of Antiquaries of London. 69
- 2.3 Robert Seymour, 'Mr. Pickwick addresses the Club', in Charles Dickens, *The Posthumous Papers of the Pickwick Club with 43 illustrations by Seymour and Phiz* (London, 1902), p. 29. By permission of the Syndics of Cambridge University Library, 1902.6.493. 69
- 2.4 'The Art of Restoring', *Fun*, 27 June 1877, p. 254. By permission from George A. Smathers Libraries, University of Florida, <http://ufdc.ufl.edu>. 82
- 2.5 'The Mania for Restoration – Punch's Almanac for 1878', *Punch*, 14 December 1877. By permission of the Master and Fellows of St John's College, Cambridge. 83
- 2.6 'Our Plea for Open Spaces', *Punch*, 9 June 1883, p. 266. By permission of the Master and Fellows of St John's College, Cambridge. 88
- 2.7 'Lady of the Lake Loquitor', *Punch*, 5 February 1876, p. 34. By permission of the Master and Fellows of St John's College, Cambridge. 89
- 2.8 'National Trust Executive Meeting 15 April 1912'. Watercolour painted by TMR (1924). Private Collection. © Photo John Hammond/National Trust. 94
- 2.9 Albert Robida, 'Transformisme', *L'Ami des Monuments*, 2 (1888), 236, 242–6. Faculty of Architecture and the History of Art Library, Cambridge. 100
- 2.10 Photograph of the 'Musée du Contre-Vandalisme', *L'Ami des Monuments*, 23 (1910), 65. Institut National d'Histoire de l'Art, Bibliothèque, collection Jacques Doucet. 106
- 2.11 Photograph of the *Amis des Monuments parisiens* listening to Charles Normand at the Monument de la Bataille de Crécy, *L'Ami des Monuments* 20 (1906), 41. Institut National d'Histoire de l'Art, Bibliothèque, collection Jacques Doucet. 107
- 2.12 Drawing of the Tour de César by Robida illustrating Charles Normand's 'Notes sur l'Excursion de Province', *L'Ami des Monuments*, 2 (1888), 192. Faculty of Architecture and the History of Art Library, Cambridge. 108
- 2.13 'Our Tourist Section', *Cycling*, 20 January 1900. By permission of the Syndics of Cambridge University Library, L461.5bl. 136

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11762-3 - The Rise of Heritage: Preserving the Past in France, Germany and England, 1789–1914

Astrid Swenson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

x

*List of illustrations*

- 2.14 ‘The Photographic Craze: A Village Besieged’, *The Amateur Photographer*, 10 June 1887, p. 271. By permission of the Syndics of Cambridge University Library, L361.9.57. 138
- 2.15 Sir Benjamin Stone, ‘Rock dwellings. Kinver. Staffordshire. 1895’, Platinum print. © Victoria and Albert Museum, London, E.5153–2000. 140
- 2.16 Photographs published by the Touring Club de France of Le Creusot, Charolles and Paray le Monial in Burgundy. *Sites et Monuments: La Bourgogne* (Paris, 1906), pp. 88 and 95. Author’s collection. 141
- 3.1 Two illustrations for the history of work exhibition in 1889, from L. Gonse, ‘L’Exposition de l’Histoire du Travail’, *Revue de l’Exposition universelle de 1889* (Paris 1889), II, 13–14. Institut National d’Histoire de l’Art, Bibliothèque, collection Jacques Doucet. 148
- 3.2 The Assyrian and Phenician houses from Garnier’s exhibition of human housing, in V. Champier, ‘Les 44 Habitation Humaines construites au Champs de Mars, par M. Charles Garnier’, *Revue de l’Exposition universelle de 1889* (Paris 1889), I, 125. Institut National d’Histoire de l’Art, Bibliothèque, collection Jacques Doucet. 150
- 3.3 The Rue du Caire, Paris 1889, from P. Bourde, ‘La Rue du Caire’, *Revue de l’Exposition universelle de 1889* (Paris 1889), I, 77. Institut National d’Histoire de l’Art, Bibliothèque, collection Jacques Doucet. 151
- 3.4 Photograph of a plaster cast from Ankor. *Revue de l’Exposition universelle de 1889* (Paris 1889), I, gravure hors texte 336 bis. Institut National d’Histoire de l’Art, Bibliothèque, collection Jacques Doucet. 152
- 3.5 Postcard of the Rue des Nations with the German pavilion at the 1900 *Exposition universelle* in Paris. Author’s collection. 153
- 3.6 Postcard of Robida’s ‘Old Paris’ adorned with ‘inhabitants’ in historic costume at the 1900 *Exposition universelle*, Paris. Author’s collection. 154
- 3.7 ‘Le Palais des Papes, à Avignon au quatorzieme siecle’, in F. Ducuing, *L’Exposition universelle de 1867 illustrée* (Paris, 1867), I, p. 372. Heidelberg University Library, K 7195 A Folio. 161
- 3.8 Drawing of Pierrefond by E.E. Viollet-le-Duc. Médiathèque de l’Architecture et du Patrimoine, Paris. © RMN/Daniel Arnaudet. 162

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11762-3 - The Rise of Heritage: Preserving the Past in France, Germany and England, 1789–1914

Astrid Swenson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*List of illustrations*

xi

- 3.9 M. Lancelot, ‘Musée rétrospectiv – Galerie du Travail’, in F. Ducuing, *L’Exposition universelle de 1867 illustrée* (Paris, 1867), II, p. 120. Heidelberg University Library, K 7195 A Folio. 179
- 3.10 Navellier Narcisse, ‘Musée de sculpture comparée en 1889’. Paris, Cité de l’architecture et du patrimoine. © RMN-Grand Palais/Martine Beck-Coppola. 182
- 3.11 Caricature of Garnier’s Exhibition of Human Habitation, *Revue de l’Exposition universelle de 1889* (Paris 1889), I, 196. Institut National d’Histoire de l’Art, Bibliothèque, collection Jacques Doucet. 184
- 4.1 Photograph by Charles Normand of the International Congress of Archaeology in Athens 1905. *L’Ami des Monuments*, 20 (1906), 369. Institut National d’Histoire de l’Art, Bibliothèque, collection Jacques Doucet. 198
- 4.2 Poster for a conference cycle on historic monuments during the 1900 *Exposition universelle*, MAP 80/8/7. By permission of médiathèque de l’Architecture et du Patrimoine. 204
- 4.3 Title page for the 1890 volume of *L’Ami des Monuments*. Faculty of Architecture and the History of Art Library, Cambridge. 210
- 4.4 ‘A Red Cross for Monuments’. *L’Ami des Monuments*, 3 (1889), 272. Faculty of Architecture and the History of Art Library, Cambridge. 211
- 5.1 ‘Completion of Cologne Cathedral’, *Supplement to the Illustrated London News*, 27 May 1843, cover. Author’s collection. 241
- 5.2 ‘The Morris Dance round St. Mark’s’, *Punch*, 10 January 1880, p. 2. By permission of the Master and Fellows of St John’s College, Cambridge. 243
- 5.3 Gustave Le Gray, Auguste Mestral, Cahors (Lot) – Pont de Cabessut, dit pont Neuf Pont ou Pont Henri IV. Fonds de la Mission héliographique. Paris, Musée d’Orsay. © RMN (Musée d’Orsay)/Hervé Lewandowski. 246
- 5.4 Postcards of the city walls of Avignon before and after the restoration by Viollet-le-Duc. Author’s collection. 251
- 5.5 Peterborough Cathedral in 1897, from Herman Muthesius, ‘Die Kathedrale von Peterborough und die Denkmalpflege in England’, *Centralblatt der Bauverwaltung*, 10 April 1897, p. 165. Faculty of Architecture and the History of Art Library, Cambridge. 254

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11762-3 - The Rise of Heritage: Preserving the Past in France, Germany  
and England, 1789–1914

Astrid Swenson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xii

*List of illustrations*

- |     |  |     |
|-----|--|-----|
| 5.6 | Olaf Gulbransson, 'Alt Heidelberg', <i>Simplicissimus</i> , 25 June 1906, 216. © DACS 2012.  | 259 |
| 5.7 | 'New Heidelberg: Der Ottheinrich der Zukunft.' <i>Lustige Blätter</i> , 34 (1904). Zentral- und Landesbibliothek Berlin.   | 260 |
| 5.8 | Postcard of Meissen Cathedral sent by Muthesius to the SPAB to illustrate the changes planned. SPAB Archives. By permission of the Society for the Protection of Ancient Buildings.      | 264 |
| 5.9 | Thomas Theodor Heine, 'Der Ausbau der Toteninsel', <i>Simplicissimus</i> , 20 April 1908, 41. © DACS 2012 and Wilhelm Schulz, 'Karneval im Mai', <i>Simplicissimus</i> , 4 May 1908, 96. | 268 |
| 6.1 | Map of state preservation in Germany by 1914. © A. Swenson.  | 324 |

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11762-3 - The Rise of Heritage: Preserving the Past in France, Germany  
and England, 1789–1914

Astrid Swenson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

## *Tables*

1	Major world exhibitions with sections on historic monuments	<i>page</i> 156
2	World exhibitions, international congresses and conferences	188
3	Legal provisions in comparison by 1914	318

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11762-3 - The Rise of Heritage: Preserving the Past in France, Germany and England, 1789–1914

Astrid Swenson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## *Acknowledgements*

I want to thank the many people who made this book possible. It started in Cambridge's wonderfully varied intellectual community, framed by debates in the History Faculty, the Heritage Research Group, St John's College, Darwin College, and in particular the Modern German History Workshop and the Cambridge Victorian Studies Group. I also owe much to the scholarly communities in Paris and Berlin and the magnificent Institute of Human Sciences in Vienna. For support and discussion during the preparation of the final manuscript, I thank my colleagues at Brunel University.

None of this would have been possible without generous financial support. In its early stages, the project was funded by the Gates Cambridge Trust, the AHRB and St John's College, Cambridge. The German Historical Institutes in London and Paris gave grants for my archival work abroad, together with their vibrant research communities. My particular thanks are to Andreas Gestrich and Werner Paravicini. The Körber-Foundation sponsored my fellowship at the Institute for Human Sciences, Vienna. I also benefited enormously from an honorary scholarship of the Studienstiftung des deutschen Volkes. The Leverhulme Trust and Darwin College, Cambridge provided me with fellowships during the second stage of the project. Brunel University and the Paul Mellon Centre for Studies in British Art helped towards the costs of image reproductions.

Permissions to use illustrations and manuscript collections are gratefully acknowledged. I am indebted to many librarians and archivists who shared their sources, knowledge and time at Cambridge University Library, St John's College Library (especially Jonathan Harrison and Pam Johnson), the Seeley Library and the Architecture and History of Art Library in Cambridge, the British Library, the German Historical Institute London, the National Archives in Kew, the Society for the Protection of Ancient Building (especially Miss Greenhill for her warm hospitality), the National Trust (especially Iain Shaw), the Archives nationales, the

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11762-3 - The Rise of Heritage: Preserving the Past in France, Germany and England, 1789–1914

Astrid Swenson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Acknowledgements*

xv

Bibliothèque historique de la Ville de Paris, the Bibliothèque nationale, the Médiathèque du patrimoine, the archives of the Louvre and UNESCO's archives in Paris; the Archives départementales in Bordeaux, the Staatsbibliothek and the Geheimes Staatsarchiv Preußischer Kulturbesitz in Berlin, the Österreichische Nationalbibliothek and the Institute for Human Sciences in Vienna.

Many readers have kindly shared their expertise. Their burdens have varied from dealing with the earliest drafts to commenting on numerous chapters from the final manuscript. All have been enormously helpful. Richard Evans read the first and the last version of the entire manuscript, and many versions in between. I am thankful for many years of discussion and inspiration. Peter Mandler sharpened my understanding of both British history and the comparative perspective and inspired through his thoughtfulness and kindness. Chris Clark, David Cannadine, Indra Sen Gupta and the anonymous readers for the Press made very helpful suggestions on how to transform the entire manuscript. At Cambridge University Press, I am grateful to Michael Watson, Chloe Howell, Sarah Roberts and Gaia Poggiogalli for their comments throughout the process of writing and editing.

Many other friends and colleagues have helped with drafts and discussions of methodology and sources. Elisabeth Vlossak, Riccarda Torriani, Chris Warnes, Stephanie Chan, Victoria Harris, Hester Vaizey, David Motadal, Bianca Gaudenzi, Toby Simpson, Christian Wenkel, Muriel Blaive, Emilia Palonen, Harriet Larkin, Martin Worthington, Joe Devanny, Elisabeth Whitton, Heather Jones, Mirjam Brusius, Varun Uberoi, and Tamson Pietsch read chapters at various stages. I was also blessed with the wisdom of the member of the Victorian Studies Group, Sadiya Qureshi, Anna Vaninskaya, Adelene Buckland, Helen Brookman, Rachel Briand-Davies, Jocelyn Betts, David Gange, Michael Ledger-Lomas, Mary Beard, Simon Goldhill, Jim Secord, Clare Pettit. They all commented on drafts and helped me think about the experiential nature of history more broadly. I learned much from Lisa Niemeyer about historical novels during our walks in Wimpole. I am grateful to Peter Burke for discussions about conceptual history, to Robert Tombs for his insights into Anglo-French relations and Tim Blanning for his thoughts about romantic restorations. Etienne François contributed much in the early stages of the project between Paris and Berlin. I am grateful to Michel Werner for discussions on *histoire croisée*; to Françoise Haman, François Hartog, Jean-Michel Leniaud for sharing their views about French heritage and to Nabila Oulebsir, Dominique Poulot and Benedicte Savoy for reflections on the impact of borders on

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11762-3 - The Rise of Heritage: Preserving the Past in France, Germany and England, 1789–1914

Astrid Swenson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xvi

*Acknowledgements*

heritage and to Tamara van Kessel for conversations about how to write a comparative history of heritage. Melanie Hall and Chris Miele generously shared their knowledge about the National Trust and the SPAB, Philippa Levine and Chris Manias about learned societies, Elizabeth Edwards about photographic societies, and Ruth Fiori about the Amis des Monuments Parisiens and the character of the elusive Charles Normand. Discussions and teaching with Barbara Könczöl were always inspiring and shaped the twentieth-century outlook. Billie Melman, Stefan Berger and Chris Lorentz helped to sharpen ideas about popular heritage.

Various chapters were also much improved by comments at seminars and conferences and by discussions with my students at Cambridge and Brunel. I am also grateful to the many friends who provided housing and company during my archive stints, especially Christian, Pascal, Sabine and Caroline in Paris and Egon and Thomaso in Berlin.

Many of my fellow students and colleagues contributed in other ways to my life, and I felt blessed by their friendship. Thank you Anna Wolff for your laughter and for always being there, to Ralph Gäbler, Angela Johnson, Céline Beauchamp, Didier and Florence Charton-Vachet, the Breinings, Uschi and Hanno Blackert for support and true friendship. To Aldo, friend and companion, thank you for living with all things heritage. Finally, I want to thank my parents, Gisela and Eckhard Swenson, for their love and support during my entire life. Together with my grandparents and the Richardts, you ignited my interest in historical consciousness through discussions and travel to many sites, which I rediscovered during the writing as being profoundly shaped by the nineteenth-century heritage-makers. This book is for you, with love.



Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11762-3 - The Rise of Heritage: Preserving the Past in France, Germany  
and England, 1789–1914

Astrid Swenson

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Abbreviations*

Abg.	Abgeordneter
AN	Archives nationales, Paris
BHS	Bund Heimatschutz
BN	Bibliothèque nationale
CMH	Commission des Monuments historiques
CMN	Centre des Monument Nationaux
CPS	Commons Preservation Society
CTH	Comité des travaux historiques
CTHS	Comité des travaux historiques et scientifiques
DNB	Oxford Dictionary of National Biography
GStA PK	Geheimes Staatsarchiv Preußischer Kulturbesitz
IICI	Institut International de Co-operation Intellectuelle
JO	Journal Officiel
MAP	Médiathèque de l'architecture et du patrimoine, Paris
NT	National Trust
OED	Oxford English Dictionary
OIM	Office International des Musées
PRO	Public Record Office
SAL	Society of Antiquaries of London
SPAB	Society for the Protection of Ancient Buildings
SPPEF	Société pour la protection des paysages et de l'esthétique de France
SPPF	Société pour la protection des paysages de France
TNA	The National Archives, London