

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-11160-7- Descartes' Meditations: A Critical Guide  
Edited by Karen Detlefsen  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

## DESCARTES' *MEDITATIONS*

Descartes' *Meditations*, one of the most influential works in western philosophy, continues to provoke discussion and debate. This volume of original essays by leading established and emerging early modern scholars ranges over all six of the *Meditations* and explores issues such as skepticism, judgment, causation, the nature of meditation and the meditator's relation to God, the nature of personhood, Descartes' theory of sense perception, and his ideas on the nature of substance. The contributors bring new insights to both central and less-studied topics in the *Meditations*, and connect the work with the rich historical and intellectual context in which Descartes forged his thought. The resulting volume will appeal to a wide range of scholars of early modern thought.

KAREN DETLEFSEN is Associate Professor in the Department of Philosophy at the University of Pennsylvania. She has published articles in *Oxford Studies in Early Modern Philosophy*, *Perspectives on Science* and *Philosophy Compass*.

Cambridge University Press  
 978-0-521-11160-7- Descartes' Meditations: A Critical Guide  
 Edited by Karen Detlefsen  
 Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

## CAMBRIDGE CRITICAL GUIDES

Titles published in this series:

Hegel's *Phenomenology Of Spirit*

EDITED BY DEAN MOYAR AND MICHAEL QUANTE

Mill's *On Liberty*

EDITED BY C. L. TEN

Kant's *Idea For A Universal History With A Cosmopolitan Aim*

EDITED BY AMÉLIE OKSENBERG RORTY AND JAMES SCHMIDT

Kant's *Groundwork Of The Metaphysics Of Morals*

EDITED BY JENS TIMMERMANN

Kant's *Critique Of Practical Reason*

EDITED BY ANDREWS REATH AND JENS TIMMERMANN

Wittgenstein's *Philosophical Investigations*

EDITED BY ARIF AHMED

Kierkegaard's *Concluding Unscientific Postscript*

EDITED BY RICK ANTHONY FURTAK

Plato's *Republic*

EDITED BY MARK L. MCPHERRAN

Plato's *Laws*

EDITED BY CHRISTOPHER BOBONICH

Spinoza's *Theological-Political Treatise*

EDITED BY YITZHAK Y. MELAMED AND MICHAEL A. ROSENTHAL

Aristotle's *Nichomachean Ethics*

EDITED BY JON MILLER

Kant's *Metaphysics Of Morals*

EDITED BY LARA DENIS

Nietzsche's *On The Genealogy Of Morality*

EDITED BY SIMON MAY

Kant's *Observations And Remarks*

EDITED BY RICHARD VELKLEY AND SUSAN SHELL

Augustine's *City Of God*

EDITED BY JAMES WETZEL

Descartes' *Meditations*

EDITED BY KAREN DETLEFSEN

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-11160-7- Descartes' Meditations: A Critical Guide  
Edited by Karen Detlefsen  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

DESCARTES'  
*Meditations*  
A Critical Guide

EDITED BY  
KAREN DETLEFSEN  
*University of Pennsylvania*



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
 978-0-521-11160-7- Descartes' Meditations: A Critical Guide  
 Edited by Karen Detlefsen  
 Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS  
 Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town,  
 Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City  
 Cambridge University Press  
 The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
 Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9780521111607](http://www.cambridge.org/9780521111607)

© Cambridge University Press 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2013

Printed and bound in the United Kingdom by the MPG Books Group

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data*  
 Descartes' *Meditations*: a critical guide / edited by Karen Detlefsen.

p. cm. – (Cambridge critical guides)

Includes bibliographical references (p. ) and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-11160-7 (hardback)

1. Descartes, René, 1596–1650. *Meditationes de prima philosophia*.
2. First philosophy. I. Detlefsen, Karen.

B1854.D45 2013

194–dc23

2012024502

ISBN 978-0-521-11160-7 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-11160-7- Descartes' Meditations: A Critical Guide  
Edited by Karen Detlefsen  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

*To my mother and father, Joyce and Bill Detlefsen*

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-11160-7- Descartes' Meditations: A Critical Guide

Edited by Karen Detlefsen

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

## *Contents*

<i>List of contributors</i>	<i>page</i> ix
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xi
<i>Descartes' texts</i>	xii
Introduction	
KAREN DETLEFSEN	I
I SKEPTICISM	
1 The skepticism of the First Meditation	7
THOMAS M. LENNON AND MICHAEL W. HICKSON	9
2 Descartes and content skepticism	25
DEBORAH BROWN	
II SUBSTANCE AND CAUSE	
3 Descartes against the materialists: how Descartes' confrontation with materialism shaped his metaphysics	43
DANIEL GARBER	45
4 Thinking: the nature of Descartes' mental substance	64
MARTHA BRANDT BOLTON	
5 Causation and causal axioms	82
TAD M. SCHMALTZ	
III SENSATIONS	
6 Sensation and knowledge of body in Descartes' <i>Meditations</i>	101
JOHN CARRIERO	103

viii	<i>Contents</i>	
7	Descartes on sensory representation, objective reality, and material falsity GARY HATFIELD	127
IV	THE HUMAN BEING	151
8	Teleology and natures in Descartes' Sixth Meditation KAREN DETLEFSEN	153
9	The role of will in Descartes' account of judgment LILLI ALANEN	176
10	God and meditation in Descartes' <i>Meditations</i> <i>on First Philosophy</i> JORGE SECADA	200
II	Cartesian selves LISA SHAPIRO	226
	<i>Bibliography</i>	243
	<i>Index</i>	255



Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-11160-7- Descartes' Meditations: A Critical Guide  
Edited by Karen Detlefsen  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

## Contributors

LILLI ALANEN is Professor Emeritus of Philosophy at the University of Uppsala. She is author of *Descartes's Concept of Mind* (2003) and editor of *Feminist Reflections on the History of Philosophy* (with Charlotte Witt, 2004).

MARTHA BRANDT BOLTON is Professor of Philosophy at Rutgers University. She has written on a wide range of early modern philosophers. Her articles include those in *Studies on Locke: Sources, Contemporaries, and Legacy* (eds. Sarah Hutton and Paul Shurman), *Berkeley's Lasting Legacy: 300 Years Later* (eds. T. Airaksinen and B. Belfrage), and *Companion to Leibniz* (ed. Brandon Look).

DEBORAH BROWN is Associate Professor in the School of History, Philosophy, Religion, and Classics at the University of Queensland. She is author of *Descartes and the Passionate Mind* (Cambridge, 2006).

JOHN CARRIERO is Professor of Philosophy at the University of California, Los Angeles. He is author of *Between Two Worlds: A Reading of Descartes's "Meditations"* (2009) and co-editor with Janet Broughton of *A Companion to Descartes* (2008).

KAREN DETLEFSEN is Associate Professor of Philosophy and Education at the University of Pennsylvania. She has published articles in *Oxford Studies in Early Modern Philosophy*, *Perspectives on Science* and *Philosophy Compass*.

DANIEL GARBER is Stuart Professor of Philosophy at Princeton University. He is author of *Descartes' Metaphysical Physics* (1992), *Descartes Embodied* (Cambridge, 2001), *Leibniz: Body, Substance, Monad* (2009), and *What Happens after Pascal's Wager: Living Faith and Rational Belief: The Aquinas Lecture* (2009). He is also editor of *The Cambridge History of Seventeenth-Century Philosophy* (with Michael Ayers, Cambridge, 1998),

*Kant and the Early Moderns* (with Béatrice Longuenesse, 2008), and *The Mechanization of Natural Philosophy* (with Sophie Roux, forthcoming).

GARY HATFIELD is the Adam Seybert Professor in Moral and Intellectual Philosophy at the University of Pennsylvania. He is author of *The Natural and the Normative: Theories of Spatial Perception from Kant to Helmholtz* (1990), *Descartes and the Meditations* (2003), and *Perception and Cognition: Essays in the Philosophy of Psychology* (2009).

MICHAEL W. HICKSON is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at Santa Clara University, California. His articles have appeared in journals such as *Journal of the History of Philosophy*, *History of Philosophy Quarterly*, and *Journal of the History of Ideas*.

THOMAS M. LENNON is Professor Emeritus of Philosophy at the University of Western Ontario. He is author of *The Battle of the Gods and the Giants* (1993), *Reading Bayle* (1999), and *The Plain Truth: Descartes, Huet, and Skepticism* (2008). He is editor of *Cartesian Views: Papers Presented to Richard A. Watson* (2003) and *The Achilles of Rationalist Psychology* (with Robert J. Stainton, 2010).

TAD M. SCHMALTZ is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Michigan. He is author of *Malebranche's Theory of the Soul* (1996), *Radical Cartesianism* (Cambridge, 2002), and *Descartes on Causation* (2008). He is editor of the *Historical Dictionary of Descartes and Cartesian Philosophy* (with Roger Ariew, Demis Des Chene, Douglas Jesseph, and Theo Verbeek, 2003), *Receptions of Descartes: Cartesianism and Anti-Cartesianism in Early Modern Europe* (2005) and *Integrating History and Philosophy of Science: Problems and Prospects* (with Seymour Mauskopf, 2012).

JORGE SECADA is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Virginia. He is author of *Cartesian Metaphysics: The Scholastic Origins of Modern Philosophy* (Cambridge, 2000).

LISA SHAPIRO is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Simon Fraser University. She is the translator and editor of *The Correspondence between Princess Elisabeth of Bohemia and René Descartes* (2007), and co-editor with Martin Pickavé of *Emotions and Cognitive Life in Medieval and Early Modern Philosophy* (2012).

Cambridge University Press  
978-0-521-11160-7- Descartes' Meditations: A Critical Guide  
Edited by Karen Detlefsen  
Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

---

## *Acknowledgments*

I would like to thank the contributors to this volume. They all have been wonderfully patient, and I could not have asked for a more pleasurable and stimulating group of scholars with whom to work. Hilary Gaskin, Anna Lowe, and Joanna Garbutt at Cambridge University Press have been enormously helpful at every stage of this project, and I am grateful for their guidance. As always, Tan Kok Chor and Amalia Tan deserve special appreciation for all the joy.

Cambridge University Press  
 978-0-521-11160-7- Descartes' Meditations: A Critical Guide  
 Edited by Karen Detlefsen  
 Frontmatter  
[More information](#)

## *Descartes' texts*

All references to Descartes' texts are by AT number, usually followed by CSM(K) number. For example (7: 84, 2: 58) indicates p. 84 of the seventh volume of AT, followed by the same passage as translated on p. 58 of the second volume of CSM(K). There is variation in citation style among chapters in this volume, and these variants are noted in those chapters.

- Descartes, René. 1964–76. *Oeuvres de Descartes*, 11 vols., ed. C. Adam and P. Tannery (Paris: J. Vrin).
1967. *Oeuvres Philosophiques*, vol. ii, edited by Ferdinand Alquié (Paris: Editions Garnier Frères).
1983. *Principles of Philosophy*, trans. Valentine Roger Miller and Reese P. Miller (Dordrecht: Reidel).
- 1985a. *The Philosophical Writings of Descartes*, 2 vols., trans. John Cottingham, Robert Stoothoff, and Dugald Murdoch (Cambridge University Press).
- 1985b. *The Philosophical Writings of Descartes*, vol. III, *The Correspondence*, trans. John Cottingham, Robert Stoothoff, Dugald Murdoch, and Anthony Kenny (Cambridge University Press).
2001. *Discourse on Method, Optics, Geometry, and Meteorology*, trans. Paul J. Oscamp, revised ed. (Indianapolis, IN: Hackett Publishing).
2008. *Meditations on First Philosophy with Selections from the Objections and Replies*, ed. and trans. Michael Moriarty (Oxford University Press).