Economics in urban conservation
Economics in urban conservation

Nathaniel Lichfield
# Contents

*List of diagrams, tables and plans*  
page xi

*Preface*  
xiii

*Acknowledgements*  
xv

*Introduction*  
The evolution of conservation and its economics  
1

*Part I  Planning and management in the conservation of the urban system*  
*Summary*  
9

1  
Life cycle in the urban system  
1.1  A concept of the urban system  
11  
1.2  Interaction between people’s activities and the physical stock  
13  
1.3  The urban system as a resource  
16  
1.4  Categorisation of urban resources  
17  
1.4.1  Natural  
17  
1.4.2  Human  
17  
1.4.3  Man-made  
17  
1.5  Life cycle of urban resources  
19  
1.5.1  Overview  
19  
1.5.2  Natural  
19  
1.5.3  Human  
20  
1.5.4  Man-made  
20  
1.6  Obsolescence, renewal and conservation in the life cycle of the built environment  
21  
1.6.1  Overview  
21  
1.6.2  Obsolescence  
22  
1.6.3  Renewal and conservation  
25  
1.6.4  Summary over the life cycle  
27  
1.7  Why develop or conserve urban resources?  
29  
1.8  Logic of conservation in the various categories of urban resources  
30  
1.8.1  Natural  
30  
1.8.2  Human  
31
Contents

1·8·3 Man-made 32
1·8·4 Overall 34

2 Planning and management of urban resources 35
2·1 From resource to property and commodity 35
2·1·1 Overview 35
2·1·2 The built environment as resource, property and commodity 36
2·2 What is management? 38
2·3 What is urban management? 39
2·4 Management for urban conservation 43
2·4·1 Focus 43
2·4·2 Natural resources 44
2·4·3 Human resources 44
2·4·4 Man-made 45
2·5 The process of planning and management for change 45
2·5·1 Change through development and conservation 45
2·5·2 The management process 47
2·5·3 Planning for management 47
2·5·4 Management in urban and regional planning 48
2·5·5 Management and planning 48

3 Planning for urban conservation 50
3·1 Role of planning in the evolution of the urban and regional system 50
3·1·1 The general planning process 50
3·1·2 Plan making 51
3·1·3 Plan implementation 52
3·1·4 Monitoring and review 52
3·2 Role of conservation in urban planning 52
3·3 Role of planning in deferring obsolescence 54
3·4 Role of planning in urban conservation 55

Part II Conservation of the cultural built heritage

Summary 61

4 The nature of the cultural built heritage 63
4·1 Man’s heritage 63
4·2 Proprietary rights in the heritage 64
4·3 The general and cultural heritage 65
4·4 The cultural built heritage 66
4·5 The CBH as property and commodity 67
4·6 Why conserve the cultural built heritage? 68
4·7 Conservation of the cultural built heritage as a special case of renewal 69
4·8 Property management for the conservation of the CBH 71

Appendix 4·1 A description of the cultural and natural heritage 73
Appendix 4·2 A description of moveable cultural property 75
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Identification and protection of the CBH</td>
<td>vii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>The issue</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>Content of inventory or list</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.1</td>
<td>What kind of artifact is to be included?</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.2</td>
<td>What are the criteria for inclusion or exclusion?</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.3</td>
<td>How to grade conservation quality?</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>Machinery for protection of list or inventory</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.1</td>
<td>What kind of listing mechanism?</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>The effects of listing</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>Securing permission to alter or demolish objects on the list</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Management and planning in the conservation of the urban cultural heritage</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>Relation of planning and management</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>Role of the CBH in urban planning</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>Role of the cultural heritage in urban planning</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>Plan making in the conservation of the CBH</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.1</td>
<td>Macro planning</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.2</td>
<td>Micro planning</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>Plan implementation in the conservation of the CBH</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6</td>
<td>The conservation programme</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>Project implementation in the conservation of the CBH</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>Project execution</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.9</td>
<td>Some planning and management questions in the conservation of the CBH</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part III</td>
<td>Economics in urban conservation</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Economics in the management of the built environment</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>Conservation in economic life</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1.1</td>
<td>What is economic life?</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1.2</td>
<td>Economic life and conservation</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>Economics of proprietary interests in conservation</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>Economics in management for urban conservation</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3.1</td>
<td>Natural resources</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3.2</td>
<td>Human resources</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3.3</td>
<td>Man-made resources</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4</td>
<td>Economics decisions in the life cycle of the built environment</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4.2</td>
<td>The model over the life cycle</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4.3</td>
<td>The model notation</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>Application of the model</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5.1</td>
<td>Use of open land</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5.2</td>
<td>Development on unbuilt land</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5.3</td>
<td>Use of the built fabric</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5.4</td>
<td>Economic obsolescence</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7.5.5 Rehabilitation</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5.6 Redevelopment</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5.7 Rehabilitation versus redevelopment</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5.8 Heritage value</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5.9 The private and public sector</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5.10 Incidence of costs and benefits on property interests</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.6 The implications of borrowing money</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.7 Taking account of the future</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.8 Land use and value in the life cycle of the built environment</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.9 Life of property</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.10 Effect of planning control</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

8 Economics in the conservation of the CBH                              | 145  |
| 8.1 The CBH as a resource                                              | 145  |
| 8.2 The CBH as property                                                | 146  |
| 8.3 Economics in the life cycle of the CBH                             | 146  |
| 8.3.1 Economics in use                                                 | 146  |
| 8.3.2 Economics of obsolescence                                        | 147  |
| 8.3.3 Economics of renewal                                             | 147  |
| 8.3.4 New uses for old                                                 | 148  |
| 8.3.5 Financial aids to meet the viability shortfall                   | 148  |
| 8.4 Land use and land value in the life cycle of the CBH               | 150  |

9 Economics in planning for conservation of the CBH                    | 152  |
| 9.1 The similarity and distinction of purpose in economics and planning| 152  |
| 9.2 Planning and the market                                            | 153  |
| 9.3 Role of economist in urban and regional planning                   | 155  |
| 9.4 Some economic principles in plan making for conservation of the CBH| 157  |
| 9.5 Economic feasibility of plans for conservation of the CBH         | 159  |
| 9.6 Economic evaluation of plans for conservation of the CBH          | 161  |
| 9.7 Economics in the CBH conservation programme                        | 161  |
| 9.8 Priorities in the conservation programme of CBH                   | 163  |
| 9.9 Economics in project implementation                               | 165  |

10 Valuation of the cultural built heritage                             | 167  |
| 10.1 The issue                                                         | 167  |
| 10.2 What is value?                                                   | 167  |
| 10.3 What is being valued in the CBH?                                 | 168  |
| 10.4 By whom is the valuation being made?                             | 170  |
| 10.4.1 An individual                                                  | 170  |
| 10.4.2 A group                                                        | 171  |
| 10.4.3 Society                                                        | 172  |
| 10.4.4 Government                                                     | 174  |
| 10.5 Market value and the CBH                                          | 175  |
| 10.6 Approaches to valuing the CBH                                     | 176  |
Contents

10.7 Approaches to grading heritage quality in preparing the inventory/list 177
10.8 Role of economics in cultural valuation 181
10.9 Opportunity cost and the CBH 182
10.9.1 The concept 182
10.9.2 Private 183
10.9.3 Social 186
10.10 How can economics help in the social decision on conservation? 188
10.11 The valuation in its decision context 190
10.11.1 Approach 190
10.11.2 Valuing conservation quality for plan and project evaluation: worthwhileness 190
10.11.3 Ranking of priority in conservation with given budget 190
10.11.4 Project implementation 191

11 Screening of the inventory or list 192
11.1 The issue 192
11.2 Nature and purpose of the list 192
11.3 Screening the inventory 194
11.3.1 Prior consultation 194
11.3.2 Planning proposals 194
11.3.3 Economics 195
11.4 Economic criteria for development affecting heritage quality 196
11.4.1 The issue 196
11.4.2 The owner/developer 198
11.4.3 The community 199

12 Who benefits and who loses from conservation of the CBH? 201
12.1 The issue 201
12.2 How to assess the true costs and benefits? 202
12.3 Who benefits and who loses? 203
12.4 The sectoral distribution of the costs and benefits 205
12.5 Who should pay the cost? 208
12.5.1 The issue 208
12.5.2 Compensation 210
12.5.3 Betterment 212
12.6 How much should be paid? – pricing for conservation 213
12.7 Conservation and tourism 214

Part IV Selected tools of economic analysis for project evaluation
Introductory 219

13 Financial impact: financial analysis 227
13.1 Context 227
13.2 An illustration of financial analysis 227
13.2.1 Where the refurbishment is viable 232
13.2.2 Where the refurbishment is non-viable 233
## Contents

13.2.3 Effect of taxation relief on financial viability 234
13.3 Social financial analysis 235
13.4 Illustration of social financial analysis 238

14 Economic impact: social cost benefit analysis 240
14.1 Context 240
14.2 Origins of method 241
14.3 Method and technique of SCBA 241
14.4 The social rate of discount 245

15 Community impact: community impact analysis 249
15.1 Context 249
15.2 Evolution of the method of PBSA/CIA 250
15.3 Some features of CIE 251
15.4 Concepts of efficiency, equity and trade off in community impact evaluation 252
15.5 The method of CIE 255
15.6 The method applied 256
15.6.1 The case 256
15.6.2 The options 260
15.6.3 The method in summary 260
15.6.4 The community impact analysis and evaluation 262
15.6.5 Conclusions on efficiency 276

Appendix 15.1 Selected published examples of planning balance sheet/community impact studies 280

Part V Case studies in the economics of conservation of the CBH

Summary 287

16 The case studies 289
16.1 Case study 1: Viability for occupation 289
16.2 Case study 2: The Royal Holloway Sanatorium, Virginia Water, Surrey 291
16.3 Case study 3: The Old Sha’arey Tsedek Hospital, Jerusalem 300
16.4 Case study 4: Covent Garden, London: redevelopment or conservation over an area 303
16.5 Conclusion for all cases 314

Appendix 16.1 Criteria for listed building consent 315

Notes 317
Bibliography 332
Index 354
Diagrams

1.1 Activity of people in a community through their life cycle .............................................. page 12
1.2 Way of life in community .................................................................................................. 13
1.3 Obsolescence, renewal and conservation in the life cycle of urban fabric ................. 28
2.1 Development plan/operational plan relationships ............................................................ 42
9.1 Assessing priorities of conservation projects in fixed budget ........................................ 164
10.1 Evaluation of cultural quality in buildings by points scoring ........................................ 179
10.2 Private opportunity costs to proprietor of conservation of the heritage ..................... 185
10.3 Social opportunity costs to community of conservation of the heritage ................. 187
12.1 Schematic model of circulation of spending on tourism related activity ................. 214

Tables

1.1 The stock in the urban and regional system: past, present, or future ......................... 14
7.1 Maximum cost of improvement per dwelling as proportion of cost of new building ... 136
12.1 Distribution of benefits and costs of conservation ......................................................... 206
IV.1 Framework for change visualised by a development project .......................................... 220
IV.2 Difference between the tools for analysis of costs and benefits .................................. 224
IV.3 Comparison of inputs of Department of Transport social cost-benefit analysis with community impact model ........................................................................................................... 225
13.1 Development appraisal: refurbishment of listed building within constraints .......... 228
13.2 Development appraisal: refurbishment with listed building consent outside constraints ................................................................. 229
13.3 Development appraisal: redevelopment ........................................................................ 230
13.4 Effect on viability of listed building refurbishment (Table 13.1) on revised assumptions on significant items ......................................................................................... 231
13.5 Social financial analysis .................................................................................................. 236
15.1 Comparison of land uses in Sha’arey Tsedek: options A and B .................................... 260
15.2 Master table of CIE showing source of input to Table 15.9 ........................................... 261
15.3 Framework for change: option A (rehabilitation) .......................................................... 263
15.4 Framework for change: option B (redevelopment) ......................................................... 264
List of diagrams, tables and plans

15.5 Impacts from project variables: option A (conservation) 266
15.6 Impacts from project variables: option B (redevelopment) 267
15.7 Community sectors and options in which they are involved 269
15.8 Summary of impacts on completion of options A and B 270
15.9 Evaluation of options (on completion) 272
15.10 Conclusion on options from Table 15.9 (on completion) 276
16.1 Royal Holloway Sanatorium: rehabilitation: financial viability of scheme (1): office/residential 294
16.2 Royal Holloway Sanatorium: rehabilitation: financial viability of most profitable residential scheme (Y) 295
16.3 Royal Holloway Sanatorium: evaluation of office/residential and residential options 296
16.4 Royal Holloway Sanatorium: summary of evaluation in Table 16.3: O/R against R options 297
16.5 Covent Garden: redevelopment: investment costs and returns on land transaction 309
16.6 Covent Garden: redevelopment: annual surplus/deficit to parties on land transaction 309
16.7 Covent Garden: comprehensive versus piecemeal redevelopment: a planning balance sheet appraisal 313

Plans

15.1 The old Sha'arey Tsedek Hospital: Jerusalem: location plan 257
15.2 The old Sha'arey Tsedek Hospital site: Jerusalem: rehabilitation scheme 258
15.3 The old Sha'arey Tsedek Hospital site: Jerusalem: redevelopment scheme 259
16.1 The Royal Holloway Sanatorium: Virginia Water: current block plan 292
16.2 Covent Garden, London: location plan 304
16.3 Covent Garden, London: redevelopment opportunity 306
Preface

This book is a sequel of joint research in 1982–84 by the writer and Professor Joseph Schweid with a grant from the Jerusalem Institute for Israel Studies*. The Research Report, The Role of Economics in the Conservation of the Cultural Built Heritage: Policy Conclusions for Israel, was presented in English in four parts:

I Planned Conservation of the Built Environment
II Economics in the Conservation of the Built Environment
III Two Jerusalem Case Studies
IV Application to Israel: Principles, Practice and Procedures

The Jerusalem Institute asked that the Report be published in two versions: in Hebrew for the Israeli audience and in English for Israel and abroad.

Since the Israeli audience would be primarily concerned with Parts III and IV, these were highlighted in the Israeli version with the remainder being presented as summaries. This version, edited by Joseph Schweid, appeared under the title Conservation of the Built Heritage (Jerusalem: The Jerusalem Institute for Israel Studies, 1986).

By the same token the English version required adaptation of the Research Report, in this instance the omission of Parts III and IV, and concentration on Parts I and II. In addition there was a further significant enlargement of scope. This arose from the experience of writing the Research Report, namely, that it was not practicable to discuss the economics of conservation without first presenting as a context the subject matter of conservation; and not practicable to present the conservation of the cultural built heritage without discussing as a context the conservation

* The Institute set up a Stearing Committee (Chairman, Professor Morris Hill) who helped us through successive drafts.
Preface

of the built heritage in general.* This approach is adopted here. But the general built heritage has been presented in greater depth, and the scope has been broadened beyond the general built heritage into ‘urban conservation’ as a whole, to take in also the national and human resource content of towns.

In the process, considerable additional material has been added in relation to urban conservation, conservation of the cultural built heritage, and the economic aspects. These include four case studies in Chapter 16, one being derived from the Jerusalem case studies, with the others from consultancy practice in Britain.

Thus the subject has been considerably broadened in scope since the initial research study, as shown in the following outline of contents.

Part I sets the scene for urban conservation in general, including its management and planning.

Part II sets the scene for conservation management and planning for the cultural built heritage, first showing its relation to the general cultural heritage, and then how it is identified, managed and planned.

Part III introduces economics into the planning and management of urban conservation before going into depth on the economics of the conservation of the cultural built heritage.

Part IV introduces four tools of economic analysis needed for applying the economics of Part III.

Part V presents four case studies which demonstrate the use of the tools in Part IV and the conclusions that can be drawn from them for answering a series of relevant questions.

This is the skeleton of the treatment of our theme. Its fleshing out is contained in the summary introducing each of the five parts so that the flavour of the book as a whole can be obtained from their prior perusal.

* The ‘cultural built heritage’ (CBH) is used below to indicate that part of the built environment (the general built heritage, GBH) which is intended for protection and conservation. But, for the Israeli version, it was argued, the word ‘heritage’ itself is sufficient to make the distinction, for in popular usage it denotes that part of the past which is to be protected: in brief, ‘cultural built heritage’ and ‘built heritage’ can be taken as synonymous. But since this book deals more with the general built heritage, it retains for contrast, ‘cultural built heritage’.
Acknowledgements

My thanks are due to many people, notably in Britain, Israel and Italy, from whom I have learned about conservation in work, lectures and discussions. In relation to this particular book my special thanks go to the following who have read the manuscript in draft and made comments which enabled me to improve the content: Donald Denman, Professor Emeritus in the Department of Land Economy, University of Cambridge; Sir Bernard Feilden, Conservation Architect; Luigi Fusco Girard, Professor in Department of Urban Economics, Faculty of Architecture, University of Naples; David Pearce, Professor of Economics, University College London; David Warren, Conservation Architect, English Heritage.

Then come those with whom I have discussed at length particular aspects within the text, namely: Michael Beesley, Professor of Economics, Graduate School of Business Studies, London; Eric Cohen, Professor in Department of Sociology and Anthropology, The Hebrew University, Jerusalem; Almerico Realfonzo, Professor of Estimo, University of Bari; Joseph Schweid, Professor in Bezalel Academy of Art and Design, Jerusalem; Roberto Di Stefano, Professor, Head of School of Reconstruction of Monuments, University of Naples; Roger Suddards, Solicitor, Bradford. Then come those too numerous to mention, from whom I have learned, in discussion and in practice.

In addition my thanks are due to my firm, Nathaniel Lichfield & Partners, in so many ways. To my partners, Geoffrey Smith and Dalia Lichfield, for their benign tolerance to my academic self-indulgence. To them and other colleagues, notably Nick Thompson, with whom I have worked on, and benefited from, our conservation studies. To Annabelle Disson for wordprocessing impeccable text in impeccable humour from the innumerable alterations I have imposed on her. To Sutchinda Rangsi for her elegant illustrations. To our librarians for their relentless pursuit of material and references.
xvi     Acknowledgements

Finally I wish to thank the following for permission to use illustrative material or text:
Her Majesty’s Stationery Office for Diagram 2.1, which is Crown copyright and reproduced with the permission of the Controller of Her Majesty’s Stationery Office.
The Minister of Supply and Services, Canada, for Diagram 10.1.
The Jerusalem Institute of Israel Studies and Mr. Yaacov Allon for Plans 15.2 and 15.3.
Hunter & Partners for Plan 16.1.
The London Residuary Body for Plan No. 16.3.
Pergamon Press for Table 16.7.