

Aristotle's Theory of Language and Meaning

This is a book about Aristotle's philosophy of language, interpreted in a framework that provides a comprehensive interpretation of Aristotle's metaphysics, philosophy of mind, epistemology, and science.

The aim of the book is to explicate the description of meaning contained in *De Interpretatione* and to show the relevance of that theory of meaning to much of the rest of Aristotle's philosophy. In the process Deborah Modrak reveals how that theory of meaning has been much maligned.

This is a major reassessment of an underestimated aspect of Aristotle that will be of particular interest to classical philosophers, classicists, and historians of psychology and cognitive science.

Deborah K. W. Modrak is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Rochester.



Aristotle's Theory of Language and Meaning

DEBORAH K. W. MODRAK

University of Rochester





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi

Cambridge University Press
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521103985

© Deborah K. W. Modrak 2001

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2001 This digitally printed version 2009

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data Modrak, Deborah K. W.

Aristotle's theory of language and meaning / Deborah K. W. Modrak.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-521-77266-4 (hardcover)

1. Aristotle – Contributions in philosophy of language. 2. Language and languages – Philosophy – History. 3. Aristotle – Contributions in philosophy of meaning. 4. Meaning (Philosophy) – History. I. Title.

B491.L3 M57 2000 121'.68'092 - dc21

99-056850

ISBN 978-0-521-77266-2 hardback ISBN 978-0-521-10398-5 paperback



In Memoriam

Carolina Shubrick Hart Ward 1915–1990

Charles Nathaniel Ward 1908–1986



Contents

	knowledgments troduction	page ix
	Part I Language and Knowledge	
1	Meaning	13
	1 Plato's Challenge	14
	2 Meaning and the De Interpretatione	19
	3 Categories and Linguistic Units	27
	4 Referring Expressions	37
	5 Sentences	43
	6 Ontological Presuppositions	45
	7 Preview	50
2	Truth and Necessary Truth	52
	1 Truth and Assertions	54
	2 Correspondence Theory of Truth	55
	3 Truth and Simples	62
	4 Necessity	66
	5 Hypothetical Necessity	74
	6 Language and Science	82
3	Language of Science	84
	Definition and the Method of Division	85
	2 The Foundations	95
	3 Basic Concepts and First Principles	101
	4 Defense of Empiricism	108
	5 Common Notions and Science	111
4	Three Types of Science	115
	1 Basic Concepts of Mathematics	117
	2 Natural Science	123
	3 Basic Concepts of Metaphysics	126
	vii	



viii	CONTENTS	
	 4 Endoxa and Dialectic 5 Essences and the Basic Concepts of Science 	132 142
	Part II Definition and Essence	
5	Definition and Ontology Requirements of Speech and Knowledge Definition and Essence Real Definition and Ordinary Definition Theaetetus Puzzles Revisited	147 149 156 168
6	 Logos as Substance The Same Logos Form and Matter Unity of Substance and Definition Identity and Accidental Sameness Forms and Universals Conclusion 	175 176 179 186 194 198
	Part III Cognition and Meaning	
8	Phantasia and Representation 1 Psychological Basis of Meaning 2 Sensory Representation 3 Likeness and Reference 4 A Different Reading 5 Drawbacks for the Theory of Meaning Abstract Thought and Meaning 1 Thought 2 Sensory Representation and Universals	219 221 230 234 237 239 244 245
	3 Answer to the Puzzle 4 Synopsis	256 262
9	Conclusions 1 Pulling the Threads Together 2 The Ancient Perspective 3 The Modern Perspective 4 Final Thoughts	265 265 268 272 277
Au Su	ect Bibliography tthor Index bject Index dex Locorum	279 289 291 294



Acknowledgments

Many of the topics covered in this volume were originally broached in talks. I would especially like to thank the audiences and commentators at Boston University, Chapel Hill Colloquium, Graduate Center of the City University of New York, Society for Ancient Greek Philosophy, University of Edinburgh, and Central and Pacific Division meetings of the American Philosophical Association for stimulating comments and queries. I would also like to thank the graduate students in the Aristotle seminars I taught in 1993 and 1997 at the University of Rochester; our discussions were very helpful. Finally, I would like to thank Robin Smith and the other, anonymous reader for Cambridge University Press for their very thoughtful and careful reading of the penultimate version.