

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-09770-3 - Between Two Worlds: George Tyrrell's Relationship to the
Thought of Matthew Arnold

Nicholas Sagovsky

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Between Two Worlds

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-09770-3 - Between Two Worlds: George Tyrrell's Relationship to the
Thought of Matthew Arnold

Nicholas Sagovsky

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Between Two Worlds

George Tyrrell's Relationship to the Thought of Matthew Arnold

Nicholas Sagovsky

*Vice-Principal
Edinburgh Theological College*

Cambridge University Press

Cambridge

London New York New Rochelle

Melbourne Sydney

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-09770-3 - Between Two Worlds: George Tyrrell's Relationship to the
Thought of Matthew Arnold
Nicholas Sagovsky
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi

Cambridge University Press
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521247542

© Cambridge University Press 1983

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1983
This digitally printed version 2008

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Catalogue Card Number: 82-22102

ISBN 978-0-521-24754-2 hardback
ISBN 978-0-521-09770-3 paperback

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-09770-3 - Between Two Worlds: George Tyrrell's Relationship to the
Thought of Matthew Arnold
Nicholas Sagovsky
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

The Burning Bush

When Moses, musing in the desert, found
The thorn bush spiking up from the hot ground,
And saw the branches, on a sudden, bear
The crackling yellow barberries of fire,

He searched his learning and imagination
For any logical, neat explanation,
And turned to go, but turned again and stayed,
And faced the fire and knew it for his God.

I too have seen the briar alight like coal,
The love that burns, the flesh that's ever whole,
And many times have turned and left it there,
Saying: 'It's prophecy – but metaphor.'

But stinging tongues like John the Baptist shout:
'That this is metaphor is no way out.
It's dogma too, or you make God a liar;
The bush is still a bush, and fire is fire.'

Norman Nicholson

(Reprinted by permission of Faber and Faber Ltd from *Five Rivers* by Norman Nicholson)

Cambridge University Press
 978-0-521-09770-3 - Between Two Worlds: George Tyrrell's Relationship to the
 Thought of Matthew Arnold
 Nicholas Sagovsky
 Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Contents

Acknowledgments	<i>page</i> ix
Abbreviations and note on references	xi
1 Tyrrell and Arnold 'between two worlds'	1
2 The history of an opinion	13
3 'Definite evidence'	20
4 Fundamental convergence: epistemology and metaphysics	38
5 The life of the spirit: ecclesiology and culture	61
6 Christology: the parting of the ways	89
7 God, and 'the Power that makes for Righteousness'	116
8 Conclusions	140
Appendix: Two letters to the Abbé Venard	149
Notes	154
Select bibliography	176
Unpublished sources	176
Published sources	177
Index	185

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-09770-3 - Between Two Worlds: George Tyrrell's Relationship to the
Thought of Matthew Arnold

Nicholas Sagovsky

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Acknowledgments

The writing of this book has represented my induction into a generous community of those who undertake and those who aid research. I cannot acknowledge all debts to those who wrote, encouraged and suggested. However, amongst others, I would like to thank the staff of the University Library, Cambridge; the staff of the Manuscripts Room at the British Library; Mme Callu and the staff of the Manuscripts Room at the Bibliothèque Nationale, Paris; Mr Smart, Mrs Gascoigne and the staff of the University Library, St Andrews; Father Osmund Lewry of Blackfriars, Oxford; Dom Mark Pontifex of Downside Abbey; Father Francis Edwards S.J., archivist at Farm Street; Dr A. W. Adams; Mme A. Louis-David; Mrs K. Pirenne; Father André Venard and Professor Marc Venard, all of whom helped me with manuscript material. Drs J. Coulson, E. Duffy, É. Goichot, E. Leonard, J. M. Livingston, A. R. Vidler and M. J. Weaver all helped me with criticism, information and encouragement. I am most grateful to the trustees of the Harold Buxton Trust and the Bethune-Baker Fund, and to the Master and Fellows of St Edmund's House, Cambridge, for financial assistance; to my sister, Lin Dennis, and to Jo Wallace-Hadrill, for accurate typing. My greatest debt of gratitude is to Professor Nicholas Lash, for the extreme care that he took in supervising the thesis that was the first draft of this book. He has taught me so much more than I can adequately express about 'doing theology on Dover Beach', not least that it is fun. Finally, I must thank my wife, Ruth, who has cheerfully given me every support over five years of research, and my son, Alexander, who waited patiently 'between two worlds' until, two hours after the last section of the book had gone to the typist, he decided to be born.

Cambridge University Press
 978-0-521-09770-3 - Between Two Worlds: George Tyrrell's Relationship to the
 Thought of Matthew Arnold
 Nicholas Sagovsky
 Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Abbreviations

- AL1 *The Autobiography of George Tyrrell* (London, 1912)
 AL2 M. D. Petre, *The Life of George Tyrrell from 1884 to 1909* (London, 1912)
- BM British Museum (i.e. British Library)
 BN Bibliothèque Nationale, Paris
 CA M. Arnold, *Culture and Anarchy* (1869)
 CCR G. Tyrrell, *Christianity at the Crossroads* (London, 1909)
 CF G. Tyrrell, *The Church and the Future* (reprinted, London, 1910)
 CM A. R. Waller (attributed to Waller, in fact by Tyrrell), *The Civilizing of the Matafanus: An Essay in Religious Development* (London, 1902)
- EC1 M. Arnold, *Essays in Criticism*, first series (1865)
 EC2 M. Arnold, *Essays in Criticism*, second series (1888)
 EFI M. D. Petre (ed.), *Essays on Faith and Immortality* (London, 1914)
 ER G. Tyrrell, *External Religion: Its Use and Abuse* (London, 1899)
 FM1, 2 G. Tyrrell, *The Faith of the Millions: A Selection of Past Essays*, first and second series (London, 1901)
- GB M. Arnold, *God and the Bible* (1875)
 HS G. Tyrrell, *Hard Sayings: A Selection of Meditations and Studies* (London, 1898)
- LC G. Tyrrell, *Lex Credendi: A Sequel to Lex Orandi* (London, 1906)
 LD M. Arnold, *Literature and Dogma* (1873)
 LE M. Arnold, *Last Essays on Church and Religion* (1877)
 Letters I, II G. W. E. Russell (ed.), *Letters of Matthew Arnold* (2 vols., London, 1895)
- LO G. Tyrrell, *Lex Orandi; or, Prayer and Creed* (London, 1903)
 MAL G. Tyrrell, *A Much-Abused Letter* (London, 1906)
 ME M. Arnold, *Mixed Essays* (1879)
 Med. G. Tyrrell, *Medievalism: A Reply to Cardinal Mercier* (London, 1908)

Cambridge University Press
 978-0-521-09770-3 - Between Two Worlds: George Tyrrell's Relationship to the
 Thought of Matthew Arnold
 Nicholas Sagovsky
 Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Abbreviations

NV	G. Tyrrell, <i>Nova et Vetera: Informal Meditations for Times of Spiritual Dryness</i> (London, 1897)
OW	G. Tyrrell, <i>Oil and Wine</i> , reissue with a new preface (London, 1907)
PMLA	<i>Publications of the Modern Language Association of America</i>
PQ	<i>Philological Quarterly</i>
RES	<i>Review of English Studies</i>
RFL	E. Engels (pseudonym for G. Tyrrell), <i>Religion as a Factor of Life</i> (Exeter, 1902)
S	R. H. Super (ed.), <i>The Complete Prose Works of Matthew Arnold</i> (11 vols., Michigan, 1960–77)
SAUL	St Andrews University Library
SL	M. D. Petre (ed.), <i>George Tyrrell's Letters</i> (London, 1920)
SPP	M. Arnold, <i>St Paul and Protestantism</i> (1870)
TSC	G. Tyrrell, <i>Through Scylla and Charybdis; or, The Old Theology and the New</i> (London, 1907)

Note on references

Most references to major primary printed sources are given in the text. For Tyrrell, bibliographical details of books can be found with the abbreviations. I have not listed all other references to Tyrrell's works in the bibliography, as the relevant references are given in the notes at the end of each chapter, and the general selection is inevitably eclectic. Thomas Loome's bibliography (*The Heythrop Journal*, 10 (1969), 280–314; 11 (1970), 161–9; *Liberal Catholicism, Reform Catholicism, Modernism* (Mainz, 1979), pp. 218–27), and that of David Schultenover, *George Tyrrell* (Shepherdstown, USA, 1981), pp. 434–62, can be confidently used for further information. The whereabouts of letters can be discovered from the list of unpublished sources in the bibliography. Where I have used printed sources for letters, these are given in the text or notes. For Arnold's prose I have used the Michigan edition of *The Complete Prose Works of Matthew Arnold*, edited by R. H. Super. This is referred to by an 'S', followed by the volume number, an indication of Arnold's original title where appropriate, and the page number. For his poetry I have used *The Poems of Matthew Arnold*, edited by Kenneth Allott, second edition, edited by Miriam Allott, in the Longman Annotated English Poets series (London, 1979).