

Ecumenism, Christian Origins and the Practice of Communion

The theology of communion, or koinonia, has been at the centre of the ecumenical movement for more than thirty years. It is central to the self-understanding of the Anglican, Roman Catholic, and Orthodox Churches, and has been prominent in the work of the World Council of Churches. This book, based on the 1996 Hulsean Lectures, examines the significance of koinonia for contemporary ecumenical theology, tracing the development of contemporary understanding in critical engagement with the thought of Plato, Aristotle, the Hebrew Scriptures, the New Testament, the Cappadocian Fathers, and Augustine. In each case, reflection on community life is related to actual communities in which texts were produced. The importance of conflict and the place of politics for the koinonia that constitutes the Christian churches is a major theme throughout. Communion is seen as a gift to be received and a discipline to be cultivated in the continuing practice of ecumenism.

Nicholas Sagovsky is the William Leech Professorial Research Fellow in Applied Christian Theology at the University of Newcastle upon Tyne. He is a member of the Anglican–Roman Catholic International Commission and delivered the Hulsean Lectures at Cambridge University in 1996.



ECUMENISM, CHRISTIAN ORIGINS AND THE PRACTICE OF COMMUNION

NICHOLAS SAGOVSKY

William Leech Professorial Research Fellow in Applied Christian Theology, University of Newcastle upon Tyne





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi

Cambridge University Press
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521772693

© Nicholas Sagovsky 2000

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2000 This digitally printed version 2008

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Sagovsky, Nicholas, 1947– Ecumenism, Christian origins and the practice of communion / by Nicholas Sagovsky.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0 521 77269 9

1. Ecumenical movement – History.

 $2.\ Christian\ union-History.\quad I.\ Title.$

BX6.5.S25 2000

262'.001'1 99-042143 CIP

ISBN 978-0-521-77269-3 hardback ISBN 978-0-521-09053-7 paperback



Contents

| Acknowledgements List of abbreviations | | Page vi |
|---|---|---------|
| I | The common life | I |
| 2 | Communion: Anglicans, Roman Catholics, and ecumenical consensus | 18 |
| 3 | Plato's vision | 48 |
| 4 | Aristotle's revisionism | 72 |
| 5 | Covenant and community | 97 |
| 6 | Little communities and the Catholic church | 116 |
| 7 | Cappadocian koinonia | 146 |
| 8 | Augustine and the story of communion | 171 |
| 9 | Ecumenism and the practice of communion | 194 |
| Sel | ect bibliography | 209 |
| Index | | 218 |



Acknowledgements

The first full draft of this book was the text of the Hulsean Lectures, given in Cambridge in the Michaelmas Term 1996. I must therefore thank the electors for the honour they did me when they gave me the opportunity to develop my thinking in such a context. I hope that John Hulse, who endowed the post of 'Christian Advocate' in 1790 that there might be someone to 'compose some proper and judicious Answer or Answers every year, to all such new and popular or other Cavils and Objections against the Christian or Revealed Religion, or against the Religion of Nature, as may...seem...most...to deserve or require an Answer' and who required 'such his written answer to be in English, and only against notorious Infidels, whether Atheists or Deists, not descending to any particular Controversies or Sects among Christians themselves', would not have found the concern in these lectures with the reconciliation of Christians to be misplaced.

Two of the Hulsean electors in particular I must thank for their encouragement with this project and friendship over many years: Nicholas Lash, who, as Norris-Hulse Professor in the University of Cambridge for nearly twenty years resisted all manner of Cavils and Objections to the Christian Religion with the seriousness (or otherwise) they deserved, and David Ford, who, as Regius Professor, makes it his business to see that the Faculty of Divinity may properly be called a community, making its contribution fully within the scholastic community of the University.

Sections of the text were also read at a conference of the Council for Christians and Jews, two meetings of the London



Acknowledgements

VII

seminar of the Society for Ecumenical Studies, a 'Bishop's Study Day' in Birmingham, as a College Lecture at Cranmer Hall, Durham, and as a Lecture in the Department of Theology at Durham University.

It is no coincidence that my theme should have matured amongst the friendships of Clare College, Cambridge. In this book there are echoes of conversations with Valentin Dedji, the late Roger Hooker, Jonathan Lear, C. F. D. (Charlie) Moule, Stephen Plant, Malcolm Ruel, Mark Santer, Dominic Scott, Robin Steinke, Stephen Sykes, Douglas Templeton, Nicholas Tustin, and John Zizioulas, conversations I remember with delight. The Master and Fellows of Clare gave me sabbatical leave for two terms in 1993 and one in 1997, for which I am profoundly grateful. The support of Tim Brown and the generosity of Jane Charman and Jo Bailey Wells, covering for me in my absence, made those times possible, as did the tolerance of my family, my closest and most beloved koinonoi.

In October 1997, I became William Leech Research Fellow in Applied Christian Theology at the University of Newcastle. When interviewed, I blithely assured the Trustees that the redrafting of this book would be finished before I took up the appointment. My timetable proved hopelessly optimistic. The task occupied much of my research time through my first year in the new post. The indulgence and support of the Trustees has enabled me at last to finish the work and to look with confidence towards a second volume on 'Justice and The Common Good'.

John Orme Mills OP, Ben Quash, Rowan Williams, Alex Wright, and three anonymous readers appointed by the Cambridge University Press read the typescript in full, offering searching and perceptive criticisms which I tried to bear in mind as I revised the text. Others who read or heard part of the text and helped me with their comments were Stephen Barton, David Carter, David Chapman, James Dunn, Paul McPartlan, and William Telford. Michael Root helped me by procuring material from the Institute for Ecumenical Research, Strasburg. Mistakes that remain after so much help are, of course, 'mine own'.

Two very different groups can have little idea how much I



viii

Acknowledgements

owe to the many hours spent in their company. I owe an immense debt to those in the group that first met to consider our response to The Community Charge, and then went on meeting to support one another in work for those at the margins of our community: Gabrielle Cox, Chris Moss SI, Alan Murdie, Paul Nicolson, Louise Pirouet, Hannah Reed, and Graeme Walker. Members of the group have so often spoken of situations in which they are expending their energies in practical concern for the poor, while I have been silent. If they in any way hear the echo of their voices or find helpful theological reflection in this book, I shall be delighted. The other group without which this book could not have been written is that which meets every year as ARCIC (The Anglican-Roman Catholic International Commission). Those annual nine-day seminars, not only in theology, but in Christian living, have been one of the great privileges of my life. Within the Commission there has been a special koinonia amongst the drafting group that met more frequently through several years. I owe an exceptional debt of gratitude to John Baycroft, Peter Cross, and Jean Tillard OP for all I have learnt working together with

I hope my sisters and brothers in ARCIC will accept my dedication of this book to them, in gratitude for the communion that we share and in longing that the Lord's petition may be fulfilled, 'ut simus consummati in unum'.

NOTE ON TRANSLATIONS

Throughout this book I have used and quoted a variety of translations of key texts, indicating in the notes which translation is being used, or adapted, for a particular quotation. Unless otherwise indicated, the translation of the Bible quoted, including for Apocryphal texts, is the Revised Standard Version or New Revised Standard Version.



Abbreviations

| ANCF | Ante-Nicene Christian Fathers Series (Edinburgh: | |
|-------|--|--|
| | T. and T. Clark; Grand Rapids: Eerdmans) | |
| CD | De Civitate Dei (Augustine) | |
| CWS | Classics of Western Spirituality Series (London: | |
| | SPCK; New York: Paulist Press) | |
| FC | The Fathers of the Church Series (Washington | |
| | DC: The Catholic University of America Press) | |
| GS | Gaudium et spes (The Pastoral Constitution on the | |
| | Church in the Modern World, from The Docu- | |
| | ments of the Second Vatican Council) | |
| LCL | Loeb Classical Library | |
| LG | Lumen Gentium (The Dogmatic Constitution on the | |
| | Church, from The Documents of the Second | |
| | Vatican Council) | |
| NEB | New English Bible | |
| NIV | New International Version (of the Bible) | |
| PCPCU | Pontifical Council for Promoting Christian Unity | |
| PNCF | Post-Nicene Christian Fathers Series (Edinburgh: | |
| | T. and T. Clark; Grand Rapids: Eerdmans) | |
| PG | Migne, J. P. (ed.), Patrologia Graeca | |
| RSV | Revised Standard Version (of the Bible) | |
| SC | Sources Chrétiennes (Paris: Cerf) | |
| TDNT | Kittel, G. (ed.) Theological Dictionary of the New | |
| | | |
| | Testament, 10 vols. (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, | |
| | Testament, 10 vols. (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1964–76), translation of Kittel, G. (ed.) Theolo- | |
| | | |
| | 1964-76), translation of Kittel, G. (ed.) Theolo- | |
| TWOT | 1964–76), translation of Kittel, G. (ed.) Theologisches Wörterbuch zum Neues Testament, 10 vols. | |



| X | List of abbreviations |
|----|--|
| | logical Dictionary of the Old Testament, unfinished, 8 vols. (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1974–), translation of Theologisches Wörterbuch zum Alten Testa- |
| UR | ment, 8 vols. (Stuttgart: Kohlhammer, 1973–5) Unitatis Redintegratio (The Decree on Ecumenism, from The Documents of the Second Vatican |
| WM | Council) Gadamer, HG. Wahrheit und Methode, revised edition (Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr, 1986) |