

This important volume deals with the challenges posed by comparative strategies in human development, challenges that reflect the dynamic and multilevel nature of development. Comparative strategies represent basic heuristic tools for studying the change and stability of both people and their environments. Yet developmentalists make comparisons that focus on the magnitude of differences between groups (based, for example, on age or gender), often neglecting issues of variability and process. Comparisons in Human Development examines the problems and promise of comparisons in the study of development and provides empirical examples of diverse comparative approaches to human activity and thought.

Although the contributors come from many disciplines and countries, they share the view that developmental research must be concerned with processes that operate through time and are regulated by their biological, social, and cultural contexts. Development is thus understood in systemic terms, with bidirectional influences crossing levels of analysis, including the cellular, individual, group, cultural, and historical. This volume identifies comparative strategies as a fundamental research issue for developmentalists faced with the complexities of this systemic model.

Comparisons in Human Development examines central issues raised by the use of comparisons in theoretical and methodological terms. It then offers empirical examples of comparative strategies, exploring the intricate comparisons of cultural psychology. In the concluding section, an international team of leading developmentalists critically evaluates the book's contributions. Comparisons in Human Development complements Developmental Science, by Robert B. Cairns, Glen H. Elder, Jr., and E. Jane Costello (Cambridge University Press, 1996), which describes in theoretical terms an interdisciplinary approach to the change and stability of behavior.



## **Cambridge Studies in Social and Emotional Development**

General Editor: Martin L. Hoffman, New York University

Advisory Board: Robert N. Emde, Willard W. Hartup, Robert A. Hinde, Lois W. Hoffman, Carroll E. Izard, Nicholas Blurton Jones, Jerome Kagan, Franz J. Mönks, Paul Mussen, Ross D. Parke, and Michael Rutter

# **Comparisons in Human Development**



# **Comparisons in Human Development**

Understanding Time and Context

Edited by

JONATHAN TUDGE

University of North Carolina at Greensboro

MICHAEL J. SHANAHAN

Pennsylvania State University

JAAN VALSINER

University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill





### CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi

Cambridge University Press
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521482028

© Cambridge University Press 1997

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1997
This digitally printed version 2008

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Comparisons in human development: understanding time and context / edited by Jonathan Tudge, Michael J. Shanahan, Jaan Valsiner.

p. cm. - (Cambridge studies in social and emotional development)

Includes bibliographical references.

ISBN 0-521-48202-X (hc)

Developmental psychology.
 Developmental psychology - Crosscultural studies.
 Developmental psychology - Longitudinal studies.
 Tudge, Jonathan.
 Shanahan, Michael J.
 Valsiner, Jaan.
 Series.
 BF713.5C66
 1997
 - dc20

96-12287 CIP

ISBN 978-0-521-48202-8 hardback ISBN 978-0-521-08795-7 paperback



# **Contents**

List of Contributors		page ix
a Jo	omparisons in Human Development: To Begin Conversation on the Control of the Cont	1
	art One Metatheoretical Approaches to evelopmental Comparisons	
1	Developmental Research and Comparative Perspectives: Applications to Developmental Science Lucien T. Winegar	13
2	Developmental Concepts across Disciplines  Michael J. Shanahan, Jaan Valsiner, and  Gilbert Gottlieb	34
3	Ecological Perspectives in Human Development: A Comparison of Gibson and Bronfenbrenner Jonathan Tudge, Jacquelyn T. Gray, and Diane M. Hogan	72
Pa	art Two Paradigmatic Statements	
4	Nested Comparisons in the Study of Historical Change and Individual Adaptation  Michael J. Shanahan and Glen H. Elder, Jr.	109
5	The Value of Comparisons in Developmental Psychology  Debra Mekos and Patricia A. Clubb	137



vi	Contents	
6	Implications from Developmental Cross-cultural Research for the Study of Acculturation in Western Civilizations  Beth Kurtz-Costes, Rona McCall, and  Wolfgang Schneider	162
Par	t Three Comparisons at the Level of Data	
7	The Co-development of Identity, Agency, and Lived Worlds  Dorothy C. Holland and Debra G. Skinner	193
8	Sociocultural Promotions Constraining Children's Social Activity: Comparisons and Variability in the Development of Friendships Paul A. Winterhoff	222
9	The Everyday Experiences of North American Preschoolers in Two Cultural Communities: A Cross-disciplinary and Cross-level Analysis Jonathan Tudge and Sarah E. Putnam	252
Par	rt Four Commentaries	
10	Developmental Science: A Case of the Bird Flapping Its Wings or the Wings Flapping the Bird?  Jeanette A. Lawrence	285
11	Conceptual Transposition, Parallelism, and Interdisciplinary Communication  Jeanette A. Lawrence and Agnes E. Dodds	293
12	The "Ecological" Approach: When Labels Suggest Similarities beyond Shared Basic Concepts in Psychology Angela Branco	304
13	Problems of Comparison: Methodology, the Art of Storytelling, and Implicit Models <i>Hideo Kojima</i>	318
14	The Promise of Comparative, Longitudinal Research for Studies of Productive-Reproductive Processes in Children's Lives  William A. Corsaro	334



vii	Contents	
15	Integrating Psychology into Social Science  James Youniss	340
	Author Index	355
	Subject Index	362



## **Contributors**

## Angela Branco

Institute of Psychology University of Brasilia 70910.900 Brasilia Brasil

## Patricia A. Clubb

Department of Psychology CB 3270 Davie Hall University of North Carolina Chapel Hill, NC 27599

## William A. Corsaro

Department of Sociology Ballantine Hall 744 University of Indiana Bloomington, IN 47405-6628

## Agnes E. Dodds

Center for the Study of Higher Education University of Melbourne Parkville, VIC 3052 Australia

## Glen H. Elder, Jr.

Carolina Population Center CB 8120, University Square East University of North Carolina Chapel Hill, NC 27599

### Gilbert Gottlieb

Center for Developmental Science University of North Carolina Chapel Hill, NC 27599-8115

ix

## Jacquelyn T. Gray

EduTech Institute Georgia Institute of Technology Atlanta, GA 30332-0280

## Diane M. Hogan

The Children's Centre
University of Dublin, Trinity
College
Dublin 2
Ireland

## Dorothy C. Holland

Department of Anthropology CB 3115, 301 Alumni Building University of North Carolina Chapel Hill, NC 27599

## Hideo Kojima

School of Education Nagoya University Chijusa-Ku Nagoya 464-01 Japan

## **Beth Kurtz-Costes**

Department of Psychology CB 3270 Davie Hall University of North Carolina Chapel Hill, NC 27599

## Jeanette A. Lawrence

Department of Psychology University of Melbourne Parkville, VIC 3052 Australia



## x Contributors

#### Rona McCall

Department of Psychology CB 3270 Davie Hall University of North Carolina Chapel Hill, NC 27599

### **Debra Mekos**

Department of Maternal and Child Health Johns Hopkins University 624 N. Broadway Baltimore, MD 21205

### Sarah E. Putnam

Department of Human Development and Family Studies 155 Stone Building University of North Carolina Greensboro, NC 27412-5001

## **Wolfgang Schneider**

Department of Psychology University of Würzburg Wittelsbacherplatz 1 D-8700 Würzburg 97074 Germany

### Michael J. Shanahan

Department of Human Development and Family Studies Pennsylvania State University 110 Henderson Building South University Park, PA 16802

#### Debra G. Skinner

Frank Porter Graham Child Development Center CB 8180 University of North Carolina Chapel Hill, NC 27599-8180

## Jonathan Tudge

Department of Human Development and Family Studies 155 Stone Building University of North Carolina Greensboro, NC 27412-5001

### Jaan Valsiner

Department of Psychology CB 3270 Davie Hall University of North Carolina Chapel Hill, NC 27599

## Lucien T. Winegar

Department of Psychology Randolph-Macon College Ashland, VA 23005

## Paul A. Winterhoff

Department of Human Environmental Sciences Meredith College 3800 Hillsborough St. Raleigh, NC 27607

### **James Youniss**

Life Cycle Institute Catholic University of America Washington, DC 20064