

Explicit quotations from the Jewish Scriptures play a vital role in several of the apostle Paul's letters to struggling Christian congregations. In most cases the wording of these quotations differs markedly from all known versions of the biblical text. Studies of Paul's use of Scripture routinely note the problem and suggest possible solutions, but none to date has made this phenomenon the primary object of investigation. The present study aims to remedy this deficiency with a careful examination of the way Paul and other ancient authors handled the wording of their explicit quotations. In drawing general conclusions, Dr. Stanley examines the broader social environment that made "interpretive renderings" a normal and accepted part of the literary landscape of antiquity.



SOCIETY FOR NEW TESTAMENT STUDIES

MONOGRAPH SERIES

General Editor: G. N. Stanton

69

PAUL AND THE LANGUAGE OF SCRIPTURE



Paul and the language of Scripture

Citation technique in the Pauline Epistles and contemporary literature

CHRISTOPHER D. STANLEY

Hastings College





> Published by the Press Syndicate of the University of Cambridge The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge CB2 1RP 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA 10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Victoria 3166, Australia

© Cambridge University Press 1992

First published 1992

Printed and bound in Great Britain by Woolnough Bookbinding, Irthlingborough, Northants

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress cataloguing in publication data

Stanley, Christopher D.

Paul and the language of Scripture: citation technique in the

Pauline Epistles and contemporary literature / Christopher D. Stanley.

cm.

Revision of the author's thesis (Ph.D.) - Duke University, 1990.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0 521 41925 5

- 1. Bible. N.T. Epistles of Paul Relation to the Old Testament.
- 2. Bible. O.T. Quotations in the New Testament.
- 3. Bible. N.T. Epistles of Paul Language, style.
- 4. Quotation. 5. Literature, Ancient History and criticism. I. Title.

BS2655.R32S73 1992

91-39844

227'.06-dc20

CIP

ISBN 0 521 41925 5 hardback



CONTENTS

	Preface	page	ix
	List of abbreviations		xi
	PART I: THE ISSUES		
1	Defining the issues		3
	1 Introduction2 A confusion of voices		3 4
	3 Proposed solutions		8
	4 Charting the course		28
2	A question of method		31
	1 The importance of methodology		31
	2 Identifying the citations		33
	3 Establishing the text		37
	4 Isolating the adaptations		51
	PART II: CITATION TECHNIQUE IN THE LETTERS OF	F PAU	L
3	Sources		65
	1 Identifying the citations		65
	2 Establishing the text		67
	3 Isolating the adaptations		79
	4 Identification codes		81
1	The evidence of Romans		83
5	The evidence of 1 and 2 Corinthians and Galatians	1	185
6	Paul and the text of Scripture	2	252

vii



viii Contents

PART III: COMPARATIVE STUDIES

7	Ci	tation technique in Greco-Roman literature	267
	1	Introduction	267
	2	Comparability of materials	269
	3	General observations	271
	4	Specific examples	274
		Strabo	275
		"Longinus"	278
		Heraclitus	281
		Plutarch	284
	5	Summary of findings	289
8	Ci	tation technique in early Judaism	292
	1	Introduction	292
	2	Materials	294
	3	Qumran	296
		4QTestimonia, 11QMelchizedek	
		and 4Q Patriarchal Blessings	298
		4QFlorilegium	299
		Manual of Discipline (1QS)	300
		War Scroll (1QM)	300
		Damascus Document (CD)	301
		Conclusions	304
	4	Apocrypha and pseudepigrapha	307
	5	Philo	323
		Philo and Homer	325
		De Ebrietate	326
		Legum Allegoria	328
		Conclusions	333
	6	Summary	336
9	Conclusions		338
	1	Paul and his contemporaries	338
	2	Form and freedom	350
	3	Intentional adaptations?	359
	Se	elect bibliography	361
	In	dex	377



PREFACE

Ancient authors relied far more on the works of their predecessors than one would ever guess from a study of their explicit quotations. The same holds true for modern scholars who have the benefit of computerized reference systems and automatic footnotes to ease their task.

The present work is a slightly revised version of a Ph.D. dissertation submitted to Duke University in the summer of 1990. Many of those who have contributed the most to this project would never find mention in the footnotes. Special thanks are due to Dr. Moody Smith, my adviser, who allowed me to pursue my interests well beyond the usual limits of a Duke dissertation. His own studies in early Christian exegesis made him an invaluable resource at numerous points along the way. Dr. Melvin Peters, in a class on the Septuagint, was the first to suggest that I explore Paul's use of the Greek biblical text. His faith in my abilities has been a constant source of encouragement. Dr. Orval Wintermute shared the fruit of years of careful research as we examined the biblical exegesis of the Qumran community and the Jewish "pseudepigrapha." Discussions with friends and colleagues likewise helped to hone my thinking in a number of key areas.

Thanks are also due to Dr. Graham Stanton for accepting this volume for publication in the SNTS series, and to Alex Wright and his colleagues at Cambridge University Press for handling a difficult manuscript with skill and aplomb. An earlier version of the section on citation technique at Qumran (chapter 8) was presented at the Annual Meeting of the Society of Biblical Literature in Anaheim, California, in November 1989. A slightly longer version of chapter 7 appeared in *Novum Testamentum* 32 (1990), 48–78, and is used here with the kind permission of the publishers.

Two other people deserve special mention for their support in the years leading up to the completion of this study. To Dr. John

ix



x Preface

Nolland, now Vice Principal at Trinity College, Bristol, goes the credit for introducing me to the world of New Testament studies. His love for learning and patient attention to detail have been an inspiration and a model to me throughout my scholarly career. To my wife, Laurel, is due an immeasurable load of gratitude for the support and encouragement that she has given me through sixteen years of marriage. This book is dedicated to the two of them.



Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-07796-5 - Paul and the Language of Scripture: Citation Technique in

the Pauline Epistles and Contemporary Literature

Christopher D. Stanley

Frontmatter

More information

ABBREVIATIONS

Abbreviations follow the system set forth in the *Journal of Biblical Literature* 107 (1988), 583–96, with the following additions:

Brooke-McLean	Brooke, Alan	England, N	Jorman	McLean and

Henry St. J. Thackeray (eds.), The Old Testament in Greek (Cambridge University Press,

1906–40)

Field Field, Frederick (ed.), Origenis Hexaplorum

quae supersunt, 2 vols. (Oxford: Clarendon, 1867, 1875; repr., Hildesheim: G. Olms, 1964)

Göttingen LXX Academia Litterarum Gottingensis, Septua-

ginta: Vetus Testamentum Graecum (Göttingen:

Vandenhoeck and Ruprecht, 1931-)

Hatch & Redpath Hatch, Edwin, and Henry A. Redpath, A Concordance to the Septuagint, 3 vols. (Oxford:

Clarendon, 1897–1906; repr., Grand Rapids:

Baker, 1987)

Holmes-Parsons Holmes, A. Roberto, and Jacobus Parsons

(eds.), Vetus Testamentum Graecum cum variis lectionibus, 5 vols. (Oxford: Clarendon, 1798–

1827)

Jastrow, Marcus, A Dictionary of the Targu-

mim, the Talmud Babli and Yerushalmi, and the Midrashic Literature, 2 vols. (London: Luzac and Co., 1903; New York: G. P. Putnam's Sons, 1903; repr., New York: Judaica Press,

1971)

Strack-Billerbeck Strack, Hermann L., and Paul Billerbeck, Kom-

mentar zum Neuen Testament aus Talmud und Midrasch, 6 vols. (Munich: Beck, 1922–61)

xi



xii List of abbreviations

Tischendorf, Constantinus (ed.), *Novum Testamentum Graece*, 2 vols. (Leipzig: Giesecke and Devrient, 1869–72)