

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-06335-7 - Information Systems Development and Data Modeling: Conceptual and Philosophical Foundations

Rudy Hirschheim, Heinz K. Klein and Kalle Lyytinen

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

Table of Contents

Preface	xi
Acknowledgements	xiii
1 Introduction	1
1.1 Background	1
1.2 Purpose of the Book	3
1.3 Goals and Organization of the Book	5
2 Definition and Evolution of Information Systems Development Methodologies and Data Modeling	10
2.1 Introduction	10
2.2 Basic Terminology	12
2.2.1 Introductory Concepts and Terms	12
2.2.1.1 <i>Codes and Data</i>	12
2.2.1.2 <i>Meaning vs. Invariances</i>	13
2.2.1.3 <i>Data vs. Information and Knowledge</i>	14
2.2.1.4 <i>Knowledge vs. Wisdom</i>	15
2.2.2 Basic Terminology for IS	15
2.2.2.1 <i>Definition of Information Systems Development as Object System Change</i>	15
2.2.2.2 <i>Definition of Information Systems Development Methodology</i>	21
2.2.3 Definition of Data Modeling	26
2.3 Seven Generations of ISD Methodologies	28
2.3.1 Background	28
2.3.2 Pre-Methodology Era	29
2.3.3 First Generation: The Emergence of Formal Life-cycle Approaches	30
2.3.4 Second Generation: The Emergence of the Structured Approaches	33
2.3.5 Third Generation: The Emergence of Prototyping and Evolutionary Approaches	34

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-06335-7 - Information Systems Development and Data Modeling: Conceptual and Philosophical Foundations

Rudy Hirschheim, Heinz K. Klein and Kalle Lyytinen

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

vi		<i>Table of Contents</i>
2.3.6	Fourth Generation: The Emergence of Socio-technical, Participative Approaches	36
2.3.7	Fifth Generation: The Emergence of Sense-making and Problem Formulation Approaches	37
2.3.8	Sixth Generation: The Emergence of the Trade-union led Approaches	38
2.3.9	Seventh Generation: The Emergence of Emancipatory Approaches	39
2.4	Evolution of Data Modeling	40
2.4.1	Pre-database Architecture: From the Phoenicians to File Organization	40
2.4.2	The Emergence and Evolution of Advanced Database Architectures	42
2.4.2.1	<i>Two Level Database Architectures</i>	42
2.4.2.2	<i>The ANSI/X3/SPARC Three Level Architecture</i>	42
2.4.3	Proliferation of High Level Data Models	44
2.5	Summary and Conclusions	45
3	Philosophical Foundations	46
3.1	Introduction	46
3.2	Definition of Paradigms	46
3.2.1	Epistemological and Ontological Assumptions of Paradigms	47
3.2.2	Classification of Four Paradigms	48
3.3	Paradigms in ISD	49
3.3.1	Differences Relating to Human Interests	51
3.3.2	Differences in Ontology	54
3.3.3	Differences Related to User Control and the Kind of System Produced	54
3.4	Data Modeling Paradigms	57
3.4.1	Ontology and Epistemology of Data Modeling	58
3.4.2	Philosophical Origins of Data Modeling Paradigms	60
3.4.3	Objectivism–Subjectivism in Data Modeling	61
3.5	Paradigmatic Implications for Object Systems Definition	63
3.5.1	Object Systems in Functionalism	63
3.5.2	Object Systems in Radical Structuralism	65
3.5.3	Object Systems in Social Relativism	66
3.5.4	Object Systems in Neohumanism	66

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-06335-7 - Information Systems Development and Data Modeling: Conceptual and Philosophical Foundations

Rudy Hirschheim, Heinz K. Klein and Kalle Lyytinen

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

<i>Table of Contents</i>	vii
3.6 Summary and Conclusions	67
4 Conceptual and Paradigmatic Foundations of ISD	68
4.1 Introduction	68
4.2 Paradigms of Information Systems Development	68
4.2.1 Paradigmatic Assumptions of Functionalist ISD	69
4.2.1.1 <i>General Description</i>	69
4.2.1.2 <i>Interpretation</i>	70
4.2.1.3 <i>Analysis and Discussion</i>	71
4.2.2 Paradigmatic Assumptions of Social Relativist ISD	73
4.2.2.1 <i>General Description</i>	73
4.2.2.2 <i>Interpretation</i>	74
4.2.2.3 <i>Analysis and Discussion</i>	75
4.2.3 Paradigmatic Assumptions of Radical Structuralist ISD	76
4.2.3.1 <i>General Description</i>	76
4.2.3.2 <i>Interpretation</i>	78
4.2.3.3 <i>Analysis and Discussion</i>	79
4.2.4 Paradigmatic Assumptions of Neohumanist ISD	80
4.2.4.1 <i>General Description</i>	80
4.2.4.2 <i>Interpretation</i>	88
4.2.4.3 <i>Analysis and Discussion</i>	89
4.3 Paradigms and the Evolution of Methodologies	92
4.3.1 An Approach to Paradigmatic Placement of Methodologies	92
4.3.2 The Relationship between Paradigms and Generations of ISD Methodologies	95
4.4 Summary and Conclusions	98
5 Paradigmatic Analysis of ISD Methodologies	99
5.1 Introduction	99
5.2 Selection of Approaches and Plan of Analysis	99
5.3 Information Systems Planning and Structured Approaches	102
5.3.1 Problem Focus and Overview	103
5.3.2 Paradigmatic Analysis of Strengths	107
5.3.3 Paradigmatic Analysis of Weaknesses	107
5.3.4 Suggested Directions for Future Improvements	110

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-06335-7 - Information Systems Development and Data Modeling: Conceptual and Philosophical Foundations

Rudy Hirschheim, Heinz K. Klein and Kalle Lyytinen

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

viii

Table of Contents

5.4 Prototyping and Evolutionary Systems Development	115
5.4.1 Problem Focus and Overview	115
5.4.2 Paradigmatic Analysis of Strengths	119
5.4.3 Paradigmatic Analysis of Weaknesses	122
5.4.4 Suggested Directions for Future Improvements	123
5.5 Soft Systems Methodology	124
5.5.1 Problem Focus and Overview	124
5.5.2 Paradigmatic Analysis of Strengths	125
5.5.3 Paradigmatic Analysis of Weaknesses	126
5.5.4 Suggested Directions for Future Improvements	127
5.6 Professional Work Practices Approach	128
5.6.1 Problem Focus and Overview	129
5.6.2 Paradigmatic Analysis of Strengths	132
5.6.3 Paradigmatic Analysis of Weaknesses	134
5.6.4 Suggestions Directions for Future Improvements	137
5.7 Summary of Methodology Analysis	138
5.7.1 Methodology Summary	138
5.7.2 Comparative Methodology Review	139
6 Conceptual and Paradigmatic Foundations of Data Modeling	144
6.1 Introduction	144
6.2 Philosophical Background	145
6.2.1 Positivism and Analytical Philosophy	145
6.2.2 The Later Wittgenstein and the Concept of the Language Game	147
6.2.3 Philosophical Hermeneutics	150
6.3 Paradigms of Data Modeling	154
6.3.1 Philosophical Perspective on Data Modeling	154
6.3.2 Paradigmatic Assumptions of Functionalist Data Modeling	157
6.3.3 Paradigmatic Assumptions of Social Relativist Data Modeling	160
6.3.4 Paradigmatic Assumptions of Neohumanist Data Modeling	165
6.4 Summary and Conclusions	170

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-06335-7 - Information Systems Development and Data Modeling: Conceptual and Philosophical Foundations

Rudy Hirschheim, Heinz K. Klein and Kalle Lyytinen

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

<i>Table of Contents</i>	ix
7 Paradigmatic Analysis of Data Modeling Approaches	171
7.1 Introduction	171
7.2 Fact-based School	172
7.2.1 Historical Roots	173
7.2.1.1 <i>Database Management</i>	173
7.2.1.2 <i>Systems Design Methods</i>	174
7.2.2 Theoretical Roots	175
7.2.2.1 <i>Linguistics</i>	176
7.2.2.2 <i>Artificial Intelligence</i>	176
7.2.2.3 <i>Programming Languages</i>	177
7.2.3 Basic View of IS and Data Modeling	177
7.2.3.1 <i>Definition of Information System</i>	178
7.2.3.2 <i>Universe of Discourse</i>	179
7.2.3.3 <i>Entities</i>	180
7.2.3.4 <i>Problems in Distinguishing Entities in the UoD</i>	180
7.2.3.5 <i>Nature and Type of Entities</i>	181
7.2.3.6 <i>Facts</i>	182
7.2.3.7 <i>Conceptual Schema</i>	183
7.2.3.8 <i>Information Base</i>	184
7.2.3.9 <i>Changes in the UoDD – the IS Operations</i>	184
7.2.3.10 <i>Summary</i>	185
7.2.4 Three Beliefs Underlying the Fact-based Approaches	186
7.2.4.1 <i>The Objective Belief</i>	186
7.2.4.2 <i>The Descriptive Belief</i>	189
7.2.4.3 <i>The Consensus Belief</i>	189
7.2.5 Classification of Fact-based Approaches	190
7.2.6 Possible Directions for Improvements	194
7.3 Rule-based School	198
7.3.1 Historical Roots	200
7.3.1.1 <i>Concept of Information</i>	200
7.3.1.2 <i>High Level Organization Models</i>	200
7.3.1.3 <i>Legal Informatics</i>	201
7.3.2 Theoretical Roots	202
7.3.2.1 <i>Linguistics</i>	202
7.3.2.2 <i>Organizational and Sociological Theory</i>	202

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-06335-7 - Information Systems Development and Data Modeling: Conceptual and Philosophical Foundations

Rudy Hirschheim, Heinz K. Klein and Kalle Lyytinen

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

x

Table of Contents

7.3.2.3	<i>Law</i>	203
7.3.3	Basic View of IS and Data Modeling	203
7.3.3.1	<i>Definition of Information System</i>	203
7.3.3.2	<i>Implications</i>	204
7.3.4	Three Beliefs Underlying the Rule-based Approaches	207
7.3.4.1	<i>The Action Belief</i>	208
7.3.4.2	<i>The Institutional Belief</i>	208
7.3.4.3	<i>The Change Belief</i>	209
7.3.5	The LEGOL/NORMA Approach	210
7.3.5.1	<i>Background and Basic Goals</i>	210
7.3.5.2	<i>Basic LEGOL/NORMA Constructs</i>	213
7.3.5.3	<i>Summary of LEGAL/NORMA Achievements</i>	218
7.3.6	The Language Action View	220
7.3.6.1	<i>Background and Basic Goals</i>	220
7.3.6.2	<i>Basic LA Constructs: Speech Act and Discourse Theories</i>	225
7.3.6.3	<i>Summary of LA View Achievements</i>	230
7.3.7	Possible Directions for Improvements	231
7.4	Summary and Conclusions	232
8	Conclusions	234
8.1	Introduction	234
8.2	Conflict about the Nature of IS Research	234
8.3	Conflict about the Nature of IS Practice	236
	Appendix A: Summaries of Selected Methodologies	239
	Bibliography	252
	Index	281