

When is it justifiable to exclude a person who wishes to enter a country? What are the acceptable moral bases for immigration policy? These questions lie at the heart of this book, the first interdisciplinary study of the fundamental normative issues underpinning immigration policy.

A distinguished group of economists, political scientists, and philosophers offer a provocative discussion of this complex topic. Among the issues addressed are the proper role of the state in supporting a particular culture, the possible destabilization of the political and social life of a country through immigration, the size and distribution of economic losses and gains, and the legitimacy of discriminating against potential immigrants in favor of members of the resident population.

The need for serious consideration of this subject is beyond question. This volume should advance discussion in an area of great practical as well as philosophical importance.



JUSTICE IN IMMIGRATION



## Cambridge Studies in Philosophy and Law

GENERAL EDITOR: JULES L. COLEMAN (YALE LAW SCHOOL)

## ADVISORY BOARD

Anthony Duff (University of Stirling)
Jean Hampton (University of Arizona)
David Lyons (Cornell University)
Neil MacCormick (University of Edinburgh)
Gerald Postema (University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill)
Joseph Raz (University of Oxford)
Jeremy Waldron (University of California)

This exciting new series reflects and fosters the most original research taking place in the study of law and legal theory by publishing the most adventurous monographs in the field as well as collections of essays. It is a specific aim of the series to traverse the boundaries between disciplines and to form bridges between traditional studies of law and many other areas of the human sciences. Books in the series will be of interest not only to philosophers and legal theorists but also to political scientists, sociologists, economists, psychologists, and criminologists.

### Other books in the series

Jeffrie G. Murphy and Jean Hampton: Forgiveness and mercy

Stephen R. Munzer: A theory of property

R. G. Frey and Christopher W. Morris (eds.): Liability and responsibility: Essays in law and morals

Robert F. Schopp: Automatism, insanity, and the psychology of criminal responsibility

Steven J. Burton: Judging in good faith Jules L. Coleman: Risks and wrong

Suzanne Uniacke: Permissible killing: The self-defense justification of

homicide

Jules L. Coleman and Allen Buchanan (eds.): In harm's way: Essays in honor of Joel Feinberg



# Justice in immigration

Edited by
WARREN F. SCHWARTZ

Georgetown University Law Center

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS



## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521452885

© Cambridge University Press 1995

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1995
This digitally printed version 2007

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Justice in immigration / edited by Warren F. Schwartz.

p. cm. – (Cambridge studies in philosophy and law)

ISBN 0-521-45288-0 (hardcover)

Emigration and immigration law - Philosophy.
 Emigration and immigration - Government policy.
 Schwartz, Warren F.
 Series.

K3275.Z9J87 1995 325'.01 – dc20

94-38247

CIP

ISBN 978-0-521-45288-5 hardback ISBN 978-0-521-04265-9 paperback

The essays collected in this volume were presented at a conference sponsored by the John M. Olin Program in Law and Economics of the Georgetown University Law Center.



# **Contents**

List	of contributors	page vii
1	Immigration, welfare, and justice	1
	JOSEPH H. CARENS	
2	Citizenship, the demands of justice, and the moral relevance	
	of political borders	18
	JULES L. COLEMAN AND SARAH K. HARDING	
3	A two-country parable	63
	JAMES M. BUCHANAN	
4	Immigration, identity, and justice	67
	JEAN HAMPTON	
5	Immigration, justice, and culture	94
	STEPHEN R. PERRY	
6	Fear and loathing at the border	136
	LOUIS MICHAEL SEIDMAN	
7	Immigration policy in liberal political theory	147
	MARK TUSHNET	
8	The welfare economics of immigration law: a theoretical	
	survey with an analysis of U.S. policy	158
	ALAN O. SYKES	
9	Just borders: normative economics and immigration law	201
	GILLIAN K. HADFIELD	
10	Some caveats on the welfare economics of immigration law	212
	SUSAN B. VROMAN	
11	The case for a liberal immigration policy	219
	MICHAEL I. TREBILCOCK	



# **Contributors**

JAMES M. BUCHANAN, Center for the Study of Public Choice, George Mason University

JOSEPH H. CARENS, Department of Political Science, University of Toronto

JULES L. COLEMAN, Yale Law School

GILLIAN K. HADFIELD, University of California at Berkeley Law School

JEAN HAMPTON, Department of Philosophy, University of Arizona

SARAH K. HARDING, Yale Law School

STEPHEN R. PERRY, Faculty of Law, McGill University

LOUIS MICHAEL SEIDMAN, Georgetown University Law Center

ALAN O. SYKES, University of Chicago Law School

MICHAEL J. TREBILCOCK, Faculty of Law, University of Toronto

MARK TUSHNET, Georgetown University Law Center

SUSAN B. VROMAN, Department of Economics, Georgetown University