

This book addresses critical issues in normative ethical theory. Every such theory must contain not only a theory of motivation but also a theory of value, and the link that is often forged between what is valuable and what is right is human welfare or well-being. This topic is a subject of considerable controversy in contemporary ethics, not least because of the current reconsideration of utilitarianism. Indeed, there is as much disagreement about the nature of value and its relationship to welfare and morality as there is about the substantive content of normative ethical theories.

The essays in this collection, all new and written by a distinguished team of moral philosophers, provide an overview, an analysis, and an attempted resolution of those controversies. They constitute the most rigorous available account of the relationship between value, welfare, and morality.



VALUE, WELFARE, AND MORALITY



Value, Welfare, and Morality

Edited by

R. G. FREY and CHRISTOPHER W. MORRIS

Bowling Green State University





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521416962

© Cambridge University Press 1993

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1993
This digitally printed version 2007

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data
Value, welfare, and morality / edited by R. G. Frey and Christopher W.

Morris

p. cm.

ISBN 0-521-41696-5

1. Social values. 2. Values. I. Frey, R. G. (Raymond Gillespie)

II. Morris, Christopher W. HM73.V35 1993

303.3'72 - dc20

92-36143 CIP

ISBN 978-0-521-41696-2 hardback ISBN 978-0-521-03959-8 paperback



Contents

List	t of contributors	page vii
Preface		ix
1	Value, welfare, and morality R. G. FREY AND CHRISTOPHER W. MORRIS	1
2	The land of lost content SIMON BLACKBURN	13
3	Putting rationality in its place WARREN QUINN	26
4	Can a Humean be moderate? JOHN BROOME	51
5	Welfare, preference, and rationality L. W. SUMNER	74
6	Preference ARTHUR RIPSTEIN	93
7	Reason and needs DAVID COPP	112
8	Desired desires GILBERT HARMAN	138
9	On the winding road from good to right JAMES GRIFFIN	158
10	Value, reasons, and the sense of justice DAVID GAUTHIER	180
11	Agent-relativity of value, deontic restraints, and self-ownership ERIC MACK	209
12	Agent-relativity – the very idea JONATHAN DANCY	233



vi	Contents	
13	The separateness of persons, distributive norms, and moral theory	252
	DAVID BRINK	
14	Harmful goods, harmless bads	290
	LARRY TEMKIN	



Contributors

Simon Blackburn, Edna J. Koury Distinguished Professor of Philosophy, University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill

David Brink, Associate Professor of Philosophy, Massachusetts Institute of Technology

John Broome, Professor of Economics and Ethics, University of Bristol David Copp, Professor of Philosophy, University of California, Davis Jonathan Dancy, Professor of Philosophy, University of Keele

R. G. Frey, Professor of Philosophy, Bowling Green State University David Gauthier, Distinguished Service Professor of Philosophy, University of Pittsburgh

James Griffin, Reader in Philosophy, Oxford University

Gilbert Harman, Professor of Philosophy, Princeton University

Eric Mack, Professor of Philosophy, Tulane University

Christopher W. Morris, Associate Professor of Philosophy, Bowling Green State University

Warren Quinn, late Professor of Philosophy, University of California, Los Angeles

Arthur Ripstein, Associate Professor of Philosophy and Law, University of Toronto

L. W. Sumner, Professor of Philosophy, University of Toronto Larry Temkin, Associate Professor of Philosophy, Rice University



Preface

In the last two decades, the rise of substantive ethics and, through this, the renewed development of normative ethical theories have become prominent concerns in moral philosophy. In turn, however, the development of such theories has raised to prominence issues in value theory and the epistemology of morals, and resolution of these issues has come to be regarded as vital to progress in the renewed search for an adequate normative ethical theory. In these regards, what is the relation between value and desire or preference? Do desires and preferences alone provide reasons for action? Indeed, do they provide reasons for action at all? Are judgments of value "subjective" in some way, and are they "projected onto the world"? Or are such judgments "objective," either in the sense of having truth-values independent of their conditions of verification or in the sense of representing something inherent in the world? What is the relationship between claims of "objectivity" in either of these senses and the natural properties of things in the world? What exactly is supervenience, and what supervenes on what? Is there a viable distinction to be drawn between agent-relative and agent-neutral value? Are there any agent-neutral values, and how do we tell whether there are? Are there agent-independent values as well? The growing conviction that we are unlikely to make further progress in the development of an adequate normative ethical theory or even in substantive ethics without resolving a number of these issues, has given them an air of urgency as well as prominence.

It was with these questions in mind that we held a conference on "Value, Welfare, and Morality" at Bowling Green. To it, we invited a number of philosophers who had made significant contributions to value theory and moral theory. We have supplemented their efforts here with five additional essays commissioned for this volume, also by significant figures. Our aim has been, then, not only to produce a volume that addresses fundamental questions to do with value, welfare, and morality but also to produce one that is representative of the very best work on



x Preface

the interlocking themes that comprise this general area of moral philosophy.

Numerous people have helped us both with the conference and this volume, especially among the graduate students, staff, and faculty of the philosophy department at Bowling Green, and we are grateful to them all. The referees for Cambridge proved helpful as well, as did our editor, Terence Moore, whose customary good advice and encouragement has once again placed us in his debt.

It is with deep sadness that we note one of our contributors, Warren Quinn, died before the appearance of this volume. While we have lost a friend, philosophy has lost a dedicated and vibrant talent. We are pleased to present here one of his best, if very last, pieces.