

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-03909-3 - The Reception of Kant's Critical Philosophy: Fichte, Schelling, and Hegel

Edited by Sally Sedgwick

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

## The Reception of Kant's Critical Philosophy

Fichte, Schelling, and Hegel

The essays in this volume consider both the development of Kant's system of transcendental idealism in his three *Critiques*, *Metaphysical Foundations of Natural Science*, and *Opus Postumum*, as well as the reception and transformation of his idealism in the work of Fichte, Schelling, and Hegel.

The contributors include many of today's preeminent philosophers of German idealism. The volume will be of critical importance to philosophers concerned with this period and to intellectual historians.

List of contributors: Sally Sedgwick, Paul Guyer, Jeffrey Edwards, Henry E. Allison, Allen W. Wood, Karl Ameriks, Günter Zöller, Robert Pippin, Daniel Breazeale, Manfred Baum, Dieter Sturma, Stephen Houlgate, Béatrice Longuenesse, and Kenneth R. Westphal.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-03909-3 - The Reception of Kant's Critical Philosophy: Fichte, Schelling,  
and Hegel

Edited by Sally Sedgwick

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

# The Reception of Kant's Critical Philosophy

*Fichte, Schelling, and Hegel*

*Edited by*

SALLY SEDGWICK

*Dartmouth College*



**CAMBRIDGE**  
**UNIVERSITY PRESS**

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-03909-3 - The Reception of Kant's Critical Philosophy: Fichte, Schelling,  
and Hegel

Edited by Sally Sedgwick

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9780521772372](http://www.cambridge.org/9780521772372)

© Sally Sedgwick 2000

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written  
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2000

This digitally printed version 2007

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data*

The reception of Kant's critical philosophy : Fichte, Schelling, and Hegel / edited by  
Sally Sedgwick.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-521-77237-0 (hardcover)

1. Kant, Immanuel, 1724–1804. 2. Idealism, German – History – 18th century. 3. Kant,  
Immanuel, 1724–1804 – Influence. 4. Fichte, Johann Gottlieb, 1762–1814. 5. Schelling,  
Friedrich Wilhelm Joseph von, 1775–1854. 6. Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich,  
1770–1831. I. Sedgwick, Sally S., 1956–

B2799.I42 R43 2000

193 – dc21

99-053159

ISBN 978-0-521-77237-2 hardback

ISBN 978-0-521-03909-3 paperback

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-03909-3 - The Reception of Kant's Critical Philosophy: Fichte, Schelling,  
and Hegel

Edited by Sally Sedgwick

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## Contents

	<i>Notes on the Contributors</i>	page vii
	<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xi
	Introduction: Idealism from Kant to Hegel	1
	SALLY SEDGWICK	
1	The Unity of Nature and Freedom: Kant's Conception of the System of Philosophy	19
	PAUL GUYER	
2	Spinozism, Freedom, and Transcendental Dynamics in Kant's Final System of Transcendental Idealism	54
	JEFFREY EDWARDS	
3	Is the <i>Critique of Judgment</i> "Post-Critical"?	78
	HENRY E. ALLISON	
4	The "I" as Principle of Practical Philosophy	93
	ALLEN W. WOOD	
5	The Practical Foundation of Philosophy in Kant, Fichte, and After	109
	KARL AMERIKS	
6	From Critique to Metacritique: Fichte's Transformation of Kant's Transcendental Idealism	129
	GÜNTER ZÖLLER	
7	Fichte's Alleged Subjective, Psychological, One-Sided Idealism	147
	ROBERT PIPPIN	
8	The Spirit of the <i>Wissenschaftslehre</i>	171
	DANIEL BREAZEALE	
9	The Beginnings of Schelling's Philosophy of Nature	199
	MANFRED BAUM	
10	The Nature of Subjectivity: The Critical and Systematic Function of Schelling's Philosophy of Nature	216
	DIETER STURMA	

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-03909-3 - The Reception of Kant's Critical Philosophy: Fichte, Schelling,  
and Hegel

Edited by Sally Sedgwick

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

vi	<i>Contents</i>	
11	Substance, Causality, and the Question of Method in Hegel's <i>Science of Logic</i> STEPHEN HOULGATE	232
12	Point of View of Man or Knowledge of God: Kant and Hegel on Concept, Judgment, and Reason BÉATRICE LONGUENESSE	253
13	Kant, Hegel, and the Fate of "the" Intuitive Intellect KENNETH R. WESTPHAL	283
14	Metaphysics and Morality in Kant and Hegel SALLY SEDGWICK	306
	<i>Bibliography</i>	325
	<i>Index</i>	335

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-03909-3 - The Reception of Kant's Critical Philosophy: Fichte, Schelling, and Hegel

Edited by Sally Sedgwick

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## Notes on the Contributors

HENRY E. ALLISON is Professor of Philosophy at Boston University, Professor Emeritus at the University of California, San Diego, and Adjunct Professor at the University of Oslo. He is also former president (1996–7) of the Pacific Division of the American Philosophical Association. He is the author of several books on Kant and other figures in the history of modern philosophy as well as more than fifty articles. His books include: *Kant's Transcendental Idealism* (1983), *Benedict de Spinoza: An Introduction* (1987), *Kant's Theory of Freedom* (1990), and *Idealism and Freedom: Essays on Kant's Theoretical and Practical Philosophy* (1996). Currently, he is working on a book on Kant's *Critique of Judgment*.

KARL AMERIKS is Hank-McMahon Professor of Philosophy at the University of Notre Dame. He has cotranslated Edmund Husserl, *Experience and Judgment* (1973), and Immanuel Kant, *Lectures on Metaphysics* (1997). He has coedited *The Modern Subject: Conceptions of the Self in Classical German Philosophy* (1995), and is editing the *Cambridge Companion to German Idealism*. He has written *Kant's Theory of Mind* (1982, second edition forthcoming), and *Kant and the Fate of Autonomy* (forthcoming 2000).

MANFRED BAUM is Professor of Philosophy at the Bergische Universität Gesamthochschule Wuppertal as well as coeditor of *Kant-Studien*. He is the author of many articles on German idealism, including "Zur Methode der Logik und Metaphysik beim Jenaer Hegel" (1980), "Anmerkungen zum Verhältnis von Systematik und Dialektik bei Hegel" (1986), and "Kants Prinzip der Zweckmäßigkeit und Hegels Realisierung des Begriffs" (1990). His books include *Deduktion und Beweis in Kants Transzendentalphilosophie* (1986) and *Die Entstehung der Hegelschen Dialektik* (1986, second edition 1989).

DANIEL BREAZEALE is Chair and Professor of Philosophy at the University of Kentucky. He is the cofounder of the North American Fichte Society and has published numerous articles on German philosophy from Kant to Nietzsche, with a focus on Fichte and other early post-Kantians. He is also the editor and translator of three volumes of Fichte's writings, including *Fichte: Early Philosophical Writings* (1988), *Foundations of Transcendental Philosophy*

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-03909-3 - The Reception of Kant's Critical Philosophy: Fichte, Schelling, and Hegel

Edited by Sally Sedgwick

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

viii

*Notes on the Contributors*

(*Wissenschaftslehre*) *nova methodo* (1992), and *Introductions to the Wissenschaftslehre and Other Writings* (1994).

JEFFREY EDWARDS is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at the State University of New York at Stony Brook. He earned his Ph.D. at Philipps-Universität Marburg, Germany. His articles include "Egoism and Formalism in the Development of Kant's Moral Theory" (1999), "Self-Love, Anthropology, and Universal Benevolence in Kant's Metaphysics of Morals" (1999), and "Der Ätherbeweis des *Opus postumum* und Kants dritte Analogie der Erfahrung" (1991). His book, *Substance, Force, and the Possibility of Knowledge in Kant's Philosophy of Material Nature*, is forthcoming with University of California Press. He is also one of the translators of Kant's complete works for Cambridge University Press.

PAUL GUYER is the Florence R. C. Murray Professor in the Humanities at the University of Pennsylvania. His books include *Kant and the Claims of Taste* (1979, second edition 1997), *Kant and the Claims of Knowledge* (1987), *Kant and the Experience of Freedom* (1993), and *Kant on Freedom, Law, and Happiness* (2000). He edited the *Cambridge Companion to Kant* (1992), and with Allen W. Wood edited and translated the *Critique of Pure Reason* (1998) in the *Cambridge Edition of the Works of Immanuel Kant*, of which he is General Coeditor. He and Eric Matthews have recently completed a new edition and translation of the *Critique of the Power of Judgment* for the same series (forthcoming 2000).

STEPHEN HOULGATE is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Warwick and editor of the *Bulletin of the Hegel Society of Great Britain*. He was President of the Hegel Society of America from 1994 to 1996. He has published numerous articles on Kant, Hegel, and post-Hegelian philosophy, including "Hegel, Kant and the Formal Distinctions of Reflective Understanding" (1995), "Necessity and Contingency in Hegel's *Science of Logic*" (1995), and "Hegel, Derrida and Restricted Economy: The Case of Mechanical Memory" (1996). His books include *Hegel, Nietzsche and the Criticism of Metaphysics* (1986), *Freedom, Truth and History: An Introduction to Hegel's Philosophy* (1991), and *The Hegel Reader* (1998).

BÉATRICE LONGUENESSE is Professor of Philosophy at Princeton University. She is the author of many articles on Kant and Hegel, including "L'Effectivité dans la Logique de Hegel" (1982), "Hegel, Lecteur de Kant sur le Jugement" (1991), and "Logique et Métaphysique dans le Système Critique: l'Exemple de la Causalité" (1994). She collaborated on the volume: *Hegel: Notes et Fragments, Iena 1803–1806: Texte, Traduction et Commentaire* (1991). Her books include *Hegel et la Critique de la Métaphysique*, (1981),

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-03909-3 - The Reception of Kant's Critical Philosophy: Fichte, Schelling, and Hegel

Edited by Sally Sedgwick

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

*Notes on the Contributors*

ix

*Kant et le Pouvoir de Juger* (1993), and the revised English version of *Kant and the Capacity to Judge* (1998).

ROBERT PIPPIN is the Raymond W. and Martha Hilpert Gruner Distinguished Service Professor in the Committee on Social Thought, the Department of Philosophy, and the College and the Chair of the Committee on Social Thought at the University of Chicago. He has published more than one hundred articles and reviews on Kant, German Idealism, the nature of European modernity, and theories of self-consciousness. His books include *Kant's Theory of Form* (1982), *Hegel's Idealism: The Satisfaction of Self-Consciousness* (1989), *Modernism as a Philosophical Problem: On the Dissatisfaction of European High Culture* (1991), *Idealism as Modernism: Hegelian Variations* (1997), and *Henry James and Modern Moral Life* (1999).

SALLY SEDGWICK is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Dartmouth College. Her articles include: "On Lying and the Role of Content in Kant's Ethics" (1991), "Can Kant's Ethics Survive the Feminist Critique?" (1990 and 1997), "Hegel on Kant's Antinomies and Distinction Between General and Transcendental Logic" (1991), "McDowell's Hegelianism" (1997), and "McDowell, Hegel, and Recent Defenses of Kant" (2000). She is writing a book on Hegel's critique of Kant.

DIETER STURMA is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Essen. He is author of *Kant über Selbstbewußtsein* (1985) and *Philosophie der Person: Die Selbstverhältnisse von Subjektivität und Moralität* (1997), coeditor (with Karl Ameriks) of *The Modern Subject: Conceptions of the Self in Classical German Philosophy* (1995), and has written numerous articles on classical German philosophy, contemporary philosophy, philosophy of mind, and ethics. He is now completing a book on Jean-Jacques Rousseau.

KENNETH R. WESTPHAL is Associate Professor of Philosophy at the University of New Hampshire. He is author of *Hegel's Epistemological Realism* (1989) and *Hegel, Hume und die Identität wahrnehmbarer Dinge* (1998). He edited *Pragmatism, Reason, and Norms* (1998) and Frederick L. Will's essays, *Pragmatism and Realism* (1997). He is completing a book entitled *Kant, Hegel, and the Objective Validity of Categorical Concepts*.

ALLEN W. WOOD is Professor of Philosophy at Stanford University. He is general coeditor of the Cambridge Edition of the Writings of Immanuel Kant. His publications include: *Kant's Moral Religion* (1970), *Kant's Rational Theology* (1978), *Karl Marx* (1981), *Hegel's Ethical Thought* (1990), "Fichte's Philosophical Revolution" (1991), and *Kant's Ethical Thought* (1999).

GÜNTER ZÖLLER is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Munich. He is the author of numerous articles on Kant and German idealism. His books



Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-03909-3 - The Reception of Kant's Critical Philosophy: Fichte, Schelling,  
and Hegel

Edited by Sally Sedgwick

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

x

*Notes on the Contributors*

include: *Theoretische Gegenstandsbeziehung bei Kant* (1984); (coeditor) *Minds, Ideas, and Objects: Essays on the Theory of Representation in Modern Philosophy* (1993); (coeditor) *Figuring the Self: Subject, Individual, and Others in Classical German Philosophy* (1997); *Fichte's Transcendental Philosophy: The Original Duplicity of Intelligence and Will* (1998); and (editor) *The Cambridge Companion to Fichte* (in preparation).

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-03909-3 - The Reception of Kant's Critical Philosophy: Fichte, Schelling,  
and Hegel

Edited by Sally Sedgwick

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

## Acknowledgments

Drafts of most of the papers in this volume were presented at a conference at Dartmouth College, “The Idea of a System of Transcendental Idealism in Kant, Fichte, Schelling, and Hegel,” in August of 1995. My first debt of gratitude is to Burkhard Tuschling, whose work on German idealism has inspired that of several of the contributors to this volume including my own. He both proposed the idea of the conference and was of much help in the planning and organization of it. I also wish to thank the National Endowment for the Humanities, Dartmouth College, The John Sloan Dickey Center, and the North American Kant Society for the financial support without which the conference would not have become “objectively real.” Finally, I am grateful to Keith Zorn and especially Ulrich Meyer for technical and editorial assistance with the preparation of this volume for publication.