

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-03830-0 - Richard Wollheim on the Art of Painting: Art as Representation and Expression

Edited by Rob van Gerwen

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

## **Richard Wollheim on the Art of Painting**

### Art as Representation and Expression

Richard Wollheim is one of the dominant figures in the philosophy of art, whose work has shown not only how paintings create their effects but why they remain important to us. His influential writings have focused on two core, interrelated questions: How do paintings depict? How do they express feelings?

In this collection of new essays, a group of distinguished thinkers in the fields of art history and philosophical aesthetics offers a critical assessment of Wollheim's theory of art. Among the themes under discussion are Wollheim's explanation of pictorial representation in terms of seeing-in, his views of artistic expression as a type of complex projection, and his notion of the internal spectator. In the final essay, Wollheim himself responds to the contributors.

Given the high level of international recognition that Wollheim's work has enjoyed for many years, this book will be eagerly sought out by all serious students of the theory of art, whether in departments of philosophy or art history.

Rob van Gerwen is Lecturer in Philosophy at the University of Utrecht.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-03830-0 - Richard Wollheim on the Art of Painting: Art as Representation  
and Expression

Edited by Rob van Gerwen

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

# Richard Wollheim on the Art of Painting

*Art as Representation and Expression*

*Edited by*

ROB VAN GERWEN

*Utrecht University*



**CAMBRIDGE**  
**UNIVERSITY PRESS**

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-03830-0 - Richard Wollheim on the Art of Painting: Art as Representation and Expression

Edited by Rob van Gerwen

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9780521801744](http://www.cambridge.org/9780521801744)

© Cambridge University Press 2001

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2001

This digitally printed version 2007

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data*

Wollheim, Richard, 1923–

Richard Wollheim on the art of painting : art as representation and expression / edited by Rob van Gerwen.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-521-80174-5

1. Painting – Philosophy. 2. Aesthetics. I. Gerwen, Rob van, 1957– II. Title.

N66.W63 2001

750'.1–dc21

00-052952

ISBN 978-0-521-80174-4 hardback

ISBN 978-0-521-03830-0 paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-03830-0 - Richard Wollheim on the Art of Painting: Art as Representation and Expression

Edited by Rob van Gerwen

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## Contents

|   |  |          |
|---|--|----------|
|   | <i>List of Contributors</i>  | page vii |
|   | <i>Relevant Works by Richard Wollheim and Their Abbreviations as Used in This Volume</i> | ix       |
|   | <i>Preface</i>   | xi       |
|   | Introduction   | 1        |
|   | ROB VAN GERWEN   |          |
|   | <b>Part One: Representation</b>  |          |
| 1 | On Pictorial Representation  | 13       |
|   | RICHARD WOLLHEIM   |          |
| 2 | Wollheim on Pictorial Representation   | 28       |
|   | JERROLD LEVINSON   |          |
| 3 | The Limits of Twofoldness: A Defence of the Concept of Pictorial Thought                 | 39       |
|   | ANDREW HARRISON  |          |
| 4 | A Hypothesis About Seeing-In   | 59       |
|   | MONIQUE ROELOFS  |          |
| 5 | Communication and the Art of Painting  | 75       |
|   | ANTHONY SAVILE   |          |
| 6 | Twofoldness: From Transcendental Imagination to Pictorial Art                            | 85       |
|   | PAUL CROWTHER  |          |
|   | <b>Part Two: Expression</b>  |          |
| 7 | Wollheim on Correspondence, Projective Properties, and Expressive Perception             | 101      |
|   | MALCOLM BUDD   |          |
| 8 | The Artistry of Depiction  | 112      |
|   | MICHAEL PODRO  |          |
| 9 | Style and Value in the Art of Painting   | 121      |
|   | CAROLYN WILDE  |          |

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-03830-0 - Richard Wollheim on the Art of Painting: Art as Representation  
and Expression

Edited by Rob van Gerwen

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

|    |  |     |
|----|--|-----|
| vi | <i>Contents</i>  |     |
| 10 | Expression as Representation<br>ROB VAN GERWEN   | 135 |
| 11 | Wollheim on Expression (and Representation)<br>GRAHAM MCFEE                            | 151 |
|    | <b>Part Three: The Internal Spectator</b>  |     |
| 12 | Viewing Making Painting<br>SVETLANA ALPERS   | 171 |
| 13 | The Staging of Spectatorship<br>RENÉE VAN DE VALL                                      | 177 |
| 14 | Presentation or Representation<br>SUSAN L. FEAGIN                                      | 189 |
| 15 | The Case for the Internal Spectator: Aesthetics or<br>Art History?<br>CAROLINE VAN ECK | 200 |
| 16 | The Spectator in the Picture<br>ROBERT HOPKINS   | 215 |
| 17 | A Word on Behalf of “the Merely Visual”<br>MICHAEL BAXANDALL                           | 232 |
|    | <b>Part Four: Reply</b>  |     |
| 18 | A Reply to the Contributors<br>RICHARD WOLLHEIM  | 241 |
|    | <i>Bibliography</i>  | 263 |
|    | <i>Index</i>   | 271 |

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-03830-0 - Richard Wollheim on the Art of Painting: Art as Representation and Expression

Edited by Rob van Gerwen

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

## List of Contributors

**Svetlana Alpers** is in the Department of History, University of California at Berkeley, Berkeley, CA, U.S.A.

**Michael Baxandall** is in London, Great Britain

**Malcolm Budd** is in the Department of Philosophy, University College London, Great Britain. E-mail: m.budd@ucl.ac.uk

**Paul Crowther** is in the Centre for Professional Ethics, University of Central Lancashire, Great Britain. E-mail: p.crowther1@uclan.ac.uk

**Caroline van Eck** is in the Department of Art History, Free University, Amsterdam, Netherlands. E-mail: eck\_van\_ca@let.vu.nl

**Susan L. Feagin** is in the Department of Philosophy, University of Missouri, Kansas City, MO, U.S.A. E-mail: feagin@philosophy.umkc.edu

**Rob van Gerwen** is in the Department of Philosophy, Utrecht University, Netherlands. E-mail: Rob.vanGerwen@phil.uu.nl

WWW: <http://www.phil.uu.nl/~rob/>

**Andrew Harrison** is in the Department of Philosophy, University of Bristol, Great Britain. E-mail: Andrew.Harrison@Bristol.ac.uk

**Robert Hopkins** is in the Department of Philosophy, University of Birmingham, Great Britain. E-mail: HOPKINRD@m4-arts.bham.ac.uk

**Jerrold Levinson** is in the Department of Philosophy, University of Maryland, U.S.A. E-mail: JL32@UMAIL.UMD.EDU

**Graham McFee** is in the Chelsea School, University of Brighton, Great Britain. E-mail: G.J.McFee@bton.ac.uk

**Michael Podro** is in the Department of Art History and Theory, University of Essex, Great Britain. E-mail: MPodro@TALK21.com

**Monique Roelofs** is at Brown University, in the Pembroke Center for Teaching and Research on Women, Providence, RI, U.S.A.

E-mail: Monique\_Roelofs@Brown.edu

**Anthony Savile** is in the Department of Philosophy, King's College, London, Great Britain. E-mail: Anthony.Savile@kcl.ac.uk

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-03830-0 - Richard Wollheim on the Art of Painting: Art as Representation and Expression

Edited by Rob van Gerwen

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

viii

*List of Contributors*

**Renée van de Vall** is in the Department of Cultural Sciences, Maastricht University, Maastricht, Netherlands.

E-mail: [R.vandeVall@LK.UNIMAAS.NL](mailto:R.vandeVall@LK.UNIMAAS.NL)

**Carolyn Wilde** is in the Department of Philosophy, University of Bristol, Bristol, Great Britain. E-mail: [Carolyn.Wilde@bris.ac.uk](mailto:Carolyn.Wilde@bris.ac.uk)

**Richard Wollheim** is in the Department of Philosophy, University of California at Berkeley, Berkeley, CA, U.S.A. E-mail: [wollheim@uclink.berkeley.edu](mailto:wollheim@uclink.berkeley.edu)

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-03830-0 - Richard Wollheim on the Art of Painting: Art as Representation and Expression

Edited by Rob van Gerwen

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## Relevant Works by Richard Wollheim and Their Abbreviations as Used in This Volume

|       |   |
|-------|---|
| AM    | 1973. <i>On Art and the Mind</i> . London: Allen Lane.  |
| AO1   | 1968. <i>Art and Its Objects: An Introduction to Aesthetics</i> . New York: Harper & Row.   |
| AO2   | 1980. <i>Art and Its Objects, second edition</i> . Cambridge, U.K.: Cambridge University Press.   |
| CR    | 1980. Criticism as Retrieval. AO2, 185–204.   |
| CPE   | 1993. Correspondence, Projective Properties, and Expression in the Arts. MD, 144–58. [Originally: 1991. Kemal, S., ed. <i>The Language of Art History</i> 51–66. New York: Cambridge University Press.] |
| MD    | 1993. <i>The Mind and Its Depths</i> . Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.   |
| PA    | 1988. <i>Painting as an Art</i> . Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.  |
| PS    | 1993. Pictorial Style: Two Views. MD, 159–70. [Originally: 1979. Lang, B., ed. <i>The Concept of Style</i> , 129–45. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.]                                   |
| SC    | 1993. The Sheep and the Ceremony. MD, 1–21. [Originally: 1979. <i>The Leslie Stephen Lecture, University of Cambridge</i> . Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.]                                 |
| TL    | 1984. <i>The Thread of Life</i> . Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.  |
| W-IPU | 1986. Imagination and Pictorial Understanding. <i>Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society, Supplement</i> , 60: 45–60.  |

Where an article has been reprinted in a collection of Wollheim's essays, the page references in the text refer to that collection.



Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-03830-0 - Richard Wollheim on the Art of Painting: Art as Representation and Expression

Edited by Rob van Gerwen

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

## Preface

This book presents the offspring of a three-day conference on Richard Wollheim's aesthetics, which was held (in Wollheim's presence) in May 1997 in Utrecht, the Netherlands, augmented with a symposium from the *Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* and Wollheim's reply to the essays. The theme of the book – as of the conference – is the troubled conceptual relations in the art of painting between expression and representation. The conference, which took place in the best of spirits, benefited from a lively and ongoing discussion on one singularly coherent and stimulating body of thought, that is, Wollheim's. Almost every chapter originating from the conference has been rewritten where appropriate in response to the discussions at the conference and to other chapters in this volume. This argumentative coherence is further served by Wollheim responses to the chapters. Thus, this volume presents a coherent body of work addressing issues raised by Wollheim but that are of importance far beyond his theory.

I would like to thank the authors for their supportive and stimulating cooperation, and particularly Graham McFee for his assistance in the editorial process. I would also like to express a word of thanks to the institutions that made it all happen: the Department of Philosophy of Utrecht University, the Leiden-Utrecht Zeno institute for research in philosophy, the Royal Dutch Academy of the Sciences (KNAW), the Foundation for Philosophy and Theology (SFT) of the Netherlands Organization for Scientific Research (NWO), and the Research Institute for History and Culture (OGC) of the department of Humanities, Utrecht University. Thanks also to Laura Lawrie, Matthew Lord, and Terence Moore of Cambridge University Press for their assistance in producing this book. Last, and emphatically, my thanks are due to Richard Wollheim for his supportive and energetic attitude and his never-diminishing strength of argument.

Rob van Gerwen  
Utrecht, October 13, 1999

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-03830-0 - Richard Wollheim on the Art of Painting: Art as Representation  
and Expression

Edited by Rob van Gerwen

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

## **Richard Wollheim on the Art of Painting**

Art as Representation and Expression