

PLATO AND HIS PREDECESSORS

How does Plato view his philosophical antecedents? Plato and his Predecessors considers how Plato represents his philosophical predecessors in a late quartet of dialogues: the Theaetetus, the Sophist, the Politicus and the Philebus. Why is it that the sophist Protagoras, or the monist Parmenides, or the advocate of flux, Heraclitus, are so important in these dialogues? And why are they represented as such shadowy figures, barely present at their own refutations? The explanation, the author argues, is a complex one involving both the reflective relation between Plato's dramatic technique and his philosophical purposes, and the very nature of his late philosophical views. For in these encounters with his predecessors we see Plato develop a new account of the principles of reason, against those who would deny them, and forge a fresh view of the best life – the life of the philosopher.

Mary Margaret McCabe is Professor of Ancient Philosophy at King's College London. She is the author of *Plato on Punishment* (as M. M. Mackenzie) (1981), *Plato's Individuals* (1994). She was co-editor with C. Gill of *Form and Argument in Late Plato* (1996).



THE W. B. STANFORD MEMORIAL LECTURES

This lecture series was established by public subscription, to honour the memory of William Bedell Stanford, Regius Professor of Greek in Trinity College, Dublin, from 1940 to 1980, and Chancellor of the University of Dublin from 1982 to 1984.



PLATO AND HIS PREDECESSORS

The Dramatisation of Reason

MARY MARGARET McCABE

King's College London





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521653060

© Mary Margaret McCabe 2000

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2000
This digitally printed first paperback version (with corrections) 2006

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

McCabe, Mary Margaret, 1948–
Plato and his predecessors: the dramatisation of reason / Mary Margaret McCabe.
p. cm. – (The W.B. Stanford Memorial Lectures)
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 0 521 65306 1 (hb)
1. Plato. Dialogues. 2. Dialogue. I. Title. II. Series.
B395.M295 2000
184—dc21 99-054956

ISBN-13 978-0-521-65306-0 hardback ISBN-10 0-521-65306-1 hardback

ISBN-13 978-0-521-03379-4 paperback ISBN-10 0-521-03379-9 paperback



Contents

Preface	page v11
1 Introduction	I
1. Reading dialogues	I
2. Frames and reflection	8
3. Historical fictions	10
4. Mean-minded opponents	13
5. Teleology and reason	17
PART I THE OPPONENTS	23
2 Measuring sincerity	25
1. Socrates' methods	25
2. 'Each person is self-sufficient as to wisdom.'	32
3. Protagoras and Socrates	36
4. The refutation of Protagoras	40
5. Socrates revived	51
Appendix: sincerity texts	54
3 Missing persons	6o
1. A murder mystery	60
2. Corpus delicti	66
3. Grinding down the giants	73
4. Parsimony	79
5. Mind over matter	85
6. Plato's history of philosophy	89
4 Can the Heraclitean live his Heracliteanism?	93
 Heraclitus' early appearances 	93
2. Measuring flux	96
3. Dealing with the men from Ephesus	104
4. Reasons, reflection and reason	117
5. Are you a man or a mollusc?	128
6. Myth and history	134

v



vi	Contents	
PAR	T II TELEOLOGY	139
5	Myth and its end 1. The cosmos back to front: <i>Politicus</i> 268–275 2. Old stories, other mythologies 3. The judgement of lives	141 141 149 159
6	Outwitting the cunning man 1. Microcosm and macrocosm 2. A cunning man? 3. Teleology is said in many ways	165 165 178 185
PAR	T III REASON AND THE PHILOSOPHER	195
7	Tracking down the philosopher 1. Disappearances and reappearances 2. Talking of wind-eggs 3. A gift-horse or a nightmare? 4. Ordering parts and wholes 5. Collection, division and due measure	197 197 205 208 211 220
8	The sufficiency of reason 1. Reason and self-determination 2. On the road to the good 3. Living a life: rethinking completeness 4. Rethinking sufficiency: explaining a life 5. True lives	230 230 242 249 252 258
9	Meeting Socrates' challenge 1. Protarchus and Socrates 2. Progress and perfectibility 3. Meeting Socrates' challenge 4. Conversation and dialectic 5. History back to front? 6. The dramatisation of the principles of reason	263 263 266 273 278 281 281
Gene	iography ral index x locorum	291 301 311



Preface

This book had its origins in the W. B. Stanford Memorial Lectures at Trinity College, Dublin, in February 1996; I am extremely grateful to John Dillon and Kathy Coleman both for the honour of their invitation and for the warmth of their hospitality, then and thereafter. My audiences in Dublin were very generous and their various comments and questions most illuminating. In particular, Vasilis Politis and John Cleary made me clarify a good deal that had been unclear; whatever opacity there remains – and I fear there may be far too much – is despite their best efforts.

In a form close to the present one Chapter 2 was delivered at the Southern Association for Ancient Philosophy in September 1996, and again at Queen's University, Belfast; and it is published in Dialogos 1998. I am grateful to the editors for permission to reprint that material here. A French version of some of Chapters 5 and 6 was delivered at the Sorbonne in 1996, and is published as 'Téléologie et Autonomie dans le Philèbe de Platon' in La fêlure du plaisir et la pensée. Études sur le Philèbe de Platon vol. 1, ed. M. Dixsaut. Some of the same material was delivered at University College Cork and at King's College London. On all these various occasions I was fortunate in my audiences, whom I should like warmly to thank. In addition John Dillon, Verity Harte, Alan Lacey and Vasilis Politis have all read and commented upon a draft of the whole book; I am extremely grateful to them, both for their patience and for their insights. As reader for the Press, John Cooper made extensive comments on the whole manuscript with his customary care and incisiveness. I am very much indebted to him both for his encouragement and his criticisms. My particular thanks also - as well as the customary exculpation - go to Tad Brennan, Luc Brisson, Myles Burnyeat, Nick Denyer, Monique Dixsaut, David Evans, Dorothea Frede, Chris Gill, Keith Hossack,



viii Preface

Chris Hughes, Denis O'Brien, David Papineau, Christopher Rowe, Anthony Savile, Mark Sainsbury, Malcolm Schofield, David Sedley, Bob Sharples, Richard Sorabji, Raphael Woolf.

Over the last six years there has been a long-running weekly seminar on ancient texts at Kings; the seminar is always an envigorating occasion, marked by its co-operative approach. I should like to thank all its members, especially Tad Brennan and Verity Harte who have joined me in convening it; and especially, also, those who were involved in the seminars on the *Politicus* and the *Philebus*. I have no doubt that in what follows any ideas that may have any merit will have come from someone else; I hope whoever it may be will forgive my disastrous memory and my failing to mention it in the particular case.

Pauline Hire at Cambridge University Press has been an exemplary editor; my warm thanks to her for her encouragement and help. Muriel Hall copy-edited the manuscript with the sanity of a light touch; my thanks.

In the academic year 1997–8 I was fortunate to hold a British Academy/Leverhulme Trust Senior Research fellowship; I am extremely grateful to the Academy and the Leverhulme Trust for their support.

As before, I should like to acknowledge two major debts in writing this book. The first is to the Department of Philosophy at King's – it is a wonderful place to do philosophy; my deep thanks. The second is to my infinitely tolerant family: my two daughters, Kate and Poppy, my mother Sarah McCabe, and my husband Martin Beddoe. This book is dedicated to Martin, with much love.

MMM