

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-02943-8 - Summa Theologiae: Volume 35 - Consequences of Charity,
(2a2ae. 34-46)

Thomas R. Heath O.P.

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

The *Summa Theologiae* ranks among the greatest documents of the Christian Church, and is a landmark of medieval western thought. It provides the framework for Catholic studies in systematic theology and for a classical Christian philosophy, and is regularly consulted by scholars of all faiths and none, across a range of academic disciplines. This paperback reissue of the classic Latin/English edition first published by the English Dominicans in the 1960s and 1970s, in the wake of the Second Vatican Council, has been undertaken in response to regular requests from readers and librarians around the world for the entire series of 61 volumes to be made available again. The original text is unchanged, except for the correction of a small number of typographical errors.

The original aim of this edition was not narrowly ecclesiastical. It sought to make this treasure of the Christian intellectual heritage available to theologians and philosophers of all backgrounds, including those who, without claiming to be believers themselves, appreciate a religious integrity which embodies hardbitten rationalism and who recognise in Thomas Aquinas a master of that perennial philosophy which forms the bedrock of European civilisation. Because of this the editors worked under specific instructions to bear in mind not only the professional theologian, but also the general reader with an interest in the 'reason' in Christianity. The parallel English and Latin texts can be used successfully by anybody with a basic knowledge of Latin, while the presence of the Latin text has allowed the translators a degree of freedom in adapting their English version for modern readers. Each volume contains a glossary of technical terms and is designed to be complete in itself to serve for private study or as a course text.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-02943-8 - Summa Theologiae: Volume 35 - Consequences of Charity,
(2a2ae. 34-46)

Thomas R. Heath O.P.

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

NIHIL OBSTAT

THOMAS GILBY, O.P.

JOHN M. DONAHUE, O.P.

IMPRIMI POTEST

CANICIUS C. SULLIVAN, O.P.

Prior Provincialis, Prov. S. Joseph S.F.A.

die 5 Junii 1972

NIHIL OBSTAT

JOHN M. T. BARTON, S.T.D., L.S.S.

Censor Deputatus

IMPRIMATUR

✠ VICTOR GUAZZELLI

Vic. Gen.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-02943-8 - Summa Theologiae: Volume 35 - Consequences of Charity,
(2a2ae. 34-46)

Thomas R. Heath O.P.

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

ST THOMAS AQUINAS
SUMMA THEOLOGICÆ

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-02943-8 - Summa Theologiae: Volume 35 - Consequences of Charity,
(2a2ae. 34-46)

Thomas R. Heath O.P.

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

ST THOMAS AQUINAS
SUMMA
THEOLOGIAE

Latin text and English translation,
Introductions, Notes, Appendices
and Glossaries



Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-02943-8 - Summa Theologiae: Volume 35 - Consequences of Charity,
(2a2ae. 34-46)

Thomas R. Heath O.P.

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

PIÆ MEMORIÆ

JOANNIS

PP. XXIII

DICATUM

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-02943-8 - *Summa Theologiae*: Volume 35 - Consequences of Charity,
(2a2ae. 34-46)

Thomas R. Heath O.P.

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

IN AN AUDIENCE, 13 December 1963, to a group representing the Dominican Editors and the combined Publishers of the New English *Summa*, His Holiness Pope Paul VI warmly welcomed and encouraged their undertaking. A letter from His Eminence Cardinal Cicognani, Cardinal Secretary of State, 6 February 1968, expresses the continued interest of the Holy Father in the progress of the work, 'which does honour to the Dominican Order, and the Publishers, and is to be considered without doubt as greatly contributing to the growth and spread of a genuinely Catholic culture', and communicates his particular Apostolic Blessing.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-02943-8 - Summa Theologiae: Volume 35 - Consequences of Charity,
(2a2ae. 34-46)

Thomas R. Heath O.P.

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

To MARK
... *the elder brother's*
Life all laced in the other's

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-02943-8 - Summa Theologiae: Volume 35 - Consequences of Charity,
(2a2ae. 34-46)

Thomas R. Heath O.P.

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

ST THOMAS AQUINAS
SUMMA THEOLOGIAE
VOLUME 35
CONSEQUENCES OF CHARITY
(2a2ae. 34-46)

Latin text, English translation, Introduction,
Notes, Appendices & Glossary

THOMAS R. HEATH O.P.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-02943-8 - Summa Theologiae: Volume 35 - Consequences of Charity,
(2a2ae. 34-46)

Thomas R. Heath O.P.

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521393829

© The Dominican Council as Trustee for the English Province of the Order of Preachers 1972
[Excepting Latin text of 'DE VITUS OPPOSITIS CARITATI, DE PRÆCEPTIS CARITATIS,
ET DE DONO SAPIENTIÆ']

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without
the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

This digitally printed first paperback version 2006

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN-13 978-0-521-39382-9 hardback

ISBN-10 0-521-39382-5 hardback

ISBN-13 978-0-521-02943-8 paperback

ISBN-10 0-521-02943-0 paperback

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-02943-8 - Summa Theologiae: Volume 35 - Consequences of Charity,
(2a2ae. 34-46)

Thomas R. Heath O.P.

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CONTENTS

xii Editorial Notes

xiv Introduction

QUESTION 34. HATRED

3 Article 1. is it possible for anyone to hate God?

5 Article 2. is hating God the worst sin?

9 Article 3. is every kind of hatred for neighbour a sin?

11 Article 4. is hatred the worst sin of all against our neighbour?

13 Article 5. is hatred a capital sin?

15 Article 6. does hatred come from envy?

QUESTION 35. SPIRITUAL APATHY

21 Article 1. is spiritual apathy a sin?

25 Article 2. is spiritual apathy a special kind of vice?

29 Article 3. is spiritual apathy a mortal sin?

31 Article 4. should spiritual apathy be counted a capital sin?

QUESTION 36. ENVY

37 Article 1. is envy discontent?

41 Article 2. is envy a sin?

43 Article 3. is envy a mortal sin?

47 Article 4. is envy a capital sin?

QUESTION 37. DISCORD

51 Article 1. is discord a sin?

55 Article 2. is discord an offspring of vainglory?

QUESTION 38. CONTENTIOUSNESS

59 Article 1. is contentiousness a mortal sin?

63 Article 2. is contentiousness an offspring of vainglory?

QUESTION 39. SCHISM

67 Article 1. is schism a special sin?

71 Article 2. is schism a worse sin than denial of faith?

75 Article 3. do schismatics have any power?

77 Article 4. is excommunication a fit punishment for schismatics?

QUESTION 40. WAR

81 Article 1. is it always a sin to wage war?

85 Article 2. may clerics and bishops engage in warfare?

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-02943-8 - Summa Theologiae: Volume 35 - Consequences of Charity,
(2a2ae. 34-46)

Thomas R. Heath O.P.

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CONTENTS

- 89 Article 3. is it lawful to use subterfuge in war?
93 Article 4. is it lawful to fight on feast days?
- QUESTION 41. BRAWLING
- 95 Article 1. is brawling always a sin?
97 Article 2. is brawling the offspring of anger?
- QUESTION 42. SEDITION
- 103 Article 1. is sedition a special sin distinct from others?
105 Article 2. is sedition always a mortal sin?
- QUESTION 43. SCANDAL
- 109 Article 1. is this a good definition of scandal: something less
right in word or action which gives occasion to a fall?
115 Article 2. is scandal a sin?
117 Article 3. is scandal a special sin?
121 Article 4. is scandal a mortal sin?
123 Article 5. may passive scandal happen even to holy men?
125 Article 6. can active scandal be found in holy men?
127 Article 7. should we forgo spiritual goods because of scandal?
133 Article 8. should we forgo temporal goods because of scandal?
- QUESTION 44. THE COMMANDS TO LOVE
- 139 Article 1. should any command to love be given?
143 Article 2. should two commands to love have been given?
145 Article 3. are two commands to love enough?
147 Article 4. is loving God 'with all your heart' well commanded?
151 Article 5. was it well to add to the words, 'you shall love the
Lord your God with all your heart' these others, 'and
with all your soul and with all your strength'?
153 Article 6. is it possible in this life to carry out this command to
love God?
155 Article 7. is the command to love our neighbour well put?
157 Article 8. does the order of preference in charity come under
the command?
- QUESTION 45. THE GIFT OF WISDOM
- 161 Article 1. should wisdom be included among the gifts of the
Holy Spirit?
165 Article 2. is wisdom seated in the intellect?
167 Article 3. is wisdom contemplative only or practical too?

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-02943-8 - Summa Theologiae: Volume 35 - Consequences of Charity,
(2a2ae. 34-46)

Thomas R. Heath O.P.

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CONTENTS

- 169 Article 4. can wisdom be with mortal sin and without grace?
 173 Article 5. is wisdom in all who have grace?
 175 Article 6. does the seventh beatitude correspond to the gift of
 wisdom?

QUESTION 46. FOLLY

- 181 Article 1. is folly the opposite of wisdom?
 183 Article 2. is folly a sin?
 185 Article 3. is folly an offspring of lust?

APPENDICES

- 189 1. Spiritual apathy
 193 2. War
 198 3. Sedition
 200 4. The Gift of Wisdom
 203 Glossary
 207 Index of Scriptural References
 210 General Index
 217 Volumes

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-02943-8 - *Summa Theologiae*: Volume 35 - Consequences of Charity, (2a2ae. 34-46)

Thomas R. Heath O.P.

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

EDITORIAL NOTES

THE TEXT AND TRANSLATION

THE Leonine text found in the Marietti Edition, Rome, 1952, published under the guidance of Peter Caramello, has been the first basis of the translation. A comparison was made with the Piana text found in the Ottawa Edition, 1941, edited by the Institute of Medieval Studies of Ottawa, and most variations were noted. Frequently the text from the Scriptures used by St Thomas differs slightly from the Vulgate text. Some of these variations have been noted. The spirit of the translation is the same as Robert Frost's definition of freedom: feeling comfortable in harness.

FOOTNOTES

Those signified by a superior number are usually the references given by St Thomas and tracked down by the Leonine Commission, with the exception of no. 1 to each article which refers to parallel texts in his writings. Those signified alphabetically are editorial references and explanatory remarks.

REFERENCES

Biblical references are to the Vulgate; Patristic references to Migne (PG, Greek Fathers; PL, Latin Fathers). When the English titles are well known, references to the works of St Thomas and Aristotle are in English. Titles of St Thomas's works are abbreviated as follows:

Summa Theologiae, without title. Part, question, article, reply; e.g. 1a. 70, 1 ad 2. 2a2æ. 25, 4.

Summa Contra Gentiles, CG. Book, chapter; e.g. CG 11, 14.

Scriptum in IV Libros Sententiarum, *Sent.* Book, distinction, question, article, solution or *questiuncula*, reply; e.g. 11 *Sent.* 15, 1, 1, ii ad 3.

Compendium Theologiae, *Compend. theol.*

Scriptural commentaries (*lecturae, expositiones reportatae*): Job, *In Job*; Psalms, *In Psal.*; Isaiah, *In Isa.*; Jeremiah, *In Jerem.*; St Matthew, *In Matt.*; St John, *In Joann.*; Epistles of St Paul, e.g. *In 1 Cor.* Chapter, verse, *lectio* as required.

Philosophical commentaries: Aristotle, *Peri Hermeneias*, *In Periherm.*; Posterior Analytics, *In Post. Anal.*; Physics, *In Phys.*; *De Cælo et*

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-02943-8 - Summa Theologiae: Volume 35 - Consequences of Charity,
(2a2ae. 34-46)

Thomas R. Heath O.P.

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

EDITORIAL NOTES

Mundo, In de Cæl.; De Generatione et Corruptione, In de Gen. et Corr.; De Anima, In de Anima; Metaphysics, In Meta.; Nichomachean Ethics, In Ethic.; Politics, In Pol. Book, chapter, lectio as required, 1, also for references to Dionysius, De divinis Nominibus, In de Div. Nom. References to Aristotle include the Bekker numbering.

Quæstiones quodlibetæ, Quodl.

Complete titles are given for other works.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I am grateful to John Linus Sullivan, O.P., Prior, and all the brethren at St Mary's, New Haven, where most of the work was done; to John Matthew Donahue, O.P., Regent of Studies, Washington, who let me hide for a semester to do it; to James M. Gustafson at Yale for his seminar on Christian love, and for his Christian love; to the others in that seminar for the same; to Urban Voll, O.P., and LeRoy Walters for letting me borrow heavily from their work; to Peter Gils, O.P., and the Leonine Commission at Yale for some good insights; to Edmond P. Cahalane of the Library of Congress; and to Raymond Vandergrift, O.P., Librarian at the House of Studies, Washington, for his extraordinary help. May we all meet merrily one day, for ever, to share the final consequence of charity.

T. R. H.

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-02943-8 - Summa Theologiae: Volume 35 - Consequences of Charity,
(2a2ae. 34-46)

Thomas R. Heath O.P.

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

INTRODUCTION

IN the following questions Thomas first takes up ten vices against charity (qq. 34-43); then the commandment to love (q. 44); the gift of wisdom which corresponds to and completes charity (q. 45); and its contrasting vice, which is folly (q. 46). Although there is an obvious emphasis on the vices against charity, fourteen articles, some of them quite long, or more than a quarter of the articles in the entire tract, are on the positive matters of the commandment to love and the gift of wisdom. The question on the commandment to love, for example, has eight articles, while only one question on the vices has that many; the question on wisdom has six and, again, only one question on the vices has that many. All the rest are made up of two, three or four article questions. This will explain why we have given this volume the title, 'Consequences of Charity' rather than the more forbidding, 'Vices against Charity'.

The text in the New Testament which seems to be guiding Thomas here appears in Paul's letter to the Galatians. There Paul contrasts the fruits of the Spirit, 'love, joy, peace, patience, kindness, goodness, trustfulness, gentleness and self-control', to those of the flesh, among which we find 'feuds and wrangling, jealousy, bad temper and quarrels, disagreements, factions and envy' (*Galatians* 5, 20-2). One cannot fail to see a similarity between this list and that proposed in the treatment here of the vices against love and the two immediate effects of love, joy and peace. These vices are hatred, apathy, envy, discord, contentiousness, schism, war, brawling, sedition and scandal. Paul and Thomas are both talking about vices that destroy love in us and in the community built up on love.

The differences in the listing are best explained by Thomas himself. Commenting on the *Galatians* text he notes that the listing used by Paul is not dictated by the demands of science but of the apostolate. 'It should be recognized that when the Apostle presents his enumeration of the various vices it is not his intention to put down all the vices in perfect order and according to the rules of art, but only those which predominate in the persons to whom he is writing.'¹ In his own theological exposition of the vices against love Thomas sees no need, then, to follow Paul's text

¹*Super Epistolas S. Pauli Lectura*, ed. R. Gai, Rome, 1953; *ad Galatas* v, 5, cf *Commentary on Saint Paul's Epistle to the Galatians*, trans. F. Larcher, Albany, 1966

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-02943-8 - *Summa Theologiae*: Volume 35 - Consequences of Charity,
(2a2ae. 34-46)

Thomas R. Heath O.P.

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

INTRODUCTION

literally. His job is to work out a more orderly list, ‘according to the rules of art’.

But even in this endeavour he runs into trouble. Now one of the most intriguing aspects of this section of the *Summa* is the shift of plan in its treatment of the vices. In q. 34 we find his initial division. This is modified somewhat in q. 35; remade in q. 37; and remade again in q. 39; and when the author has finally presented his plan we see that the order has changed again from his final statement of it in q. 39. His intention in q. 34 is clear: to discuss the vices opposed to charity; first hatred as standing against love, then spiritual apathy and envy as standing against the joy of charity, then discord and schism as standing against peace, and finally offensiveness and scandal as standing against beneficence and fraternal correction. In q. 35 he refines his thinking about spiritual apathy and envy, seeing the first to be against the joy we should have in the divine good and the second against the joy we should have in our neighbour’s good. But in q. 37, when he opens his treatment of discord he hits upon another order. He sees that discord and schism do not exhaust the vices against peace. What of war? What of sedition? So he conceives of another principle of division. The vices against peace may be of three kinds: against peace in the heart (discord); on the lips (contentiousness); and in deeds (schism, war and sedition). In q. 39 he sees yet another vice, brawling, which belongs with the last three, and he indicates he will treat all four in this order: schism, brawling, sedition and war. But then his actual treatment switches the order, placing war second rather than last. And in the meantime he has dropped offensiveness which appeared in his first division, standing against neighbourliness (*beneficentia*), probably because brawling, sedition and war cover most of the sins against charity in deed; and he discusses scandal as standing against neighbourliness rather than against fraternal correction.

This, as we have said, is intriguing. Yet it brings out rather clearly two aspects of Thomas’s thought. The first is the vital, one might almost say the vivacious, quality of his thinking. His mind was ever flexible, ever open to better plans, clearer ways of setting out the material. It bespeaks life, a living struggle to grasp the whole truth and to say it as clearly as possible.

The second aspect is somewhat more conjectural, but I should never have even been able to make the conjecture if I had not talked with the Belgian Dominican, Peter Gils, who has worked with the Paris–Saulchoir Leonine Commission for many years and has become an expert on the autograph of the Angelic Doctor. During the fall of 1970 he and I were together in New Haven, I working on this translation, he working with the Leonine Commission at Yale University. One night he casually remarked

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-02943-8 - Summa Theologiae: Volume 35 - Consequences of Charity,
(2a2ae. 34-46)

Thomas R. Heath O.P.

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

INTRODUCTION

that a clear conclusion he had drawn from his work was, *Thomas was a man in a hurry*. Then, at my request, he showed me how he had come to that thought.²

The autograph of St Thomas, he explained, is devilishly hard to read. For example, what many experts read for years as *ubi sic canitur* was really *nisi peccaverit*. Why such a horrendous misreading? Thomas wrote in a hurry. He never went back to cross his t's or dot his i's with meticulous care. The manuscript had all the crosses and the dots, everything was there, but the reader had to 'back them up' to the proper places. The big job, then, in reading the handwriting of St Thomas is to match his crosses and dots with the right t's and i's. This is much too simple an explanation for all the symbols and abbreviations in the Gothic script, but it does illustrate a principle one must use.

Thomas was a man in a hurry. This principle would hold for his dictation as well as his script, and I submit it could explain the division of the present section of the *Summa*. If he had leisure he could have gone back after he had done the introduction to q. 37 and re-written q. 34's introduction, or re-written q. 37's introduction after he had discovered 'brawling'. But he had immense work in front of him and so little time, so little time. He would leave the rearranging to those who would follow and who would see what he meant, anyhow. He had to get on with his work.

Among the vices here treated, I have thought three worth separate appendices: spiritual apathy, since it is an affliction widespread in the world and in the Church today; war, since those many scholars dedicated to peace in these times of war will find it helpful to know the historical roots of Thomas's teaching; and sedition, since so much theology is being done today on the subject of revolution. I have included a fourth appendix on the gift of wisdom.

In quoting the scriptures my method has been to use the Jerusalem Bible (J) whenever its sense is substantially the same as the Latin text cited. Otherwise I use the Douay version which is almost a literal rendering of the Vulgate. I have also used the notes from the Jerusalem Bible as giving a fairly recent consensus on the interpretation of the many texts used. I feel no obligation in a volume of this sort to make an exhaustive study of the various modern interpretations of each text, though occasionally I have cited texts and notes from the Jerome Biblical Commentary (JBC), the Revised Standard Version (RSV), the Oxford Bible (OX) and the New American Bible (NAB).

²See P.-M. Gils, 'Textes inédits de S. Thomas: Les premières rédactions du *Scriptum super Tertio Sententiarum*', *Revue des Scien. Phil. et Théol.* 45 (1961) 201-28; 46 (1962) 445-62 and 609-28

Cambridge University Press

978-0-521-02943-8 - *Summa Theologiae*: Volume 35 - Consequences of Charity,
(2a2ae. 34-46)

Thomas R. Heath O.P.

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

INTRODUCTION

It seems to me that along with *Galatians* 5, 20–2 already cited in this Introduction the mood of this section of the *Summa* is also captured by what Saint Paul says earlier in that same chapter. ‘My brothers, you were called, as you know, to liberty; but be careful, or this liberty will provide an opening for self-indulgence. Serve one another, rather, in works of love, since the whole of the Law is summarized in a single command: Love your neighbour as yourself. If you go snapping at each other and tearing each other to pieces, you had better watch or you will destroy the whole community.’ (*Galatians* 5, 13).

In the following Questions Thomas comments with great brilliance on the implications of this text. One who desires to understand the dynamics of hatred, schism, war, scandal and things like that ‘which destroy the whole community’ as well as apathy and envy which destroy the individual in the community, will surely profit from reading this volume.