

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-02832-5 - Schenker Studies 2
Edited by Carl Schachter and Hedi Siegel
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

This is Cambridge University Press's second volume of studies based on the work of Heinrich Schenker, now recognized as this century's most influential figure in the areas of music theory and analysis. The first section of the book contains archival studies that derive from the contents of Schenker's *Nachlass*, recently made available to scholars. Schenker's unpublished papers also supplement several of the analytical studies in the second, larger, section of the book. These essays fall into four groups: studies in the Classic and Romantic repertory, studies in twentieth-century music, rhythmic studies, and studies in the theory of Schenker's fundamental analytical constructs, the *Urfinie* and the *Ursatz*.

Carl Schachter is Distinguished Professor Emeritus of Queens College of the City University of New York, and on the faculty of the Mannes College of Music, New York. He is co-author of *Counterpoint in Composition* and *Harmony and Voice Leading*.

Hedi Siegel is Adjunct Associate Professor at Hunter College of the City University of New York. She is editor of the first volume of *Schenker Studies*.

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-02832-5 - Schenker Studies 2
Edited by Carl Schachter and Hedi Siegel
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Schenker Studies 2

Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-02832-5 - Schenker Studies 2
Edited by Carl Schachter and Hedi Siegel
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Schenker Studies 2

edited by

Carl Schachter and Hedi Siegel



Cambridge University Press
978-0-521-02832-5 - Schenker Studies 2
Edited by Carl Schachter and Hedi Siegel
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521470117

© Cambridge University Press 1999

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without
the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1999
This digitally printed first paperback version 2006

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN-13 978-0-521-47011-7 hardback
ISBN-10 0-521-47011-0 hardback

ISBN-13 978-0-521-02832-5 paperback
ISBN-10 0-521-02832-9 paperback

 CONTENTS

<i>Abbreviated references to Schenker's writings</i>	<i>page</i> ix
<i>Preface</i>	xi
ARCHIVAL STUDIES	
Levels of understanding: an introduction to Schenker's <i>Nachlass</i> <i>Robert Kosovsky</i>	3
When "Freier Satz" was part of <i>Kontrapunkt</i> : a preliminary report <i>Hedi Siegel</i>	12
Schenker's unpublished work with the music of Johannes Brahms <i>Allen Cadwallader and William Pastille</i>	26
ANALYTICAL STUDIES	
C. P. E. Bach and the fine art of transposition <i>Wayne Petty</i>	49
Comedy and structure in Haydn's symphonies <i>L. Poundie Burstein</i>	67
"Symphonic breadth": structural style in Mozart's symphonies <i>David Gagné</i>	82
"Structural momentum" and closure in Chopin's Nocturne Op. 9, No. 2 <i>John Rink</i>	109
On the first movement of Sibelius's Fourth Symphony: a Schenkerian view <i>Edward Laufer</i>	127
Voice leading as drama in <i>Wozzeck</i> <i>Arthur Maisel</i>	160
Sequential expansion and Handelian phrase rhythm <i>Channan Willner</i>	192
Strange dimensions: regularity and irregularity in deep levels of rhythmic reduction <i>Frank Samarotto</i>	222
Diachronic transformation in a Schenkerian context: Brahms's Haydn Variations <i>Timothy Jackson</i>	239
	vii

Bass-line articulations of the <i>Urlinie</i> <i>Eric Wen</i>	276
Structure as foreground: “das Drama des Ursatzes” <i>Carl Schachter</i>	298
<i>Index</i>	315

ABBREVIATED REFERENCES TO SCHENKER'S WRITINGS

The following works of Heinrich Schenker will often be cited by title alone. Complete bibliographic information is given below, with the abbreviated form appearing in bold type.

Harmonielehre, Volume I of *Neue musikalische Theorien und Phantasien* (Stuttgart: Cotta, 1906); reprint edition (Vienna: Universal Edition, 1978)
Harmony, translated by Elisabeth Mann Borgese, edited and annotated by Oswald Jonas (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1954, republished 1980); reprint edition (Cambridge, Mass.: M.I.T. Press, 1973)

Kontrapunkt, Volume II of *Neue musikalische Theorien und Phantasien*, Book 1 (Stuttgart: Cotta, 1910), Book 2 (Vienna: Universal Edition, 1922); reprint edition (Hildesheim: Olms, 1991)

Counterpoint, Books 1 and 2, translated by John Rothgeb and Jürgen Thym, edited by John Rothgeb (New York: Schirmer Books, 1987)

Beethovens neunte Sinfonie (Vienna: Universal Edition, 1912); reprint edition (Vienna: Universal Edition, 1969)

Beethoven's Ninth Symphony, translated and edited by John Rothgeb (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1992)

Erläuterungsausgabe. Die letzten fünf Sonaten von Beethoven: Kritische Ausgabe mit Einführung und Erläuterung (Vienna: Universal Edition, 1913–20); new edition, revised by Oswald Jonas (Vienna: Universal Edition, 1971–72)

Sonate E dur, **Op. 109**, published 1913; revised edition, 1971

Sonate As dur, **Op. 110**, published 1914; revised edition, 1972

Sonate C moll, **Op. 111**, published 1915; revised edition, 1971

Sonate A dur, **Op. 101**, published 1920; revised edition, 1972

(Op. 106 was never published.)

Der Tonwille, Issues 1–10 (Vienna: A. J. Gutmann, 1921–24, later republished in three volumes by Universal Edition); reprint edition (Hildesheim: Olms, 1990)

Das Meisterwerk in der Musik, Yearbooks I–III (Munich: Drei Masken Verlag, 1925, 1926, and 1930); reprint edition (Hildesheim: Olms, 1974)

Abbreviated references

The Masterwork in Music, Volumes I–III, translated by Ian Bent, Alfred Clayton, William Drabkin, Richard Kramer, Derrick Puffett, John Rothgeb, and Hedi Siegel, edited by William Drabkin (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994, 1996, and 1997)

Fünf Urlinie-Tafeln (Vienna: Universal Edition, 1932; New York: David Mannes Music School, 1933)

Five Graphic Music Analyses, republication of *Fünf Urlinie-Tafeln* with a new introduction and glossary by Felix Salzer (New York: Dover, 1969)

Der freie Satz, Volume III of *Neue musikalische Theorien und Phantasien* (Vienna: Universal Edition, 1935); second edition, edited and revised by Oswald Jonas (Vienna: Universal Edition, 1956). Page references are to the second edition unless otherwise noted.

Free Composition (*Der freie Satz*), translated and edited by Ernst Oster (New York: Longman, 1979); reprint edition (New York: Schirmer Books)

PREFACE

Like its predecessor, Cambridge University Press's first volume of Schenker studies published in 1990, this book offers a broad and inclusive survey of the field of Schenkerian research. It gives an accurate, if necessarily partial, view of the field at the present time; a number of the essays could not have been written twenty, or even ten, years ago. Only twenty years have passed since Ernst Oster's translation of *Der freie Satz* appeared. This publication has been the catalyst for the ambitious scholarly enterprise of publishing the entire corpus of Schenker's work in English translation. A significant part of this enterprise has been achieved with the translation of the three volumes of *Das Meisterwerk in der Musik* as well as other important works by Schenker. Perhaps the most striking recent development, however, has not been a publication. Rather it has been the availability to scholars of Schenker's *Nachlass*, at both the Oster Collection of the New York Public Library and the Jonas Collection at the University of California, Riverside. In addition, Mrs. Felix Salzer has generously granted access to items in her husband's private collection. In so doing she has contributed to the realization of Felix Salzer's long-held goal of bringing Schenker's unpublished work to light. Thus an almost entirely new area of research has been opened up: the development of Schenker's theories as revealed by the study of his voluminous papers. The first section in *Schenker Studies 2* consists of three archival studies. Robert Kosovsky suggests guidelines for the scholarly study of the *Nachlass*. Hedi Siegel traces the origins of *Der freie Satz* to unpublished sections of *Kontrapunkt*. The contribution by Allen Cadwallader and William Pastille is devoted to the "Brahms folder" in the Oster Collection. The contents of Schenker's *Nachlass* have also begun to permeate analytical work within the Schenker community as is evidenced by several of the analytical studies in this book.

The larger part of the book is devoted to analytical studies. These eleven essays fall roughly into four groups: studies in the Classic and Romantic repertory, studies in twentieth-century music, rhythmic studies, and studies in the theory of the *Urfinie* and *Ursatz*. The first of these four groups contains music from the repertory that Schenker himself drew upon. For Schenker, C. P. E. Bach was one of the greatest composers, and Bach's *Versuch* had a profound influence on the development of his theories. Later Schenkerians have devoted relatively little attention to the music of this important master. The essay by Wayne Petty explores an unusual facet of Bach's compositional technique and reveals that what seem to be simple and literal transpositions are in fact highly

imaginative recompositions. The article by L. Poundie Burstein uses analytical readings of Haydn symphonies as points of departure for the examination of humor in music. David Gagné integrates the analysis of harmony and voice leading with a close reading of texture and orchestration in Mozart's symphonic movements to show how performance medium and genre condition the tonal structure of a work. John Rink turns to a familiar composition, frequently analyzed by Schenker and his followers – Chopin's Nocturne Op. 9, No. 2 – and offers a new and compelling view of its form and structure.

The contributions by Edward Laufer and Arthur Maisel deal with music by Sibelius and Berg that Schenker himself would have violently rejected. The application of Schenker's theories to twentieth-century music has been and remains a controversial enterprise, but one that continues to engage excellent musicians and scholars. Of the two essays, Laufer's modifies Schenker's approach much less than Maisel's, but that is clearly because Sibelius's music is closer to the tonal tradition than Berg's. Laufer takes pains to show antecedents in eighteenth- and nineteenth-century music for Sibelius's highly original way of writing. Maisel draws interesting parallels between the tonal structure of *Wozzeck* and the dramatic structure of the libretto. At the same time he takes a somewhat polemical stance with respect to current posttonal theory.

The next three studies – by Channan Willner, Frank Samarotto, and Timothy Jackson – return to the Schenkerian repertory, with a focus on the topic of rhythm. Willner explores the very elusive and subtle phrase rhythm in the music of the high Baroque. In Samarotto's essay, durational reduction reveals deep rhythmic structures in two Beethoven pieces that are inherently asymmetric – a discovery that can have far-reaching implications for the study of rhythm in general. Jackson's comprehensive study of Brahms's Haydn Variations explicates this complex work from a perspective that takes in conflicts and contradictions between levels. Jackson draws upon study of Brahms's sketches and upon archival work with Schenker's published and unpublished material on the Variations; in doing this, he sets new directions for rhythmic studies as well as studies in the foundations of Schenker's theory.

Schenker's fundamental analytical constructs, the *Urlinie* and the *Ursatz*, form the topics of Eric Wen's and Carl Schachter's contributions. Wen concentrates on an unusual but by no means infrequent manipulation of the *Urlinie* – its transfer into the bass. This possibility has been acknowledged by earlier Schenkerian analysts (and by Schenker himself), but never studied in depth. Schachter studies situations where the *Ursatz* – far from remaining in the “background” – participates strikingly in the salient features of the foreground, including its contradictions and conflicts.

While most of the essays in this volume originated as papers read at the Second International Schenker Symposium held in 1992 at the Mannes College of Music in New York, several were presented at other conferences. Among these are Edward Laufer's essay: though related to the paper he read at the Schenker Symposium, it is derived from a presentation given at the Second International Sibelius Conference held in Helsinki in 1995. A shorter version of Channan Willner's essay was first delivered at the Sixth Biennial Conference on Baroque Music held in 1994 at the University of Edinburgh. Carl Schachter read

an earlier version of his essay in London at the 1991 City University Music Analysis Conference. The paper he read at the 1992 Schenker Symposium has been published elsewhere, as have a number of other papers on the conference program (with several remaining unpublished). Thus, unlike the first *Schenker Studies*, this book does not owe its contents to a single conference.

In the studies that discuss Schenker's *Nachlass*, items held by the Oster Collection are reproduced by courtesy of the Music Division of the New York Public Library, Astor, Lenox, and Tilden Foundations. We are very grateful to Mrs. Felix Salzer for her permission to reproduce or transcribe items from the *Nachlass* in her possession. The Pierpont Morgan Library, Mary Flagler Cary Music Collection, kindly gave us permission to reproduce the facsimile included in David Gagné's essay. We thank Universal Edition and the estate of Ernst Oster for their permission to reprint two figures from *Free Composition* in Timothy Jackson's essay.

The illustrative examples in this book do not include extensive excerpts from the musical works discussed; therefore the reader is asked to consult the relevant scores. We extend our thanks to the music typesetters who contributed to the preparation of the examples: to Dejan Badnjar for the complex graphs of Edward Laufer's essay, to Frank Samarotto for the examples in his own essay, and to Timothy McCord and Paul Carter, who carefully laid the groundwork for the examples of several essays. We owe special thanks to Arthur Maisel who drew on his musicality, expertise, and experience in setting the majority of the examples in the book. The preparation of the musical examples was made possible by a generous grant from the Mannes Music Theory Fund.

We wish to thank Jonathan Finkelman, Joshua Gilinsky, Linnéa Johnson, and Suzanne Osborne for their watchful checking of manuscript and proof, and Stephen Slottow for his attentive preparation of the index. Finally, this book would not have become a reality without the support and sympathetic guidance of Penny Souster and the work of her colleagues at Cambridge University Press.

Carl Schachter
Hedi Siegel
New York City