

This is the first comprehensive book-length analysis of personal pronouns in present-day English. Drawing on the Survey of English Usage corpus and the International Corpus of English, Katie Wales examines a wide range of discourse types and texts and of varieties of English around the world. Her approach is pragmatic and functional, rather than formal, and her concern is with speakers and writers and their uses of language in social, cultural and rhetorical contexts. The discussion is illustrated with numerous examples of the usage of personal pronouns and also of reflexives and possessives.



STUDIES IN ENGLISH LANGUAGE

Executive Editor: Sidney Greenbaum

Advisory Editors: John Algeo, Rodney Huddleston, Magnus Ljung

Personal pronouns in present-day English



Studies in English Language

The aim of this series is to provide a framework for original studies of present-day English. All are based securely on empirical research, and represent theoretical and descriptive contributions to our knowledge of national varieties of English, both written and spoken. The series will cover a broad range of topics in English grammar, vocabulary, discourse, and pragmatics, and is aimed at an international readership.

Already published

Christian Mair Infinitival complement clauses in English: a study of syntax in discourse

Charles F. Meyer Apposition in contemporary English

Jan Firbas Functional sentence perspective in written and spoken communication

Izchak M. Schlesinger Cognitive space and linguistic case

Forthcoming

John Algeo A study of British-American grammatical differences



Personal pronouns in present-day English

KATIE WALES

Professor of English Language Royal Holloway University of London





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press

The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521471022

© Cambridge University Press 1996

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1996

This digitally printed first paperback version 2006

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Wales, Katie.

Personal pronouns in present-day English/Katie Wales.

p. cm (Studies in English language)

Includes index.

ISBN 0 521 47102 8 (hardback)

 $1. \ English \ language-Pronoun. \quad I. \ Title. \quad II. \ Series.$

PE1261.W35 1995

425-dc20 95-35080 CIP

ISBN-13 978-0-521-47102-2 hardback

ISBN-10 0-521-47102-8 hardback

ISBN-13 978-0-521-02503-4 paperback

ISBN-10 0-521-02503-6 paperback



For Randolph Quirk, Geoffrey Leech and the late Sidney Greenbaum



Contents

	Prej	face	page xi
	List	of abbreviations and symbols	xv
1	Personal pronouns: definitions and descriptions		
	1.1	Definitions	1
	1.2	Pro-forms	4
	1.3	'Meaning' and 'person'	5
	1.4	Pronouns as 'noun-like'	9
	1.5	Pronoun paradigms	12
2	Pro	nouns, anaphora and discourse	21
	2.1	Third person pronouns: a recapitulation	21
	2.2	Third person pronouns and anaphora: frameworks for	•
		analysis	22
	2.3	Anaphora and discourse: a pragmatic approach	26
	2.4	Third person pronouns and 'avoidance of repetition'	30
	2.5	Third person pronouns and cataphora	36
	2.6	Endophora and exophora: some uses of they and it	43
3	You	and me, them and us: the politics of pronouns	50
	3.1	The inter-personal pronouns	50
	3.2	'Third person' forms and speech roles	54
	3.3	'Them and us' attitudes	58
	3.4	We and inter-personal rhetoric	63
	3.5	Me and you: subjectivity or empathy?	68
	3.6	Thou and you and the power of address	73
			ix



x Contents

	3.7	'Impersonal' one: a new personal pronoun	78	
4	Between you and I: problems of case			
	4.1	Pronouns and case: a suitable case for treatment	85	
	4.2	Regional variations in pronominal case forms	89	
	4.3	•	94	
	4.4	Co-ordinated pronouns: case and word order	102	
	4.5	Towards a common case	107	
5	No one's sexist, are they? The problem of 'generic			
	he'		110	
	5.1	Pronouns and a 'common gender'	110	
	5.2	The rise and fall of 'generic he'	112	
	5.3	Pronominal alternatives to 'generic he'	119	
	5.4	'Unisex', 'singular' or 'indeterminate' they	125	
6	'English as she is spoken': pronouns and			
	per	sonification	134	
	6.1	Gender marking in the noun phrase	134	
	6.2	The gender system in non-standard English	137	
	6.3	'Natural' gender in standard English: problems of		
		co-reference	139	
	6.4	Personification or sexification: he versus she	146	
	6.5	Up she rises, and off she goes: poetry in motion	153	
	6.6	Reification: some uses of it	159	
	6.7	Collectives and it/they reference	161	
	6.8	Conclusion: gender and point of view	165	
7	Possessives and reflexives: current trends			
	7.1	Personal pronouns, possessives and reflexives	166	
	7.2	Possessive pronouns: forms and functions	169	
	7.3	It's not it's, it's its	177	
	7.4	Your average generic: a special usage	179	
	7.5	Reflexive pronouns: forms and functions	184	
	7.6	Reflexives and personal pronoun variation	188	
	7.7	Reflexives, emphatics and 'hyper-correctness'	191	
	Conclusion: towards the millennium and beyond -			
	per	sonal pronouns in the twenty-first century	197	
	Note	25	199	
	Refe	rences	213	
	Index		225	



Preface

Language, unlike mathematics, is not clearcut or precise. It is a natural human creation, and, like many other natural human creations, it is inherently messy.

(M.A.K. Halliday, Language as social semiotic, London: Edward Arnold, 1978: 203)

I have been obsessed with personal pronouns for nearly twenty years of my career, so this book represents something of an exorcism. The extent of my obsession is confirmed by the fact that it begins and ends with a pronoun. The reasons for my interest and enthusiasm I hope the book makes clear: the first full-length analysis of personal pronouns specifically in present-day English that I know of.

The treatment of pronouns in grammar-books, their traditional *loci* of description, tends to be selective, brief and often surprisingly prescriptive. One type of data, in fact, which I have drawn upon for comparison comprises two dozen twentieth-century influential or popular English grammar-books for native speakers and foreign learners of English. Time and again I discovered just how conservative they were, their 'rules' at odds with actual usage, direct descendants of their eighteenth-century forebears. In this context, apart from in the first chapter, I have tried not to use too many invented examples of my own: not only are they of limited value, but also too many erroneous ideas about pronominal usage have developed from them.

My data for empirical observation and analysis mostly comprises 'real' English as it is used. For, as Taylor (1993: 17) observes, even the most upto-date and comprehensive grammars do not always reflect on-going changes in English. I have therefore drawn upon my own extensive files of examples of pronouns in use in the 1980s and 1990s up until January 1995; and also, in particular, the corpora of English usage housed at University College London. So I have drawn on the Survey of English Usage (SEU) corpus, comprising written and spoken standard English material from the late 1950s and early 1960s until the late 1980s; and the million-word corpus of British usage, part of the proposed International Corpus of English (ICE-GB), based on materials collected in 1990–1. The 'present-day' of my title, then, must be interpreted in

хi



xii Preface

a dynamic rather than a static sense, referring to an English that is continually changing, but with my observations focussed on the usages of the most recent generation. However, I have used examples from the 1990s wherever possible, particularly in cases where a construction or speech-habit seems particularly 'trendy'. And 'present-day' provides pleasing alliteration.

I have also, it must be said, been keen to stress, where relevant, that present-day usages are often rooted in the past; and conversely, that the personal pronouns, traditionally labelled a 'closed' class of lexical items in the word-store of English, are not as stable and as non-resistant to influences as might appear.

I have also tried, wherever possible, to provide examples from a wide variety of Englishes, and not only standard English English. I am fully aware that discussion of pronouns, as of other grammatical features, has tended to focus on standard English English (and to a lesser extent American English) as the archetype, so that the unfortunate impression can be given to foreign learners of English that other varieties either do not exist or are not as significant, or are somehow 'deviant'. Many of the numerous tables in this book illustrate what I term 'non-standard' pronominal usages: not 'non-standard' in the sense of 'uneducated' (see Quirk et al., 1985: 1.22), but of 'regional' or 'mainstream dialect': 'real' English, in a loaded sense for some dialectologists and sociolinguists. However, as I would also stress, it is not always easy to distinguish 'standard' from 'non-standard', especially in informal varieties, both of speech and of writing; there is more instability or fluctuation in standard English than some grammars would suggest. I have also tried to provide many illustrations from varieties of English beyond Britain, including 'new Englishes'; although, as I acknowledge in my Conclusion, there is much work as yet to be done on investigating the grammatical features of such varieties.

My approach is empirical rather than theoretical, although I have noted significant theoretical perspectives where they seemed most relevant (in chapter 2, on anaphora, for example). As even that chapter reveals, my approach is also pragmatic and functional rather than formal: what appears to be a 'syntactic' phenomenon cannot actually be satisfactorily explained syntactically. And here, as overall, I am as much concerned with the 'user' or speaker/writer as with 'use': hence inevitably concerned with social, political and rhetorical issues of culture, relationships and power. Users of English have always created their own 'systems' of pronouns or 'rules' of use for their own needs and strategies, and continue to do so, often in complete disregard of grammarians' notions of logic. Pronouns are as much a part of (active) language behaviour as they are of (stative) grammar.

Far too many interesting connotations and rhetorical effects in fact have been ignored by grammarians altogether, who tend to assume in any case that pronouns are mono-valent in meaning. Alternatively, 'variant' uses have been buried in footnotes, which are yet significant for the learner of English, for example. In general, I hope to convey from my book as a whole a strong,



Preface xiii

Bakhtinian impression of the regional, social, generic, stylistic and situational diversity of present-day English pronominal usage, which a conventional grammar-book quite fails to achieve.

The first chapter introduces basic concepts and definitions of the personal pronouns, many of which are elaborated in the later chapters. I have found myself in complete agreement with Michael (1970: 72), who argues that the traditional category of pronoun is an 'inconsistent combination' of what appear to be 'unrelated functions', held together virtually by its name. I have included possessives and reflexives in the scope of my study, discussing these particularly in chapter 7. Chapters 2 and 3 distinguish between third person, on the one hand, and first and second person ('inter-personal') pronouns, on the other, including one. Chapter 2 is largely concerned with textual relations and discourse processing, lending support to a model of co-reference based on a 'world' of shared and mutual knowledge between speaker and hearer. Chapter 3 is much concerned with discourse functions and strategies in the light of the complex social relationships between speakers and addressees.

Chapter 4 might at first glance appear to be the most traditional chapter, in the sense that it is concerned with formal issues of 'case'; but my emphasis is very much on contemporary usage both within and beyond the British Isles, on the difference between precept and practice, and on sociolinguistic issues of prestige and stigma.

Chapters 5 and 6 are similar to the extent that they both raise questions about the much-debated topics of 'gender' and 'sexism'; but chapter 5 provides a detailed and up-to-date account of the so-called 'generic he' debate and of the pronominal alternatives; and chapter 6 an extensive discussion and illustration of the whole question of the animateness hierarchy and 'personification', in relation to pronoun usage.

It is now clearly stated in the National Curriculum for England and Wales that pupils between the ages of five and sixteen years should 'recognise that . . . the grammatical features that distinguish standard English [sic] include how pronouns . . . should be used' (1995: 3). It is to be hoped that this volume is of use to those teachers who seek to instruct their pupils on this far from simple, yet fascinating, subject; and not only in England and Wales, but wherever in the world English is taught.

Without the considerable benefit of a year's Senior Research Fellowship from the British Academy/Leverhulme Trust, for the academic year 1992–3, this book would still be in progress. I am also deeply indebted to Sidney Greenbaum, the series editor, for his helpful comments on each chapter. His death while the book was at final proofs stage came as a great shock. To Sid I owe a particularly personal connotation of the pronoun it ('How's it going?'). Many other colleagues, friends and students have helped me over the last few years, sometimes unwittingly: notably Wolf-Dietrich Bald, Joyce Bianconi, David Bovey, Robert Burchfield, Paul Coggle, Xavier Dekeyser, Ninah Devons, Martin Dodsworth, Leslie Dunkling, Monika Fludernik, Deidre



xiv Preface

Glynn-Jones, Keith Green, Helen Hemingway, Kathleen Hodgson, Sven Jacobson, Peter Jones, the late Tony Ladd, Caroline McAfee, Yibin Ni, Graham Nixon, Randolph Quirk, Alisa Salamon, Paul Simpson, Peter Stockwell, Kenneth Tibbo, Tim Wales, John Wells and Francis Wheen. Mi thanks to y'all from mysen.



Abbreviations and symbols

acc. accusative case (Old English)

adj. adjective
Afr. Eng. African English
Barns. Barnsley dialect

BEV Black English Vernacular
Bl. Count. Black Country English

Bl. Eng. Black English

Celt./Gael. Celtic English/Gaelic English

Cock. Cockney dialect

dat. dative case (Old English)

Dubl. Dublin English
E. Angl. East Anglian dialect

ego. egocentric

EME Early Middle English fem. feminine gender Fiji English

GB theory Government and Binding theory

gen. genitive case
Gull. Gullah
Guy. Guyanese
Hib. Eng. Hiberno-English

ICE-GB International Corpus of English (Great Britain corpus)

instr. instrumental case (Old English)

Jam. Cr. Jamaican Creole
Jam. Eng. Jamaican English
Lancs. Lancashire dialect

LDELC The Longman dictionary of English language and culture

(London: Longman, 1992)

Lond. Jam. London Jamaican English

 $\mathbf{x}\mathbf{v}$



xvi Abbreviations and symbols

LRB The London Review of Books

Mal. Eng. Malay English masc. masculine gender ME Middle English

Mids. Midland dialects of English

Monts. Montserrat English neut. neuter gender

Newf. Newfoundland English
Nig. Pig. Nigerian Pigin English

nom. nominative case (Old English)
non-Nt. non-northern dialects of English
non-stand. non-standard dialects of English

Nt. northern

Nt. Eng. Northern English

NW Mids. North-west Midland dialects of English

obj. objective case

OCEL The Oxford Companion to the English Language, ed.

T. McArthur. (Oxford University Press, 1992)

OE Old English

OED The Oxford English Dictionary

Pap. Pig. Papuan Pigin pl. plural poss. possessive PP personal propersonal pro

PP personal pronoun

prep. C prepositional complement

pres. present tense Rast. Rastafarian English

reg. regional varieties of British English

RP Received Pronunciation

Sam. Pig. Samoan Pigin

Sam. Pl. Eng. Samoan Plantation English

Scot. Eng. Scottish English

SEU The Survey of English Usage

Shet. Shetland English

sg. singular

Som. Somerset dialect

St. Am. Eng. Southern American English (USA)

subj. subjective case

SW South-west dialects of English

TG Transformational (generative) grammar

Tok. Pis. Tok Pisin
Tynes. Tyneside dialect

voc. vocative

W. Afr. Pig. West African Pigin



Abbreviations and symbols xvii

W. Mids. West Midland dialect

W. Yorks. West (Riding of) Yorkshire dialect

Wel. bord. Welsh border dialect
Wel. Eng. Welsh English
Yorks. Yorkshire dialect

1PP first person pronoun 2PP second person pronoun 3PP third person pronoun

< > enclose graphic symbols (letters of alphabet)

/ / enclose phonemic symbols

Ø zero