> Social goals and social organization Essays in memory of Elisha Pazner



Elisha A. Pazner, 1941-1979. (Photo by June Flanders.)

Social goals and social organization Essays in memory of Elisha Pazner

Edited by LEONID HURWICZ University of Minnesota DAVID SCHMEIDLER Tel-Aviv University HUGO SONNENSCHEIN Princeton University



CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge London New York New Rochelle Melbourne Sydney

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 0521023955 - Social Goals and Social Organization: Essays in Memory of Elisha Pazner Edited by Leonid Hurwicz, David Schmeidler and Hugo Sonnenschein Frontmatter

More information

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521262040

© Cambridge University Press 1985

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1985 This digitally printed first paperback version 2005

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data
Main entry under title:
Social goals and social organization.
Bibliography: p.
Includes index.
Welfare economics – Addresses, essays, lectures.
Distributive justice – Addresses, essays, lectures.
Pazner, Elisha, 1941–1979. I. Pazner, Elisha, 1941–1979. II. Hurwicz, Leonid. III. Schmeidler, David, 1939–. IV. Sonnenschein, Hugo.
HB846.S65 1985 330.15'5 85-6668

ISBN-13 978-0-521-26204-0 hardback ISBN-10 0-521-26204-6 hardback

ISBN-13 978-0-521-02395-5 paperback ISBN-10 0-521-02395-5 paperback

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS FOR THE REPRINTED ARTICLES BY ELISHA PAZNER

"A Difficulty in the Concept of Fairness" (with David Schmeidler), *Review of Economic Studies*, 41(3), 441-443 (1974). Reprinted by permission of the Society for Economic Analysis Ltd.

"Recent Thinking on Economic Justice," *Journal of Peace Science*, 2(1), 143–153 (1976). Reprinted by permission of the Journal of Peace Studies.

"Social Contract Theory and Ordinal Distributive Equity" (with David Schmeidler), *Journal of Public Economics*, 5(3–4), 261–268 (1976). Reprinted by permission of the North-Holland Publishing Company.

"Pitfalls in the Theory of Fairness," *Journal of Economic Theory, 14*(2), 458–466 (1977). Reprinted by permission of the Journal of Economic Theory.

"Cheatproofness Properties of the Plurality Rule in Large Societies" (with Eugene Wesley), *Review of Economic Studies*, 45(1), 85–91 (1978). Reprinted by permission of the Society of Economic Analysis Ltd.

"Egalitarian Equivalent Allocations: A New Concept of Economic Equity" (with David Schmeidler), *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 92(4), 671–687 (1978). Reprinted by permission of John Wiley and Sons, Inc.

Contents

	Elisha A. Pazner Editors' preface	page vii xi
	List of contributors	xii
1	A perspective Leonid Hurwicz	1
	Part I. The surveys	
2	Axioms for social welfare orderings <i>Claude d'Aspremont</i>	19
3	Solutions to the bargaining problem Ehud Kalai	77
4	Theories of justice based on symmetry William Thomson and Hal R. Varian	107
5	Strategy-proofness: the existence of dominant- strategy mechanisms <i>Eitan Muller and Mark A. Satterthwaite</i>	131
6	The theory of implementation in Nash equilibrium: a survey Eric S. Maskin	173
7	Implementation via Nash equilibria in economic environments Andrew Postlewaite	205
8	Bayesian equilibrium and incentive-compatibility: an introduction Roger B. Myerson	229

v

Cambridge University Press
0521023955 - Social Goals and Social Organization: Essays in Memory of Elisha Pazner
Edited by Leonid Hurwicz, David Schmeidler and Hugo Sonnenschein
Frontmatter
More information

vi **Contents**

9	The economics of competitive bidding: a selective survey Paul R. Milgrom	261
	Part II. Six papers by Elisha A. Pazner	
10	A difficulty in the concept of fairness (with David Schmeidler)	293
11	Recent thinking on economic justice	297
12	Social contract theory and ordinal distributive equity (with David Schmeidler)	311
13	Pitfalls in the theory of fairness	321
14	Cheatproofness properties of the plurality rule in large societies (with Eugene Wesley)	331
15	Egalitarian equivalent allocations: a new concept of economic equity (with David Schmeidler)	341
	Author index	359
	Subject index	362

Elisha A. Pazner

Elisha A. Pazner was born on April 16, 1941, in Geneva, Switzerland, and died on March 28, 1979, in Jerusalem. He arrived in Israel in 1953, but left soon after for Argentina because of his father's foreign service position. His compulsory service in the Israeli Defense Force extended from May 1960 until October 1962. Elisha began his study of economics at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem (B.A. 1966) and did graduate work at Harvard University (M.A. 1969, Ph.D. 1971). He was a member of the Department of Economics at Tel-Aviv University from October 1971 until his sudden death. During this time he spent over two years as a visitor at Northwestern University, Evanston, Illinois.

Elisha's interests in economics were quite broad. Although most of his research was in theory and mainly microtheory, he did work in macrotheory, including applications to the Israeli economy. He belonged to the minority of the members of his department who could quote the recent economic indicators of the Israeli economy.

Elisha's main research efforts were devoted to topics in public finance, public economics, general equilibrium analysis, welfare economics, social choice, incentives, and industrial organization. A large share of these works followed a research plan that was only slightly adjusted over the years. He was interested in the welfare evaluation of economic activity. The basic neoclassical premise that an agent's welfare depends only on his own consumption seemed to Elisha too restrictive, and his work on economic equity has helped us to understand how we can reach further. Elisha also emphasized the issue of procedural justice, which had been neglected by most of the profession. This was a major stimulus to his interest in decentralization and allocation mechanisms. As he put it in nonscientific terms, "It matters not only what you get but how you get it." Those who knew Elisha personally are not surprised that he made this point. Many will agree that the "how" is important for human motivation. Elisha believed that it can and should be part of welfare economics and it was the main topic on his research agenda at the time of his death.

Cambridge University Press

0521023955 - Social Goals and Social Organization: Essays in Memory of Elisha Pazner Edited by Leonid Hurwicz, David Schmeidler and Hugo Sonnenschein Frontmatter More information

> Elisha A. Pazner viii

PUBLICATIONS AND RESEARCH PAPERS OF ELISHA A. PAZNER

Ľ Published titles and journal articles (in English)

- Pazner, Elisha A. [1972]. "Merit Wants and the Theory of Taxation." Public Finance, 27:460-472.
- Pazner, Elisha A., and David Schmeidler [1974]. "A Difficulty in the Concept of Fairness." Review of Economic Studies, 41(3):441-443. [Chapter 10, this book
- Pazner, Elisha A., and Assaf Razin [1974]. "Welfare Aspects of Exchange-Rate Uncertainty.." Econometrica, 11(163):256. Pazner, Elisha A., and Assaf Razin [1974]. "A Model of Investment under
- Interest Rate Uncertainty." International Economic Review, 15:798-802.
- Pazner, Elisha A. [1974]. "Economic Principles and Environmental Quality." Quarterly Review of Economics, 21:202-206.
- Pazner, Elisha A. [1975]. "Quality Choice and Monopoly Regulation," Chapter 1 in Regulating the Product, edited by Richard E. Caves and Marc J. Roberts, The Brookings Institution, pp. 3-16. Cambridge, Mass.: Ballinger.
- Pazner, Elisha, A. [1975]. "Optimal Pricing and Income Distribution," Chapter 10 in Regulating the Product, edited by Richard E. Caves and Marc J. Roberts, The Brookings Institution, pp. 201-219. Cambridge, Mass.: Ballinger.
- Pazner, Elisha A., and Richard E. Caves [1975]. "Value of Options, Value of Time and Local Airline Subsidy," Chapter 12 in Regulating the Product, edited by Richard E. Caves and Marc. J. Roberts, The Brookings Institution, pp. 249-268. Cambridge, Mass.: Ballinger.
- Pazner, Elisha A., and Assaf Razin [1975]. "Expected Present value vs. Expected Future Value." The Journal of Finance, 30(3):875-877.
- Pazner, Elisha A., and Assaf Razin [1975]. "Industry Equilibrium under Random Demand." European Economic Review, 6(4):387-395.
- Pazner, Elisha A., and David Schmeidler [1975]. "Competition Analysis under Complete Ignorance." International Economic Review 16 (February):246-257.
- Pazner, Elisha A. [1976]. "Recent Thinking on Economic Justice," Journal of Peace Science, 2(1):143-153. [Chapter 11, this book]
- Pazner, Elisha A. [1976]. "Inflation, Resource Allocation and Income Distribution." Quarterly Review of Economics, 23:417-423 (in Hebrew).
- Pazner, Elisha A., and David Schmeidler [1976]. "Social Contract Theory and Ordinal Distributive Equity." Journal of Public Economics, 5(3-4):261-268. [Chapter 12, this book]
- Pazner, Elisha A., Ehud Kalai, and David Schmeidler [1976]. "Collective Choice Correspondences as Admissible Outcomes of Social Bargaining Processes." Econometrica, 44(2):233-240.
- Pazner, Elisha A., Alex Cukierman, and Assaf Razin [1977]. "A Macroeconomic Model of the Israeli Economy: 1956-1974." Bank of Israel Economic Review, 44:29-64.
- Pazner, Elisha A. [1977]. "Pitfalls in the Theory of Fairness." Journal of Economic Theory, 14(2):458-466. [Chapter 13, this book]

Cambridge University Press

0521023955 - Social Goals and Social Organization: Essays in Memory of Elisha Pazner Edited by Leonid Hurwicz, David Schmeidler and Hugo Sonnenschein Frontmatter More information

Elisha A. Pazner

ix

- Pazner, Elisha A. [1977]. "Comprehensive Income Taxation, Equity and Efficiency." The Israeli Tax Review, 37-38:135-138 (in Hebrew).
- Pazner, Elisha A., and Eugene Wesley [1977]. "Stability of Social Choices in Infinitely Large Societies." Journal of Economic Theory, 14(2):252-262.
- Pazner, Elisha A. [1978]. "Wage Indexation to Prices and Output: A Proposal." Quarterly Review of Economics, 25:188-191 (in Hebrew).
- Pazner, Elisha A., and Eugene Wesley [1978]. "Cheatproofness Properties of the Plurality Rule in Large Societies," *Review of Economic Studies*, 45(1): 85-91. [Chapter 14, this book]
- Pazner, Elisha A., and David Schmeidler [1978]. "Decentralization, Income Distribution and the Role of Money in Socialist Economics." *Economic Inquiry*, 16(2):257-264.
- Pazner, Elisha A., and David Schmeidler [1978]. "Egalitarian Equivalent Allocations: A New Concept of Economic Equity." *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 92(4):671-687. [Chapter 15, this book]
- Pazner, Elisha A. [1978]. "Individual Rationality and the Concept of Social Welfare." Theory and Decision 10(1-4):281-292.
- Pazner, Elisha A. [1979]. "Equity, Nonfeasible Alternatives and Social Choice: A Reconsideration of the Concept of Social Welfare." Aggregation and Revelation of Preferences, edited by Jean-Jacques Laffont, pp. 161–173. Amsterdam: North Holland.
- Pazner, Elisha A. [1979]. "The Characterization of Implementable Choice Rules." Aggregation and Revelation of Preferences, edited by Jean-Jacques Laffont, pp. 349-350. Amsterdam: North Holland.
- Pazner, Elisha A., and Assaf Razin [1980]. "Competitive Efficiency in an Overlapping Generation Model with Endogenous Population." Journal of Public Economics, 13(2):249-258.
- Pazner, Elisha A., and Efraim Sadka [1980]. "Excess-Burden and Economic Surplus as Consistent Welfare Indicators." Journal of Public Finance, 35(2): 249-258.
- Pazner, Elisha A., and Richard A. Musgrave [1980]. "Liability Rules, Equity and Efficiency." Journal of Public Finances, 35(1):1-12.
- Pazner, Elisha A., and Efraim Sadka [1981]. "Welfare Criteria for Tax Reforms-Efficiency Aspects." Journal of Public Economics, 16:113-122.
- Pazner, Elisha A. [1981]. "On Indexation and Macroeconomic Stability," in Development in an Inflationary World, edited by M. June Flanders and Assaf Razin. Sapir Institution, pp. 155-161. New York: Academic Press.

II Unpublished reports

Pazner, Elisha A., and David Schmeidler [1974]. "Just Saving and the Golden Rule." The Foerder Institute for Economic Research, T.R. 38, 8 pages.

Pazner, Elisha A. [1975]. "Distributive Justice, Entitlement Principles and the Original Position." 20 pages.

Editors' preface

Soon after Elisha Pazner's death, the editors of this book gathered together to plan a tribute to his memory. Rather than deciding to give Elisha's many friends the opportunity to provide a paper on a subject of their choice, we decided on a more ambitious undertaking. Our idea was to solicit a collection of surveys on subjects closely associated with Elisha's interest in the design and evaluation of economic mechanisms. We approached some of the people who we felt were making the most outstanding contributions in those areas. Because we believed that bargaining theory and the economics of competitive bidding were especially ripe for surveys, we extended our boundaries to include those topics as well, despite the fact that they fall marginally outside of Elisha's own research interests. We could not be more pleased with the result. It is a tribute to Elisha that so many busy people were willing to put aside their research to prepare these surveys. No areas of economic theory are more active today than those surveyed here; similarly, none are concerned with more basic issues. We have tried to honor Elisha with a book that he would have wanted to have on hand and use for his lectures.

The surveys are preceded by "A Perspective" by Leo Hurwicz. It contains a systematic account of the development of the literature on mechanism design and thus provides a context for both the surveys and the six published papers authored or coauthored by Elisha that follow.

> L. H. D. S. H. S.

xi

Contributors

Claude d'Aspremont Center for Operations Research and Econometrics Université Catholique de Louvain

Leonid Hurwicz Department of Economics University of Minnesota

Ehud Kalai Graduate School of Management Northwestern University

Eric S. Maskin Department of Economics Harvard University

Paul R. Milgrom Department of Economics Yale University

Eitan Muller School of Business Administration University of Jerusalem Roger B. Myerson Graduate School of Management Northwestern University

Andrew Postlewaite Department of Economics University of Pennsylvania

Mark A. Satterthwaite Graduate School of Management Northwestern University

William Thomson Department of Economics University of Rochester

Hal R. Varian Department of Economics University of Michigan