

This study combines an analysis of the argumentative complexities of Romans 1–8 with the presentation of modern theories of how meaning arises and functions. These theories (especially as represented by the semi-otics of Umberto Eco) shed important light on two central questions raised by Paul's method: why does he reason so persistently about matters which depend ultimately on supernatural enlightenment, and why, where he does, are his arguments often so unclear and so hard to reduce to logical consistency? To both questions new answers emerge.



SOCIETY FOR NEW TESTAMENT STUDIES

General Editor: Margaret E. Thrall

MONOGRAPH SERIES

82

WRESTLING WITH RATIONALITY IN PAUL



Wrestling with rationality in Paul

Romans 1-8 in a new perspective

JOHN D. MOORES

Formerly Lecturer in Italian, University College London





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo

Cambridge University Press
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521472234

© Cambridge University Press 1995

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 1995

This digitally printed first paperback version 2005

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Moores, John D.

Wrestling with rationality in Paul: Romans 1-8 in a new perspective / John D. Moores.

p. cm. – (Monograph series / Society for New Testament Studies: 82) Includes bibliographical references and indexes.

ISBN 0 521 47223 7

- 1. Bible. N.T. Romans I-VIII Criticism, interpretation, etc.
- 2. Faith and reason Christianity.
 3. Enthymeme (Logic). I Title.
 II. Series: Monograph series (Society for New Testament Studies): 82
 BS2665.2.M66 1995

227'.1066 - dc 20 94-15199 CIP

ISBN-13 978-0-521-47223-4 hardback ISBN-10 0-521-47223-7 hardback

ISBN-13 978-0-521-01883-8 paperback ISBN-10 0-521-01883-8 paperback



To the memory of my mother and father



Nothing can credibly be proposed as the language of faith which cannot honestly be defended by the person who speaks.

Harmony comes into being through love mediated by language.

G. Ebeling

Pauline theology . . . circles round in ever new attempts to bring out the saving significance of the Cross. It is a theology of the Word because it is only through the word of the Cross that Jesus's death remains present, remains grace, remains promise and covenant; and it is the work of the one who is risen to let this word manifest itself in preaching, in the sacraments and in the Christian life.

E. Käsemann



CONTENTS

	Acknowledgements	page	xii
	List of abbreviations		xiii
	Introduction: The layout of this study and th approach behind it	e	1
1 1.1	Enthymematic semiosis in Paul A semiotic perspective for the study of Pauline argument. Umberto Eco's 'typology of modes of sign		5
1.2	production'. Pauline argument and the rhetorical dimension of hidiscourse. Two lines of approach: the classical and the	is	5
1.3	'new'. Intentionality in Pauline rhetoric. Differing estimate and the assumptions they entail regarding Pauline per suasiveness.		10 16
	From the rhetorical to the sacred dimension. Codin levels in Paul. The role of the enthymeme. Consequences of a semiological perspective. The crisi of rationality in Paul.		21 28
2	Varieties of enthymematic effect in Romans 1–4		33
	The character of the enthymeme. Identifying er thymemes.	1-	33
2.2	The 'power of the gospel'. The enthymematic factor is Romans 1:16–17. Reconstructing the logic of debatable meanings.		37
2.3	Those who are 'without excuse'. Those referred to i 1:20. The one addressed in 2:1. The enthymeme a innuendo.		46
2.4	The 'advantage' of the Jew in the context of universalsin. Affirmation and denial in 3:1–20. The proleptical		
	enthymematic factor.		51

ix



x Contents

	'Boasting' decried; the law upheld in the context of boundary-effacing faith. Romans 4 as key to 3:27–31.	60
2.6	Beyond the enthymematic. Some methodological considerations.	66
3 3.1	Ways in which enthymemes arise in Romans 5–7 The peace of the justified in 5:1 as logically consequent-	68
3 2	ial. Uncertainties of enthymematic implication. The Christian's confident hope; two-sided enthyme-	68
	matic support for 5:5. (The uncertain role of 5:12–21.) Sinning in the interests of grace. The 'knock-down' enthymeme of 6:1. The tangled basis of its confutation	77
	(6:2–11).	81
3.4	Christian eschewal of sin; prescribing what is affirmed. Enthymematic construal of logical anomaly in 6:12. Its sequel.	86
3.5	The spirituality of the law upheld in refutation of the	
3.6	bipartite enthymematic 'Aunt Sally' of 7:7a and 7:13a. Linking the role and status of the enthymeme to how	93
	and when it arises, within the ambit of Romans 5-7.	98
4 4.1	How enthymematic argument stands in Romans 8 The Christian's reprieve and the two 'laws'. The case for seeing 8:1 as an inference enthymematically drawn from 8:2. Different ways of unpacking ἄρα, and their bearing	102
	on the issue.	102
4.2	Mortality, spirituality and filial inheritance. 8:9–17 and the regrounding of the argumentative dynamic through the enthymematic implications of Christian sonship.	111
4.3	From sonship and invincibility to totality of gifting. The enthymemes of 8:31–2: their finality and its re-	
4.4	dimensioning. Security in the love of God. Paul's assurance (8:38) and	118
	its foundation in enthymeme and truism.	122
4.5	Range and limits of the implications of Romans 8 for the role of the enthymeme in Paul's discourse.	129
5	Knowing what tune Paul is playing	132
5.1	Coding and clarity in Guiraud and Prieto. Paul's own	122
5.2	view of communication, and the problem it highlights. Clarity and the enthymeme in Romans 1–8. How should the coding be characterised? Aesthetic and other	132
5 2	approaches.	138
ر.3	Coding in 'fuzzy' perspective. The possible implications for some concepts of Paul's.	145



	Contents	xi
	Interpretation and Isotopy. The value of isotopical analysis. An application to Romans on the basis of 1:12.	153
5.5	Problems and advantages of the foregoing application. Its interaction with my general thesis.	156
	Conclusions reached; their scope assessed	159
	Notes	161
	Bibliography	193
	Index of names	206
	Index of technical terms	210



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I owe an immense debt of gratitude to Professor Leslie Houlden of King's College London, without whose encouragement I would never have brought to completion the London University thesis on which this book is based, and without whose kindly strictures it would never have been publishable.

Where the linguistic dimension of the work is concerned I am deeply appreciative of the ready and reassuring help I have received from Professor Giulio Lepschy of Reading University.

Among numerous other friends who have given me the benefit of their comments and corrections, I would particularly like to mention Mr Mohan Uddin who has read and re-read the text with unfailing patience and care, as well as Miss V. Petrassi, Mr S. Q. K. Underwood and Mr T. Barnes whose collaboration in checking proofs and other details has been invaluable.

I have been constantly aware, in pursuing this enquiry, of how much I owe to the seminars at the London Bible College which first opened my mind to modern hermeneutical and technical approaches to biblical study.

My indebtedness to Professor Eco is evident in the study itself. It arises entirely from the powerful impact upon me of his published writings (in welcome accord with my life's long-standing orientation towards Italian stimuli). I have not sought his approval of my application of his theories or his confirmation of my construal of them. The responsibility is mine if I have misused them.

May I finally add how grateful I am to Dr Thrall and the Society for New Testament Studies for the privilege of being allowed to contribute to their Monograph series.

xii



ABBREVIATIONS

ALBO	Analecta	Lovaniensia	Biblica	et Orientalia
	1 maiocta	Lovaniciona	Dionea	ot Oriontana

AnBib Analecta Biblica

AP Aesthetica Preprint

ATRSS Anglican Theological Review Supplementary Series

AV Authorised Version of the Bible (1611)

BA W. Bauer: Griechisch-deutsches Wörterbuch zu den Schriften des Neuen Testaments und der frühchristlichen Literatur, ed. K. and B. Aland, 6th edn, 1988 (Berlin and NY, de Gruyter)

BAGD W. Bauer: A Greek-English Lexicon of the NT and Other Early Christian Literature, ET of 4th German edn by W. F. Arndt and F. W. Gingrich, 2nd edn revised by F. W. Gingrich and F. W. Danker, 1979 (Chicago UP)

BDF F. Blass, A. Debrunner and R. W. Funk, A Greek Grammar of the NT, 1961 (Chicago UP)

BETh Beiträge zur evangelischen Theologie

Bibl Biblica

BNTC Black's NT Commentaries

BS Bibliotheca Sacra

BTFT Bijdragen, Tijdschrift voor Filosofie en Theologie

BZ Biblische Zeitschrift

BZNW Beihefte zur ZNW

CBQ Catholic Biblical Quarterly

CR Commentary on Romans

CU Communication Unit

DBI A Dictionary of Biblical Interpretation, ed. R. J. Coggins and J. L. Houlden, 1990 (London, SCM)

EB The Expositor's Bible

EKKNT Evangelisch-Katholischer Kommentar zum Neuen Testament

xiii



xiv Abbreviations

ET English translation	n
------------------------	---

ETL Ephemerides Theologicae Lovanienses

EvTh Evangelische Theologie

ExT Expository Times

FRLANT Forschungen zur Religion und Literatur des Alten und Neuen Testaments

FS Festschrift

GTA Göttingen Theologische Arbeiten

HBT Horizons in Biblical Theology

HCHC Hermeneia – A Critical and Historical Commentary on the Bible

HNT Handbuch zum Neuen Testament

HTKNT Herders theologischer Kommentar zum Neuen Testament

HTR Harvard Theological Review

ICC International Critical Commentary

Int Interpretation

JBL Journal of Biblical Literature

JSNT Journal for the Study of the NT

JSNT SS Journal for the Study of the NT, Supplement Series

JTS Journal of Theological Studies

LB Linguistica Biblica

LN J. P. Louw and E. A. Nida: Greek-English Lexicon of the NT, Based on Semantic Domains, 2nd edn, 1989 (NY, UBS)

LSJ H. W. Liddell and R. Scott: A Greek-English Lexicon (revised and augmented by H. Stuart Jones and R. McKenzie), 9th edn, 1940 (Oxford, Clarendon)

LT Lieux Théologiques

LXX Septuagint

MKEK Meyers kritisch-exegetischer Kommentar über das Neue Testament

MM J. H. Moulton and G. Milligan: *The Vocabulary of the Greek Testament*, 1930 (London, Hodder)

MNTC Moffatt NT Commentary

MT Masoretic Text

NEB New English Bible, 1970 (Oxford UP)

Neot Neotestamentica

NICNT New International Commentary on the NT

NIGTC New International Greek Testament Commentary

NovT Novum Testamentum



Abbreviations xv

NovTS Supplements to Novum Testamentum

NTD Das Neue Testament Deutsch

NTS New Testament Studies

PLJP E. P. Sanders, Paul, the Law and the Jewish People, 1985 (London, SCM)

PPJ E. P. Sanders, Paul and Palestinian Judaism, 1977 (London, SCM)

Presb Presbyterion

RB Revue Biblique

Rhet Rhetorica

RSV Revised Standard Version of the Bible, NT 2nd edn 1971, OT 1952

SB H. L. Strack and P. Billerbeck: Kommentar zum Neuen Testament aus Talmud und Midrash, 1926–28 (Munich, Beck'sche)

SBLDS Society of Biblical Literature Dissertation Series

SE Studia Evangelica

Sem Semeia

SJT Scottish Journal of Theology

SNTSMS Society for NT Studies Monograph Series

SNTU Studien zum Neuen Testament und seiner Umwelt

ST Studia Theologica

StB Stuttgarter Bibelstudien

TDNT Theological Dictionary of the NT, ed. G. Kittel and G. Friedrich (ET), 1964–76 (Grand Rapids, Eerdmans)

Theol Theology

TNTC Tyndale NT Commentary

TPINTC Trinity Press International NT Commentaries

TQ Theologische Quartalschrift

TS U. Eco, A Theory of Semiotics, 1976 (Bloomington, Indiana UP)

TSG U. Eco, Trattato di semiotica generale, 10th edn 1987 (Milan, Bompiani)

TZ Theologische Zeitschrift

UCr H. Cremer: Biblico-theological Lexicon of NT Greek, ET from German edn of W. Urwick, 4th edn 1895 (Edinburgh, Clark)

WBC Word Biblical Commentary

WGTh Greek-English Lexicon of the NT, ET (revised and enlarged) by J. H. Thayer of Grimm's Wilke's Clavis Novi Testamenti, 4th edn 1901 (Edinburgh, Clark)



xvi Abbreviations

WMANT Wissenschaftliche Monographien zum Alten und Neuen Testament WUNT Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament

ZNW Zeitschrift für die Neutestamentliche Wissenschaft

ZTK Zeitschrift für Theologie und Kirche