THE CAMBRIDGE COMPANION TO BRENTANO

Franz Brentano (1838–1917) led an intellectual revolution that sought to revitalize German-language philosophy and to reverse its post-Kantian direction. His philosophy laid the groundwork for philosophy of science as it came to fruition in the Vienna Circle, and for phenomenology in the work of such figures as his student Edmund Husserl. This volume brings together newly commissioned chapters on his important work in theory of intentionality, theory of judgment, the reform of syllogistic logic, empirical descriptive psychology and phenomenology, theory of knowledge, metaphysics and ontology, value theory, and natural theology. It also offers a critical evaluation of Brentano's significance in his historical context, and of his impact on contemporary philosophy in both the analytic and the continental traditions.

DALE JACQUETTE is Professor of Philosophy at The Pennsylvania State University. His recent books include David Hume's Critique of Infinity (2001), Symbolic Logic (2001) and Ontology (2002).

> OTHER VOLUMES IN THE SERIES OF CAMBRIDGE COMPANIONS AQUINAS Edited by NORMAN KRETZMANN and **ELEONORE STUMP** HANNAH ARENDT Edited by DANA VILLA ARISTOTLE Edited by jonathan barnes AUGUSTINE Edited by ELEONORE STUMP and NORMAN KRETZMANN BACON Edited by MARKKU PELTONEN SIMONE DE BEAUVOIR Edited by claudia card DARWIN Edited by JONATHAN HODGE and GREGORY RADICK DESCARTES Edited by JOHN COTTINGHAM DUNS SCOTUS Edited by THOMAS WILLIAMS EARLY GREEK PHILOSOPHY Edited by A. A. LONG FEMINISM IN PHILOSOPHY Edited by MIRANDA FRICKER and JENNIFER HORNSBY FOUCAULT Edited by GARY GUTTING FREUD Edited by JEROME NEU GALILEO Edited by PETER MACHAMER GERMAN IDEALISM Edited by KARL AMERIKS GREEK AND ROMAN PHILOSOPHY Edited by DAVID SEDLEY HABERMAS Edited by STEPHEN K. WHITE HEGEL Edited by FREDERICK BEISER HEIDEGGER Edited by CHARLES GUIGNON HOBBES Edited by TOM SORELL HUME Edited by DAVID FATE NORTON HUSSERL Edited by BARRY SMITH and DAVID WOODRUFF SMITH WILLIAM JAMES Edited by RUTH ANNA PUTNAM KANT Edited by PAUL GUYER KIERKEGAARD Edited by ALASTAIR HANNAY and GORDON MARINO LEIBNIZ Edited by NICHOLAS JOLLEY LEVINAS Edited by SIMON CRITCHLEY and ROBERT BERNASCONI LOCKE Edited by VERE CHAPPELL MALEBRANCHE Edited by STEVEN NADLER MARX Edited by TERRELL CARVER

> MEDIEVAL JEWISH PHILOSOPHY Edited by DANIEL H. FRANK and OLIVER LEAMAN MEDIEVAL PHILOSOPHY Edited by A. S. MCGRADE MILL Edited by JOHN SKORUPSKI NEWTON Edited by I. BERNARD COHEN and GEORGE E. SMITH NIETZSCHE Edited by BERND MAGNUS and KATHLEEN HIGGINS OCKHAM Edited by PAUL VINCENT SPADE PASCAL Edited by NICHOLAS HAMMOND PLATO Edited by RICHARD KRAUT PLOTINUS Edited by LLOYD P. GERSON RAWLS Edited by SAMUEL FREEMAN ROUSSEAU Edited by PATRICK RILEY BERTRAND RUSSELL Edited by NICHOLAS GRIFFIN SARTRE Edited by CHRISTINA HOWELLS SCHOPENHAUER Edited by CHRISTOPHER JANAWAY THE SCOTTISH ENLIGHTENMENT Edited by ALEXANDER BROADIE SPINOZA Edited by DON GARRETT THE STOICS Edited by BRAD INWOOD WITTGENSTEIN Edited by HANS SLUGA and DAVID STERN

The Cambridge Companion to **BRENTANO**

Edited by Dale Jacquette The Pennsylvania State University



CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-00765-8 - The Cambridge Companion to Brentano Edited by Dale Jacquette Frontmatter <u>More information</u>

> PUBLISHED BY THE PRESS SYNDICATE OF THE UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE The Pitt Building, Trumpington Street, Cambridge, United Kingdom

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge, CB2 2RU, UK 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011-4211, USA 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia Ruiz de Alarcón 13, 28014 Madrid, Spain Dock House, The Waterfront, Cape Town 8001, South Africa

http://www.cambridge.org

© Cambridge University Press 2004

This book is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2004

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

Typeface Trump Medieval 10/13 pt. System $\&T_EX 2_{\mathcal{E}}$ [TB]

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data
The Cambridge companion to Brentano / edited by Dale Jacquette.
p. cm. - (Cambridge companions to philosophy)
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 0 521 80980 0 ISBN 0 521 00765 8 (pbk.)
I. Brentano, Franz Clemens, 1838-1917. 2. Philosophy, Austrian 19th century. 3. Philosophy, Austrian - 20th century. I. Title: Brentano.
II. Jacquette, Dale. III. Series.
B3212.Z7C35 2004
193 - dc21 2003053215

ISBN 0 521 80980 0 hardback ISBN 0 521 00765 8 paperback

> Vera philosophiae methodus nulla alia nisi scientiae naturalis est. — Franz Brentano, 1866

To the memory of Roderick M. Chisholm

CONTENTS

	List of contributors	page xiii
	Acknowledgments	xvii
	List of abbreviations	xviii
	Chronology	xx
I	Introduction: Brentano's philosophy DALE JACQUETTE	I
2	Brentano's relation to Aristotle ROLF GEORGE AND GLEN KOEHN	20
3	Judging correctly: Brentano and the reform of elementary logic PETER SIMONS	45
4	Brentano on the mind KEVIN MULLIGAN	66
5	Brentano's concept of intentionality DALE JACQUETTE	98
6	Reflections on intentionality JOSEPH MARGOLIS	131
7	Brentano's epistemology LINDA L. MCALISTER	149
8	Brentano on judgment and truth CHARLES PARSONS	168

xii Contents

9	Brentano's ontology: from conceptualism to reism ARKADIUSZ CHRUDZIMSKI AND BARRY SMITH	197
10	Brentano's value theory: beauty, goodness, and the concept of correct emotion WILHELM BAUMGARTNER AND LYNN PASQUERELLA	220
II	Brentano on religion and natural theology susan f. krantz gabriel	237
12	Brentano and Husserl ROBIN D. ROLLINGER	255
13	Brentano's impact on twentieth-century philosophy KARL SCHUHMANN	277
	Bibliography	298
	Index	316

CONTRIBUTORS

WILHELM BAUMGARTNER is Professor of Philosophy and Director of the Franz Brentano Forschung at the University of Würzburg, Germany. He is the editor of Brentano Studien: Internationales Jahrbuch der Franz Brentano Forschung, and the author of numerous articles on Brentano, his school, and on philosophy in the phenomenological tradition. He has edited, together with Roderick M. Chisholm, Brentano's Deskriptive Psychologie, and has assisted with several translations of works by Brentano into Polish, Slovenian, Italian, and Romanian. He is currently Chairman of the Internationale Franz Brentano Gesellschaft (www.franz-brentano.de), and as Director of the Brentano Forschung preserves the Brentano Nachlaß to make it available for research. Baumgartner is currently preparing Brentano's Lectures on Metaphysics and Scientific Correspondence for publication.

ARKADIUSZ CHRUDZIMSKI is research assistant at the University of Salzburg, Austria, and assistant professor at the University of Zielona Gûra, Poland. He is the author of *Die Erkenntnistheorie von Roman Ingarden* and *Intentionalitätstheorie beim frühen Brentano*, in addition to articles on ontology, epistemology, phenomenology and Austrian philosophy.

ROLF GEORGE is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Waterloo, Canada, where he has taught since 1966. His publications include English translations of Brentano's work on Aristotle, On the Several Senses of Being in Aristotle, The Psychology of Aristotle, and, with Roderick M. Chisholm, Aristotle and his World View. He also edited Brentano's Aristotelian manuscripts, Über Aristoteles. He is

xiv List of contributors

the author of articles on a variety of topics including logic, Austrian philosophy, eighteenth-century philosophy and distributive justice.

DALE JACQUETTE is Professor of Philosophy at The Pennsylvania State University. He is the author of articles on logic, metaphysics, philosophy of mind, and Wittgenstein, and has recently published Philosophy of Mind, Meinongian Logic: the Semantics of Existence and Nonexistence, Wittgenstein's Thought in Transition, David Hume's Critique of Infinity, Symbolic Logic, On Boole, and Ontology, and edited a collection on Schopenhauer, Philosophy, and the Arts and the Blackwell Companion to Philosophical Logic. He is currently editor of American Philosophical Quarterly.

GLEN KOEHN is Adjunct Associate Professor at the University of Maryland, University College. He has taught at South Korean universities, and has had longstanding interests in both Brentano and Aristotle. His recent paper on Aristotelian ethics, "Human Goodness and the Golden Mean," appeared in the *Journal of Value Inquiry*.

SUSAN F. KRANTZ GABRIEL is Professor of Philosophy at St. Anselm College, New Hampshire. She is editor and translator of the English edition of Brentano's lectures on natural theology, On the Existence of God, and author of Refuting Peter Singer's Ethical Theory: The Importance of Human Dignity, as well as articles on Brentano and other subjects.

JOSEPH MARGOLIS is Laura H. Carnell Professor of Philosophy at Temple University, Philadelphia. He has published widely in a variety of specialities. His most recent books include: Selves and Other Texts and Reinventing Pragmatism: American Philosophy at the End of the Twentieth Century. He has recently completed The Unraveling of Scientism and The Advantages of a Second-Best Morality.

LINDA L. MCALISTER is Professor Emerita at the University of South Florida. She has taught at San Diego State University, Brooklyn College, the CUNY Graduate Center, and UCLA. Her dissertation was on Brentano's ethics and she was subsequently engaged by the Franz Brentano Foundation to prepare the English edition of Brentano's *Psychologie vom empirischen Standpunkt*. After publishing other works on Brentano she turned her attention to feminist philosophy. She edited *Hypatia: a Journal of Feminist Philosophy* List of contributors

for several years and she is editor of *Hypatia's Daughters*, a collection of articles about women in the history of philosophy.

KEVIN MULLIGAN is Professor of Analytic Philosophy at the University of Geneva, Switzerland. He has recently edited (with J.-P. Cometti) La Philosophie autrichienne de Bolzano à Musil: histoire et actualité, and (with B. Baertschi) Les Nationalismes, and is the author of numerous articles on ontology, perception, emotions and values, Wittgenstein and Austro-German philosophies of mind.

CHARLES PARSONS is Edgar Pierce Professor of Philosophy at Harvard University. He has written on logic, philosophy of logic and mathematics, Kant, Husserl, Gödel, and other figures. He is co-editor of volumes III–V of the *Collected Works* of Kurt Gödel and author of *Mathematics in Philosophy* and *Mathematical Thought and its Objects*.

LYNN PASQUERELLA is Professor of Philosophy and Chair of the Institutional Review Board at the University of Rhode Island. She is a Fellow in the John Hazen White Sr. Center for Ethics and Public Service, a past recipient of the University of Rhode Island's Teaching Excellence Award, and has published extensively in the areas of medical ethics, theoretical and applied ethics, public policy, and the philosophy of law.

ROBIN D. ROLLINGER is assistant to the Husserl Archives in Louvain, Belgium. He is the author of two books, *Meinong and Husserl on Abstraction and Universals* and *Husserl's Position in the School of Brentano*, as well as various articles on phenomenology and its background in nineteenth- and early twentieth-century philosophy, psychology, and logic. He is editor of a volume of writings from Husserl's literary remains on transcendental idealism, to appear in the *Husserliana* series, and is currently editing a volume of writings from Husserl's extensive literary remains on the theory of judgment for the *Husserliana*.

KARL SCHUHMANN was Professor of History of Post-Medieval Philosophy at Utrecht University in The Netherlands. In addition to numerous articles on Renaissance philosophy and seventeenthcentury mechanism, especially Hobbes, he published many articles

xv

xvi List of contributors

on the Brentano school. He was editor of Husserl's *Ideen I*, and, together with Elisabeth Schuhmann, of Husserl's *Briefwechsel*. In 1984, with J. N. Mohanty, he founded the journal Husserl Studies. His books include *Die Fundamentalbetrachtung der Phänomenologie*, Husserl-Chronik, and Husserls Staatsphilosophie.

PETER SIMONS is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Leeds, UK. He is the author of two books: *Parts* and *Philosophy and Logic in Central Europe from Bolzano to Tarski*, as well as over 150 articles, including several on Brentano. His interests include metaphysics, logic, the history of Austrian and Polish philosophy and logic, the philosophy of mathematics, and the application of ontology to engineering and business. He is currently Director of the Franz Brentano Foundation.

BARRY SMITH is Julian Park Professor of Philosophy at State University of New York (SUNY), Buffalo, and Director of the Institute for Formal Ontology and Medical Information Science at the University of Leipzig, Germany. He is the author of Austrian Philosophy: the Legacy of Franz Brentano, and has translated Brentano's Philosophical Investigations on Space, Time and the Continuum. He has worked extensively in ontology and in the history of Germanlanguage philosophy, and his current research is focused on the applications of formal ontology in information science. He was recently awarded the Wolfgang Paul Prize of the Alexander von Humboldt Foundation.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I am grateful first and foremost to the authors for their excellent contributions to this volume of previously unpublished essays on the philosophy of Franz Clemens Brentano. I am indebted also to Hilary Gaskin, philosophy editor at Cambridge University Press, for her professional guidance of this project, and for cultivating an atmosphere of partnership with the press in the book's production. I acknowledge the Alexander von Humboldt-Stiftung for its generous assistance in sponsoring my research at the Franz Brentano Forschung, Julius-Maximilians-Universität, Würzburg, Germany, during my sabbatical leave from The Pennsylvania State University in 2000-1, when the planning and organization of the book was undertaken. I thank Tina (Traas) Jacquette for her love and marathon philosophical conversations. Reinhard Fabian of the Forschungsstelle und Dokumentationszentrum för österreichische Philosophie, Graz, Austria, provided the digital photograph of Brentano which appears on the book's cover, image-enhanced by Scott K. Templeton, to whom warmest thanks are also due. Finally, Karl Schuhmann, contributor to this volume and longtime Brentano scholar of distinction, passed away as this book was in preparation. He is warmly remembered as a philosopher, historian, exacting critic of many philosphical traditions, and admired friend.

Dale Jacquette

т

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-00765-8 - The Cambridge Companion to Brentano Edited by Dale Jacquette Frontmatter More information

ABBREVIATIONS

ORIGINAL GERMAN TEXTS

The following abbreviations are used throughout in referring to Brentano's most frequently consulted writings; publication details are given in the Bibliography.

1	ORIGINAL GERMAN TEXTS
ANR	Die Abkehr vom Nichtrealen
AW	Aristoteles und seine Weltanschauung
DG	Vom Dasein Gottes
DP-G	Deskriptive Psychologie
GA	Grundzüge der Aesthetik
GAE	Grundlegung und Aufbau der Ethik
HS	Ad disputationem qua theses gratiosi philosorum
	ordinis consensu et auctoritate pro impetranda venia
	docendi in alma universitate julio-maximiliana
	defendet (25 Habilitationsschrift defense theses)
KL	Kategorienlehre
KPP	Von der Klassifikation der psychischen Phänomene
LRU	Die Lehre vom richtigen Urteil
MBS	Von der mannigfachen Bedeutung des Seienden nach
	Aristoteles (Dissertation)
MWO	Meine letzten Wünsche für Österreich
PA-G	Die Psychologie des Aristoteles, insbesondere seine
	Lehre vom Nous Poietikos (Habilitationsschrift)
PES-G	Psychologie vom empirischen Standpunkt
RP	Religion und Philosophie
RZK	Philosophische Untersuchungen zu Raum, Zeit und
	Kontinuum

xviii

List of abbreviations

xix

SNB	Vom sinnlichen und noetischen Bewußtein:
	Psychologie vom empirischen Standpunkt III
UA	Über Aristoteles
USE	Vom Ursprung sittlicher Erkenntnis
USP	Untersuchungen zur Sinnespsychologie
VE	Versuch über die Erkenntnis
VPP	Die vier Phasen der Philosophie und ihr augenblicklicher Stand
WE	Wahrheit und Evidenz
ZF	Über die Zukunft der Philosophie
2	STANDARD ENGLISH TRANSLATIONS
AWV	Aristotle and his World View
DP-E	Descriptive Psychology
EG	On the Existence of God: Lectures Given at the
	Universities of Würzburg and Vienna (1868–91)
FCE	The Foundation and Construction of Ethics
KRW	The Origin of the Knowledge of Right and Wrong
PA-E	The Psychology of Aristotle: in Particular his Doctrine
	of the Active Intellect
PES-E	Psychology from an Empirical Standpoint
SNC	Sensory and Noetic Consciousness: Psychology from an
0110	Empirical Standpoint III
SSB	On the Several Senses of Being in Aristotle
STC	Philosophical Investigations on Space, Time, and the
010	Continuum
TC	The Theory of Categories
	The True and the Evident
TE	

CHRONOLOGY

16 January 1838	Born, Franz Clemens Honoratus Hermann
	Brentano, in Marienberg am Rhein (near
	Boppard), Germany
1855-6	Studies at and graduates from the
	Aschaffenburger Gymnasiums Studium der
	Philosophie am Lyzeum
1857-8	Attends Philosophische Fakultät der
	Universität München (Munich) (three
	semesters)
1858	Transfers to Bayerische-Julius-
	Maximilians-Universität, Würzburg,
	Germany (one semester); studies philosophy
	and theology; later in the year moves to
	Berlin and attends two semester lecture
	courses by Aristotle scholar F. A.
	Trendelenburg in Berlin
1859–60	Studies medieval Aristotelian (Scholastic)
	philosophy at Münster Akademie
1862	Completes doctoral dissertation at the
	philosophische Fakultät Tübingen, On the
	Manifold Sense of Being in Aristotle (Von
	der mannigfachen Bedeutung des Seienden
	<i>bei Aristoteles</i>); publishes as first book;
	brief visit to Dominican monastery in Graz,
	Austria
1863	Begins theological studies in Munich
1864	Enters Theologisches Seminar at the
	Universität Würzburg; completes

хx

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-00765-8 - The Cambridge Companion to Brentano Edited by Dale Jacquette Frontmatter More information

Chronology	xxi
August 6, 1864 1865	theological studies and preparation for priesthood Ordained as Catholic priest Writes Habilitationsschrift in Philosophische Fakultät der Universität
	Würzburg on The Psychology of Aristotle, in Particular his Doctrine of the Active Intellect (Die Psychologie des Aristoteles, insbesondere seine Lehre vom Nous Poietikos)
July 15, 1866	Gives public defense of twenty-five Habilitationsschrift theses in Würzburg; declares natural science to be the only correct method of philosophy
1866–70	Begins lecturing in philosophy at Würzburg; students during this period notably include Carl Stumpf, Anton Marty, Hermann Schell, Georg von Herling and Ernst Commer
1870	Embroiled in controversy concerning papal infallibility, the outcome of which eventually causes him to give up the priesthood
1872	Appointed Professor Extraordinarius (promoted from Privatdozent) at Würzburg; travels to England and meets Herbert Spencer, Cardinal Newman, and William Robertson Smith; corresponds with John Stuart Mill; Mill dies before their anticipated meeting
April 11, 1873	Renounces holy orders over conscientious objections to doctrine of papal infallibility
January 22, 1874	Appointed Professor Ordinarius at the University of Vienna; students during this period notably include Franz Hillebrand, Edmund Husserl, Alexius Meinong, Alois Höfler, Christian von Ehrenfels, Thomas G. Masaryk, Josef Kreibig, Emil Arleth, Kazimierz Twardowski, Alfred Berger, and

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 978-0-521-00765-8 - The Cambridge Companion to Brentano Edited by Dale Jacquette Frontmatter More information

xxii	Chronology	
		Baron von Pidoll; lectures also attended by Sigmund Freud
1874		Publishes masterwork <i>Psychology from an</i> <i>Empirical Standpoint (Psychologie vom</i> <i>empirischen Standpunkt)</i>
1880		Renounces Austrian citizenship in order to marry as former priest, otherwise not recognized under Austrian law of the time; gives up Vienna professorship with the understanding that it will later be restored; afterward allowed to return to lecture at the University of Vienna only as Privatdozent (not permitted as such to supervise Ph.D. theses in philosophy); recovers former German citizenship
Septen	nber 16, 1880	Marries Ida von Lieben
1888		Birth of son, Johannes Brentano
1894		Death of Ida
1895		Retires as Privatdozent from the University of Vienna; leaves Vienna in April; travels to Switzerland and settles in Florence, Italy; becomes Italian citizen
1897		Marries Emilie Rueprecht
1897–1	911	Active period of publication and
		philosophical correspondence outside academia
May, 1	915	Leaves Florence and moves to Zurich, Switzerland, when Italy enters World War I
March	17, 1917	Dies in Zurich and is buried in Sihlfeld Cemetery; later reinterred in family plot in Aschaffenburg, Germany