

#### REAL ETHICS

John Rist surveys the history of ethics from Plato to the present and offers a vigorous defence of an ethical theory based on a revised version of Platonic realism. In a wide-ranging discussion he examines well-known alternatives to Platonism, in particular Epicurus, Hobbes, Hume and Kant, as well as contemporary 'practical reasoners', and argues that most post-Enlightenment theories of morality (as well as Nietzschean subversions of such theories) depend on an abandoned Christian metaphysic and are unintelligible without such grounding. He also argues that contemporary choice-based theories, whether they take a strictly ethical or more obviously political form, are ultimately arbitrary in nature. His lively and accessible study is informed by a powerful sense of philosophical history, and will be of interest to both students and scholars of ethics.

JOHN M. RIST is Professor Emeritus of Philosophy and Classics at the University of Toronto. His publications include *Plotinus: The Road to Reality* (Cambridge University Press, 1967), *The Mind of Aristotle* (University of Toronto Press, 1989), *Augustine: Ancient Thought Baptized* (Cambridge University Press, 1994), and many journal articles.





# **REAL ETHICS**

Reconsidering the Foundations of Morality

JOHN M. RIST





#### CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press
The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521006088

© John M. Rist 2002

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2002 Third printing 2004

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication Data Rist, John M.

Real Ethics: Reconsidering the Foundations of Morality / John M. Rist.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0 521 80921 5 (hc) — ISBN 0 521 00608 2 (pbk.)

I. Ethics. 2. Realism. 3. Ethics — History. I. Title.

BJ1012. R53 2001

170 — dc21 2001035254

ISBN 978-0-521-80921-4 Hardback ISBN 978-0-521-00608-8 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate. Information regarding prices, travel timetables, and other factual information given in this work is correct at the time of first printing but Cambridge University Press does not guarantee the accuracy of such information thereafter.



### **Contents**

Acknowledgements		<i>page</i> vii
	Introduction: Ethical crises old and new	I
I	Moral nihilism: Socrates vs. Thrasymachus	ΙO
2	Morals and metaphysics Plato's metaphysical grounding of morality From Plato to Augustine Towards alternatives to Platonic realism	27 27 38
3	The soul and the self Multiple selves Core self or future soul? Moral vs. ontological accounts of man Agent-relative reductionism Morality, humanity and the soul	45 61 61 72 83 88 92
4	Division and its remedies Psychological incompleteness Towards integration: love and reflection Towards integration: love and friendship An alternative proposal: politics and virtue without metaphysics	95 95 100 108
5	Rules and applications Some uses of rules Dirty hands The limits of fairness	119 119 130
6	The past, present and future of practical reasoning Post-realist moral debate Aristotle's ethics: between Platonism and 'practical reasoning' Aristotle, Aquinas and the goals of life	140 140 142 151



vi	Contents	
	Old battles transformed: Hume and naturalism Kant and post-Kantian practical reasoning	156 163
7	Autonomy and choice	ı 78
	Rights, needs and wants	ı 78
	Choice: history and prospects	188
	Choice, continuing moral identity and responsibility	194
	Freedom, habit and the good life	199
8	Ethics and ideology	205
	Responsibility, correction and community	205
	Realism or ideological deception?	222
	From ethics to politics	228
	The end of history and the ahistorical individual	241
9	God and ethics	257
	Realist ethics and divine commands	<sup>257</sup>
	God, 'dirty hands' and the possibility of politics	264
	Philosophy and theology: tactics and honest traditions	271
Bil	bliography	285
Index		202
1/WEA		



## Acknowledgements

During the dozen or so years in which I have been thinking specifically about the themes of this study, I have incurred many philosophical debts: not least because, after three or four years, I realized that I should be much better equipped if I had a deeper knowledge of Augustine, on whom I eventually published a book in 1994. I should therefore thank those students in Toronto who took PHI 200 and 300 (Ethics), and those who followed my tortuous attempts to give graduate seminars on Augustine which made both historical and philosophical sense.

Of the many colleagues and friends who helped at different stages I should first mention Elmar Kremer, who properly savaged parts of the second version of the text. A precursor of parts of chapters 1 and 2 was discussed at a Boston Area Colloquium in Ancient Philosophy meeting at Holy Cross College, Worcester, Massachusetts, and I should thank all those who took part in the constructive debate, especially Rachel Barney. Some of my more wide-ranging suggestions were offered and published as an Aquinas lecture at Marquette University, and I thank John Jones and the Marquette Department of Philosophy - not to mention their visiting professor Arthur Madigan SJ of Boston College – for providing such a comfortable location to try things out and for asking awkward questions about the notion of the common good. The Augustinianum in Rome has provided me with an appropriate locale for the final stages of the book, and I owe a special debt to its Director, Professor Angelo di Berardino, and to Professors Robert Dodaro, Allan Fitzgerald and George Lawless, all of the Order of Saint Augustine, for all kinds of help and encouragement.

Dr Hilary Gaskin of the Cambridge University Press has always been a most helpful editor, and I should like to indicate my appreciation to the two anonymous Press readers for their very constructive comments, which led to substantial improvements, particularly in my treatment of Epicurus and Hume.

vii



viii

Acknowledgements

One always kicks philosophical ideas around in the family, and my children have often contributed (wittingly or unwittingly) to the debate I have tried to record, and I close with my regular homage to the merciless survey of both language and argument to which Anna Rist subjected two would-be final versions of my entire text. She has shared the thinking with me and in hundreds of places has helped me get the argument right and lucid.

With non-professional readers in mind, I have tried to ensure that the text can be understood without reference to the footnotes.