

### Innovation under the Radar

Investigating the nature, drivers and sources of innovation in Africa, this book examines the channels for effective diffusion of innovation in and to Africa under institutional, resource and affordability constraints. Xiaolan Fu draws on almost a decade of research on innovation in Africa to explore these issues and unpack the process, combining a rigorous statistical analysis of a purposely designed multi-wave, multi-country survey with in-depth studies of representative cases. Building on this research, Fu argues that African firms are innovative but unsupported. Those 'under-the-radar' innovations that widely exist in Africa as a result of the constraints are not sufficient to enable Africa to leapfrog the innovation gap in the era of the Fourth Industrial Revolution. This is the first comprehensive analysis of the creation and diffusion of innovation in low-income countries. It also provides the first survey-based analysis of innovation in the informal economy.

Xiaolan Fu is the Founding Director of the Technology and Management Centre for Development and Professor of Technology and International Development at the University of Oxford. She led the UK Foreign, Commonwealth and Development Office (FCDO) and Economic and Social Research Council (ESRC) funded research on 'Diffusion of Innovation in Low-income Countries' and is appointed by the Secretary-General of the United Nations to the Council of the Technology Bank for the Least Developed Countries and the 10-Member High-Level Advisory Group of the Technology Facilitation Mechanism for sustainable development.



# Innovation under the Radar

The Nature and Sources of Innovation in Africa

Xiaolan Fu

University of Oxford







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781316634219

DOI: 10.1017/9781316869482

© Xiaolan Fu 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2020

First paperback edition 2024

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Names: Fu, Xiaolan, 1967- author.

Title: Innovation under the radar: the nature and sources of innovation in Africa /

Description: 1 Edition. | New York : Cambridge University Press, 2020. |

Includes bibliographical references and index.

 $Identifiers: LCCN\ 2020024233\ |\ ISBN\ 9781107183100\ (hardback)\ |\ ISBN\$ 

9781316869482 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Technological innovations – Africa. | Information technology –

Economic aspects - Africa.

Classification: LCC HC800.Z9 F8 2020 | DDC 338/.064096-dc23

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2020024233

ISBN 978-1-107-18310-0 Hardback ISBN 978-1-316-63421-9 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



To my beloved dad Baisong, mum Hualin, for the love that enlightened my life; husband Shaohui and son Yujie, for your love and support over the years.



## Contents

	List of Figures	page ix
	List of Tables	xii
	Foreword	xvii
	Acknowledgements	xix
1	Introduction	1
2	Innovation in Low-Income Countries: Received Wisdom	16
3	The Economy of Ghana and Tanzania: An Overview	43
P	art I The Nature and Domestic Sources of Innovation in Africa	63
4	Innovation under the Radar as a Response to Constraints The Nature of Innovation in Africa (with G. Zanello)	: 65
5	Open Innovation as a Response to Constraints and Risks: The Role of Collaboration, Universities, Clusters and Value Chains	105
6	Innovation and Growth of African Firms: Survival and Growth	125
7	Women Entrepreneurs and Innovation in Ghana (with M. Muchie and A. Egbetokun)	152
8	The Role of the State in Innovation in Africa (with G. Essegbey and B. Diyamett)	188
Pa	art II The Diffusion of Foreign Innovation into Africa	215
9	The Diffusion of Foreign Innovation to Africa: The Role of Trade, FDI and Diasporas	217
		vii



viii

240
265
267
284
303
315
339 358 365 410



# Figures

2.1	Framework of diffusion of innovation in LICs	page 42
3.1	Top five partners of import, Ghana and Tanzania	50
3.2	Top five partners of export, Ghana and Tanzania	50
3.3	Intra-Africa trade, Ghana and Tanzania (2006–2016)	51
3.4	FDI flows, Ghana and Tanzania (2006–2016)	52
3.5	Mobile phone subscription in Ghana and Tanzania (per 10	00
	people)	55
3.6	Size and development of the informal economy in Ghana an	ıd
	Tanzania	61
4.1	Proportion of innovative firms (by nature of firm) in Ghana	a 73
4.2	Proportion of innovative firms (by nature of firm) in Tanzan	ia 74
4.3	Proportion of firms active in innovations: (left) by nature o	f
	innovation and (right) by nature of innovation and firm in	
	Ghana (2015)	75
4.4	Proportion of firms active in innovations: (left) by nature o	f
	innovation and (right) by nature of innovation and firm in	
	Tanzania (2015)	76
4.5	Proportion of firms' engagement in new-to-the-firm and	
	new-to-the-world product/process innovations in 2015: (left	
	by nature of innovation and (right) by sector of firm in Ghar	
4.6	Proportion of firms' engagement in new-to-the-firm and new	V-
	to-the-world product/process innovations in 2015: (left) by	
	nature of innovation and (right) by sector of firm in Tanzan	
4.7	Importance of obstacles to innovation for formal (solid line	<del>:</del> )
	and informal (dotted line) Ghanaian firms in 2015 (1 =	
	insignificant, 5 = crucial, average values)	83
4.8	Importance of obstacles to innovation for formal (grey) and	
	informal (black) Tanzanian firms in 2015 (1 = insignifican	-
	5 = crucial, average values)	84
4.9	1	ed
	lines) and informal (solid lines) Ghanaian firms in 2015	
	(1 = insignificant, 5 = crucial, average values)	96
		ix



## x List of Figures

4.10	Importance of local sources of information for formal (dotted lines) and informal (solid lines) Tanzanian firms in 2015 (1 = insignificant, 5 = crucial, average values)	97
5.1	Number of firms in Ghana that are members of a vertical production network consisting of SMEs and origin of the	<i>,</i> ,
	network	120
5.2	Benefits of being part of a vertical production network: (I) produce something that firms in the country would otherwise not be able to produce, (II) make existing products cheaper or	
	of better quality	122
6.1	The success of the innovations introduced by informal (grey line) and formal (black line) firms in Ghana in 2015	
	(irrelevant = 0, high = 3, average values)	129
6.2	The success of the innovations introduced by informal (grey lines) and formal (black lines) firms in Tanzania in 2015	
	(irrelevant = 0 to high = 3, average values)	130
6.3	Distribution of labour productivity by level of formality of the firms	148
7.1	Interaction effects of manager's attributes and gender on	
	product innovation	169
7.2	Contrasts (statistical significance) of the predictive margins	
	reported in Figure 7.1	170
8.1	Reasons for not participating in training programmes for	
	formal and informal firms: (left) percentages of different	
	reasons and (right) numbers of formal and informal firms for	106
0.0	each reason	196
0.2	Reasons for not receiving subsidized rate loans for formal and informal firms: (left) percentages of different reasons and	
	(right) numbers of formal and informal firms for each reason	198
83	Reasons for not participating in training programmes for	190
0.5	formal and informal firms in Ghana (2015): (left) percentages	
	of different reasons and (right) numbers of formal and	
	informal firms for each reason	204
8.4	Reasons for not participating in training programmes for	
	formal and informal firms in Tanzania (2015): (left)	
	percentages of different reasons and (right) numbers of	
	formal and informal firms for each reason	206
8.5	Reasons for not receiving subsidized rate loans for formal and	
	informal firms in Ghana (2015): (left) percentages of	
	different reasons and (right) numbers of formal and informal	
	firms for each reason	207



	List of Figures	xi
8.6	Reasons for not receiving subsidized rate loans for formal and informal firms in Tanzania (2015): (left) percentages of	
	different reasons and (right) numbers of formal and informal	
	firms for each reason	208
9.1	Proportion of countries of origin (left) by innovations and	
	(right) by nature of firm, of technological and management	
	innovations, in Ghana (2015)	219
9.2	Proportion of countries of origin (left) by innovations and	
	(right) by nature of firm, of technological and management	220
0.0	innovations, in Tanzania (2015)	220
9.3	Importance of foreign sources of knowledge and innovation	
	for formal (dotted lines) and informal (solid lines) firms in	222
0.4	Ghana 2015 (1 = insignificant, 5 = crucial, average values)	222
9.4	Importance of foreign sources of knowledge and innovation for formal (dotted lines) and informal (solid lines) firms in	
	Tanzania 2015 (1 = insignificant, 5 = crucial, average values)	223
0.5	Factors in ensuring the success of foreign knowledge	223
9.5	absorption and adaptation for formal (dotted lines) and	
	informal (solid lines) firms in Ghana 2015 (1 = insignificant,	
	5 = crucial, average values)	228
9.6	Factors in ensuring the success of foreign knowledge	220
٥.0	absorption and adaptation for formal (dotted lines) and	
	informal (solid lines) firms in Tanzania 2015 (1 =	
	insignificant, 5 = crucial, average values)	229
9.7	Channels of managerial knowledge spillovers in the	
,,,	Ghanaian construction sector	234
10.1	Major investors in Africa, 2011 and 2016, by UNCTAD,	
	World Investment Report 2018. Data (billions of dollars)	
	based on the FDI stock of partner countries	245
10.2	Overlap plot of the propensity score	256
	Social network	263
12.1	Learning, knowledge flow and capabilities in M-PESA TIS	287
12.2	Number of M-PESA active users	292
12.3	M-PESA output	292
13.1	Stock of operational robots in 2016 and changes in	
	2010–2016	305
	Individuals using the internet per 100 inhabitants (2017)	311
	Types and players of under-the-radar innovation	318
14.2	Strategies of under-the-radar innovation in comparison to	
	that of above-the-radar innovation	328



# Tables

2.1	Geographical coverage	page 41
2.2	Sectoral coverage (number of studies in parentheses)	42
3.1	GDP and employment, Ghana and Tanzania (2006-2016	5) 46
3.2	Total merchandise trade (2006–2016)	48
3.3	Import and export structure by product group, Ghana and	d
	Tanzania (2006–2016)	49
3.4	Educational expenditure and school enrolment in Ghana	
	and Tanzania	54
4.1	Description of firms	70
	Key firm characteristics (by nature of firm) in Ghana (2015)	5) 71
4.3	Key firm characteristics (by nature of firm) in Tanzania	
	(2015)	72
4.4	Percentage of total turnover of goods or service innovation	ıs
	introduced in Ghana (2014)	81
4.5	Percentage of total turnover of goods or service innovation	ıs
	introduced in Tanzania (2014)	82
4.6	Importance of obstacles hampering innovation for formal	
	and informal firms in Ghana (2013 and 2015)	85
4.7	Importance of obstacles hampering innovation for formal	
	and informal firms in Tanzania (2015)	86
4.8	Materialization of innovation in Ghana (2015, percentage	
	of innovating firms)	91
4.9	Materialization of innovation in Tanzania (2015,	
	percentages of innovating firms)	92
4.10	Sources of management innovation in Ghana and Tanzani	
	(2015, percentages of innovating firms)	95
4.11	Importance of local sources of information for formal and	
	informal firms in Ghana (2015)	99
4.12	Importance of local sources of information for formal and	
	informal firms in Tanzania (2015)	100
5.1	Formal collaborations in Ghanaian firms, by types of	
	partners (2012–2014, number of firms)	111

xii



	List of Tables	X111
5.2	Formal collaborations in Tanzanian firms, by types of	
	partners (2012–2014, number of firms)	112
5.3	Participation in networks of firms in Ghana (2015,	
	percentages of firms)	117
5.4	Participation in networks of firms in Tanzania (2015,	
	percentages of firms)	117
5.5	Benefits of being a member of a cluster in Ghana	
	(percentages of members of cluster)	118
6.1	Impact of the innovations introduced in Ghana, by nature	
	of firm	132
6.2	Impact of the innovations introduced in Tanzania, by	
	nature of firm	133
6.3	Descriptive statistics	143
6.4	Entrepreneurship: principal component (eigenvectors) and	
	variable used	144
6.5	First stage of innovation model: determinants of innovation	
	(Model I) and technological and non-technological	
	innovation (Models II and III)	144
6.6	Second stage of the innovation model: determinants of	
	firms' productivity by innovation (Model I) and	
	technological and non-technological innovation (Models II	
	and III)	146
7.1	Description of variables	162
	Comparing innovation output in male- and female-led firms	164
7.3	The role of manager's gender in innovation (logit	
	estimations)	167
7.4	The role of manager's gender in innovative sales (fractional	
	logit estimations)	174
	Detailed sectoral distribution of the sampled firms	179
	Pairwise correlations among independent variables	180
	Results of first-stage (selection) probit equation	181
7.8	Robustness test – logit estimations with semi-formal firms	
	treated as informal	182
7.9	Robustness test – fractional logit estimations with semi-	
	formal firms treated as informal	183
	Summary statistics of sensitivity analysis	184
8.1	Benefiting from participation in training and subsidized	
	rate loans programme for formal and informal firms:	
	training	196
8.2	The importance of government policies for formal and	
	informal firms	200



xiv	List of Tables	
	The implementation of government policies for formal firms and informal firms	200
8.4	Benefiting from participation in training and subsidized	
	rate loans programme for formal and informal firms in	•
0.5	Ghana	202
8.5	Benefiting from participation in training and subsidized rate loans programme for formal and informal firms in	
	Tanzania	203
8.6	The importance of government policies for formal and	203
0.0	informal firms in Ghana	210
8 7	The importance of government policies for formal and	210
0	informal firms in Tanzania (2015)	211
8.8	The implementation of government policies for formal firms	
	and informal firms in Ghana	212
8.9	The implementation of government policies for formal firms	
	and informal firms in Tanzania (2015)	213
9.1	Importance of foreign sources of knowledge and innovation	
	for formal and informal firms in Ghana (2015)	225
9.2	Importance of foreign sources of knowledge and innovation	
	for formal and informal firms in Tanzania (2015)	226
9.3	Determinants of managerial knowledge spillovers in the	
	Ghanaian construction sector for selected recipients	235
	Distribution of participants in the survey	248
	Base model	251
	Firm network	254
	Firm network for worker sample	255
	Estimation results from the propensity score matching	256
	Propensity score matching with firm network	257
	Propensity score matching with individual network	258
	Dependent variables	261 261
	Independent variables Correlation among controls	262
	Summary of variables	274
	Descriptive statistics: knowledge sourcing strategies across	214
11.2	firms reporting different innovations, mean values	277
11 3	Correlation matrix: innovation sources	278
	Probit results: the role of ICT in determining the likelihood	2.0
11.1	of becoming innovators, without and with internet	
	interactions	280
11.5	Tobit estimation results: the role of ICT in fostering	
	innovation intensity	281



	List of Tables	XV
12.1	Selected values derived from the M-PESA platform within	
	ten years (between 2007 and 2018)	300
14.1	Drivers of under-the-radar innovation	326
14 2	Routes of under-the-radar innovation	327



## Foreword

This book, bringing together Xiaolan Fu's research on the nature and sources of innovation in Africa over the last seven years, represents a rather unique piece of academic research. Based on careful, empirical, in-depth research on two countries - Ghana in West Africa and Tanzania in East Africa (as well as a case study in Kenya) - the author brings to the forefront the various and diverse ways in which innovation in Africa takes place. This is not based on R&D as is the case in industrialized countries, nor purely 'frugal' or 'inclusive' in nature as assumed in many Asian low-income countries, but innovative in a creative African way - low-cost innovations, based on individual creativity, practice, organizational learning and adaptation. What the author calls 'innovation under the radar'. Most of these activities are incremental in nature, strongly demand-led and implemented across the board: in significantly improved, sometimes even new, products or processes, in non-technological areas such as management and marketing, in design. Innovation within a context of constraints to firms on all sides. In short: innovation to survive. No traditional innovation indicator will capture such activities.

The mirror picture of such invisible innovation is reflected in the lack of input from science and engineering in this African innovation process and the lack of the diffusion of foreign technology, including managerial knowledge. As the book highlights (containing also some contributions written with a couple of African colleagues of Xiaolan Fu), within the context of the global digital Fourth Industrial Revolution, this will be one of Africa's major challenges in the years to come. Xiaolan Fu's emphasis on the policy need to build up digital competencies in the African continent, both with respect to infrastructure and human skills, for Africa to 'leapfrog innovation' as illustrated in cases such as M-PESA, is well made. Coming from a world-class Chinese scholar who acknowledges in the conclusions that her interpretation of some of the results obtained might have been constrained by her lack of 'knowledge of the rich history,

xvii



xviii Foreword

culture and economic and social diversity' of the African continent, one rather welcomes this detailed analysis of the nature and sources of innovation in Africa, often undetected by scholars more knowledgeable about the history and industrial development of the continent. I strongly recommend this book.

LUC SOETE



## Acknowledgements

The book arises from my research on innovation in low-income countries since 2012. It is a serious academic book based on seven years of research and reflection. It aims to present a systematic, comprehensive and coherent study of the nature, origin and diffusion of innovation in Africa and the challenges and opportunities faced in the era of the Fourth Industrial Revolution. Although most of the chapters are fairly self-contained, the hope is that the whole will add up to more than the sum of its parts and enable us to develop a comprehensive understanding of this underresearched area of innovation, which is itself an outcome of system engineering.

Many acknowledgements and thanks are due. Among the numerous colleagues and friends I wish to thank for helpful and constructive comments and discussions are Pierre Mohnen, George Essegbey, Anne Miroux, Yong Li, Luc Soete, Bengt-Åke Lundvall, Christopher Adam, Marc Ventresca, Bitrina Diyamett, Anne Kingiri, Martin Bell, Raphie Kaplinsky, Adrian Wood, Valpy FitzGerald, Mammo Muchie, David Kaplan, Maria Sanova, Tomasso Ciarli, Shamika Sirimanne, Dong Wu, Dirk Willem te Velde, Augusto Luis Alcorta, Wunsch-Vincent, Sacha, Razzaque, Mohammad, Heide Hackmann, William Colglazier, David O'Connor, Oliver Schwank, Richard Roehrl, Wei Liu, Pervez Ghauri, Juha Vaatanen, Godfred Frempong, Shyama Ramani, Suraksha Gupta, Sonia Kabir, Douglas Gollin, Diego Sanchez-Ancochea, Calestous Juma, Jorge Katz and Jizhen Li; editors of Cambridge University Press, Valerie Appleby and Laura Parish; as well as five anonymous reviewers of the book proposal.

Chapter 6 is co-authored with Giacomo Zanello, Chapter 8 with Mammo Muchie and Abiodun Egbetokun, Chapter 9 with George Essegbey and Bitrina Diyamett, Chapter 14 with Jun Hou and Chapter 15 with Anne Kigiri. Luc Soete has kindly written a foreword for the book.

In particular, I would like to extend my thanks to Carmen Contreras for her valuable assistance in the analysis of the new innovation survey data from Ghana and Tanzania; to Giacomo Zanello and Jun Hou for their

xix



### xx Acknowledgements

excellent work in the first stage of the DILIC project; to Shaomeng Li, Mavis Akuffobea and Lanta Daniel for their assistance in background data collection for Chapter 3; to Pu Yan for assistance to a background paper for the United Nations Conference on Trade and Development (UNCTAD) which partly contributed to Chapter 13; and to Geraldine Adiku, Elvis Avenyo and Patricia Dudman for their careful assistance in the editing and proofreading of the whole book manuscript at different stages of its development. The support of Valerie Appleby and Laura Parish of Cambridge University Press was essential for the publication of the book.

Much of the research was sponsored by the Economic and Social Council (ESRC), the Foreign, Commonwealth Development Office (FCDO), formerly the Department for International Development (DFID), and the European Commission FP7, and was carried out in collaboration with my partners in Africa, the United Kingdom and other European countries, and beyond. The fieldwork and data collection have benefited from the support of the Science and Technology Policy Research Institute (STEPRI) of the Council for Scientific and Industrial Research (CSIR) of Ghana and the Science, Technology and Innovation Policy Research Organisation (STIPRO) of Tanzania. I would also like to thank UNCTAD, UNIDO, UN DESA and Luc Soete of UNU-MERIT for their support and helpful comments throughout the research process. The visits to Oxford University by Anne Kingiri and Abiodun Egbetokun were supported by an Africa-Oxford Travel Grant. I am grateful to the DFID-ESRC Growth Research Program (DEGRP) and the European Commission FP7 for their support on the dissemination, outreach and impact of some of the research, especially those related to the studies on 'Diffusion of innovation in low-income countries' and the 'MNEs and sustainable development'.

I am also grateful to the copyright holders of the following journals and the United Nations for permitting me, with acknowledgement, to present full or part of the papers that have appeared in their journals or reports in a suitably revised form: Giacomo Zanello, Xiaolan Fu, Pierre Mohnen and Marc Ventresca, 'Innovation in low income countries: a literature review', Journal of Economic Survey (30) 2016 (part of Chapter 2); Xiaolan Fu, Pierre Mohnen and Giacomo Zanello, 'Innovation and productivity in formal and informal firms in Ghana', Technological Forecasting & Social Change (131) 2017 (part of Chapter 6); Xiaolan Fu and Hao Xu, 'Knowledge transfer in MNEs in Africa: A comparison of Chinese and European MNEs in Ghana', chapter 5 in Multinationals, Local Capabilities, and Development, 2019 (part of Chapter 12); and 'Building digital competencies to benefit from frontier technologies', by UNCTAD, © (2019) United Nations (part of Chapter 13). I would like



#### Acknowledgements

xxi

to thank my co-authors for allowing the results of our joint research to be included in this book.

I would also like to thank my colleagues at the 10-Member Group of United Nations (UN) Technology Facilitation Mechanism (TFM), the Council of the Technology Bank for the Least Developed Countries of the United Nations and the Leadership Council of the Sustainable Development Solutions Network (SDSN). The constant interactions with them and the intensive discussions at the meetings helped me to reflect and sharpen my thinking on technology and innovation for sustainable development in the developing countries, especially in lowincome countries.

Prototypes of various chapters have been presented, in past years, at various conferences and seminars in many universities, which cannot all be acknowledged here in detail. A few examples of these conferences include the 'UNU-WIDER Development Conference 2013' in Helsinki, 'Expert Meeting on Innovation of the General Assembly of the United Nations 2014', 'Development Cooperation Forum 2015', 'Academy of Innovation and Entrepreneurship 2013 Annual Conference' in Oxford, 'Development Studies Association Annual Conference', '1st African Innovation Summit', 'DILIC Innovation Conference' in Ghana, 'DILIC End of Project Conference' in London, '2017 ILO Future of Work Forum', 'United Nations STI Forum in New York 2016 and 2017', 'UNCTAD Multi-Year Expert Group Meeting', 'UNIDO 50 Years Anniversary Conference', 'UK-China Innovation Round Table Meeting', 'UK-China Innovation and Development Forum', and other conferences or workshops organized by UNCTAD Committee of Sciences and Technology for Development, UN DESA, UNCTAD, UNIDO and the International Council for Sciences. I am grateful to the organizers and participants for providing me with these opportunities to obtain helpful feedback on the research from experts and practitioners, and to share findings from the research with the wider community on technology, innovation and development.

The research has attracted attention and gained strong support from international organizations: UNCTAD, UNIDO, UN DESA, WIPO and ITU. It has been a great privilege to realize that the findings from this body of research will be able to contribute to the international debate and policymaking concerning the role of innovation in the global effort to achieve the sustainable development goals (SDGs), and in international efforts to strengthen the innovation and technological capabilities and technology facilitation in developing countries.

I thank the Department of International Development of Oxford University for hosting the research. I also thank colleagues, associate



### xxii Acknowledgements

fellows and students of the Technology and Management Centre for Development, Oxford University, for stimulating discussions and help. The collegiality of the Fellowship of Green Templeton College, Oxford, has also been an inspirational support.

Finally, I would like to express my enormous gratitude to my family, especially my husband, Shaohui, and my son, Yujie, for their great love, patience and support. Without their support, the research would not have been as successful as it is today, and the book would not have come to fruition.