# THE SENSE OF SIGHT IN RABBINIC CULTURE

This book studies the significance of sight in rabbinic cultures across Palestine and Mesopotamia (approximately first to seventh centuries). It tracks the extent and effect to which the rabbis living in the Greco-Roman and Persian worlds sought to appropriate, recast, and discipline contemporaneous understandings of sight. Sight had a crucial role to play in the realms of divinity, sexuality and gender, idolatry, and, ultimately, rabbinic subjectivity. The rabbis lived in a world in which the eyes were at once potent and vulnerable: eyes were thought to touch objects of vision, while also acting as an entryway into the viewer. Rabbis, Romans, Zoroastrians, Christians, and others were all concerned with the protection and exploitation of vision. Employing many different sources, Rachel Neis considers how the rabbis engaged varieties of late antique visualities, along with rabbinic narrative, exegetical, and legal strategies, as part of an effort to cultivate and mark a "rabbinic eye."

RACHEL NEIS is an assistant professor in the History Department and in the Program for Judaic Studies at the University of Michigan. Her interests include rabbinic literature and culture, the history of the senses, and comparative ancient and contemporary law and legal theory.

#### GREEK CULTURE IN THE ROMAN WORLD

Editors

SUSAN E. ALCOCK, Brown University JAŚ ELSNER, Corpus Christi College, Oxford SIMON GOLDHILL, University of Cambridge

The Greek culture of the Roman Empire offers a rich field of study. Extraordinary insights can be gained into processes of multicultural contact and exchange, political and ideological conflict, and the creativity of a changing, polyglot empire. During this period, many fundamental elements of Western society were being set in place: from the rise of Christianity, to an influential system of education, to long-lived artistic canons. This series is the first to focus on the response of Greek culture to its Roman imperial setting as a significant phenomenon in its own right. To this end, it will publish original and innovative research in the art, archaeology, epigraphy, history, philosophy, religion, and literature of the empire, with an emphasis on Greek material.

Recent titles in the series:

Local Knowledge and Microidentities in the Imperial Greek World Edited by Tim Whitmarsh

Homer Between History and Fiction in Imperial Greek Literature Laurence Kim

Facing the Gods: Epiphany and Representation in Graeco-Roman Art, Literature and Religion Verity Platt

> Narrative, Identity and the Ancient Greek Novel Tim Whitmarsh

Women and Visual Replication in Roman Imperial Art and Culture Jennifer Trimble

The Maeander Valley: A Historical Geography from Antiquity to Byzantium Peter Thonemann

> Greece and the Augustan Cultural Revolution J. S. Spawforth

Rethinking the Gods: Philosophical Readings of Religion in the Post-Hellenistic Period Peter Van Nuffelen

Saints and Symposiasts: The Literature of Food and the Symposium in Greco-Roman and Early Christian Culture

Jason König

The Social World of Intellectuals in the Roman Empire: Sophists, Philosophers, and Christians Kendra Eshleman

Religion and Identity in Porphyry of Tyre: The Limits of Hellenism in Late Antiquity Aaron Johnson

## THE SENSE OF SIGHT IN RABBINIC CULTURE

Jewish Ways of Seeing in Late Antiquity

RACHEL NEIS



Cambridge University Press 978-1-316-62890-4 — The Sense of Sight in Rabbinic Culture Rachel Neis Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>



University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781316628904

© Rachel Neis 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

> First published 2013 First paperback edition 2016

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-107-03251-4 Hardback ISBN 978-1-316-62890-4 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press 978-1-316-62890-4 — The Sense of Sight in Rabbinic Culture Rachel Neis Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>

> To my grandparents, Ruchella and Pinchas Friedwald, and Marta and Alex Neischiler, zikhronam li-verakhah

Cambridge University Press 978-1-316-62890-4 — The Sense of Sight in Rabbinic Culture Rachel Neis Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>

### Contents

Acknowledgments		<i>page</i> viii
No	te on rabbinic sources and translations	xi
	Introduction	I
I	Visual theory	18
2	God gazing and homovisuality	41
3	Heterovisuality, face-bread, and cherubs	82
4	Visual eros	113
5	Eyeing idols	170
6	Seeing sages	202
	Conclusion	253
Bibliography		263
Index of ancient sources		307
Index of subjects		313

vii

### Acknowledgments

The completion of this book marks the end of a beginning: the chapter of my coming to America and my initiation into the world of the academy. I have the opportunity now to acknowledge not just those who have seen me through the writing (and rewriting) of the book itself, but also those debts of teaching and friendship that I have happily accrued since 1998. Kimberley Patton and Steven Katz encouraged me as I took my first steps in graduate work in the USA; a grant from the Memorial Foundation offered material support and a Wexner Graduate Fellowship offered that and much more. Shaye Cohen, Shaya Gafni, Jeffrey Hamburger, Jay Harris, and Peter Schäfer taught and advised me during graduate school and beyond. Steven Fine has been a mentor since early days. He and Georgia Frank read the earliest version of what was to become this book. I thank all these scholars for their mentorship and for helping me sharpen the earliest iterations of my thoughts on rabbinic visuality.

Along with a Rackham Faculty grant, a fellowship at the Frankel Institute of Judaic Studies at the University of Michigan in 2009–2010 gave me the chance to do crucial research. My thanks to Deborah Dash Moore and the other fellows for their helpful comments on portions of Chapters 5 and 6. Intense and rewarding conversations with Leora Auslander about the senses and Jewishness, during that year and since, were especially important to this book. I had the chance to present parts of this book and to receive invaluable feedback at the departments of Religious Studies at Yale University, Religious Studies and Judaic Studies at the University of Virginia, Religious Studies at Princeton University, and the Scholion at Hebrew University. For these opportunities and for their input, I thank Steven Fraade, Phyliss Granoff, Jim Ponet, Peter Schäfer, Greg Schmidt, Daniel Schwartz, Liz Shanks, and Zeev Weiss. Julia Thomas not only gave me incisive comments on parts of the book, but also delighted me with friendship and talk over sushi and Asahi. I owe a huge debt to Charlotte Fonrobert for her gracious mentorship and friendship, and for closely reading the entire

viii

Cambridge University Press 978-1-316-62890-4 — The Sense of Sight in Rabbinic Culture Rachel Neis Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>

#### Acknowledgments

manuscript. Maya Barzilai, Ra'anan Boustan, Gil Klein, and Mika Natif have offered precious friendship along with generous readings – and rereadings – of my work. At crucial junctures Yaakov Elman, Susannah Heschel, Martin Jaffee, Jane Kanarek, Madeline Kochen, Patricia Cox Miller, Mika Natif, Aharon Oppenheimer, Aharon Shemesh, Daphna Stroumsa, Guy Stroumsa, Sarah Stroumsa, Paolo Squatriti, Philippa Townsend, and Steven Weitzmann read chapters of this book and gave perceptive comments.

The University of Michigan is a stimulating environment in which to think, talk, and work. My colleagues in History, Judaic Studies, and beyond, make this place what it is. Geoff Eley, Todd Endelman, Elliot Ginsburg, Deborah Dash Moore, Gina Morantz-Sanchez, Ian Moyer, Diane Owen Hughes, Christian de Pee, Scott Spector, Terry Tinkle, and Rebecca Zurier read all or much of this work in various phases, and have helped me improve it. Anita Norich and Val Kivelson have rocked as readers, mentors, and friends. Geoff Eley shared advice, friendship, and reminders of the SOC; Gina Morantz-Sanchez offered counsel and has never let me forget that my real name is Ruchella. Connie Hamlin, Karen Higgs-Payne, Tracy Darnell, and the other wonderful members of staff offered gracious assistance and guidance, often in answer to last-minute cries for help. Exchanges with Mika Auerback, Catherine Brown, John Carson, Deirdre de la Cruz, Jonathan Freedman, Dario Gaggio, Gabrielle Hecht, Kali Israel, Sue Juster, Mary Kelley, Kim Kunoff, Julian Levinson, Josh Miller, Farina Mir, Anthony Mora, and Leslie Pincus brightened dark wintry days.

My time writing this book in Ann Arbor has also been enriched by the company of Linda Jo Doctor, Phillis Engelbert, Elliot Ginsburg, Holly Hughes, Esther Newton, Ruby Tapia, Tanya Thunberg, Lisa McDonald, Alice Liberson, Laura Wernick, Lori Brooks, and Zane White. During extended visits and research in Jerusalem and Tel Aviv, precious conversations with Sivan Shtang, Inbal Shamir, November Wanderin, and Natalie Weinstein allowed me to rethink the relationship between art, ideas, and politics. Sharon Gershoni and Sarra Lev, Shaya Gafni, Naomi Gafni, Aharon Oppenheimer and Oded Irshai offered warm friendship, good conversation, and advice.

Michael Sharp of Cambridge University Press has been patient and supportive throughout this process. I am grateful to Susan Alcock, Jaś Elsner, and Simon Goldhill for their support of my project as Series Editors, to Jaś Elsner and Simon Goldhill for having served as readers, and to the anonymous third reader for their enormously helpful critiques. My thanks to the superb editorial team at Cambridge University Press, including Liz Hanlon, Jodie Hodgson, and Jacqueline French. Parts of "Eyeing Idols:

Cambridge University Press 978-1-316-62890-4 — The Sense of Sight in Rabbinic Culture Rachel Neis Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>

X

#### Acknowledgments

Rabbinic Viewing Practices in Late Antiquity," *Jewish Quarterly Review*, 102/4 (2012), 533–60 are reprinted in Chapter 5. Permission to print is gratefully acknowledged. My appreciation to the Ghetto Fighters' Museum Archive for permission to print the image of Sam Herciger's relief sculpture, *The Rabbis*. I thank Hannah Roussel and Julia Schapiro for their research assistance. David Lobenstine's editorial brilliance and enthusiastic engagement helped make this book more intelligible. Adam Parker, a wonderful interlocutor and scholar, contributed invaluable research assistance, copy-editing, and bibliographic work, along with the index.

I am grateful to my parents for their love and support. I have been inspired, stimulated and supported by my ongoing conversations about vision, art, film, and life, with my siblings, Dalia and Daniel. Last but not least, I want to thank Daphna Stroumsa, whose presence has made the last two years of toil a delight; you have warmed my life.

#### Note on the cover image

I was drawn to the sculpture, "The Rabbis," not only for its subject and the curious representation of eyes, but also for its "primitivist" and folkart inspired style, in which I saw echoes of late antique funerary reliefs, particularly the bearded, large-eyed, funerary mask in Bet Shearim (the "mask" sarcophagus, Sarcophagus 84, Room XVI, Catacomb 20). While ancient sculpture may now seem to stare at us vacantly, in its time, eyes were usually filled in with color (for a marvellous example, see the painted pair of eyes on display at the Metropolitan Museum of Art, Gallery 156). The wide-open and unmarked eyes of Herciger's *The Rabbis* draw in our gaze, but we remain uncertain as to how to register their blank stare. Are these rabbis sightless, or do they possess a vision that we cannot possibly hope to share?

### Note on rabbinic sources and translations

In all citations of rabbinic sources, I have tried to use the best available edition or manuscript. I generally follow the editions and manuscripts listed below; where I depart from these texts, I have noted which manuscript or edition I follow and my reasons for doing so. All translations of biblical and rabbinic sources are my own, unless noted otherwise. All Hebrew, Aramaic, and Greek phrases in the text are transliterated for the benefit of the non-specialist. For names, places, and words that have entered the English vernacular, I use the common English spelling.

Citations from rabbinic texts are according to SBL style guidelines: m. precedes names of Mishnaic tractates; t. for Tosefta; y. for the Palestinian Talmud (Yerushalmi); and b. for the Bavli. Midrashic collections and other rabbinic works are nearly always cited by their full name.

#### Mishnah

Albeck, Hanokh (ed.), *Shishah Sidre Mishnah*, 6 vols. (Tel Aviv: Devir, 1957–1959) Ms. Kaufmann A 50 (Budapest, Akademia), available online via the National Library of Israel at http://jnul.huji.ac.il/dl/talmud/

#### Tosefta

Lieberman, Saul (ed.), *The Tosefta*, 4 vols. (New York: The Jewish Theological Seminary of America, 1955–1973)

Zuckermandel, M. S. (ed.), *Tosefta, Based on the Erfurt and Vienna Codices* (repr. Jerusalem: Wahrmann Books, 1970)

### Palestinian Talmud

Sussmann, Yaakov (ed.), *Talmud Yerushalmi* (Jerusalem: Academy of the Hebrew Language, 2001)

xii

Note on rabbinic sources and translations

### **Babylonian Talmud**

Vilna edition: *The Babylonian Talmud* (Vilna: The Widow and Brothers Romm, 1880–1886)

Though I use the Vilna edition as the base text, I have also consulted available manuscripts and early printed editions. I have indicated in the notes where variant readings have informed my translation or analysis.

#### Midrash Halakhah

Horowitz, H. S. and Israel A. Rabin (eds.), *Mekhilta Derabbi Yishma'el* (Frankfurt, 1928–1931; repr. Jerusalem: Bamberger and Wahrmann, 1970)

- Epstein, J. N. and Ezra Z. Melamed (eds.), *Mekhilta Derabbi Shim'on b. Yoḥai* (Jerusalem: Mekitse Nirdamim, 1956)
- Weiss, Isaac Hirsch (ed.), *Sifra deve Rav: hu' Sefer Torat Kohanim [to Leviticus]* (Vienna, 1862; repr. New York: Om Publishing Company, 1946)
- Horowitz, H. S. (ed.), *Sifre deve Rav [to Numbers]* (Leipzig, 1917; repr. Jerusalem: Wahrmann, 1966)
- Finkelstein, Louis (ed.), *Sifre on Deuteronomy* (Berlin: Gesellschaft zur Föderung der Wissenschaft des Judentums, 1939; repr. New York: The Jewish Theological Seminary of America, 1969)

#### Midrash Aggadah

- Midrash Rabbah is cited from the Vilna edition, 2 vols. (Vilna, 1879; repr. New York: E. Grossman, 1953), except for the following:
  - Genesis Rabbah: Theodor, Judah and Hanokh Albeck (eds.), Midrash Bereshit Rabbah, 3 vols. (Berlin, 1912–1927; repr. Jerusalem: Shalem Books, 1996)
  - Lamentations Rabbah: Buber, Salomon (ed.), Midrash Ekhah Rabbah (Vilna: Romm, 1899)
  - *Leviticus Rabbah*: Margaliot, M. (ed.), *Midrash Vayiqra Rabbah*, 2 vols. (New York: The Jewish Theological Seminary of America, 1993)

Mandelbaum, Bernard (ed.), *Pesiqta Derav Kahana*, 2 vols. (New York: The Jewish Theological Seminary of America, 1987)

Friedmann, Meir (Ish Shalom) (ed.), Pesiqta Rabbati (Vienna, 1880)