

## Reviewing the South

The American South received increased attention from national commentators during the interwar era. Beginning in the 1920s, the proliferation of daily book columns and Sunday book supplements in newspapers reflected a growing audience of educated readers and its demand for books and book reviews. This period of intensified scrutiny coincided with a boom in the publishing industry, which, in turn, encouraged newspapers to pay greater attention to the world of books. At the same time, southern writers began to turn inward and northern journalists found in the South material worthy of national coverage. *Reviewing the South* shows how northern critics were as much involved in the southern literary renaissance as southern authors and critics. Southern writing, Gardner argues, served as a litmus to gauge southern exceptionalism. For critics and their readers, nothing less was at stake than the region's ability to contribute to the vibrancy and growth of the nation.

Sarah E. Gardner is Professor of History and Director of the Center for Southern Studies, Mercer University, where she teaches courses on the American South, nineteenth-century America, and print culture. She is the author of *Blood and Irony: Southern White Women's Narratives of the Civil War, 1861–1937* and co-editor of *Voices of the South*.

## Cambridge Studies on the American South

### Series Editors

Mark M. Smith, *University of South Carolina, Columbia*  
 Peter Coclanis, *University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill*

Interdisciplinary in its scope and intent, this series builds upon and extends Cambridge University Press's longstanding commitment to studies on the American South. The series offers the best new work on the South's distinctive institutional, social, economic, and cultural history and also features works in a national, comparative, and transnational perspective.

### Titles in the Series

- Keri Leigh Merritt, *Masterless Men: Poor Whites and Slavery in the Antebellum South*
- Sarah E. Gardner, *Reviewing the South: The Literary Marketplace and the Southern Renaissance, 1920–1941*
- Robert E. Bonner, *Mastering America: Southern Slaveholders and the Crisis of American Nationhood*
- Ras Michael Brown, *African-Atlantic Cultures and the South Carolina Lowcountry*
- Christopher Michael Curtis, *Jefferson's Freeholders and the Politics of Ownership in the Old Dominion*
- Louis A. Ferleger and John D. Metz, *Cultivating Success in the South: Farm Households in Postbellum Georgia*
- Craig Friend and Lorri Glover, eds., *Death and the American South*
- Luke E. Harlow, *Religion, Race, and the Making of Confederate Kentucky, 1830–1880*
- Ari Helo, *Thomas Jefferson's Ethics and the Politics of Human Progress: The Morality of a Slaveholder*
- Karlos K. Hill, *Beyond the Rope: The Impact of Lynching on Black Culture and Memory*
- Katherine Rye Jewell, *Dollars for Dixie: Business and the Transformation of Conservatism in the Twentieth Century*
- William A. Link and James J. Broomall, eds., *Rethinking American Emancipation: Legacies of Slavery and the Quest for Black Freedom*
- Susanna Michele Lee, *Claiming the Union: Citizenship in the Post-Civil War South*
- Scott P. Marler, *The Merchants' Capital: New Orleans and the Political Economy of the Nineteenth-Century South*
- Peter McCandless, *Slavery, Disease, and Suffering in the Southern Lowcountry*
- James Van Horn Melton, *Religion, Community, and Slavery on the Colonial Southern Frontier*
- Barton A. Myers, *Rebels against the Confederacy: North Carolina's Unionists*
- Thomas Okie, *The Georgia Peach: Culture, Agriculture, and Environment in the American South*
- Johanna Nicol Shields, *Freedom in a Slave Society: Stories from the Antebellum South*
- Damian Alan Pargas, *Slavery and Forced Migration in the Antebellum South*
- Brian Steele, *Thomas Jefferson and American Nationhood*
- Jonathan Daniel Wells, *Women Writers and Journalists in the Nineteenth-Century South*

## Reviewing the South

### *The Literary Marketplace and the Southern Renaissance, 1920–1941*

SARAH E. GARDNER

*Mercer University, Macon, Georgia*



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
 978-1-316-60237-9 — Reviewing the South  
 Sarah Gardner  
 Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

**CAMBRIDGE**  
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom  
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
 4843/24, 2nd Floor, Ansari Road, Daryaganj, Delhi – 110002, India  
 79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781107147942](http://www.cambridge.org/9781107147942)

© 2017 Sarah E. Gardner

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Inc.

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data*

Names: Gardner, Sarah E., author.

Title: Reviewing the South : the literary marketplace and the Southern Renaissance, 1920–1941 / Sarah E. Gardner (Mercer University, Macon, Georgia).

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom; New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2017. | Series: Cambridge studies on the American South |

Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2016053917 | ISBN 9781107147942 (hardback : alkaline paper)

Subjects: LCSH: American literature – Southern States – History and criticism. |

American literature – 20th century – History and criticism. | Book reviewing –

United States – History – 20th century. | American literature – Publishing –

History – 20th century. | Book industries and trade – United States – History –

20th century. | Critics – Northeastern States – History – 20th century. | Southern

States – Relations – Northeastern States. | Northeastern States – Relations – Southern

States. | Southern States – Intellectual life – 20th century. | Northeastern States –

Intellectual life – 20th century. | BISAC: HISTORY / United States / 20th Century.

Classification: LCC PS261.G33 2017 | DDC 810.9/975–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2016053917>

ISBN 978-1-107-14794-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

## Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page</i> ix
<i>Abbreviations Used</i>	xiii
Introduction: From Renaissance to Reformation	I
1 The World the Reviewers Made	14
2 The Cultural Economy of Reading in the Interwar Years	47
3 The South Meets Harlem	79
4 Confronting Jim Crow	114
5 Away Down South in the Land of Problems	151
6 A Class of Burden-Bearers	184
7 The Most Audacious Book Ever Written by Southerners	222
8 Fiction Fights the Civil War	253
<i>Epilog</i>	291
<i>Index</i>	307

## Acknowledgments

Working on this project has deepened my appreciation for the generic qualities of different forms of writing. The humble review, the angry rejoinder, the gushing fan letter all follow particular conventions that define the genre and signal its purpose. Readers expect as much. So who am I to break the literary conventions of the acknowledgment section?

I thus begin by thanking two of my colleagues and dearest friends at Mercer, Tom Scott and Doug Thompson, who convinced me six years ago that I had something worth saying. Their unwavering support, good cheer, and not-so-gentle ribbing have sustained me through the everyday frustrations that come with drafting a book. Their offices are near mine; they bore up exceedingly well under the constant stream of invectives that wafted down the third floor of Langdale Hall. (Sorry, guys.)

This book would not have been possible without financial support of various institutions. My sincere thanks to the Southern Historical Collection, the University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill; the Gilder Lehrman Institute of American History; the Harry Ransom Center, University of Texas, Austin; the Newberry Library; and the Office of the Provost, Mercer University. Special thanks to Dean Lake Lambert – now president of Hanover College – who offered his unconditional encouragement and limited sabbatical funds, even when I was at my most pessimistic – which was *Every. Single. Day.* (Your copy is in the mail.)

Thanks, too, to the librarians and archivists who managed my requests, answered my questions, identified additional sources, and tolerated those little conversations I had with myself – not so silently – in reading rooms across the country. (At least I wasn't as annoying as that woman who sang to herself at the Beinecke.) A shout-out to Cecilia Williams at Mercer's

Tarver Library who handled my interlibrary loan requests with alacrity and remarkable forbearance. (I might have crashed the online request site a time or two.)

David Moltke-Hansen read every word of this manuscript – more than once, as he is wont to remind me. I pushed back now and then, but I know that the manuscript is cleaner and tighter because of his careful reading and critical acumen. Chris Curtis tried to read every word, but he got caught up on a legendarily bad sentence – so bad he crossed it out twice – and didn’t quite make it through. But eventually he came back around. Thank you both for your enduring friendship, even in the face of bad prose. Mark Smith and Peter Coclans advocated on my behalf when circumstances demanded it. Thank you for your timely intervention.

What would I do without my fellow GraftonLiners? Truly, you are a beacon of light that shines above the black pit of despair and self-doubt that swallows up even the most intrepid writers. Paul Harvey, time to cue up Kool & The Gang!

Countless friends and colleagues kept me well fed, sufficiently lubricated, and joyously entertained when I came to town to do research. (“Never again with the martini.”) I especially thank Vate Powell and Johannah Howard; Margaret Storey and Jonathan Heller; Frank Valadez; Christy and Jeff Clemons (wine and prosciutto for everyone!); David Moltke-Hansen and Pat Poteat; Katie Harper and Ryan Pride; and Beth Sherouse.

Eventually I had to leave the archives and return home. Tad Brown, Kathy Kloepper, Deneen Senasi, and Charlie Thomas made sure I was equally well cared for in Georgia. Anastasia Christman and Jim Jimmy Jam Cappelletti fueled me during those endless hours of writing and revising by sending me playlists and encouraging spontaneous dance parties. Every scholar should have a personal DJ and such fabulous friends. So many people encouraged me to keep on keepin’ on – far too many to name, but I’ll risk censure and recrimination by singling out Bob Brinkmeyer, Susan Donaldson, Pat Sullivan, Natalie Ring, and Lesley Gordon. The rest of you know who you are. More importantly, I know who you are and I am most appreciative. I am indeed a lucky woman.

Finally, a word of profound thanks to Houston Roberson, who accompanied me on many research trips to New York City, the District of Columbia, and Chapel Hill. Far more importantly, he had been a staunch friend and ally for nearly twenty years. Houston died as I finished up reviewing the copy edits on this manuscript. I know he would have been

*Acknowledgments*

xi

the first to pop the cork and celebrate the book's publication. I regret not getting this book out sooner.

My husband, a writer of considerable talent, once drew in the margin of an early draft a frowny face with tears of boredom streaming down. We have different styles, he and I. I've tried to let in a bit of his daring and dash. But I refuse to accept a single sentence equals a graf. (And yes, he just edited that sentence.)

Portions of this work have appeared previously in different versions. My thanks to the following presses for granting permission to reprint this material. A portion of this text is based on an essay titled "The Secret of Vengeance": Honor and Revenge in Andrew Lytle's *The Long Night*" in *The Field of Honor: Essays on Southern Character and American Identity*, John Mayfield and Todd Hagstette, eds. (Columbia, SC: University of South Carolina Press, 2017). Used with permission. Sections of Chapters 1 and 6 appeared in "A Southerner in New York: James Agee in Literary Manhattan" in *Let Us Now Praise Famous Men at 75*, Michael Lofaro, ed. (Knoxville: University of Tennessee Press, 2017). A portion of the epilogue contains slightly revised text excerpts from "Mr. Cowley's Southern Saga" which originally appeared in *Faulkner and History*, Jay Watson and James G. Thomas, Jr., eds. (University Press of Mississippi, 2017).

This bad boy is finished. Time for a cup of coffee and a bag of peanut butter M&Ms.



## Abbreviations Used

ARC	Amistad Research Center, Tulane University, New Orleans, Louisiana
BL	Beinecke Rare Book and Manuscript Library, Yale University, New Haven, Connecticut
CU	Rare Book and Manuscripts Reading Room, Butler Library, Columbia University, New York, New York
EU	Manuscripts and Rare Books Library, Robert W. Woodruff Library, Emory University, Atlanta, Georgia
HL	Houghton Library, Harvard University, Cambridge, Massachusetts
HRC	Harry Ransom Humanities Research Center, University of Texas, Austin, Texas
IU	The Lilly Library, Indiana University, Bloomington, Indiana
LC	Library of Congress, Washington, DC
MSU	Special Collections Department, Mitchell Memorial Library, Mississippi State University, Starkville, Mississippi
NL	Newberry Library, Chicago, Illinois
NYPL	New York Public Library, New York, New York
PUL	Rare Books and Special Collections Department, Firestone Library, Princeton University, Princeton, New Jersey
SC	South Caroliniana Library, University of South Carolina, Columbia, South Carolina
SCHC	South Carolina Historical Society, Charleston, South Carolina
SHC	Southern Historical Collection, Manuscripts Department of the Library of the University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill, North Carolina

SU	Special Collections Research Center, Ernest Stevenson Bird Library, Syracuse University, Syracuse, New York
TU	Howard-Tilton Memorial Library, Tulane University, New Orleans, Louisiana
UA	W. S. Hoole Special Collections Library, University of Alabama, Tuscaloosa, Alabama
UGA	Hargrette Rare Book and Manuscript Library, University of Georgia, Athens, Georgia
UM	J. D. Williams Library, University of Mississippi, University, Mississippi
UMI	Hatcher Graduate Library, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, Michigan
UV	Special Collections Library, University of Vermont, Burlington, Vermont
UVA	Albert and Shirley Small Special Collections Library, University of Virginia, Charlottesville, Virginia
VU	Manuscripts Department, Jean and Alexander Heard Library, Vanderbilt University, Nashville, Tennessee