

Contents

List of Figures	<i>page</i> xvi
List of Tables	xviii
Preface	xxiii
1 Introduction	1
1.1 The Societal Problem	4
1.2 Advice and Mechanism Design	9
1.3 Choice under the Influence of Advice	10
1.4 Outline of the Book	11
PART I BACKGROUND	
2 Advice	21
2.1 What Is Advice?	21
2.2 Types of Advice	22
2.2.1 Naive Advice	22
2.2.2 Technical Advice	23
2.2.3 Wise Advice and Nudges	24
2.2.4 Coaching	26
2.2.5 Narratives	28
2.3 Advice in This Book	30
2.4 Approaches to Advice Giving and Following	30
2.4.1 The Economics Approach	31
2.4.2 The Psychologist Approach	37
2.5 What’s Next?	41
3 Conventions, Social Learning, and Intergenerational Games	45
3.1 Supergames and Intergenerational Games	45

X CONTENTS

3.2	Norms and Conventions	51
3.3	Forward Induction and Stable Equilibrium Conventions	54
3.3.1	Stable Conventions in the Battle of the Sexes Games	57
3.3.2	Stable Conventions in the Lab	59
3.3.3	Punishments	63
3.4	A Note on Social Learning	63
3.5	Other Generational Games	65
3.5.1	Dynastic Games	66
3.5.2	Overlapping Generations	70
3.6	Conclusion	71
3.7	Appendix: Intergenerational Games	72
PART II COORDINATION, DISTRIBUTION, AND TRUST CONVENTIONS		
4	On the Evolution of Coordination and Inequality-Preserving Conventions – the Battle of the Sexes Revisited	85
4.1	The Game	86
4.2	Results	87
4.3	The Evolution of Conventions in the Baseline Experiment: Punctuated Equilibria	89
4.4	The Advice Puzzle: Social and Belief Learning in Treatments I and II	97
4.5	Other-Regarding Preferences	100
4.6	Conclusion	103
4.7	Appendix: Regime Estimation	104
5	Conventional Behavior and Bargaining – Advice and Behavior in Intergenerational Ultimatum Games	111
5.1	Bargaining Conventions	113
5.2	Bargaining Outcomes with Advice	119
5.3	Conventionality	122

5.4	The Impact of Advice	127
5.4.1	What Motivates Our Advisors	128
5.4.2	Unfulfilled Expectations Cause Rejections	133
5.5	Conclusion	136
6	Trust and Trustworthiness	138
6.1	What Is Trust?	138
6.1.1	The Trust Game	140
6.1.2	Trust and Trustworthiness	141
6.2	The Experiment: Design and Procedures	145
6.2.1	General Features	145
6.3	Trust and Sender Behavior	146
6.3.1	Offers and Advice: Does Advice Increase or Decrease Trust?	146
6.3.2	Advice Sent and Followed	148
6.3.3	Does Advice Increase Sender Payoffs?	149
6.4	Trustworthiness and Receiver Behavior	152
6.4.1	Return Behavior	152
6.4.2	Does Advice Make Receivers More or Less Trustworthy?	156
6.5	Reciprocity	159
6.5.1	Reciprocity and Fairness	162
6.6	Do Increases in Trust Lead to Trustworthiness or Does Trustworthiness Call Forth Increased Trust?	164
6.7	Conclusion	166
PART III THE IMPACT OF PUBLIC ADVICE AND COMMON KNOWLEDGE		
7	The Impact of Private and Public Advice in the Minimum-Effort Game	175
7.1	Don't Do What We Did!	175
7.1.1	Private, Public, and Common-Knowledge Advice	177
7.1.2	The Minimum-Effort Game	178

xii CONTENTS

7.2	Experimental Design	181
7.3	Can We Talk Ourselves to Efficiency? Results	188
7.3.1	Block I Treatments – Minimum Choices	188
7.3.2	Beliefs in Block I	194
7.3.3	Block II Games – Minimum Choices and Advice Quality	198
7.3.4	Path Dependence	201
7.4	Beliefs and Common <i>p</i> -beliefs	205
7.5	Conclusion	208
7.6	Appendix: Estimates from Ordered Probit Model	209
8	Advice and Common Knowledge in the Two-Thirds Guessing Game: Does Advice Increase Strategic Sophistication?	214
8.1	The Two-Thirds Guessing Game	217
8.2	Experimental Design and Procedures	220
8.2.1	Hypotheses	222
8.3	Results	224
8.3.1	Private Advice	224
8.3.2	Public Advice	226
8.4	Cognitive Hierarchies	232
8.5	Conclusion	237
PART IV THE VALUE OF ADVICE		
9	Learning with the Advice of a Meddlesome Boss	245
9.1	Decision Problem	248
9.2	Experimental Procedures	249
9.2.1	The Optimal Action	252
9.3	Results	253
9.3.1	Surprise-Quiz Behavior	253
9.3.2	Advice Giving and Following	256
9.3.3	Advice Following	257
9.3.4	Advice Giving	260
9.4	Conclusion	264

10	Advice and Social Learning	267
10.1	Experimental Design	268
10.2	Theory and Predictions	270
10.2.1	Preliminaries	271
10.2.2	Action-Only	271
10.2.3	Advice-Only	275
10.2.4	Action-Plus-Advice	276
10.3	Do Actions Speak Louder than Words? Experimental Results	277
10.3.1	Question 1	277
10.3.2	Observed and Predicted Cutoffs	279
10.3.3	Question 2	283
10.4	Question 3	287
10.5	Conclusion	287
10.6	Appendix: Proof of Uniqueness and Regressions	288
10.6.1	Proof: No Other Equilibria Exist	288
10.6.2	Regression Analysis of Cutoffs: Advice-Only and Action-Only	289
10.6.3	Regression Analysis: Action-Plus-Advice Treatment	290
11	The Market for Advice	294
11.1	Experimental Design	297
11.1.1	The Investment Game	297
11.1.2	Creating Experts or Advisors	298
11.2	Creating Clients or Advisees: The Belief–Price Elicitation Game	300
11.3	Results	301
11.3.1	The Market for Advice	302
11.4	Belief Biases	308
11.4.1	Optimal Updating of Beliefs	308
11.5	Conclusion	314

## xiv CONTENTS

## PART V ADVICE AND ECONOMIC MECHANISMS

12	Chatting and Matching	321
12.1	The School Choice Matching Problem	323
12.1.1	Boston Mechanism	324
12.1.2	Gale–Shapley Deferred Acceptance Mechanism	325
12.2	Experimental Design	326
12.2.1	The Matching Problem	326
12.2.2	Networks	329
12.2.3	Treatments	331
12.3	Results	331
12.3.1	Strategy Classification	332
12.3.2	Phase 1: A Quick Summary of Results	333
12.3.3	Impact of Chat: Differences between Phase 2 and Phase 1	336
12.3.4	Welfare Changes	344
12.3.5	The Content of Chat	348
12.4	Conclusion	355
12.5	Appendix: Stated Preferences and Welfare	357
13	School Matching and Learning under the Influence of Intergenerational Advice	360
13.1	Experimental Design	365
13.1.1	Treatments	366
13.2	Results	368
13.2.1	Truth-Telling and Efficiency	368
13.2.2	Volatility	372
13.2.3	Explaining Our Results: Social versus Experiential Learning	374
13.3	Structural Estimation and Simulation	376
13.4	Advice Giving and Receiving	383
13.4.1	Advice Giving	384

CONTENTS xv

13.4.2 Advice Following	386
13.4.3 Verbal Advice	386
13.5 Conclusion	390
14 Conclusions	394
Index	408