

MONETARY REDRESS FOR ABUSE IN STATE CARE

Investigating a fast-developing field of public policy, Stephen Winter examines how states redress injuries suffered by young people in state care. Considering ten illustrative exemplar programmes from Australia, Canada, Ireland, and Aotearoa New Zealand, Winter explores how redress programmes attempt to resolve the anguish, injustice, and legacies of trauma that survivors experience. Drawing from interviews with key stakeholders and a rich trove of documentary research, this book analyses how policymakers should navigate the trade-offs that survivors face between having their injuries acknowledged and the difficult, often retraumatizing, experience of attaining redress. A timely critical engagement with this contentious policy domain, Winter presents empirically driven recommendations and a compelling argument for participatory, flexible, and survivor-focussed programmes. This title is also available as Open Access on Cambridge Core.

STEPHEN WINTER is Associate Professor of Political Theory at the University of Auckland and a leading expert in state redress programmes. He is the author of *Transitional Justice in Established Democracies: A Political Theory* (2014) and co-editor of *Magna Carta and New Zealand: History, Politics and Law in Aotearoa* (2017).

MONETARY REDRESS FOR ABUSE IN STATE CARE

STEPHEN WINTER

*Associate Professor in Political Theory,
Waipapa Taumata Rau | University of Auckland*



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
 978-1-316-51416-0 — Monetary Redress for Abuse in State Care
 Stephen Winter
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,
 a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of
 education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781316514160

DOI: 10.1017/9781009082662

© Stephen Winter 2023

This work is in copyright. It is subject to statutory exceptions and to the provisions of relevant licensing agreements; with the exception of the Creative Commons version the link for which is provided below, no reproduction of any part of this work may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

An online version of this work is published at doi.org/10.1017/9781009082662 under a Creative Commons Open Access license CC-BY-NC 4.0 which permits re-use, distribution and reproduction in any medium for non-commercial purposes providing appropriate credit to the original work is given and any changes made are indicated. To view a copy of this license visit <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0>

All versions of this work may contain content reproduced under license from third parties. Permission to reproduce this third-party content must be obtained from these third-parties directly.

When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI 10.1017/9781009082662

First published 2023

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Winter, Stephen, author.

Title: Monetary redress for abuse in state care / Stephen Winter, University of Auckland.

Description: New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, [2023] | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2022025812 (print) | LCCN 2022025813 (ebook) | ISBN 9781316514160 (hardback) | ISBN 9781009077422 (paperback) | ISBN 9781009082662 (epub)

Subjects: LCSH: Abused children. | Abused children—Services for. | Child welfare.

Classification: LCC HV6626.5 .W49 2023 (print) | LCC HV6626.5 (ebook) | DDC 362.76—dc23/eng/20220714

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2022025812>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2022025813>

ISBN 978-1-316-51416-0 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

For Roxane, Emma, and William

iustitia suum cuique distribuit
—Cicero

CONTENTS

List of Tables x
Acknowledgements xi
List of Abbreviations xiii

PART I

1 **Introducing Monetary Redress** 3
 1.1 Introduction 3
 1.2 Major Themes and Argument 7
 1.3 The Scope of the Book 9
2 **Injurious Histories** 17
 2.1 Introduction 17
 2.2 Problems with History 18
 2.3 Survivors’ Injuries 21
3 **What Makes Redress Better?** 31
 3.1 Introduction 31
 3.2 Survivors’ Interests 32
 3.3 State Interests 38

PART II

4 **Irish Redress** 47
 4.1 Introduction 47
 4.2 The Industrial Schools Programme 47
 4.3 Caranua 55
 4.4 Magdalene Laundries 57
5 **Australian Redress** 64
 5.1 Introduction 64
 5.2 The Forde Foundation 64
 5.3 Queensland Redress 65
 5.4 Redress WA 72

viii	CONTENTS	
6	Canadian Redress	83
6.1	Background	83
6.2	Common Experience Payments	84
6.3	Personal Credits	92
6.4	Independent Assessment Process	93
7	Redress in Aotearoa New Zealand	105
7.1	Introduction	105
7.2	The Historic Claims Process	106
	PART III	
8	Redress Policy Design and Delivery	119
8.1	Introduction	119
8.2	Designing Redress	119
8.3	Delivering Redress	126
8.4	Administrative Recommendations	136
9	Who and What Should Be Eligible for Redress?	139
9.1	Introduction	139
9.2	Who Is Eligible?	140
9.3	What Injuries Are Eligible?	149
9.4	Consequential Damage	156
9.5	Eligibility Recommendations	159
10	The Evidentiary Process	161
10.1	Introduction	161
10.2	Advertising Redress to Survivors	161
10.3	Testimonial Evidence	163
10.4	Institutional Records	173
10.5	Professional Evidence	174
10.6	Evidentiary Recommendations	175
11	Assessing Redress Claims	178
11.1	Introduction	178
11.2	Assessment Tools	178
11.3	Fast and Slow Tracks	184
11.4	Publicity	187
11.5	Standards of Evidence	189
11.6	Consequential Damage	191
11.7	Assessment Recommendations	195

CONTENTS ix

12	Local and Holistic Support for Survivors	197
12.1	Introduction	197
12.2	Community Agencies	197
12.3	Professional Services	206
12.4	Support Recommendations	213
13	What to Pay in Redress and How to Pay It	215
13.1	Introduction	215
13.2	Setting Values	216
13.3	Paternalist Reservations	225
13.4	Communicating Values	228
13.5	Payment Recommendations	234
14	Conclusion	236
14.1	Introduction	236
14.2	Enabling Choice	237
14.3	Holism	243
14.4	In Closing	245
	<i>Appendix 1 Historic Currency Prices</i>	251
	<i>Appendix 2 Interviews</i>	255
	<i>Appendix 3 Payment and Assessment Matrices</i>	259
	<i>Bibliography</i>	279
	<i>Index</i>	309

TABLES

1.1 Exemplar programmes: information summary 13
5.1 Queensland Redress payments and values 70
5.2 Redress WA levels and payment values 82
6.1 Number of adjudicator settlements by CDN dollar value 103

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Many people and organisations contributed to this book. I used sabbatical leave and funding from Waipapa Taumata Rau | University of Auckland in 2014, 2018, and 2022 for researching and writing. During that period, University College Dublin (UCD), Ireland, and Griffith University, Australia, hosted me while I was conducting field research, and I thank Ben Tonra of UCD and Kathy Daly of Griffith for their hospitality. I also thank Kathy Daly and Juliet Davies for providing research material from their archives.

Interviewees contributed much to the work. Nearly every institution I contacted made serious efforts to provide assistance, and interviewees were generous with their valuable time and expertise. I also benefited from the hospitality of survivor agencies in Australia, Canada, Ireland, and Aotearoa New Zealand.

I deeply appreciate those who helped me with writing. Sonja Cooper, Geoff Kemp, Amanda Hill, David MacDonald, Kathy Smits, Phillipa White, Martin Wilkinson, and Emma Winter all read and commented upon chapter drafts. William and Roxane Winter helped me compile Appendix 3. Jordan Hanford read the entire book in draft, and his effective work as an editorial assistant saved me many scholarly blushes.

I thank Marianne Nield and Rachel Imrie of Cambridge University Press for their support and guidance. I would also like to thank Finola O'Sullivan, who initially supported the project. I am grateful to two anonymous readers for their helpful suggestions and guidance. The book benefited from expert editorial work provided by Aiswarya Narayanan and the team at Straive.

I acknowledge my use of previously published material. Chapter 3 is a revised version of my article 'State Redress as Public Policy: A Two-Side Coin', first published in the *Journal of Law and Social Policy*,

Volume 31, 2019. Chapter 11 borrows some material from ‘Tools for Tragedy: Procedures for Assessing Historic Redress Claims’, *Politics and Policy*, 49(1), 162–85 (<https://doi.org/10.1111/polp.12385>). I thank Wiley & Sons for permission to use that material.

Finally, I thank Keith Wiffin for agreeing to let me start the book with his story.

ABBREVIATIONS

ADR	alternative dispute resolution
AFN	Assembly of First Nations (Canada)
ALS	Aboriginal Legal Service (Australia)
AUD	Australian dollars
CDN	Canadian/Canadian dollars
CEP	Common Experience Payments (Canada)
CLAS	Confidential Listening and Assistance Service (New Zealand)
HCP	Historic Claims Process (New Zealand)
IAP	Independent Assessment Process (Canada)
IRSRC	Indian Residential Schools Resolution Canada
IRSSA	Indian Residential Schools Settlement Agreement (Canada)
MSD	Ministry of Social Development (New Zealand)
NAC	National Administrative Committee (Canada)
NARA	National Research and Analysis Unit (Canada)
NGO	non-governmental organisation
NRS	National Redress Scheme (Australia)
NZD	New Zealand dollars
RHSP	Resolutions Health Support Program (Canada)
SAO	Settlement Agreement Operations Branch (Canada)
TRC	Truth and Reconciliation Commission (Canada)
the VBB Principles	Basic Principles and Guidelines on the Right to a Remedy and Reparation for Victims of Gross Violations of International Human Rights Law and Serious Violations of International Humanitarian Law (United Nations)