

CAUSATION IN THE LAW OF THE WORLD TRADE ORGANIZATION

Causation in the Law of the World Trade Organization: An Econometric Approach is for both scholars and practitioners of WTO law with an interest in the causal questions that WTO law raises. Assuming no prior knowledge of causal philosophy or statistical analysis, Catherine Gascoigne discusses the problems in the current approach to assessing causation in the WTO jurisprudence and she then proposes an alternative methodology that draws on causal philosophy and econometric analysis. The book demonstrates how this methodology could be harnessed to make causal determinations for the purpose of implementing trade remedies and also to make out claims of serious prejudice. Additionally, the book argues that the methodology could be helpful for assessing the impact of domestic legislation on policy objectives under the General Exceptions and the Technical Barriers to Trade Agreement. The final chapter draws out the implications of using the methodology in order to calculate the amount of retaliation permissible under the Dispute Settlement Understanding.

CATHERINE GASCOIGNE is a Macquarie Research Fellow at Macquarie Law School, Macquarie University. She earned her PhD in Law at the University of Cambridge, where she studied as both a Gates Cambridge Scholar and a W. M. Tapp Scholar. She won the Society of International Economic Law/Journal of International Economic Law/Oxford University Press Essay Prize (2018/2019), which is awarded to an early career researcher for the best essay on any subject relating to international economic law.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-316-51130-5 — Causation in the Law of the World Trade Organization
An Econometric Approach
Catherine Gascoigne
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE INTERNATIONAL TRADE
AND ECONOMIC LAW

Series Editors

Professor Lorand Bartels

University of Cambridge

Professor Thomas Cottier

University of Berne

Professor Tomer Broude

Hebrew University of Jerusalem

Professor Andrea K. Bjorklund

McGill University, Montréal

Processes of economic regionalisation and globalisation have intensified over the last decades, accompanied by increases in the regulation of international trade and economics at the levels of international, regional and national laws. At the same time, significant challenges have arisen with respect to economic liberalization, rule-based systems of trade and investment, and their political and social impacts. The subject matter of this series is international economic law, in this contemporary context. Its core is the regulation of international trade, investment, finance and cognate areas such as intellectual property and competition policy. The series publishes books on related regulatory areas, in particular human rights, labour, environment and culture, as well as sustainable development. These areas are horizontally interconnected and vertically linked at the international, regional and national levels. The series also includes works on governance, dealing with the structure and operation of international organisations related to the field of international economic law, and the way they interact with other subjects of international and national law. The series aims to include excellent legal doctrinal treatises, as well as cutting-edge interdisciplinary works that engage law and the social sciences and humanities.

Books in the Series

Causation in the Law of the World Trade Organization: An Econometric Approach

Catherine Gascoigne

The European Union and International Investment Law Reform: Between Aspirations and Reality

Ivana Damjanovic

Agricultural Domestic Support under the WTO: Experience and Prospects

Lars Brink and David Orden

Capital Controls and International Economic Law

Bryan Mercurio

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
 978-1-316-51130-5 — Causation in the Law of the World Trade Organization
 An Econometric Approach
 Catherine Gascoigne
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

The Law and Practice of Global ICT Standardization

Olia Kanevskaia Whitaker

Between Market Economy and State Capitalism: China's State-Owned Enterprises and the World Trading System

Henry S. Gao and Weihuan Zhou

New Asian Regionalism in International Economic Law

Pasha L. Hsieh

Essential Interoperability Standards: Interfacing Intellectual Property and Competition in International Economic Law

Simon Brinsmead

Digital Services in International Trade Law

Ines Willemyns

Law and Politics on Export Restrictions: WTO and Beyond

Chien-Huei Wu

Energy in International Trade Law: Concepts, Regulation and Changing Markets

Anna-Alexandra Marhold

Shareholders' Claims for Reflective Loss in International Investment Law

Lukas Vanhonnaeker

Transparency in the WTO SPS and TBT Agreements: The Real Jewel in the Crown

Marianna B. Karttunen

Preferential Services Liberalization: The Case of the European Union and Federal States

Johanna Jacobsson

Emerging Powers in International Economic Law: Cooperation, Competition and Transformation

Sonia E. Rolland and David M. Trubek

Commitments and Flexibilities in the WTO Agreement on Subsidies and Countervailing Measures

José Guilherme Moreno Caiado

The Return of the Home State to Investor-State Disputes: Bringing Back Diplomatic Protection?

Rodrigo Polanco

Industrial Policy and the World Trade Organization: Between Legal Constraints and Flexibilities

Sherzod Shadikhodjaev

The Public International Law of Trade in Legal Services

David Collins

The Prudential Carve-Out for Financial Services: Rationale and Practice in the GATS and Preferential Trade Agreements

Carlo Maria Cantore

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-316-51130-5 — Causation in the Law of the World Trade Organization
An Econometric Approach
Catherine Gascoigne
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Preferential Services Liberalization: The Case of the European Union and Federal States

Johanna Jacobsson

Judicial Acts and Investment Treaty Arbitration

Berk Demirkol

Distributive Justice and World Trade Law: A Political Theory of International Trade Regulation

Oisín Suttle

Freedom of Transit and Access to Gas Pipeline Networks under WTO Law

Vitalily Pogoretsky

Reclaiming Development in the World Trading System, 2nd edition

Yong-Shik Lee

Developing Countries and Preferential Services Trade

Charlotte Sieber-Gasser

Establishing Judicial Authority in International Economic Law

Edited by Joanna Jemielniak, Laura Nielsen and Henrik Palmer Olsen

WTO Dispute Settlement and the TRIPS Agreement: Applying Intellectual Property Standards in a Trade Law Framework

Matthew Kennedy

Trade, Investment, Innovation and their Impact on Access to Medicines: An Asian Perspective

Locknie Hsu

The WTO and International Investment Law: Converging Systems

Jürgen Kurtz

The Law, Economics and Politics of International Standardisation

Edited by Panagiotis Delimatsis

Export Restrictions on Critical Minerals and Metals: Testing the Adequacy of WTO Disciplines

Ilaria Espa

Optimal Regulation and the Law of International Trade: The Interface between the Right to Regulate and WTO Law

Boris Rigod

The Social Foundations of World Trade: Norms, Community, and Constitution

Sungjoon Cho

Public Participation and Legitimacy in the WTO

Yves Bonzon

The Challenge of Safeguards in the WTO

Fernando Piérولا

General Interests of Host States in International Investment Law

Edited by Giorgio Sacerdoti, with Pia Acconci, Mara Valenti and Anna De Luca

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-316-51130-5 — Causation in the Law of the World Trade Organization
An Econometric Approach
Catherine Gascoigne
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

WTO Disciplines on Subsidies and Countervailing Measures: Balancing Policy Space and Legal Constraints

Dominic Coppens

The Law of Development Cooperation: A Comparative Analysis of the World Bank, the EU and Germany

Philipp Dann

Liberalizing International Trade after Doha: Multilateral, Plurilateral, Regional, and Unilateral Initiatives

David A. Gantz

Domestic Judicial Review of Trade Remedies: Experiences of the Most Active WTO Members

Edited by Müslüm Yilmaz

The Relevant Market in International Economic Law: A Comparative Antitrust and GATT Analysis

Christian A. Melischek

International Organizations in WTO Dispute Settlement: How Much Institutional Sensitivity?

Marina Foltea

Public Services and International Trade Liberalization: Human Rights and Gender Implications

Barnali Choudhury

The Law and Politics of WTO Waivers: Stability and Flexibility in Public International Law

Isabel Feichtner

African Regional Trade Agreements as Legal Regimes

James Thuo Gathii

Processes and Production Methods (PPMs) in WTO Law: Interfacing Trade and Social Goals

Christiane R. Conrad

Non-Discrimination in International Trade in Services: 'Likeness' in WTO/GATS

Nicolas F. Diebold

The Law, Economics and Politics of Retaliation in WTO Dispute Settlement

Edited by Chad P. Bown and Joost Pauwelyn

The Multilateralization of International Investment Law

Stephan W. Schill

Trade Policy Flexibility and Enforcement in the WTO: A Law and Economics Analysis

Simon A. B. Schropp

CAUSATION IN THE LAW OF THE WORLD TRADE ORGANIZATION

An Econometric Approach

CATHERINE GASCOIGNE

Macquarie University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-316-51130-5 — Causation in the Law of the World Trade Organization
An Econometric Approach
Catherine Gascoigne
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,
a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of
education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781316511305

DOI: 10.1017/9781009052146

© Catherine Gascoigne 2023

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions
of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take
place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2023

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

A Cataloging-in-Publication data record for this book is available from the Library of Congress

ISBN 978-1-316-51130-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence
or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this
publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will
remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-316-51130-5 — Causation in the Law of the World Trade Organization
An Econometric Approach
Catherine Gascoigne
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

For my parents, John and Kate

CONTENTS

List of Figures page xiv
Acknowledgements xvi
Table of Cases xviii
List of Legal Instruments xxix
List of Abbreviations xxxiii

Introduction 1
Overview of Argument 1
Advantages and Disadvantages of an Econometric Approach 7
Outline of Chapters 12
Causal Questions That Fall Outside the Scope of This Book 15
 Breach of an Obligation 16
 Sanitary or Phytosanitary Measures to Relate to Prescribed
 Policy Objectives 19
 Potential Market Impacts 24
 Nullification or Impairment of Benefits 27
Sources and Methodology 29
Limitations of This Book 30

1 Causal Theory 32
1.1 Introduction 32
1.2 Cause-in-Fact Causal Theory 36
 1.2.1 Some Non-quantitative Approaches to Determining
 Causation 36
 1.2.2 Some Quantitative Approaches to
 Determining Causation 54
1.3 Cause-in-Law Causal Theory 61
1.4 Conclusion 65

2 Trade Remedies 68
2.1 Introduction 68
2.2 The Meaning of a ‘Genuine and Substantial Relationship of Cause
and Effect’ 72
2.3 The Meaning of ‘Injury’ in the Trade Remedies Context 74

2.4	The 'Multi-factorial' Approach	76
2.5	The Role of the Non-attribution Analysis in the Face of the Multi-factorial Approach	80
2.6	Breaking the Causal Link	84
2.6.1	Popularity of the 'Breaking the Causal Link' Approach with Domestic Competent Authorities	84
2.6.2	The Appellate Body's Assessment of the 'Breaking the Causal Link' Approach	91
2.7	The Tripartite Non-attribution/Causal Link Analysis	97
2.7.1	The First Step of the Tripartite Non-attribution/Causal Link Analysis	97
2.7.2	The Second Step of the Tripartite Non-attribution/Causal Link Analysis	97
2.7.3	The Third Step of the Tripartite Non-attribution/Causal Link Analysis	118
2.8	Conclusion	123
3	Serious Prejudice	125
3.1	Introduction	125
3.2	The Nature of a Market Phenomenon in Relation to a Finding of Serious Prejudice	128
3.2.1	Articles 6.3(a) and (b): Displacement and Impedance	129
3.2.2	Article 6.3(c): Significant Price Suppression or Price Depression	130
3.2.3	Article 6.3(d): Increase in Market Share	133
3.3	Jurisprudence Concerning Non-attribution and Causal Link Analysis in Respect of a Serious Prejudice Analysis	134
3.4	The Unitary vis-à-vis the Bifurcated Process for Determining the Cause and Effect of a Market Phenomenon	136
3.5	Non-attribution: The First Two Steps of the Tripartite Process	140
3.5.1	Introduction	140
3.5.2	The First Step of the Non-attribution Process	142
3.5.3	The Second Step of the Non-attribution Process	142
3.6	Causal Link: The Third Step of the Tripartite Process	158
3.7	Conclusion	166
4	Regulating for Non-trade Purposes	169
4.1	Introduction	169
4.2	Jurisprudence Concerning the Relationship between a Measure and Its Policy Objective under the General Exceptions and Article 2.2 of the TBT Agreement	173
4.2.1	The Relationship between a Measure and a Policy Objective as Causal in Nature	173
4.2.2	The Difficulty of Determining a Causal Link	181

CONTENTS		xiii
4.2.3	Predicting the Future Effect of a Measure on a Policy Objective	183
4.3	Non-attribution: The First Two Steps of the Tripartite Process	197
4.3.1	Introduction	197
4.3.2	The First Step of the Non-attribution Process	198
4.3.3	The Second Step of the Non-attribution Process	200
4.4	Causal Link: The Third Step of the Tripartite Process	204
4.5	Conclusion	204
5	Retaliatory Measures	206
5.1	Introduction	206
5.2	Jurisprudence Concerning Non-attribution and Causal Link Analysis in Respect of the Retaliatory Measures	210
5.2.1	Causation in Retaliation Arbitrations	210
5.2.2	Non-attribution in Retaliation Arbitrations	214
5.3	Causal Link Analysis in the Determination of Nullification and Impairment	220
5.4	Non-attribution: The First Two Steps of the Tripartite Process	227
5.4.1	Introduction	227
5.4.2	The First Step of the Non-attribution Process	229
5.4.3	The Second Step of the Non-attribution Process	230
5.5	Causal Link Analysis: The Third Step of the Tripartite Process	233
5.6	Quantification of the Level of Nullification and Impairment	234
5.7	Conclusion	238
	Conclusion	240
	Restatement of Argument	240
	Current Jurisprudence	241
	Contribution of This Book	243
	<i>Bibliography</i>	246
	<i>Index</i>	252

FIGURES

- 1.1 The application of the *sine qua non* test to the factual scenario of Beatrice distracting Adam from supervising the burning wood 38
- 1.2 Representation of the one factor cause in the *sine qua non* analysis 45
- 1.3 Representation of the importance of the set in the weak necessity/strong sufficiency test 45
- 1.4 The weak necessity/strong sufficiency analysis of duplicative over-determination 48
- 1.5 The weak necessity/strong sufficiency analysis of pre-emptive over-determination 50
- 1.6 Hart and Honoré's 'causally relevant factor' analysis of contributory duplicative over-determination cases 51
- 1.7 Wright's NESS analysis of contributory duplicative over-determination cases 53
- 1.8 Graph of the number of houses burnt down in Sylvania from 2012–17 55
- 1.9 Binomial distribution of the probability of the number of houses incinerated based on the null hypothesis 60
- 1.10 Overview of the three steps of the Tripartite Non-attribution/Causal Link Analysis 64
- 2.1 Example of how an 'overall' injury to industry might be divided into sub-injuries 75
- 2.2 Graphic illustration of the 'sufficiency of imports approach' 77
- 2.3 Graphic illustration of the 'multi-factorial approach' 78
- 2.4 Overview of Steps One, Two and Three of the Tripartite Non-attribution/Causation Analysis: Non-attribution and causation analysis under Articles 4.2 of the Safeguards Agreement, 3.5 of the Antidumping Agreement and 15.5 of the SCM Agreement 98
- 2.5 Step Two of the Tripartite Non-attribution/Causal Link Analysis: Example of applied apportionment causal link test: Application of the *sine qua non* test 104
- 2.6 Step Two of the Tripartite Non-attribution/Causal Link Analysis: Example of applied apportionment causal link test: Hart and Honoré's 'Causal Factor Test' 106
- 2.7 Step Two of the Tripartite Non-attribution/Causal Link Analysis: Example of applied apportionment causal link test: Richard Wright's NESS test 109

LIST OF FIGURES xv

2.8 Step Two of the Tripartite Non-attribution/Causal Link Analysis: example of the aggregation of individually insufficient factors under Wright’s NESS test 110

2.9 Step Three of the Tripartite Non-attribution/Causal Link Analysis: Causal Link Analysis 122

3.1 Overview of Steps One, Two and Three of the Tripartite Non-attribution/Causal Link Analysis: Non-attribution and causal link analysis under Article 6.3 of the SCM Agreement 143

3.2 Representation of aggregation 150

3.3 Representation of cumulation 152

4.1 Probability distribution of seals killed per year according to the null hypothesis 191

4.2 Linear regression analysis of the data represented in Table 4.1 194

4.3 Overview of Steps One, Two and Three of the Tripartite Non-attribution/Causal Link Analysis with respect to Articles XX of the GATT, XIV of the GATS and Article 2.2 of the TBT Agreement 199

5.1 Overview of Steps One, Two and Three of the Tripartite Non-attribution/Causal Link Analysis with respect to Articles 22.6 DSU and 4.10 SCM Agreement 231

5.2 Sub-injury’s causal contribution 237

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This book has had a relatively long gestation – beginning as a doctoral thesis at the University of Cambridge and ending during my time as a Research Affiliate at the University of Sydney. Throughout that time, this book has benefitted, both financially and intellectually, from the generosity of many people and institutions that I wish gratefully to acknowledge here.

First and foremost, I would like to thank Professor Lorand Bartels MBE (University of Cambridge), my doctoral supervisor. In particular, I would like to thank him for encouraging me to write on this neglected topic and for guiding me through its development with his characteristic academic rigour, intellectual enthusiasm and wry wit. Additionally, I am greatly indebted to Professor Michael Waibel (University of Vienna) and Professor Jan Wouters (KU Leuven), my doctoral examiners. In addition to providing invaluable advice about how to revise my doctoral thesis for publication, they also generously provided me with introductions to domestic authorities who were able to assist with the domestic approaches discussed in Chapter 2 of this book. Professor David Howarth (University of Cambridge) and my first-year examiner, Professor Alexander (Sandy) Steel (University of Oxford) also provided useful comments on some early drafts of my doctoral thesis that helped to shape its final form.

Additionally, I would like to express my profound gratitude to the Gates Cambridge Trust for supporting my doctoral studies at the University of Cambridge. I am also very thankful for the further financial support of the WM Tapp Studentship from Gonville and Caius College, Cambridge, the Gowrie Scholarship and the Australian Bicentennial Scholarship Award. Finally, I would like to thank the University of Sydney Law School (particularly Professor Chester Brown) for allowing me to be a Research Affiliate during the final stages of completing this book.

Furthermore, I would like to gratefully acknowledge several domestic authorities for the information that they helped to provide regarding the causation and non-attribution analysis discussed in Chapter 2 of the

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

xvii

book. In particular, I wish to thank: the United States International Trade Commission, especially Karl von Schrilitz, Assistant General Counsel for Import Injury; the United Kingdom Trade Remedies Authority; the Antidumping Commission, Australia; the Directorate-General for Trade of the European Commission; and the Trade and International Team within the Ministry of Business, Innovation and Employment, New Zealand. I also wish to thank the Government of Canada's Trade Law Bureau.

My final, fondest and most profound thanks must go to my family for their tireless support of all of my academic endeavours. First, I would like to thank my parents, John and Kate, to whom this book is dedicated as a token of my appreciation. Lastly, I would like to express my enormous gratitude to my husband, Andrew, as well as my children, Amelia and Alexander, for so graciously accommodating the temporal and material pressures that large academic projects place on family life.

It is important to note that, with permission from Cambridge University Press, parts of this book have been published elsewhere. First, a significant part of Chapter 2 has been published as a journal article: Catherine Gascoigne, 'The Determination of Causation in the Application of Trade Remedies' (2021) 20(1) WTR 56. Moreover, select parts of Chapters 3, 4 and 5 appear in the following book chapter: Catherine Gascoigne, 'A *Priori* Causal Inferences in the Law of the World Trade Organization' in Kajtar, Cali and Milanovic (eds), *Secondary Rules of Primary Importance in International Law: Attribution, Causality, Evidence and Standards of Review in the Practice of International Courts and Tribunals* (European Society of International Law Series) (OUP 2022).

Finally, the jurisprudence cited in this book was updated to 31 May 2022.