

THE WRITING ON THE WALL

As Israel's control of the Occupied Palestinian Territory nears its fiftieth anniversary, *The Writing on the Wall* offers a critical perspective on the international law of occupation. Advocating a normative and functional approach to occupation and to the question of when it exists, it analyzes the application of humanitarian and human rights law, pointing to the risk of using the law of occupation in its current version to legitimize new variations of conquest and colonialism. The book points to the need for reconsidering the law of occupation in light of changing forms of control, such as those evident in Gaza. Although the Israeli occupation is a main focal point, the book broadens its compass to look at other cases, such as Iraq, Northern Cyprus, and Western Sahara, highlighting the role that international law plays in all of these cases.

PROFESSOR AEYAL GROSS teaches at the Faculty of Law, Tel Aviv University. He also teaches regularly as a guest at SOAS, University of London. His research and writing focus on international human rights law and international humanitarian law. He has previously published a comparative study, coedited with Colleen Flood: *The Right to Health at the Public/Private Divide* (Cambridge University Press, 2014).

THE WRITING ON THE WALL

Rethinking the International Law of Occupation

AEYAL GROSS



Cambridge University Press
 978-1-316-50932-6 — The Writing on the Wall
 Aeyal Gross
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 4843/24, 2nd Floor, Ansari Road, Daryaganj, Delhi 110002, India
 79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
 Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781316509326
 10.1017/9781316536308

© Aeyal Gross 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Gross, Aeyal, author.

Title: The writing on the wall: rethinking the international law of occupation / Aeyal Gross.

Description: New York: Cambridge University Press, 2017. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2016052799 | ISBN 9781107145962 (hardback) | ISBN 9781316509326 (paper back)

Subjects: LCSH: Military occupation.

Classification: LCC KZ6429 .G76 2017 | DDC 341.6/6--dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2016052799>

ISBN 978-1-107-14596-2 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-316-50932-6 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	page vii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xi
Introduction: <i>Jus ad occupation</i> and <i>jus in occupation</i>	1
1 The Ends and Fictions of Occupation: Between Fact and Norm	17
2 The Indeterminacy of Occupation: From Conceptualism to the Functional Approach	52
3 Indeterminacy and Control in the Occupied Palestinian Territory	136
4 The Construction of a Wall between The Hague and Jerusalem: Humanitarian Law or a Fata Morgana of Humanitarian Law	265
5 The Securitization of Human Rights: Are Human Rights the Emperor's New Clothes of the International Law of Occupation?	338
<i>Bibliography</i>	397
<i>Index</i>	429

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I first presented what would form the skeleton for this book's major arguments in the closing plenary of a conference sponsored by Tel Aviv University, the Hebrew University, and the International Committee of the Red Cross, marking the fortieth anniversary of Israel's occupation of the Occupied Palestinian Territory. The publication of this book, as we approach the fiftieth anniversary of this occupation, attests not only to my engagement in other ventures that prolonged the research for this project but also, in a way, to the reflection of the subject matter in the writing process: something that had been meant to be temporary but at times seems indefinite, indeterminate, and elusive. But despite the temptation to keep it as open-ended as some of the situations it addresses, the book had to go to print.

I wish to use this opportunity to thank many who helped me reach this point. First, warm thanks to Dean Hanoch Dagan of the Tel Aviv University Faculty of Law for enabling the extended leave during which I began my research for this book, and to his successors – Dean Daphne Barak-Erez and Dean Ron Harris – for their support and for the funding that made the research possible. I am grateful to my colleagues and students at Tel Aviv for their engagement over many years, and to the Tami Steinmetz Center for Peace Research at Tel Aviv University for its generous support, particularly to Mordechai Tamarkin, who heads the Center, and to Ephraim Lavie, its director.

Being a visiting fellow at the University of London's Institute of Advanced Legal Studies allowed me to pursue this research, and I am grateful to the Institute's director at the time, Avrom Sherr, and to his assistant, Eliza Boudier, for their warm hospitality. I am also thankful to The School of Law at SOAS, University of London, and especially to Matt Craven, until recently Dean of the Faculty of Law and Social Sciences, for welcoming me since my first arrival in London.

Heartfelt thanks to Catriona Drew, who welcomed me to London and to the SOAS class on Israel/Palestine and international law, which we have

been teaching together since and where many of the ideas in this book were played out, and to our students over the years. I am grateful to Catriona for her friendship, collegiality, and advice; her careful reading and commenting on much of this manuscript; and the many Friday afternoons spent after class at the London Review of Books Cake Shop over her flat white coffee and my oolong tea discussing our work and our lives.

I deeply appreciate the constant advice, support, and friendship of Susan Marks of the London School of Economics and Political Science.

Back at Tel Aviv, I benefited from my involvement with several human rights organizations. I am a member of the board in two of them – the Association for Civil Rights in Israel (ACRI) and Gisha: Legal Center for the Freedom of Movement. At ACRI, I especially thank the lawyers who headed the department dealing with the Occupied Territories – first Limor Yehuda and later Tamar Feldman. Interaction with them and with the practicalities of legal work regarding the Occupied Territories enriched my perspectives. At Gisha, I am particularly grateful to the founders, Kenneth Mann and Sari Bashi. Sari was the organization's first executive director. By (literally) asking me on board, she and Kenneth ensured my constant interaction with their work on Gaza, which has been extremely significant to my research and my writing. Many thanks to Eitan Diamond, who succeeded Sari as Gisha's executive director, for his continued engagement and for our many conversations on related topics, also during his previous positions first in B'Tselem and later with the International Committee of the Red Cross. My consultative role in the reports that Gisha issued on the occupation of Gaza after the disengagement, the first one written by Kenneth and Sari, and the second by Sari with Tamar Feldman (when Tamar worked at Gisha before moving to ACRI), intertwined with and broadened my writing. ACRI and Gisha were involved in some of the litigation discussed in the book. The opinions expressed in the book, however, are solely my own. Some of the discussion concerning Gaza in Chapter 3 draws on an article I co-wrote with Tamar Feldman on food security in Gaza, and I am grateful for this cooperation.

My first academic article on occupation was co-written with Orna Ben-Naftali and Keren Michaeli, and the ideas laid out in that article form the basis for some of the arguments in Chapter 1 of this book. I am grateful to them both. I owe special and warm thanks to Orna for our many years of thinking together on the topic over much wining and dining, and for her enduring friendship.

I am grateful to Duncan Kennedy at Harvard Law School for his interest in this project and for his support ever since he was one of my dissertation

advisors. Although Martti Koskeniemi of the University of Helsinki was never formally my teacher, I have certainly been his student ever since I read his book, *From Apology to Utopia*, when I was in graduate school. I am grateful for his scholarship, which has vastly influenced the way I think about international law, and his continuing support. To paraphrase Oscar Schachter's observation about the "invisible college of international lawyers," I am grateful to the invisible (but to me very visible) college of those doing critical work in international law for their presence in my personal and academic life.

Thanks to Kevin Jon Heller for dedicating a symposium to the functional approach to occupation in the blog *Opinio Juris*, and to the other participants in the symposium for their insightful contributions.

Over the years, I have presented variations of the thoughts developed in the book in many forums, and I am grateful to their participants for their helpful insights. In particular, I wish to thank the European Society of International Law, at whose conferences some of the ideas presented here were discussed. Thanks to Yaara Alon, Orna Ben-Naftali, Eyal Benvenisti, Nehal Bhuta, Sandy Kedar, Barak Medina, Keren Michaeli, Avner Pinchuk, Amnon Reichman, and Yuval Shany, who read and commented on earlier articles on which some of the manuscript draws. I benefited from conversations with Ahmed Amara, Francoise Hampson, Karen Knop, Noam Lubell, Lila Margalit, and Marco Sassoli.

Very special and warm thanks to Eliav Liebllich, who read and commented on the manuscript, for his dedication as well as his insights, friendship, and collegiality.

Thanks to Assaf Even-Chen and Nimrod Karin, who worked with me as research assistants on some of the earlier articles I wrote on occupation. I am grateful for the excellent work of several research assistants during the research and writing of this book: Nadav Dishon, Yehuda Goor, Adar Grayvesky, Alon Harel, Dana Lloyd, Roy Mattar, Yael Vias-Gvirsman, Hedi Viterbo (by now a distinguished scholar), and David Zlotogorski. Peter Teishev has worked as my research assistant on this project for the longest period, and I highly cherish his commitment, his indispensable role, and his dedication to this book as if it was his own.

Batya Stein reviewed different stages of the manuscript over several years. I am grateful for her superb editing skills, which contributed enormously to make this a better book, and for her unfailing support.

Warm thanks to Finola O'Sullivan at Cambridge University Press, who urged me to submit the book to the Press, and to Elizabeth Spicer, who, as commissioning editor, was immediately interested and vigorously shepherded the review and publication process.

Finally, I am grateful to my parents, Zvia and Joseph, and to my siblings, Raz and Vardit, and their families for their unwavering love and support, and to Ofer, who has traveled with me through this process and travels with me through life and without whose love and encouragement none of this would have been possible.

Two chapters in the book draw on previously published articles, which I have significantly revised and updated for this book. Chapter 4 draws on *The Construction of a Wall between The Hague and Jerusalem: The Enforcement and Limits of Humanitarian Law and the Structure of Occupation*, 19 LEIDEN JOURNAL OF INTERNATIONAL LAW 393 (2006). Chapter 5 draws on *Human Proportions: Are Human Rights the Emperor's New Clothes of the International Law of Occupation?* 18 EUROPEAN JOURNAL OF INTERNATIONAL LAW 1 (2007), and on my chapter, "The Righting of the Law of Occupation," in *THE FRONTIERS OF HUMAN RIGHTS* (Nehal Bhuta ed., Oxford University Press, 2016).

ABBREVIATIONS

AMA	Agreement on Movement and Access (Gaza)
AP1	Additional Protocol 1 of June 8, 1977, to the Geneva Conventions
CPA	Coalition Provisional Authority (Iraq)
DRC	Democratic Republic of Congo
ECHR	European Convention of Human Rights 1950
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
EECC	Ethiopia–Eritrea Claims Commission
GCIV	Fourth Geneva Convention (Geneva Convention Relative to the Protection of Civilian Persons in Time of War) 1949
HCJ	High Court of Justice (Israel)
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights 1966
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICRC	International Committee of the Red Cross
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia
IHL	International Humanitarian Law
IHRL	International Human Rights law
NKR	Nagorno-Karabakh Republic
OPT	Occupied Palestinian Territory
PA	Palestinian Authority
TRNC	Turkish Republic of Northern Cyprus
UNSC	United Nations Security Council