

LAW AND POLITICS ON EXPORT RESTRICTIONS

Delving into export restrictive measures this book links the key areas of WTO law, public international law, investment and competition law to expose how and why WTO rules on export dimension are insufficient due to export bias; how public international law helps to justify their adoption or maintenance; and how investment and competition laws contribute to their regulation. Built on works on accession protocols and national security exceptions, this book goes beyond international trade law and looks into international political economy, competition and investment law. It contributes to debates in conceptualising public and private forms of export restrictions, appreciating the complementary nature of trade and competition law in disciplining them; capturing the dynamic between trade and investment policies for their effectuation and circumvention; and bridging trade law and public international law to better understand their impositions for political and diplomatic purposes with the invocation of the national security justification.

CHIEN-HUEI WU earned his doctoral degree in EUI in 2009 and was awarded Ta-You Wu Memorial Award in 2014. He published WTO and the Greater China: Economic Integration and Dispute Resolution (2012) and co-edited Law and Diplomacy in the Management of EU-Asia Trade and Investment Relations (2019).



CAMBRIDGE INTERNATIONAL TRADE AND ECONOMIC LAW

Series editors

Dr Lorand Bartels University of Cambridge

Professor Thomas Cottier University of Berne

Professor Tomer Broude Hebrew University of Jerusalem

Professor Andrea K. Bjorklund McGill University, Montréal

Processes of economic regionalisation and globalisation have intensified over the last decades, accompanied by increases in the regulation of international trade and economics at the levels of international, regional and national laws. At the same time, significant challenges have arisen with respect to economic liberalisation, rule-based systems of trade and investment, and their political and social impacts. The subject matter of this series is international economic law, in this contemporary context. Its core is the regulation of international trade, investment, finance and cognate areas such as intellectual property and competition policy. The series publishes books on related regulatory areas, in particular human rights, labour, environment and culture, as well as sustainable development. These areas are horizontally interconnected and vertically linked at the international, regional and national levels. The series also includes works on governance, dealing with the structure and operation of international organisations related to the field of international economic law, and the way they interact with other subjects of international and national law. The series aims to include excellent legal doctrinal treatises, as well as cutting-edge interdisciplinary works that engage law and the social sciences and humanities.

Books in the series

Energy in International Trade Law: Concepts, Regulation and Changing Markets Anna-Alexandra Marhold

Essential Interoperability Standards: Interfacing Intellectual Property and Competition in International Economic Law Simon Brinsmead

Shareholders' Claims for Reflective Loss in International Investment Law Lukas Vanhonnaeker

Transparency in the WTO SPS and TBT Agreements: The Real Jewel in the Crown Marianna B. Karttunen



Emerging Powers in International Economic Law: Cooperation,

Competition and Transformation

Sonia E. Rolland and David M. Trubek

Commitments and Flexibilities in the WTO Agreement on Subsidies

and Countervailing Measures

José Guilherme Moreno Caiado

The Return of the Home State to Investor-State Disputes:

Bringing Back Diplomatic Protection?

Rodrigo Polanco

The Public International Law of Trade in Legal Services

David Collins

Industrial Policy and the World Trade Organization:

Between Legal Constraints and Flexibilities

Sherzod Shadikhodjaev

The Prudential Carve-Out for Financial Services: Rationale and

Practice in the GATS and Preferential Trade Agreements

Carlo Maria Cantore

Preferential Services Liberalization: The Case of the European

Union and Federal States

Johanna Jacobsson

Judicial Acts and Investment Treaty Arbitration

Berk Demirkol

Distributive Justice and World Trade Law: A Political Theory of

International Trade Regulation

Oisin Suttle

Freedom of Transit and Access to Gas Pipeline Networks under WTO Law

Vitalily Pogoretskyy

Reclaiming Development in the World Trading System, 2nd edition

Yong-Shik Lee

Developing Countries and Preferential Services Trade

Charlotte Sieber-Gasser

WTO Dispute Settlement and the TRIPS Agreement: Applying Intellectual

Property Standards in a Trade Law Framework

Matthew Kennedy

Establishing Judicial Authority in International Economic Law

Edited by Joanna Jemielniak, Laura Nielsen and Henrik Palmer Olsen

Trade, Investment, Innovation and their Impact on Access to Medicines:

An Asian Perspective

Locknie Hsu

The Law, Economics and Politics of International Standardisation

Edited by Panagiotis Delimatsis,

The WTO and International Investment Law: Converging Systems

Jürgen Kurtz



Export Restrictions on Critical Minerals and Metals:

Testing the Adequacy of WTO Disciplines

Ilaria Espa

Optimal Regulation and the Law of International Trade: The Interface between the Right to Regulate and WTO Law

The Social Foundations of World Trade: Norms, Community, and Constitution

Sungjoon Cho

Public Participation and Legitimacy in the WTO

Yves Bonzon

The Challenge of Safeguards in the WTO

Fernando Piérola

General Interests of Host States in International Investment Law

Edited by Giorgio Sacerdoti, with Pia Acconci,

Mara Valenti and Anna De Luca

The Law of Development Cooperation: A Comparative Analysis of the

World Bank, the EU and Germany

Philipp Dann

WTO Disciplines on Subsidies and Countervailing Measures:

Balancing Policy Space and Legal Constraints

Dominic Coppens

Domestic Judicial Review of Trade Remedies: Experiences of the Most

Active WTO Members

Edited by Müslüm Yilmaz

The Relevant Market in International Economic Law: A Comparative Antitrust and GATT Analysis

Christian A. Melischek

International Organizations in WTO Dispute Settlement: How Much Institutional Sensitivity?

Marina Foltea

Public Services and International Trade Liberalization: Human Rights and Gender Implications

Barnali Choudhury

The Law and Politics of WTO Waivers: Stability and Flexibility in Public International Law

Isabel Feichtner

African Regional Trade Agreements as Legal Regimes

James Thuo Gathii

Liberalizing International Trade after Doha: Multilateral, Plurilateral,

Regional, and Unilateral Initiatives

David A. Gantz



> Processes and Production Methods (PPMs) in WTO Law: Interfacing Trade and Social Goals

Christiane R. Conrad

Non-Discrimination in International Trade in Services:

'Likeness' in WTO/GATS

Nicolas F. Diebold

The Law, Economics and Politics of Retaliation in WTO Dispute Settlement

Edited by Chad P. Bown and Joost Pauwelyn

The Multilateralization of International Investment Law

Stephan W. Schill

Trade Policy Flexibility and Enforcement in the WTO:

A Law and Economics Analysis

Simon A. B. Schropp

Law and Politics on Export Restrictions: WTO and beyond

Chien-Huei Wu



LAW AND POLITICS ON EXPORT RESTRICTIONS

WTO and Beyond

CHIEN-HUEI WU

Academia Sinica, Taipei, Taiwan







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108948869

DOI: 10.1017/9781108953566

© Chien-Huei Wu 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2021 First paperback edition 2023

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data Names: Wu, Chien-Huei, author.

Title: Law and politics on export restrictions : WTO and beyond / Chien-Huei Wu, Academia Sinica, Taipei, Taiwan.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom; New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2021. | Series: Cambridge international trade and economic law | Includes bibliographical references and index

Identifiers: LCCN 2021019432 (print) | LCCN 2021019433 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108844789 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108948869 (paperback) | ISBN 9781108953566 (epub)

Subjects: LCSH: Export controls. | World Trade Organization.

Classification: LCC K3950 .W83 2021 (print) | LCC K3950 (ebook) | DDC 343.08/78-dc23

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2021019432

LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2021019433

ISBN 978-1-108-84478-9 Hardback ISBN 978-1-108-94886-9 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



To *Chia-Hua*, for her warm companionship in the past three decades



CONTENTS

Preface xiii

Table of Legislation xv

Table of Cases xviii

List of Acronyms and Abbreviations xx

- 1 Introduction
- 2 WTO Rules on Export Restrictions 20
- 3 Governing Export Restrictions: National Security and International Political Economy 112
- 4 Export Restrictions in the Global Supply Chain: Investment and Competition 192
- 5 Conclusion: Reconfiguring the Global Supply Chain in the Post-COVID-19 Era 261

Bibliography 270 Index 281



PREFACE

The genesis of this work dates back to 2012 and the publication of my first book based on my doctoral dissertation and the Panel Report on *China – Raw Materials*. Intrigued by the complexities surrounding the accession protocols, general exception and the limited regulation of export restrictions in the GATT/WTO system, I wished to explore the rationale responsible for the lack of disciplines under international trade law, which had resulted in only limited scholarly work and a general lack of attention to the subject matter. Eight years later, export restrictions proliferate – often, in the name of national security. Importantly, the Trump Administration has relied on export restrictions and controls in its trade war and technological race with China. The subsequent Clean Network Initiative and Economic Prosperity Network remind us of the East–West divide of the Cold War era when the Coordinating Committee for Multilateral Export Control played a critical role in governing trade flows.

The international economic relations we now face differ in important ways from those of the Cold War era. Crucially, international economic relations in the past few years have seen a process of securitisation – a reaction against the means employed by architects of the post-war economic order, de-politicisation and constitutionalisation, to prevent another catastrophe. Today, both China and Russia are members of the WTO, and GATT/WTO rules, originally designed for market economies, have been extended to these (formerly) communist countries. Besides, given economic globalisation, the economic interdependence between the United States and China is far closer than that between the United States and the Soviet Union. Moreover, due to technological advances, the line between civilian trade and controlled trade on strategic and military items is blurred. Thus, it is not entirely clear whether decoupling between the US and Chinese economies may be realised, and if so, in what way.

xiii



xiv PREFACE

This work spans a good deal of time, both in terms of its production and what is covered. It was finalised on 10 October 2020 and all information and websites and links were up to date then. I have benefited from funding from the Ministry of Science and Technology in Taiwan, and research visits to the World Trade Institute in Bern, the Law School of Georgetown University in Washington, DC, and the Max Planck Institute for Comparative Public Law and International Law in Heidelberg. I am also grateful to Ms Esther Liao for her research assistance, Jeffrey Cuvilier for proofreading the manuscript, and Joe Ng and Gemma Smith from Cambridge University Press for editorial help and bringing this book into being.

In my first book, I cited the words of Lord Alfred Tennyson in *Ulysses*. I would like to repeat in this book and hope my academic career will continue

To strive, to seek, to find, and not to yield



TABLE OF LEGISLATION

China-Australia FTA 50 USC Appendix (Exon-Florio Art. 1.3(a) 107 amendment) Art. 2.4 107 Art. 2170(b)(1)(A) 211 Art. 2170(d)(1) 211 Art. 2.7.1 107 Council Regulation (EU) No 833/2014, Art. 2170(d)(4) 212 Art. 2.1 179 **ASCM** Art. 1.1(a)(1) 235 Dairy Board Act of 1961, New Zealand Art. 14 247 Art. 11.3 235 DPA Art. 1.1(a)(1)(iv) 48 Art. 102 250 ASG DSU Art. 11.1(b) 242 Art. 22.3 166 Art. 11.4 242 Art. 11(1)(b) 59 Art. 3.3 19 Art. 6.2. 19 ATT Art. 5.2 & 11.1 122 EAR Art. 6 123 Art. 734.4(c) 185 Art. 7.1 123 EU-Chile Association Agreement Biological Weapons Convention Arts. 57 & 58 101 Art. 3 122 EU-Korea FTA Art. 2.11 102 Block Exemption Regulation Art. 2.9 102 Art. 1(1)(a) 252 EU-Mexico Cooperation Agreement Chemical Weapons Convention Art. 5(b) 101 Art. 1.1(a) 122 EU-Singapore FTA China's Accession Protocol Art. 2.11.2 102 Art. 11.3 66 Art. 2.11.3 102 Art. 8.1(a) 67 Art. 2.17.10 103 Art. 8.2 67 Art. 2.17.11 103 China-ASEAN Agreement on Trade in Art. 2.17.6 103 Goods Art. 2.17.9 103 Art. 8.1 106 Art. 2.7 103



xvi

TABLE OF LEGISLATION

Art. 2.11.3 103 Proposed Protocol on Transparency on Art. 2.17.7 103 **Export Licensing** EU-South Africa TDCA Art. 1 88 Art. 19.3 101 Art. 2.1 88 EU-Vietnam FTA Art. 4 89 Art. 2.12 102 Art. 5.1 89 Art. 2.14.1 102 **TFEU** Art. 2.14.2(b) 102 Art. 101(1) 250 **Export Control Regulation** Art. 102 250 Art. 2.1 139 The GATT FDI Screening Regulation Art. II1(a) 2 TPP Art. 3.1 214 Art. 3.2 & 3.3 214 Art. 2.13.1 105 Art. 4(1) 214 Art. 2.13.2 105 Art. 4(2) 214 Art. 2.13.3 105 Art. 8 214 Art. 2.13.4(b) 106 Art. 2.13.5 106 GCC-EFTA FTA Art. 2.4 107 **UN Charter** Art. 24(1) 123 NAFTA Art. 25 124 Art. 1102(2) 218 Art. 39 123 Art. 309.1 98 UNSC Resolution 1540 Art. 309.2 98 Art. 1 131 Art. 309.3 99 Art. 2 131 Art. 315.1(a) 99 Art. 3 131 Art. 315.1(b) 99 US-Australia FTA Art. 315.1(c) 99 Art. 2.11 104 Art. 315.2 100 Art. 2.19.1 105 NPT Art. 2.19.2 105 Art. 1, 2 & 4 123 Art. 2.19.3 105 Art. 2.19.2 105 Proposed Agreement on Export Taxes US-Chile FTA Art. 3.1(a) 90 Art. 3.11.1 104 Art. 3.1(b) 90 Art. 3.11.2(a) 105 Art. 5(a) & (b) 90 Art. 3.11.3 105 Art. 5(c) 90 Art. 3.13 105 Art. 6 90 Art. 3.11.2(c) 105 Art. 7 90

US-Korea FTA

Art. 2.11 104

Art. 8 90



TABLE OF LEGISLATION

xvii

Art. 2.18.1 105	
Art. 2.18.2(c)	105
Art. 2.18.4(b)	105
Art. 2.18.2(a)	105
USMCA	
Art. 2.11.2(a)	100
Art. 2.11.2(c)	100

Art. 2.11.3 100 Art. 2.11.4 101 US–Singapore FTA Art. 3.7.1 104 Art. 3.7.2 105 Art. 3.7.3 105



TABLE OF CASES

Acron OAO and Dorogobuzh OAO v. Council of the European Union 54 Argentina – Measures Affecting the Export of Bovine Hides and Import of Finished Leather 7, 40

Bahrain – Measures relating to Trade in Goods and Services, and Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights 155

Canada – Measure Affecting Exports of Unprocessed Herring and Salmon 30, 109

Canada – Measures Relating to Exports of Wheat and Treatment of Imported Grain 246

Canada - Softwood Lumber 37, 39, 40, 41, 42, 43, 44, 45, 46, 52

China – Measures Affecting Imports of Automobile Parts 70

China – Measures Related to the Exportation of Rare Earths, Tungsten, and Molybdenum 6, 11, 65, 109, 110, 262

China – Measures Related to the Exportation of Various Raw Materials 6, 7, 11, 17, 18, 26, 27, 28, 65, 66, 70, 80, 103, 109, 110, 262 CMS v. Argentina 159 Columbia – Port of Entry 25

Dassonville 95 Delhaize v. Promalvin 95, 97 Établissements Delhaize frères and
Compagnie Le Lion SA v. Promalvin
SA and AGE Bodegas Unidas SA 95
European Union – Anti-Dumping
Measures on Biodiesel from
Argentina 55, 56

Fediol v. Commission 36 FTC v. Mylan Labs Inc. 256

General Motors v. Commission 253
Germany – Icelandic Fishery Dispute – Ban
on Icelandic Fish Landings 14, 175
Germany v. Iceland 175
GlaxoSmithKline Services Unlimited v.
Commission 254
Groenveld BV, Haarlem v. Produktschap
voor Vee en Vlees, Rijswijk 95

Hammond Lead Products, Inc. v. United States 42

India – Autos 25 India – Quantitative Restrictions 25

Japan - Film 240, 241

Japan - Measures Affecting Consumer
Photographic Film and Paper 240

Japan - Measures Related to the
Exportation of Products and
Technology to Korea 189

Japan - Restrictions on Imports of Certain
Agricultural Products 238

xviii



TABLE OF CASES

xix

Japan - Trade in Semi-Conductors 238, 239

Javico v. Yves St Laurent 254, 255

Korea - Commercial Vessels 235

Nicaragua v. United States of America 158, 159, 177

Oebel 95, 96

Pope & Talbot, Inc. v. The Government of Canada 204, 217, 218, 219, 220, 221, 222, 223, 224, 225, 226, 229

Procureur du Roi v. Benoît and Gustave Dassonville 95

Russia – Measures concerning Traffic in Transit 81, 151, 152, 158, 164, 168, 170, 171, 186, 188, 190, 191

Russian Federation – Measures on the Importation of Live Pigs, Pork and Other Pig Products from the European Union 81, 180

S. D. Myers, Inc. v. The Government of Canada 204, 227, 228, 229, 230, 231, 232

Saudi Arabia – Measures concerning the Protection of Intellectual Property Rights 9, 155, 156, 167, 168 Saudi Arabia – Measures relating to Trade in Goods and Services, and Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights 9, 155

Tempa Elec. Co. v. Nashville Coal Co. 257

Trugman-Nash, Inc. v. New Zealand Dairy Bd. 247, 248

Ukraine – Export Prohibitions on Wood Products 103

United Arab Emirates – Measures relating to Trade in Goods and Services, and Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights 9, 155

United States - Certain Measures on Steel and Aluminum Product 143

United States – Countervailing Duty Investigation on Dynamic Random Access Memory Semiconductors (DRAMS) from Korea 50, 236, 237

United States - Measures Treating
Exports Restraints as Subsidies 17,
21, 36, 37, 47, 48, 49, 50, 52

US - Anti-Dumping and Countervailing Duties (China) 235, 236

US - COOL 26

US – Corrosion-Resistant Steel Sunset Review 233

US - Section 337 219



ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

1956 FCN 1956 Treaty of Friendship, Commerce and Navigation between the

US and Nicaragua

ADA Anti-Dumping Agreement AoA Agreement on Agriculture

ASCM Agreement on Subsidies and Countervailing Duties

ASG Agreement on Safeguards
ATT Arm Trade Treaty

BIS Bureau of Industrial Security
CCL Commerce Control List
CFI Court of First Instance

CFIUS Committee on Foreign Investment in the United States

CHINCOM China Committee

CJEU Court of Justice of European Union
CNOOC China National Offshore Oil Corporation
CNPC China National Petroleum Corporation

COCOM Coordinating Committee for Multilateral Export Controls
CPTPP Comprehensive and Progressive Agreement for Trans-Pacific

Partnership

DDA Doha Development Agenda

DDTC Directorate of Defence Trade Control

DoS Department of State
DPA Defense Production Act

DSU Dispute Settlement Understanding
EAA Export Administration Act
EAR Export Administration Regulation

ECA Export Control Act
ECJ European Court of Justice

ECRA Export Control Reform Act of 2018

ECT Energy Charter Treaty

ECtHR European Court of Human Rights
EEC European Economic Community
FDA Food and Drug Administration

XX



ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

xxi

FDI Foreign Direct Investment

FINSA Foreign Investment and National Security Act

FIRRMA Foreign Investment Risk Review Modernization Act of 2018

FOCAC Forum on China-Africa Cooperation

FTA Free Trade Agreement FTC Federal Trade Commission

GATT General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade

GCC Gulf Cooperation Council
ICJ International Court of Justice

ICT Information and Communication Technologies
IEEPA International Emergency Economic Powers Act

ILCInternational Law CommissionIMFInternational Monetary FundISILIslamic State of Iraq and the LevantISISIslamic State of Iraq and Syria

ITAR International Traffic in Arms Regulation

KEXIM Export-Import Bank of Korea LDC Least Developed Countries

LIBERTAD Cuban Liberty and Democratic Solidarity
MAI Multilateral Agreement on Investments

MNC Multinational Corporation

MTCR Missile Technology Control Regime

NAAEC North American Agreement on Environmental Co-operation

NAFTA North American Free Trade Area
NAMA Non-Agriculture Market Access
NATO North Atlantic Treaty Organization
NFIDC Net Food Importing Developing Country

NPT Treaty on the Non-Proliferation of Nuclear Weapons

NSG Nuclear Supplier's Group NZDB New Zealand Dairy Board

OECD Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development OFAC Department of Treasury's Office of Foreign Assets Control

OMA Orderly Marketing Arrangement

OPEC Organization of the Petroleum Exporting Countries

RTA Regional Trade Agreement

SCRM Supply Chain Risk Management

SFRY Socialist Federal Republic of Yugoslavia

Sinopec China Petroleum and Chemical Corporation

SLA Softwood Lumber Agreement

TFEU Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union

THAAD Terminal High Altitude Area Defence
TPP Trans-Pacific Partnership Agreement



XXII ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

TRIMs Trade-Related Investment Measures

TRIPS Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights

TSCA Toxic Controlled Substances Act

TSMC Taiwan Semiconductor Manufacturing Company

Union Oil Company of California
UNSC United Nations Security Council
URAA Uruguay Round Agreements Act
USDOC Department of Commerce of the US

USDOD Department of Defence

USEPA US Environment Protection Agency
USITA US International Trade Administration
USMCA United States-Mexico-Canada Agreement

USML Munition List

USSR Union of Soviet Socialist Republics

VAT Value Added Tax

VCLT Vienna Convention on Law of Treaties

VERs Voluntary Export Restraints
VRA Voluntary Restraint Arrangement

WFP World Food Program

WGTCP Working Group on Trade and Competition Policy

WTO World Trade Organization

WTO Agreement Agreement Establishing the World Trade Organization

ZTE Zhongxing Telecommunications Equiment Corporation