

The Constitution of Political Economy

The two dominant conceptions of political economy are based on either reducing political decisions to rational-choice reasoning or, conversely, reducing economic structures and phenomena to the realm of politics. In this book, Adrian Pabst and Roberto Scazzieri contend that neither conception is convincing and they argue for a fundamental rethinking of political economy. Developing a new approach at the interface of economic theory and political thought, the book shows that political economy covers a plurality of dimensions, which reflect internal hierarchies and multiple relationships within the economic and political sphere. *The Constitution of Political Economy* presents a new, richer conception of political economy that draws on a range of thinkers from the history of political economy, recognising the complex embedding of the economy and the polity in society. Effective policy-making has to reflect this embedding and rests on the interdependence between local, national, and international actors to address multiple systemic crises.

ADRIAN PABST is Professor of Politics in the School of Politics and International Relations at the University of Kent and Deputy Director of the National Institute of Economic and Social Research.

ROBERTO SCAZZIERI is Professor of Economic Analysis, Department of Economics, University of Bologna, National Fellow of the National Lincei Academy, and Senior Member of Clare Hall and Gonville and Caius College, Cambridge.



The Constitution of Political Economy

Polity, Society and the Commonweal

ADRIAN PABST

University of Kent, Canterbury, and National Institute of Economic and Social Research, London

ROBERTO SCAZZIERI

University of Bologna, and National Lincei Academy, Rome







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108831093

DOI: 10.1017/9781108923231

© Adrian Pabst and Roberto Scazzieri 2023

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2023

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

A Cataloging-in-Publication data record for this book is available from the Library of Congress.

ISBN 978-1-108-83109-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

List of Tables		page viii	
Pr	eface		ix
Ac	knou	vledgements	xi
	Intro	oduction: Rethinking Political Economy	1
		The Complex Identity of Political Economy	1
		Beyond the Boundaries of Economics and Politics	3
		Outline of the Book	4
	Part	I Interdependence and the Economic Constitution	
1	Political Economy in Question		13
	1.1	Political Economy as a Contested Field	13
	1.2	Dichotomies in Economic and Political Theory	17
	1.3	Relational Embeddedness and Intellectual Traditions	s 22
	1.4	Constitution versus Contract	26
	1.5	The 'Three Bodies' of Political Economy	31
	1.6	Towards a Constitution of Economic Policy	34
2	Sociability and Interdependence		38
	2.1		38
	2.2	Proportionality and the Social Order of the Economy	y 39
	2.3	Dispositions and the Body Politic	43
	2.4	Spheres of Interdependence and Patterns	
		of Sociability	49
	2.5	Aggregation, Systemic Interest, and Conflict	57
	2.6	Sociability, Circumscription, and Partial Similarity	60
3	Association and the Division of Labour		62
	3.1 3.2	The Association of Interdependent Activities Modes of Association, Division of Labour,	62
	- · -	and Levels of Activity	64

V



vi		Со	ntents
	3.3	Process Balancing and Extent of the Market:	
		Routes to the Division of Labour	68
	3.4 3.5	Production Regimes and Proportionality Conditions Straight-Line versus Job-Shop: A Fundamental	70
	J.5	Duality in Production Regimes	72
	3.6 3.7	Production Regimes and Social Structures	80
		The Material Constitution of a Dynamic Polity Appendix: Capabilities, Tasks, and Materials	85
		in Production Structures	89
4	The	Constitution of the Economy	96
	4.1	Constitution and Interdependencies	96
	4.2	Modes of Association, Dispositions, and Interests	97
	4.3	Group Affiliations and Constitutional Arrangements	102
	4.4	A Constitutional Taxonomy	107
	4.5	The Economy as a 'Constituted' Body	109
	4.6	The Constitutional Framing of Economic Policy	118
	Part	II Political Spaces and Policy Actions	
5	A Po	olitical Economy of the Body Politic	125
	5.1	The Human Condition of Sociability	125
	5.2 5.3	Contractualism and Contemporary Political Economy Foundations of Contractualist Political Economy:	128
		A Critical Assessment	131
		5.3.1 The Primacy of the State over the Economy	
		and Society	132
		5.3.2 The Primacy of the Economy over Society	
		and the Polity	137
	5.4		
		Doria and Genovesi	139
	5.5	Civil Life as an Evolutionary Process:	
		Hume, Smith, Beccaria, and Filangieri	145
	5.6	The Primacy of Association: Montesquieu,	
		Burke, and Tocqueville	149
	5.7	Association and the Body Politic	154
6		stellations of Interests and Institutional Architecture	156
	6.1	Positions, Interests, and Structures of Interdependence	156



Co	ontent	S	vii
	6.2	Constellations of Interests and	
	0.2	Constitutional Settlements	159
	6.3	Cleavages, Associations, and the Economic	
		Constitution	163
	6.4	Conciliation of Interests	168
	6.5	From Partial Interests to Systemic Interest	170
	6.6	Patterns of Interdependence and Systemic Interest	172
	6.7	Patterns of Systemic Interest and	
		Institutional Architectures	176
	6.8	Institutional Dynamics, Interdependence,	
		and the Formation of Policies	184
7	Policy Actions in an Embedded Polity		187
	7.1	Constitution and Policy-Making	187
	7.2	Embedded Policy-Making: Framework	
		and Heuristics	188
	7.3	Industrial Policy: Structural Interdependencies	
		and the Governance of Production	195
	7.4	Structural Liquidity and Embedded Credit Policy	199
	7.5	International Trade: Multi-Level Arrangements and	
		Relation-Specific Policy	205
	7.6	Systemic Challenges, Resilience, and Policy Actions	208
8	Conclusion: The Constitution of Political Economy		215
	8.1	Constitutional Principles and Transformation Maps	215
	8.2	Dispositions, Interests, and Sequences of Change	216
	8.3	Towards a Dynamic Theory of Political Economy	220
Re	eferen	ces	224
N	Name Index		259
Su	hiect	Index	266



Tables

2.1	A two-industry inter-connected economy	58
4.1	A taxonomy of economic constitutions	108

viii



Preface

This book develops a new conception of political economy at the interface of economic theory and political thought. Our argument is that political economy covers a plurality of dimensions, which reflect the internal hierarchies and multiple relationships within the economic and the political sphere. We theorise political economy as the interdependence between these two spheres that rests on the web of social relationships in which both are embedded. Policy-making depends on recognising the complex interactions of the economy, the polity, and society.

An overarching theory is needed not only to conceptualise the nature of systemic crises such as pandemics, climate change disruptions, arms races, and struggles for resources facing the world today but also to help design effective policy responses. There are plural and interdependent domains involved in policy-making, which highlight the key role of coordination between local, national, and international actors as a necessary condition to reduce the vulnerability and enhance the resilience of humankind.

The theory of political economy developed in this book considers the economy and the polity as twin spheres arising from the constitution of society in its relatively persistent structure. The economic system and the 'body politic' are closely intertwined within each political economy, which is in turn a sphere whose 'constitution' is identified by specific proportions and an admissible range of transformations. A *constitutional heuristic* is therefore necessary to understand the interplay of persistence and change and to assess the feasibility of policy actions in any given context.

The intellectual strands underpinning our argument are manifold, but two traditions turn out to be central. The constitutional tradition in political theory is a major source of inspiration with its emphasis on the *lex supra regem* principle, which draws attention to the political order of society as a relatively invariant condition independent



x Preface

of the contingent acts of will of a sovereign authority. The structural tradition in economic theory is the other key influence behind our conception of political economy. This tradition emphasizes forms of interrelatedness between economic activities that derive from human actions but not necessarily from human design. Our book combines these two traditions in a unifying framework based on the relative invariance of certain relationships relative to others, and on the 'order of motion' that policy actions should follow under given constitutions of the economy and the polity.



Acknowledgements

This work draws on a scholarly collaboration started almost twenty years ago when Adrian was a PhD student at the University of Cambridge and part of a group of researchers attached to the Centre for Research in the Arts, Social Sciences and Humanities (CRASSH) and Roberto was a visiting fellow at CRASSH, where we were both hosted by its director Ludmilla Jordanova. Our cooperation took shape as part of a collaborative project on 'Migration of Ideas' jointly sponsored by CRASSH and by the Institute of Advanced Study of the University of Bologna and continued shortly afterwards thanks to our joint involvement in the Centre for History and Economics at King's College, Cambridge. In subsequent years, we continued an intense intellectual exchange through a variety of joint writing projects from the history of ideas to the theory of civil society and the theory of political economy.

We owe a debt of gratitude to our respective institutions and scholarly circles. Adrian would like to thank his teachers and colleagues for their wisdom and support, starting at the University of Cambridge with Solomos Solomou who as director of studies at Peterhouse, Cambridge, taught him macroeconomics in a historical perspective; Sheilagh Ogilvie whose teaching on economic history and the first industrial revolution was inspirational; Ha-Joon Chang who emphasised the plurality of state intervention in the economy; Partha Dasgupta whose focus on ethics and ecology was formative; and Willem Buiter who combined scholarly rigour with humour in unique ways during supervisions for the final-year undergraduate dissertation. Adrian is also very grateful to his teachers at the London School of Economics and Political Science, notably John Gray who taught him the meaning of philosophical scepticism and some of the myths of modernity and Paul Kelly who introduced him to modern contractual theory, as well as to Jean-Marie Donegani and Marc Sadou at Sciences Po Paris who broadened his interests in intellectual history.

xi



xii

Acknowledgements

Adrian would also like to thank numerous colleagues and friends for their generosity and support over many years, including Russell Berman, Simona Beretta, Maxim Bratersky, Leonid Grigoriev, Wayne Hudson, Ron Ivey, Patrick Mardellat, Giovanni Marseguerra, John Milbank, James Noyes, Marcia Pally, David Pan, Catherine Pickstock, the late Pier Luigi Porta, Alberto Quadrio Curzio, the late Roger Scruton, and Larry Siedentop. He owes a special debt of gratitude to Luigino Bruni, Jon Cruddas, Maurice Glasman, Brian Griffith, Andy Haldane, Robert Skidelsky and Stefano Zamagni whose work has been an inspiration over many years. At the University of Kent, he would like to thank Nadine Ansorg, Iain MacKenzie, Richard Sakwa, Ben Turner, Richard Whitman, and David Wilkinson, and at the National Institute of Economic and Social Research Arnab Bhattacharjee, Jagjit Chadha, Peter Dolton, Larissa Marioni, Stephen Millard, Max Mosley, Barry Naisbett and Lucy Stokes. More recently, he has worked closely with colleagues as part of the Productivity Institute, including Bart van Ark, Diane Coyle, Philip McCann, Steve Roper, Tony Venables, and Andy Westwood.

Adrian is also indebted to the institutions that have supported his studies and research, starting with the Faculty of Economics and Peterhouse in the University of Cambridge, the European Institute at the London School of Economics and Political Science, Sciences Po Paris, the Higher School of Economics in Moscow, and the Australian Catholic University where he spent his research sabbatical in 2017–18.

Above all, he is deeply grateful to his parents Reinhart and Brigitte, his wife Elena, and his children Alexander and Katya for their support and patience for so long – especially the evenings, weekends, and holidays spent working on this book.

Roberto is grateful to the teachers, colleagues, and students who have been inspirations and companions in his intellectual journey from Bologna and Oxford to Padua, Cambridge, again Bologna, and in most recent years the Accademia Nazionale dei Lincei in Rome. He is especially grateful to Alberto Quadrio Curzio who prompted his interest in the theory of production and in the history of economic analysis during his formative years at Bologna and has been a continuing intellectual and personal inspiration ever since; to the late Luigi Pasinetti, for his pioneering research on the structural dynamics of production economies and for his exemplary commitment to a lifelong research programme; to Michael Landesmann, the Oxford and Cambridge



Acknowledgements

xiii

friend with whom some of the production analytical tools developed in this book, and in particular the 'relative invariance' criterion, were conceived and developed; to Harald Hagemann, for the joint work on sequentially constrained transitional paths that has been central to the constitutional heuristic presented in this monograph; to Mauro Baranzini at Oxford, Cambridge, and Lugano, and D'Maris Coffman at Cambridge and London, for many years of collaborative research at the interface between structural dynamics, socio-institutional transformation, and the framing of economic policy; and to Ivano Cardinale at Bologna, Cambridge, and London, with whom some of the core ideas behind the theory of political economy presented in this book were envisioned and developed. Roberto would also like to express his deep gratitude to the late Paolo Grossi for the enlightening discussions on matters of constitutional law in historical perspective that have shaped the final stages of this project.

Among the many colleagues and friends with whom key concepts of this book have been discussed over the years, Roberto would like to thank Amartya Sen, David Soskice, Carlo D'Adda, Stefano Zamagni, Emma Rothschild, Patrizio Bianchi, Lorenzo Ornaghi, Faye Duchin, Alessandro Vercelli, Silva Marzetti, Jan Kregel, Maria Carla Galavotti, Bernard Grofman, Douglas Hofstadter, Wang Hui, Mario Amendola, Albert Steenge, Amit Bhaduri, Sheila Dow, Richard Arena, Antonio Andreoni, Ha-Joon Chang, Partha Dasgupta, Martin Daunton, Ian Donaldson, John Morrill, Craig Muldrew, Frank Perlin, Sophus Reinert, Luisa Brunori, Malcolm Pines, Heinrich Bortis, Lilia Costabile, Aura Reggiani, Sunanda Sen, Mike Gregory, Marco Di Tommaso, David Ibbetson, Michele Caputo, and Ajit Sinha. He recollects with gratitude the inspiring conversations with teachers and colleagues who have passed away, notably John and Ursula Hicks, Michael Bacharach, Nicholas Georgescu-Roegen, Francis Seton, Sukhamoy Chakravarty, Phyllis Deane, Geoff Harcourt, Polly Hill, Timothy McDermott, Nicola Matteucci, Carlo Poni, Jack Goody, Ronnie Ellenblum, Izumi Hishiyama, Patrick Suppes, Andrew Skinner, Istvan Hont, and Pier Luigi Porta.

He would also like to express his gratitude to the institutions that supported his research in various ways, and primarily the University of Bologna (Faculty of Political Sciences, Faculty of Economics and Commerce, and Department of Economics), Linacre College in Oxford, Clare Hall and Gonville and Caius College in Cambridge,



xiv

Acknowledgements

the Accademia Nazionale dei Lincei, the Bologna Academy of Sciences, the Lombard Institute of Sciences and Letters, the Institute of Advanced Studies and the Interdisciplinary Research Centre in Epistemology and History of Science at the University of Bologna, the Research Center in Economic Analysis and International Economic Development (CRANEC) at the Catholic University of Milan, the Centre for Financial History at Newnham College and Darwin College in Cambridge, the International Interdisciplinary Research Laboratory of the International Balzan Foundation, the Italian National University Centre for Applied Economic Studies, and the Babbage International Policy Forum at the Institute for Manufacturing in the University of Cambridge.

Last but not least, Roberto would like to express his deepest gratitude to his wife Cristina and his son Luigi for their continued support in the long intellectual journey from start to completion of this project.

It has been a great pleasure for us both, as colleagues and friends, to work together on this book.