

Index

- a fortiori* knowledge, analogy as constituting, 15, 63
- a posteriori* knowledge, analogy in connection with, 9–10, 31, 46, 68
- a priori* knowledge, analogy as constituting, 10, 31, 46, 68
- Abrahamic traditions, 9, 155, 208, 218
- adaptation, 6, 15, 44, 85, 88–9, 92, 101, 111, 131, 229
- adaptationism, 44, 206
- alternation, 18, 29, 157–9
- agrarianism. *See* farming
- analogia entis* (analogy between God and world), 51, 64, 66, 69
- analogical argument
 - a fortiori*, 18, 73, 119, 157, 198
 - Aristotelian, 46, 50, 55–7
 - classical vs. Reidian, 11, 16, 20, 75, 97
 - Darwinian, 18, 137, 158–9
 - extensibility of, 179
 - Herschelian, 193
 - induction, distinction from argument by, 56
 - informal, 141
 - material circumstance requirement of, 17, 72, 74, 80, 140–2, 150–1
 - Platonic, 34–5, 49
 - probabilistic, 6, 24, 52
 - Reidian, 6, 138, 140, 158
 - validity of, 24–5, 31, 76, 137–43, 151
- analogy
 - alternation of, 18, 29, 63, 157–9
 - architect, 209–10
 - Aristotelian, 2, 5, 49–50, 206
 - attribution, of, 51
 - casual use of, 10, 75
 - clock, 196, 212, 215–16
 - coinage of term, 8
 - Darwinian, 158–9, 227
 - definition of, 23, 52
 - Euclidean, 30
 - extension of, 5, 191
 - heuristic, 183, 187
 - historical development of concept, 47
 - homology, and, 132
 - independent of properties of relata, 67, 75
 - invariance as causally relevant feature of, 16
 - limits of, 173
 - map as, 31, 65
 - mathematical, 25, 32, 47, 55, 64
 - beyond, 2–3, 5, 8, 29, 31, 34–8, 48–9, 67, 74
 - Kant's apparent insistence upon, 70
 - problem of incommensurable magnitudes within, 8, 25–6
 - model for target, as, 16, 48
 - model of, 30
 - multiple, 149
 - proportionality as, 2, 5, 7–8, 16–17, 20, 23, 25, 52, 54, 68, 190, 198, 233
 - Darwinian, 13
 - Eudoxus defines, 26–8
 - Reidian, 10, 56–8
 - repeated ratio as, 27
 - scale model of, 25, 30, 48
 - scientific fruitfulness of, 38, 196, 201
 - scientific theory as, 160
 - similar triangles as, 8, 25, 30–1, 48, 68
 - similarity, as synonym for, 56, 64
 - similarity, contrasted with, 23, 52, 58, 66–7, 72, 76
 - substitute for knowledge, as, 51, 64–5, 71
- animism, 215
- Archytas of Tarentum, 32–3, 49
- argument to analogy, 62
- argument to the best explanation, 44
- Aristotle
 - 'example' as analogical argument of, 46, 50, 55–7
 - war against neighbours, case study of, 46–7
- analogy and metaphor, relation of, 18, 177
- analogy, summary of position on, 49–50
- art and nature, on, 210–12

- Aristotle (cont.)
 biology of, 205–6
 corresponding parts of animals, analysis of, 42
 final cause, on, 39
 fixity of species, on, 39, 206
History of Animals, 42
 metaphor, on, 163–8
Parts of Animals, 36, 39–40, 42
Poetics, 164
 potentiality, on, 177
Prior Analytics, 46, 50
 revival of, 71
Rhetoric, 55, 166
 similarity between analogical relata, on, 41–2, 50, 54
 substance, on concept of, 40, 44
 tragedy, on, 45–6
 atheism, 22, 66, 208
- Baer, Karl Ernst von, 133
 Bakewell, Robert, 90, 214, 218
 Bartha, Paul, 138
 Bartov, H., 156
 bear, 183
 Bentham, George, 107
 Berkeley, George, 10, 65–7
 biogeography, 82, 96, 98–9, 102, 108, 113, 129, 214
 Boltzmann, Ludwig, 230
 Boyle, Robert, 7, 207, 213
 art–nature relations, on, 212–13
 British empire, 215
 Brocchi, Giovanni, 79–80, 219
 Browne, Peter, 10, 65–7
 Browne, Thomas, 208
 Burnett, D. Graham, 20, 182, 196–202
 Bussey Institute (Harvard University), 228
 Butler, Joseph, 10
- Cajetan, Thomas, 52, 54–5, 67
 capitalism, 21, 213–14, 218
 Castle, William, 228
 causal decomposition, 191, 193
 causal-explanatory theory, 14, 96, 99, 111, 114, 119–23, 135, 230–2, 234
 defined, 14
 chance, 62, 89, 91–3, 110, 112, 114, 120–1, 210, 217, 231
 Cicero, 53
 classification (biological), 42, 101, 108, 114–15, 130–2, 134, 186
 natural, 132
 comparative biology, 9, 37, 40, 44, 99, 130–1
 concept generated by analogically related objects, 33
- consequence, inference from, 13
 Copleston, Edward, 9–10, 65, 70–1
 Corn Laws, 214
 Cornell, John, 213
 crossing, 12, 82–5, 94, 110, 116, 118, 122, 145
 Cuvier, Georges, 39, 130, 205
- Darwin, Charles
 analogical reasoning
 incorrect summary of, 87, 97
 scholarly debate concerning, 20–1, 150–1, 182–202
 summary of, 97, 99
 two stages in, 17
 analogy
 dated?, 234–5
 development of natural selection as, 12–13, 90
 historiographical context for, 217–19
 summary of use of, 158–9
 argument, mature form of, 95–6
 Aristotelian analogy integrated with *vera causa*, 98
 Aristotle, knowledge of, 203
 art–nature relations, on, 207–10, 218, 225, 234
 conditions of existence as ‘higher law’ of, 130–1
 Descent of Man, The, 111, 217
 ‘ecological’ thinking of, 102
 Essay, 14, 94, 101, 106–7, 130, 200, 216
 Expression of the Emotions in Man and Animals, The, 216
 life of, 11, 77, 92, 208, 214, 218
 metaphors, deployment of, 19
 Natural Selection, 13, 102, 106, 216
 Origin of Species, On the
 diagram in, 115, 124–6
 ‘one long argument’, as, 3, 13–14, 20, 105–6
 preparation of, 13, 95, 100
 summary of, 3–5, 23
 two big ideas of, 1
 Paley, knowledge of, 11, 59, 63–4, 203, 213
 private notebooks of, 6, 13, 81–2, 84, 86–7, 94–5, 208, 210
 selective processes as relations (not relata), 87
 Sketch, 14, 94–5, 98, 101, 106–7, 130, 216
 Variation of Animals and Plants under Domestication, The, 188, 194, 210
- Darwin, Erasmus, 84, 214, 219
 De Candolle, Alphonse de, 95
 definition, theory of, 33
 deism, 10, 208, 217
 Descartes, René, 22

- determinism, 210
 diversification of descendants, 101
 division of labour, 101, 124, 221
 Dobzhansky, Theodosius, 230
 drift, 22, 228–32
 Duncan, John, 9
- elephant, 42–4, 69
 embryology, 96, 99, 101, 114, 130, 132–4, 212
Encyclopédie (ed. Diderot and d'Alembert), 53–5
 Epicureanism, 10, 22, 218
 Euclid, 25–31, 38, 48
 scale model of analogy, 30
 Eudoxus, 2, 5, 26–7, 38, 48
 solution of problem of incommensurable
 magnitudes, 8, 48
- eugenics, 225
 experiment, 20, 146, 183, 187–8, 205, 213, 228
 explanatory virtue, 14, 96, 113, 126–7, 136, 184
- farming, 7, 13, 15, 18, 21–2, 121, 123, 189, 214,
 217, 230, 232, 235
- fiction, 185
 final cause, 39, 88
 Fisher, Ronald, 7, 22, 184, 195, 226–30,
 233
- fossil, 60, 78–9, 81, 113, 129
- function
 Aristotelian, 45
 biological, 9, 40–1, 44
- functionalism, 131
- Galton, Francis, 7, 141, 224–5
 genealogy, 115–16, 131, 133–4
- generation
 asexual, 82, 86, 229
 extension of life via, 11, 79, 83, 219
 asexual and sexual compared, 78, 82–3, 94,
 100, 219
 sexual, 85, 88, 99, 229
 extension of species lifetime via, 11, 79–81,
 209, 219
- genetics, 22, 227, 229–30
 Geoffroy Saint-Hilaire, Etienne, 130–1
- geology, 15–16, 78–9, 97, 99, 105, 108, 110,
 113, 126, 147, 216
- germ plasm, 224
 Gildenhuys, Peter, 20, 182–3, 190–5, 197
- God, 208, 210, 212, 217–18
 analogical knowledge of, 9–10, 51, 59, 62–7,
 69, 71, 155–6, 163, 208
 selector, as, 94–5
 Gould, Stephen Jay, 184
- grafting, 11, 79–81, 83, 209, 229
- Grant, Robert, 78, 84
- Gray, Asa, 210
 Gregory, Ryan, 234
- Haldane, John Burdon Sanderson, 22
 Harvey, William, 205
Hebrews, 157
 Henle, Paul, 164
 heredity, 12, 15, 84, 89, 195, 224, 227, 230
 Herschel, John, 14, 97, 108, 191–4, 201, 216
 Hesse, Mary, 160
 historicism, 131
 Humboldt, Alexander von, 215
 Hume, David, 215
 Hutton, James, 214, 216
- inbreeding, 92, 94, 110, 116, 158–9, 228–30,
 232, 234
- induction, intuitive, 61
- Inkpen, Andrew, 213
- interbreeding, 84, 122, 201, 228
- Isocrates, 168
- isolation, 6, 82, 85, 94, 102
- Kant, Immanuel, 10, 67–70, 162
 Analogies of Experience, The, 67
 Critique of Pure Reason, 67
 Prolegomena, 67, 69
- King, William, 10, 64, 71
- Kneale, William, 61
- Lamarck, Jean-Baptiste, 82, 84, 114, 224
- Lawrence, William, 224
- Lennox, James, 20, 182–7
- Levine, George, 169
- Linnaeus, Carl, 205
- Lipton, Peter, 184
- Locke, John, 70
- Lyell, Charles, 12, 14, 78–81, 84, 88, 96, 98,
 136, 188, 214, 216
- MacCulloch, John, 92–3
- machines, 19, 21, 61, 153, 173, 201, 213, 215,
 217
- Malthus, Thomas, 12, 21, 86–90, 93, 95, 147,
 214
 sorting of, 88–9, 116, 214
- mathematical population genetics. *See* statistics
- mechanical philosophy, 207–8, 212–13, 215–17
- Mendel, Gregor, 227
- Mendelianism, 227, 230, 233
- metaphor
 analogy, differentiated from, 162–3
 concept formation, used in, 175
 extensibility of, 168–9, 172–5
 extension of analogy, as, 161, 164, 168, 175

- metaphor (cont.)
 functional, as, 171
 personification as example of, 153, 162–3,
 171, 175, 180
 provisional science, as, 160
 scientific vs. poetic, 170–1
 struggle as example of as, 161
 Mill, John Stuart, 10, 57, 72, 74–6, 141
 System of Logic, A, 74
 modern synthesis, 230
modus tollens, 3
 monads, 82
 morphology, 16, 44, 96, 98, 108, 114, 130, 132,
 180

 natural kinds, 36–7
 natural theology, 11, 59–60, 208
Naturphilosophie, 215–16
 Newton, Isaac, 96, 98, 136, 192, 201, 234
 normativity, 234

 Oken, Lorenz, 216
 ontogeny, 133–4
 origin of life, 216
 outbreeding, 228, 232, 234

 palaeontology, 96, 99, 108, 129
 Paley, William, 11, 58–64, 73, 213
 argument to analogy, 62
 pangensis, 100, 186, 217
 pantheism, 22, 95, 215
 Pearson, Karl, 232
 personification. *See* metaphor, personification as
 example of
 phylogeny, 86, 134
 pigeons, 144–5
 Plato, 33–5, 40, 49
 state as an analogical model for the soul, 34,
 49
 Platonism, 10, 22, 36, 208, 218
 Playfair, John, 216
 population pressure, 12
 Prichard, James, 224
 Pythagoras, 8

 Quintilian, 91, 176

 Reid, Thomas, 6, 10, 55–8, 61, 74–5
 evidential criteria of, 96
 Reidian analogy, 10, 56–8
 Richards, Evelleen, 198
 Richards, Richard, 20, 158, 182–3, 187–90
 Romanticism, 22, 215–16, 218
 rudimentary organs, 134
 Ruse, Michael, 213

Samuel, II, 204
scala natura, 130
 Schelling, Friedrich, 215
 scholasticism, 9–10, 51–3, 138
 Sebright, John, 85, 196, 218
 selection
 artificial, 143–6, 189, 231
 artificial and natural analogised, 94, 108, 143,
 146, 153, 209
 artificial and natural compared, 5, 15, 17,
 91–3, 108–9, 117, 122, 146, 152,
 154–5, 157, 182, 188, 200–1, 207
 complex, 146
 conscious, 145
 metaphorical vs. literal, 178–81
 methodical, 110, 116, 122, 144–5, 196,
 198–200, 222
 natural, 12–13, 87, 120
 analogy not theory, as, 105
 Darwin's first use of, 87
 efficacy of, 118
 evidential case for, 13, 135–6, 187
 extension from analogy, as, 126
 law, as, 128
 moment of assertion, 89
 sexual, 100–1, 111, 117–18, 122, 134, 225
 singular, as, 194–5, 197
 spectrum of, 20, 182, 196–200
 unconscious, 110, 116, 144–5, 196, 198–200,
 222
 selective breeding, 1–2, 6, 12, 15, 18, 21, 78, 85,
 90, 92, 94, 97, 99, 104, 120, 149, 232
 post-Darwinian, 225, 228
 two types of, 95, 109
 Smith, Adam, 219–23, 226
 'invisible hand' of, 219–20, 223
 socialism, 225
 specialisation, 15, 101, 111, 133
 species
 definition of, 36, 152
 domesticated, 1, 99, 109, 208
 extinction of (extrinsic process), 6, 11–12,
 77–8, 84, 87–8, 100, 102, 120, 123, 209
 formation of new, 4, 29, 70, 82, 84–6, 91, 93,
 96, 98, 107, 129, 136–7, 141, 152, 156,
 180, 209
 immutability of, 39, 84, 135, 206
 mortality of (intrinsic process), 11, 77, 79–83,
 88, 100, 208–9, 219
 mutability of, 81, 103–4
 varieties, compared with, 15, 112–13
 species selectionism, 219
 Spencer, Herbert, 105, 188, 226
 statistics, 22, 226, 228–30, 232
 Stoicism, 10, 22, 218

Index

251

- structuralism, 131
- struggle for existence, 12, 89, 110, 120, 147–8, 163, 178, 187, 190
- superfecundity, 12
- survival of the fittest, 60, 105, 162
- tautology, 233
- taxonomy. *See* classification (biological)
- Theaetetus, 26
- theism, 59–60, 66, 88, 95, 208
- Theunissen, Bert, 234
- thought experiment, 20, 182, 184–6
- Thucydides, 72
- tree of life, 1, 15, 83, 106, 114, 121, 125, 152, 155, 159, 186
 - Porphyry tree, 36
- unity of type, 130–1
- US Department of Agriculture, 228
- use-inheritance, 85, 88, 110, 224
- Vandenesse, Urbain de, 55
- variation (within species), 12, 89, 108–9, 112, 143, 146
- vera causa*, 3, 16, 20, 96–8, 108–9, 128, 182–4, 187, 231, 234
 - definition of, 14
 - established via *a fortiori* reasoning, 119
 - exposition of, 96, 98, 106, 126
 - Herschel on, 97, 108
 - integrated with Aristotelian proportionality, 134, 231
 - natural selection as, 14, 98, 107, 111, 136
 - alternatives to, 111–12
 - Reid on, 14, 97
 - rejected, 183
 - scholarly debate concerning Darwin's use of, 20, 182–5, 187–8, 190
- Wallace, Alfred Russel, 7, 102–5, 223–4, 226
 - accepts selection analogy, 103, 105
- Waters, Kenneth, 150
- wedge simile, 88, 116
- Weismann, August, 224
- Weitzenfeld, Julian, 150
- Whately, Richard, 9–10, 52, 65, 70–4, 139
 - Elements of Logic*, 71
 - Elements of Rhetoric*, 70–1
- Whewell, William, 14, 97
- Wright, Sewall, 7, 22, 226, 228–30, 234
- Wright–Fisher controversy, 227, 230
- Wynne, Rice, 92
- Yarrell, William, 84, 92