

## Contents

<i>Preface</i>	<i>page</i> xiii
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xvi
<i>Table of Treaties</i>	xix
<b>1 Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1 The Topic	1
1.2 Defining 'Necessity' at the Outset	3
1.3 Military Necessity in the Law of International and Non-international Armed Conflict	4
1.4 Disciplines and Areas of Law Which Are, and Are Not, Dealt With	5
1.5 The Scope of the LOAC and the Limits of Context: <i>Jus ad Bellum</i> vs <i>Jus in Bello</i>	8
1.6 Specific Issues Regarding Sources	10
1.7 The Road Ahead	20
<b>PART I: CONCEPT, HISTORY AND BASICS</b>	<b>23</b>
<b>2 Elements of Military Necessity</b>	<b>25</b>
2.1 Initial Definition of Military Necessity	25
2.2 The Nature of <i>Military</i> Necessity As Opposed to Other Necessities	27
2.3 Military Necessity and the Question of 'Necessary for What?'	28
2.4 Military Necessity and Cause and Effect	32
2.5 Acts Which Are Not Motivated by Military Necessity	37
2.6 Military Necessity As Permission or Prohibition	38
2.7 The Different Faces of Military Necessity	41

2.8	Aggravations of Military Necessity and an Element of Time	42
2.9	Military Necessity and the Inevitable Use of Discretion by the Military Commander	47
<b>3</b>	<b>Military Necessity and Its History</b>	<b>48</b>
3.1	Early Writings	48
3.2	The Codification Era: Lieber Code and the Departure of Modern Treaty Law	54
<b>4</b>	<b>Assessing Military Necessity through a Military Margin of Appreciation</b>	<b>64</b>
4.1	Margin of Appreciation: General Remarks	64
4.2	Military Margin of Appreciation: As a Construct of Military Necessity	65
4.3	Characteristics of a Flexible Norm: 'Subjectivity vs Objectivity'	67
4.4	Application of Flexible Rules in the LOAC: Necessity vs Humanity?	70
4.5	The Yardstick of Assessment: the Reasonable Commander	76
4.6	The Military Commander's Assessment and the 'Fog of War'	86
<b>5</b>	<b>Assessing Necessity and Criminal Responsibility</b>	<b>90</b>
5.1	Sanctions As Limits on the Commander's Assessment	90
5.2	The Commander's Three Pillars of Liability	90
5.3	Basic Features of War Crimes	91
5.4	The Notion of Severity and the Function of Military Necessity	94
5.5	The Limits of Reasonableness	98
<b>6</b>	<b>Military Necessity and Humanitarian Considerations</b>	<b>103</b>
6.1	The Point of Departure: to Conciliate Military Necessity with Humanity	103
6.2	Humanity and Necessity: Remarks on a Balance	104
6.3	The Status of 'Humanity': What Is Necessity to Be Weighed Against?	106
6.4	Performing the Balance: a Point of Departure	108
6.5	'Heavy-Weight' Necessity: the Doctrine of <i>Kriegsraison</i>	109
6.6	The General Rule of Limitation: Denial of <i>Kriegsraison</i>	119

	<b>PART II: DISTINCTION AS LIMITATION UPON MILITARY NECESSITY IN THE LAW OF ARMED CONFLICT</b>	127
7	<b>The Principle of Distinction: Also a Limitation upon Military Necessity</b>	129
	7.1 A Basic Rule with Two Elements	129
	7.2 Two Elements: Prohibitive and Permissive	131
	7.3 <i>Absolute</i> Prohibition	131
	7.4 Absolute Prohibition but Not Absolute Protection	132
	7.5 Formation and Violation of the Rule of Distinction	133
	7.6 Lawful Targets: Combatants, Civilians Directly Participating in Hostilities and Military Objectives	134
	7.7 The Treaty Definition of Military Objectives: Leaving Too Much for the Commander's Assessment?	135
	7.8 A History of Military Objectives under the Umbrella of Military Necessities	138
	7.9 The Doubt Rules: Presuming Civilian Status	141
8	<b>Military Objects</b>	145
	8.1 The 'Two-Pronged Test'	145
	8.2 'Effective Contribution' to 'Military Action' and the Controversy over 'War-Sustaining Capabilities'	147
	8.3 Military Objectives by 'Nature'	150
	8.4 Military Objectives by 'Use'	153
	8.5 The Issue of 'Dual-Use Objects'	153
	8.6 Military Objectives by 'Purpose'	157
	8.7 Military Objectives by 'Location'	159
	8.8 Particular Questions Related to Bridges	159
	8.9 Returning to the Commander's Assessment	161
9	<b>Combatants As Lawful Targets</b>	163
	9.1 General Remarks	163
	9.2 Who Are Combatants?	163
	9.3 Military Necessity and Combatants As Lawful Targets	167
	9.4 Military Necessity and the Alleged Duty to 'Capture Rather than Kill' a Combatant	168
	9.5 The Prohibition of Unnecessary Suffering on Combatants	170
10	<b>Military Necessity and the Notion of 'Lawful Combatancy'</b>	180
	10.1 Lawful Combatancy and the POW Privilege	180
	10.2 'Unlawful Combatancy': Legal Status and Consequences	186

10.3	Consequences of 'Unlawful Combatancy': Humane Provisions vs the Necessity of Harsh Means	187
10.4	Particular Groups: Spies and Mercenaries	190
10.5	The Necessity of Irregular Warfare: Underpinnings of the Debate over the Requirement of Distinction	192
10.6	The Requirement of Distinction	199
10.7	Returning to the Commander's Assessment	206
<b>11</b>	<b>Who Are Civilians and When Do They Lose Their Protection?</b>	<b>207</b>
11.1	Definition of Civilians	207
11.2	The Elements of Protection: and Their Limitations	210
11.3	Loss of Civilian Protection Due to Direct Participation in Hostilities	212
	<b>PART III: EFFECTUATING DISTINCTION: ENFORCING AN ULTIMATE BALANCE BETWEEN NECESSITIES OF WAR AND CONSIDERATIONS OF HUMANITY</b>	<b>229</b>
<b>12</b>	<b>Protection of the Civilian Population and Perceptions of Military Necessity</b>	<b>231</b>
12.1	Introductory Remarks: Prohibitions and Perceptions of Military Necessity	231
12.2	Prohibition of 'Terror Attacks' against Civilians	231
12.3	Prohibition of Indiscriminate Attacks	240
12.4	Attacks by Way of Reprisals against Civilians	248
<b>13</b>	<b>Military Necessity and Proportionality</b>	<b>255</b>
13.1	'Proportionality' in General and the Specific 'Principle of Proportionality' in the LOAC	255
13.2	The LOAC Rule: Proportionality As a Prohibition of Excessive Collateral Damage	257
13.3	Proportionality As a 'Silent Condition' of Necessity	268
<b>14</b>	<b>Military Necessity and the Scope and Nature of Military Advantage</b>	<b>276</b>
14.1	Preliminary Remarks: the Elements and Scope of Military Advantage	276
14.2	The Recent Treaty Origin of Military Advantage	277
14.3	The Distinction between Military Advantage and Military Necessity	279
14.4	'Concrete and Direct' vs 'Definite Military Advantage'	288

## Contents

xi

14.5	The Requirement of 'Concrete and Direct' Advantage from the Attack As a Whole	290
14.6	Military Advantage As Distinct from Other Advantages: the Point of Departure	298
14.7	Assessing the Military Advantage: Not to Force a Change in the 'Negotiating Attitude' of the Other Party	300
14.8	Military Advantage As Opposed to 'Winning Hearts and Minds'	305
14.9	Military Advantage and the Specific Issue of Use of Force to Repress International Crimes	309
14.10	Military Advantage and the Security of the Attacking Forces	310
15	<b>The Commander's Ultimate 'Margins': Assessing Excessiveness and Feasibility</b>	315
15.1	The 'Extremely Difficult' Decisions	315
15.2	Assessing Excessiveness in the Proportionality Rule	316
15.3	'Feasibility'	327
	<b>PART IV: THE EXCEPTIVE FACE OF MILITARY NECESSITY</b>	339
16	<b>Destruction and Seizure of Property When Military Necessity Requires</b>	341
16.1	A Historical Rule with Narrow but Significant Value	341
16.2	The Rule in Treaty Law and Customary Law	343
16.3	Necessary As Opposed to Wanton Destruction of Property	344
16.4	Practical Scope of Application I: Operations Not Amounting to Attacks	346
16.5	Practical Scope of Application II: Destruction of Civilian Property	348
16.6	The Notion of 'Property'	349
16.7	Does the Requirement of 'Imperative' Add Any Value?	350
16.8	Practical Scope of Application III: the Modes of Destruction and Seizure	351
16.9	No Explicit Assessment of Necessity Required for Booty of War and Capture for Prize	361
17	<b>Military Necessity and Rules on Special Protection</b>	363
17.1	General Remarks	363
17.2	Protection of Combatants <i>Hors de Combat</i>	364
17.3	Loss of Protection against Attacks	369
17.4	Military Necessity and Denial of Quarter	371

17.5	Parachutists from Aircraft in Distress	372
17.6	Medical and Religious Personnel and Units	373
17.7	Civil Defence Personnel and Organisations	376
17.8	Cultural Property	377
17.9	Works and Installations Containing Dangerous Forces	381
17.10	Natural Environment	385
17.11	Starvation and Objects Indispensable to the Survival of the Civilian Population	388
17.12	Other Rules on Special Protection and Considerations of Military Necessity	393
	<b>PART V: CONCLUSIONS</b>	397
18	<b>Conclusions: Limitations to the Commander's Assessment of Military Necessity</b>	399
18.1	Overview: Limitations in Different Ways	399
18.2	Necessity and the Assessment of Necessity: Sometimes One and the Same	400
18.3	The Basics of Military Necessity: Means to Ends As a Feature of War Itself	400
18.4	The Military Commander's Assessment: Margin of Appreciation	402
18.5	Assessments of Necessity Left with Little Guidance	403
18.6	Assessments of Military Necessity Leaving Little Room for the Commander's Discretion	406
18.7	The Right to Invoke Military Necessity Is Limited: Not <i>a</i> Limitation	407
18.8	Military Advantage Is Something Other than Military Necessity	407
18.9	The Practical Scope of Considerations of Military Necessity Today: a Twofold Appearance	409
	<i>Bibliography</i>	410
	<i>Index</i>	426