

Liberalism, Diversity and Domination

This study addresses the complex and often fractious relationship between liberal political theory and difference by examining how distinctive liberalisms respond to human diversity. Drawing on published and unpublished writings, private correspondence and lecture notes, the study offers comprehensive reconstructions of Immanuel Kant's and John Stuart Mill's treatment of racial, cultural, gender-based and class-based difference to understand how two leading figures reacted to pluralism, and what contemporary readers might draw from them. The book mounts a qualified defence of Millian liberalism against Kantianism's predominance in contemporary liberal political philosophy, and resists liberalism's implicit association with imperialist domination by showing different liberalisms' divergent responses to diversity. Here are two distinctive liberal visions of moral and political life.

Inder S. Marwah is Assistant Professor of Political Science at McMaster University, Ontario. He has published articles in political theory in leading peer-reviewed journals. His research focuses on the intersection of race, empire, and political theory, both in the history of political thought and in the present.

Liberalism, Diversity and Domination

Kant, Mill and the Government of Difference

INDER S. MARWAH
McMaster University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
 978-1-108-49378-9 — Liberalism, Diversity and Domination
 Inder S. Marwah
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
 New Delhi – 110025, India
 79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
 Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108493789
 DOI: 10.1017/9781108608497

© Inder S. Marwah 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

Printed and bound in Great Britain by Clays Ltd, Elcograf S.p.A.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Marwah, Inder S., 1977– author.

TITLE: Liberalism, diversity and domination : Kant, Mill, and the government of difference / Inder S. Marwah, McMaster University, Ontario.

DESCRIPTION: New York : Cambridge University Press, [2019] | Includes bibliographical references.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2019003157 | ISBN 9781108493789

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Liberalism – Philosophy. | Pluralism – Political aspects. | Kant, Immanuel, 1724–1804. | Mill, John Stuart, 1806–1873

CLASSIFICATION: LCC JC574 .M392 2019 | DDC 320.51–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2019003157>

ISBN 978-1-108-49378-9 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-49378-9 — Liberalism, Diversity and Domination
Inder S. Marwah
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

For Lally and Marlène Marwah

Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page viii</i>
1 Introduction	I
2 Unbending Crooked Timber	27
3 Difference, Diversity and Exclusion	77
4 Democratic Character and the Affective Grounds of Politics	125
5 Complicating Barbarism and Civilization	174
6 Millian Liberalism	222
7 Epilogue	256
<i>Bibliography</i>	262
<i>Index</i>	288

Acknowledgments

This book owes a lot of debts to a lot of people, which have only accrued over its long (too long) development. The kernel started at the University of Toronto and gained its shape from the wise counsel and steering of both peers and teachers. On the latter front, I owe special thanks to Peggy Kohn, Joe Carens and, most of all, Ronnie Beiner. All were as perceptive as they were supportive, and Ronnie in particular was endlessly generous with his time and attention, and still is. Peggy sparked a critical inclination that has only grown over time, and there are few conceptual muddles, I discovered, that can't be unriddled over a dog walk with Joe. Simone Chambers and Lisa Ellis provided invaluable feedback on this project's early phases, along with equally invaluable guidance in the intervening years. Their exemplary scholarship on Kant, along with Arthur Ripstein's seminar on his legal and political philosophy, shaped my appreciation for Kant's ethical and political thought, and whatever comprehension I might have of it is their doing (the misapprehensions remain mine). I had the good fortune to be surrounded by a vibrant group of theorists in Toronto, including Kiran Banerjee, Erica Frederiksen, Özgür Gürel, Margaret Haderer, Alex Livingston, James McKee, Mihaela Mihai, Adrian Neer, Jakeet Singh, Leah Soroko, Serdar Tekin and Mathias Thaler, many of whom remain cherished interlocutors. All have commented on, cut to pieces or otherwise improved the rough patch of ideas from which this book emerged, and I very much appreciate it. Alex and Kiran, in particular, read way more of this, at way rougher stages, than any person should have to. Their generosity as critics is exceeded only by their generosity as friends.

A second community of scholars, at the University of Chicago, were especially influential in moving this book toward its final form. Over an all-too-brief time in Chicago, I not only benefited from their rich expertise, but also came to see what political theory looks like from a different vantage point. I'm grateful to have had the opportunity to shift my sights. Daniel Nichanian kindly scheduled me into the Political Theory Workshop on short notice, where Gordon Arlen offered incisive comments. Patchen Markell graciously

Acknowledgments

ix

discussed the introduction and pushed me to clarify the project's ambitions. Sankar Muthu indulged me with many long and invariably generative discussions on Kant. My greatest debt, though, is owed to Jennifer Pitts, who drew this book's latent argument to the fore. Despite our divergences over Mill's political philosophy, Jennifer was unfailingly open and generous in her willingness to argue them with me, and in hosting me at the Department of Political Science. She is a model of scholarly capaciousness and insight, and I am profoundly grateful to her.

Thanks are also owed to audiences at conferences and workshops who provided vital feedback on various parts of various chapters. These include annual meetings of the American Political Science Association, the Western Political Science Association, the Canadian Political Science Association and, most helpfully, the Association for Political Theory, whose intellectual community has been (and continues to be) exceptionally vibrant and supportive. Workshops at Acadia University, the University of Toronto, the University of Chicago and the University of Cambridge were singularly productive, and I thank them for hosting me. Over the years, I have also profited from colleagues and friends willing to share their ideas and ameliorate mine. I would like to thank Barbara Arneil, Duncan Bell, Stefan Dolgert, Stephen Engelmann, Loren Goldman, Burke Hendrix, Jared Holley, Murad Idris, Onur Ulas Ince, Duncan Ivison, Emma Stone Mackinnon, Karuna Mantena, Ben McKean, Charles Mills, Jeanne Morefield, Menaka Philips, Phil Triadafilopoulos, Inés Valdez and Lynn Zastoupil for more or less formal or informal comments and conversations pushing me to rethink things. In addition to editing the introduction, Daniel Aureliano Newman has over a lifelong friendship quietly shaped not just what's here, but my interests and person more generally.

McMaster University is a wonderful disciplinary home, and I'm grateful to my colleagues in the Department of Political Science for their ever-present support and interest – in particular, James Ingram, whose spirited engagement and provocations have improved this book beyond measure. I'm also grateful to the graduate students I've been fortunate to know at McMaster, whose originality and inquisitiveness always change my perspective, and always for the better. One such student, Justin Ng, provided valuable editorial assistance, and I thank him for it.

Generous support in the form of a postdoctoral scholarship from the Social Sciences and Humanities Council of Canada provided the time and space to move this book forward. Various parts of it appeared earlier in several journal articles. Sections of Chapters 2 and 3 were first published in "*Elatere Motiva: From the Good Will to the Good Human Being*," *Kantian Review* 18, no. 3 (2013): 413–437; "What Nature Makes of Her: Kant's Gendered Metaphysics," *Hypatia* 28, no. 3 (2013): 551–567; and "Bridging Nature and Freedom? Kant, Culture and Cultivation," *Social Theory and Practice* 38, no. 3 (July 2012): 385–406. A section of Chapter 5 originally appeared as

“Complicating Barbarism and Civilization: Mill’s Complex Sociology of Human Development,” *History of Political Thought* 32, no. 2 (2011): 345–366, and a brief segment of Chapter 6 was first published in “Two Concepts of Liberal Developmentalism,” *European Journal of Political Theory* 15, no. 1 (2016): 97–123. All are reprinted with permission, for which I am grateful to the journals and their presses.

I’m also grateful to Cambridge University Press, and particularly, to Robert Dreesen, who has guided this book through the editorial process with equal measures of patience and enthusiasm. Robert Judkins, Doreen Kruger and Krishna Prasath have been invaluable in transforming the manuscript into a book, and I’m especially indebted to the press’s two reviewers for their attentiveness, critical acumen and generosity.

Finally, thanks are owed to my family, and to my family-in-law for their constant warmth and kindness, as well as for introducing me to Cornish pasties (they’re delicious). My brother Jaspal’s boundless independence of thought is inspiring, as is his willingness to hop on a plane and come explore whatever city the WPSA happens to be in on any given year. My wife Morwenna has borne the many ups and downs that accompanied this project with unwavering good-heartedness, support and love. She is the pivot around which my life revolves, and I’d be entirely lost without her. My children, Piran and Una, make anything and everything worthwhile, and have patiently (as patiently as toddlers are able) tolerated evenings and weekends sucked into the vortex of this book. My greatest thanks are for my parents. Their enduring intellectual curiosity not only remains a beacon to aspire to, but instilled in me from as early as I can remember an unquestioned faith in the value of learning. Of the innumerable goods they have graced me with, chief among them was never having to wonder whether this kind of a life was worth pursuing. This book is dedicated to them.