

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-49347-5 — Free Will Skepticism in Law and Society  
Edited by Elizabeth Shaw, Derk Pereboom, Gregg D. Caruso  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

## FREE WILL SKEPTICISM IN LAW AND SOCIETY

“Free will skepticism” refers to a family of views that all take seriously the possibility that human beings lack the control in action – i.e., the free will – required for an agent to be truly deserving of blame and praise, punishment and reward. Critics fear that adopting this view would have harmful consequences for our interpersonal relationships, society, morality, meaning, and laws. Optimistic free will skeptics, on the other hand, respond by arguing that life without free will and so-called basic desert moral responsibility would not be harmful in these ways, and might even be beneficial. This collection addresses the practical implications of free will skepticism for law and society. It contains eleven original essays that provide alternatives to retributive punishment, explore what (if any) changes are needed for the criminal justice system, and ask whether we should be optimistic or pessimistic about the real-world implications of free will skepticism.

ELIZABETH SHAW is a lecturer in criminal law and criminology at the University of Aberdeen, where she is also a codirector of the Justice Without Retribution Network.

DERK PEREBOOM is Susan Linn Sage Professor in the Sage School of Philosophy and Senior Associate Dean of the Arts and Humanities at Cornell University. He is the author of *Living without Free Will* (2001), *Consciousness and the Prospects of Physicalism* (2011), and *Free Will, Agency, and Meaning in Life* (2014).

GREGG D. CARUSO is Professor of Philosophy at SUNY Corning and Honorary Professor of Philosophy at Macquarie University. He is also a codirector of the Justice Without Retribution Network at the University of Aberdeen School of Law. His books include *Free Will and Consciousness* (2012) and *Exploring the Illusion of Free Will and Moral Responsibility* (2013).

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-49347-5 — Free Will Skepticism in Law and Society  
Edited by Elizabeth Shaw , Derk Pereboom , Gregg D. Caruso  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

# FREE WILL SKEPTICISM IN LAW AND SOCIETY

*Challenging Retributive Justice*

EDITED BY  
ELIZABETH SHAW  
*University of Aberdeen*

DERK PEREBOOM  
*Cornell University*

GREGG D. CARUSO  
*SUNY Corning*



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-49347-5 — Free Will Skepticism in Law and Society  
Edited by Elizabeth Shaw, Derk Pereboom, Gregg D. Caruso  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom  
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India  
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.  
It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education,  
learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781108493475](http://www.cambridge.org/9781108493475)  
DOI: 10.1017/9781108655583

© Cambridge University Press 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written  
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

Printed and bound in Great Britain by Clays Ltd, Elcograf S.p.A.

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

ISBN 978-1-108-49347-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy  
of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication  
and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain,  
accurate or appropriate.

## Contents

<i>List of Contributors</i>	page vii
1 Free Will Skepticism in Law and Society: An Overview <i>Gregg D. Caruso, Elizabeth Shaw, and Derk Pereboom</i>	I
PART I ON THE PRACTICAL IMPLICATIONS OF FREE WILL SKEPTICISM: OPTIMISM VS. PESSIMISM	27
2 Free Will Denial and Deontological Constraints <i>Saul Smilansky</i>	29
3 Free Will Skepticism and Its Implications: An Argument for Optimism <i>Gregg D. Caruso</i>	43
4 Beyond the Retributive System <i>Bruce N. Waller</i>	73
PART II ALTERNATIVES TO RETRIBUTIVE PUNISHMENT	97
5 Free Will Skepticism and Prevention of Crime <i>Derk Pereboom</i>	99
6 Deontology and Deterrence for Free Will Deniers <i>Benjamin Vilhauer</i>	116
7 Free Will Skepticism, General Deterrence, and the “Use” Objection <i>Kevin J. Murtagh</i>	139

vi	<i>Contents</i>	
	PART III FREE WILL SKEPTICISM AND THE CRIMINAL JUSTICE SYSTEM	159
8	Fichte and Psychopathy: Criminal Justice Turned Upside Down <i>Michael Louis Corrado</i>	161
9	Causality and Responsibility in Mentally Disordered Offenders <i>John Callender</i>	177
10	The Implications of Free Will Skepticism for Establishing Criminal Liability <i>Elizabeth Shaw</i>	192
11	Free Will Skepticism and Criminal Punishment: A Preliminary Ethical Analysis <i>Farah Focquaert</i>	207
	<i>Index</i>	237

## *Contributors*

JOHN CALLENDER is a consultant psychiatrist and Honorary Senior Lecturer in Psychology at the University of Aberdeen. He is the author of *Free Will and Responsibility: A Guide for Practitioners* (2010).

GREGG D. CARUSO is Professor of Philosophy at SUNY Corning and Honorary Professor of Philosophy at Macquarie University. He is also a codirector of the Justice Without Retribution Network at the University of Aberdeen. His books include *Neuroexistentialism: Meaning, Morals, and Purpose in the Age of Neuroscience* (coedited with Owen Flanagan, 2018).

MICHAEL LOUIS CORRADO is Arch Allen Distinguished Professor of Law Emeritus at the University of North Carolina School of Law. He writes mainly about the philosophy of criminal law, but he has also written on law and economics, on tort law, and on comparative law.

FARAH FOCQUAERT is Professor of Philosophical Anthropology at Ghent University. She is the author of numerous papers in leading scientific and philosophical journals. She is a coeditor of the forthcoming *Routledge Handbook of the Philosophy and Science of Punishment*.

KEVIN J. MURTAGH is an Assistant Public Defender in Asheville, North Carolina, where he represents juveniles and indigent adults in criminal cases. His philosophical work has focused on punishment, sentencing theory, and free will.

DERK PEREBOOM is Susan Linn Sage Professor in the Sage School of Philosophy and Senior Associate Dean of the Arts and Humanities at Cornell University. He is the author of books including *Free Will, Agency, and Meaning in Life* (2014).

ELIZABETH SHAW is a lecturer in criminal law and criminology at the University of Aberdeen. She is a codirector of the Justice Without Retribution Network.

SAUL SMILANSKY is a professor in the Department of Philosophy at the University of Haifa, Israel. He is the author of *Free Will and Illusion* (2000), *10 Moral Paradoxes* (2007), and over eighty papers in philosophical journals and edited collections.

BENJAMIN VILHAUER is Professor of Philosophy and Chair of the Philosophy Department at City College, CUNY. He has published a variety of articles in edited volumes and journals, including *The Philosophical Quarterly*, *Philosophical Studies*, the *Canadian Journal of Philosophy*, and the *American Philosophical Quarterly*.

BRUCE N. WALLER is Professor of Philosophy at Youngstown State University. His books include *Against Moral Responsibility* (2011), *The Stubborn System of Moral Responsibility* (2015), and *The Injustice of Punishment* (2018).