

Democracy at Work

One of the greatest challenges in the twenty-first century is to address large, deep, and historic deficits in human development. *Democracy at Work* explores a crucial question: how does democracy, with all of its messy, contested, and, time-consuming features, advance well-being and improve citizens' lives? Professors Brian Wampler, Natasha Borges Sugiyama, and Michael Touchton argue that differences in the local robustness of three democratic pathways – participatory institutions, rights-based social programs, and inclusive state capacity – best explain the variation in how democratic governments improve well-being. Using novel data from Brazil and innovative analytic techniques, the authors show that participatory institutions permit citizens to express voice and exercise vote, inclusive social programs promote citizenship rights and access to public resources, and more capable local states use public resources according to democratic principles of rights protections and equal access. The analysis uncovers how democracy works to advance capabilities related to poverty, health, women's empowerment, and education.

Brian Wampler is Professor of Political Science at Boise State University. He is the author of *Activating Democracy in Brazil: Popular Participation, Social Justice, and Interlocking Institutions* (2015), and *Participatory Budgeting in Brazil: Contestation, Cooperation and Accountability* (2007).

Natasha Borges Sugiyama is Associate Professor of Political Science at the University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee. She is the author of *Diffusion of Good Government: Social Sector Reforms in Brazil* (2012).

Michael Touchton is Assistant Professor of Political Science at the University of Miami. He is the co-author of *Salvaging Communities: How American Cities Rebuild Closed Military Bases* (Forthcoming) with Amanda Johnson.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-49314-7 — Democracy at Work
Brian Wampler , Natasha Borges Sugiyama , Michael Touchton
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Democracy at Work

*Pathways
to Well-Being in Brazil*

BRIAN WAMPLER

Boise State University

NATASHA BORGES SUGIYAMA

University of Wisconsin – Milwaukee

MICHAEL TOUCHTON

University of Miami



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
 978-1-108-49314-7 — Democracy at Work
 Brian Wampler, Natasha Borges Sugiyama, Michael Touchton
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
 New Delhi – 110025, India
 79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108493147

DOI: 10.1017/9781108675949

© Brian Wampler, Natasha Borges Sugiyama, and Michael Touchton 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd. Padstow Cornwall
 A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Wampler, Brian, author. | Sugiyama, Natasha Borges, author. | Touchton, Michael, 1979– author.

TITLE: Democracy at work : pathways to well-being in Brazil / Brian Wampler, Natasha Borges Sugiyama, Michael Touchton.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY, USA : Cambridge University Press, 2020. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2019018390 | ISBN 9781108493147 (hardback : alk. paper)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Democracy – Social aspects – Brazil. | Income distribution – Brazil. | Public health – Brazil. | Women and democracy – Brazil. | Education and state – Brazil. | Brazil – Social policy | Brazil – Social conditions – 21st century.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC JL2481 .W363 2020 | DDC 306.20981–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2019018390>

ISBN 978-1-108-49314-7 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

| | |
|--|----------------|
| <i>List of Figures</i> | <i>page</i> vi |
| <i>List of Tables</i> | vii |
| <i>Preface and Acknowledgments</i> | xi |
| <i>List of Interviews</i> | xiv |
| <i>List of Abbreviations</i> | xvii |
| Introduction | I |
| 1 Democracy at Work | 22 |
| 2 Building Pathways for Change | 58 |
| 3 Research Design, Methods, and Variables | 85 |
| 4 Reducing Poverty: Broadening Access to Income | 103 |
| 5 Improving Health: Saving Lives | 132 |
| 6 Empowering Women: Saving Mothers and Enhancing Opportunities | 166 |
| 7 Educating Society: Promoting Public Education and Learning | 198 |
| 8 Pathways at Work: Lessons from Brazil's Poor Northeast | 228 |
| Conclusion: How Democracy Improves Well-Being | 276 |
| <i>Appendix</i> | 294 |
| <i>References</i> | 316 |
| <i>Index</i> | 344 |

Figures

| | | |
|-----|------------------------------------|----------------|
| 1.1 | Democratic ladders of abstraction | <i>page</i> 34 |
| 1.2 | Interaction of pathways | 37 |
| 8.1 | Brazil and the state of Pernambuco | 233 |
| 8.2 | Interaction of pathways | 269 |

Tables

| | | |
|-----|--|----------------|
| 3.1 | Key independent variables across models in Chapters 4–7 | <i>page</i> 94 |
| 3.2 | Summary statistics for key independent variables | 95 |
| 3.3 | Brazil's policy management councils | 97 |
| 4.1 | Poverty across Brazil | 112 |
| 4.2 | Explaining poverty outcomes 2006–2013: Federal social programs, policy councils, and local state capacity | 121 |
| 4.3 | Policy councils, federal social programs, and public goods spending, 2006–2013 | 124 |
| 4.4 | Explaining poverty scores through interactions among policy councils, Bolsa Família coverage, and local state capacity | 126 |
| 5.1 | Regional health differences across Brazil, 1990–2010 | 139 |
| 5.2 | Health-related policy councils across Brazil, 2001–2013 | 144 |
| 5.3 | PSF coverage rates across Brazilian municipalities, by region | 147 |
| 5.4 | Explaining infant mortality, 2006–2013: Federal social programs, voluntary policy councils, and local state capacity | 154 |
| 5.5 | Explaining infant mortality, 2006–2013: Federal social programs and incentivized policy council meetings | 156 |
| 5.6 | Explaining infant mortality: Voluntary policy councils, federal social programs, and local state capacity, 2006–2013 | 159 |
| 5.7 | Explaining infant mortality through interactions among policy councils, Bolsa Família coverage, and local state capacity | 161 |
| 6.1 | Political and economic status of Brazilian women | 178 |
| 6.2 | Explaining variation in maternal mortality, 2006–2013 | 189 |

| | | |
|-----|--|-----|
| 6.3 | Explaining variation in earnings for low-income women, 2006–2013 | 191 |
| 6.4 | Explaining variation in women’s political participation, 2006–2013 | 192 |
| 6.5 | Explaining women’s empowerment through interactions among policy councils, Bolsa Família coverage, and local state capacity | 193 |
| 7.1 | Education across Brazil | 206 |
| 7.2 | Number of councils related to education and youth | 209 |
| 7.3 | Explaining variation in school attendance, 2003–2013 | 219 |
| 7.4 | Explaining college entrance exam scores (ENEM), 2006–2013 | 220 |
| 7.5 | Explaining elementary school attendance, 2006–2013 | 222 |
| 7.6 | Explaining high school test (ENEM) performance, 2006–2013: Interactions among policy councils, Bolsa Família coverage and local state capacity | 223 |
| 7.7 | Explaining educational outcomes through interactions among policy councils, Bolsa Família coverage, and local state capacity | 224 |
| 8.1 | Case study municipalities: Socioeconomic summary statistics | 231 |
| 8.2 | Case study municipalities: Social summary statistics | 233 |
| 8.3 | Case study municipalities: Democratic pathway summary statistics | 234 |

TABLES IN APPENDIX

| | | |
|--------|--|-----|
| A4.2.a | Explaining poverty outcomes, 2006–2013 | 296 |
| A4.2.b | Explaining poverty outcomes, 2006–2013 | 297 |
| A4.2.c | Explaining poverty outcomes: Voluntary policy councils, 2006–2013 | 298 |
| A5.4.a | Explaining infant mortality, 2006–2013 | 299 |
| A5.4.b | Explaining infant mortality, 2006–2013 | 300 |
| A5.4.c | Explaining infant mortality, 2006–2013 | 301 |
| A5.4.d | Explaining infant mortality, 2006–2013 | 302 |
| A5.5.a | Explaining infant mortality, 2006–2013 | 303 |
| A6.3.a | Explaining maternal mortality, 2006–2013 | 304 |
| A6.3.b | Explaining variation in maternal mortality, 2006–2013 | 305 |
| A6.4.a | Explaining variation in women’s income, 2006–2013 | 306 |
| A6.4.b | Explaining variation in women’s income, 2006–2013: Federal social programs and voluntary policy councils | 307 |

List of Tables

ix

| | | |
|--------|--|-----|
| A6.5.a | Explaining variation in women’s political participation, 2006–2013 | 308 |
| A6.5.b | Explaining women’s political empowerment, 2006–2013 | 309 |
| A7.3.a | Explaining school attendance, 2006–2013 | 310 |
| A7.3.b | Explaining school attendance, 2006–2013 | 311 |
| A7.4.a | Explaining ENEM test scores, 2006–2013 | 312 |
| A7.4.b | Explaining high school graduation rates, test scores, and test passage rates, 2006–2013 | 313 |
| | Case Studies: Questionnaire for <i>Democracy at Work</i> | 314 |

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-49314-7 — Democracy at Work
Brian Wampler , Natasha Borges Sugiyama , Michael Touchton
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Preface and Acknowledgments

This book is born out of each of our experiences studying Brazilian politics and issues of development. We spent countless hours discussing how Brazil made progress toward human development in the 2000s and early 2010s and saw how our three skill sets could combine to thoroughly address this question in a way that few teams could. We came to this project having previously explored different research questions: Brian had written extensively about Brazil's participatory infrastructure for citizen engagement in local decision-making. Natasha had developed her expertise on municipal-level, pro-poor policy reforms and citizenship development among the poor. Michael brought research experiences related to economic development and an interest in building new datasets to uncover causal processes for Brazil's social, economic, and political transformations. Each of these unique perspectives comes together in our enterprise to understand how local democratic practices contribute to gains in human development in a context with a supportive federal environment and constitutional guarantees for social rights. Where local experiences falter, we wanted to understand why.

Our analysis developed over time and early iterations of our work appeared as conference papers. Together, we have presented versions of chapters at a number of professional conferences organized by the American Political Science Association, the Latin American Studies Association, the International Political Science Association, the Midwest Political Science Association, and the Southern Political Science Association. We thank our panel discussants and audience members for their thoughtful comments and probing questions. Discussants included: Sarah Brooks, Evelyne Huber, James McGuire, Eduardo Moncada, and

Joseph Wong. An early version of our work, which we presented at the LASA Congress in New York, won the best paper award of the subnational politics and society section. That paper, “Democracy at Work: Moving beyond Elections to Improve Well-Being,” was later published in the *American Political Science Review* (2017).

Colleagues from various universities have also been kind enough to host us for research presentations, symposia, and colloquia where we refined our ideas. Collectively, we presented portions of our research at the University of Miami’s Political Science Department and Institute for Advanced Study of the Americas; Clemson University; the University of Alaska, Southeast; Boise State University; and the World Bank. The Fulbright Foundation supported Michael’s engagement with Brazilian scholars at the State University of Campinas (UNICAMP), the Federal University of Rio Grande do Sul, the Federal University of Espirito Santo, the Federal University of Amapá, and the Fundação Joaquim Nabuco. Wagner Romão was instrumental in helping to make these connections possible.

Our research was supported by a number of institutions, for which we are grateful. The University of Miami also provided generous support for Michael to take a research leave to complete fieldwork on this project. Boise State University and the School of Public Service provided financial support for Brian’s research trip to Brazil, sabbatical support, and funding for undergraduate and graduate research assistants. The University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee (UWM) supported Natasha’s sabbatical to Brazil. Thanks also go to UWM’s Center for Latin American and Caribbean Studies (CLACS) for Natasha’s research support in Brazil and to the Office of Undergraduate Research for their Student Undergraduate Research Fellowship program, which connected Natasha to talented undergraduate research assistants.

At the risk of omitting colleagues who offered us helpful comments along away, we also thank the following individuals: Rebecca Abers, Sonia Alvarez, Leonardo Avritzer, Merike Blofield, Joanildo Burity, Maxwell Cameron, Jose Maria Cardoso de Silva, Euzeneia Carlos, Alan Cavalcanti da Cunha, Helenilza Cunha, Zach Elkins, Gustavo Fernandes, Ben Goldfrank, Laura Gomez-Mera, Calla Hummel, Felicia Knaul, Marcelo Kunrath, Luciana Andressa Martins de Souza, Ricardo Mayer, Françoise Montambeault, Carlos Pereira, Tiago Peixoto, Roberto Pires, Lucio Renno, and Kurt Weyland for providing us with their feedback and venues for fruitful dialogue about our ideas. Special thanks go to Wendy

Hunter, with whom Natasha has worked closely on other research related to Bolsa Família.

Several individuals have served as extended team members on this project, including graduate and undergraduate students at our three home institutions. Ana Costa has been an important contributor to our work, assisting with data collection, Freedom of Information requests, graphics, translations, and even accompanying Brian and Mike to conduct research in Pernambuco. In Milwaukee, Luis Mauro Valadão Quiroz Filho and Samuel Orłowski assisted in transcribing focus group interviews. In Brazil, we were aided by Gleiciane Souza, who assisted us in setting up interviews in Camaragibe, Jaboatão dos Guararapes, and Garanhuns.

At the editorial stage, we benefited from advice and copyediting by Jennifer Morales. We are especially grateful to Sara Duskow at Cambridge University Press who provided us with early feedback and guided our manuscript through the review process. Our anonymous reviewers read our manuscripts with great care and offered valuable suggestions, which improved the book tremendously.

It is a terrible custom in academic book publishing to thank family and friends last. We are remiss in doing so here, not because their contributions are any less important, but rather because it is their support that serves as the backbone to our present and future academic enterprise. Our families made the beginnings of this project possible by joining us on research trips and sabbaticals many years ago. Our children, nephews, and nieces motivate us to keep working for a world where social inclusion is a reality for all. So we end with our thanks to them because they inspire our future. In particular, Brian thanks Paula, Sebastian, and Ginger. Natasha thanks Greg, Nina, and Anton. Michael thanks Mom, Dad, and Paul. This book is dedicated to Brazilians who engage with and defend democratic practices to further a more just and inclusive society.

Interviews

- Agenilda Ramos Nascimento. Coordinator of the Social Assistance Council, Jaboatão dos Guararapes, Pernambuco; May 22, 2017.
- Ana Claudia, Garanhuns, Pernambuco; June 1, 2017.
- Ana Paula Oliveira Soares. President of the FUNDEB Council, Garanhuns, Pernambuco; June 1, 2017.
- Ana Selma Santos. Former Executive Secretary of Women, Jaboatão dos Guararapes, Pernambuco; June 6, 2017.
- Andrea Gomes de Sa. President of the Municipal Education Council, Garanhuns, Pernambuco; June 1, 2017.
- Catalina, Garanhuns, Pernambuco; May 28, 2017.
- Cynthia Barbosa. Journalist and education activist, Camaragibe, Pernambuco; May 17, 2017.
- David, Garanhuns, Pernambuco; May 31, 2017
- Debora Tenorio. Police Chief, Garanhuns, Pernambuco; May 31, 2017.
- Denivaldo Freire. Secretary of Education, Camaragibe, Pernambuco; May 17, 2017.
- Diana Conceição. President of the Municipal Social Assistance Council, Garanhuns, Pernambuco; May 31, 2017.
- Dorvalina Maciel de Vasconcelos. Secretary for the Education Councils, Garanhuns, Pernambuco; May 30, 2017.
- Edilene Silva. Member of the Municipal Council of Women's Rights and of the *Uniao Brasileira de Mulher*, Jaboatão dos Guararapes, Pernambuco; May 22, 2017.
- Eduardo Gaspar. Public employee – Secretariat of Social Assistance, Camaragibe, Pernambuco; May 19, 2017.

List of Interviews

xv

- Edvaldo Ferreira, Jr. Secretary of Social Assistance, Camaragibe, Pernambuco; May 17, 2017.
- Eliane Alves. CSO leader and women's advocate, Camaragibe, Pernambuco; May 18, 2017.
- Eliane Simões Vilar. Secretary of Women, Garanhuns, Pernambuco; May 31, 2017.
- Fatima Lacerda. Former Secretary of Planning (2009-2015), Jaboatão dos Guararapes, Pernambuco; May 30, 2017.
- Fernando Antonio. Public employee – Secretariat of Education, Camaragibe, Pernambuco; May 17, 2017.
- Flavio Eduardo Santos. Executive Secretary of the Health Care Council, Camaragibe, Pernambuco; May 18, 2017.
- Gilberta, Garanhuns, Pernambuco; June 3, 2017.
- Gilberto Soares Pereira. Health Manager in Caetes (PE), Garanhuns, Pernambuco; May 30, 2017.
- Givaldo Nascimento. President of the Municipal Social Assistance Council, Camaragibe, Pernambuco; May 18, 2017.
- Humberto Granja Neto. Manager of *Cadastro Único*, Garanhuns, Pernambuco; June 1, 2017.
- Janete Tavares. Former public employee - Secretariat of Women, Jaboatão dos Guararapes, Pernambuco; June 5, 2017.
- José Juca Melo Filho. Vice President of the Social Assistance Council and Civil Society Councilor, Garanhuns, Pernambuco; May 31, 2017.
- Júlio Antão. President of the Municipal Council for Persons with Disability, Camaragibe, Pernambuco; May 17, 2017.
- Karina Antunes. Human Rights Manager, Jaboatão dos Guararapes, Pernambuco; May 30, 2017.
- Karla Menezes. Former Secretary of Government, Jaboatão dos Guararapes, Pernambuco; May 31, 2017.
- Laudicea Oliveira. Journalist and member of Women's and Health Care Councils, Camaragibe, Pernambuco; May 17, 2017.
- Leandra Magalhaes dos Santos. Public employee – Secretariat of Health, Garanhuns, Pernambuco; May 31, 2017.
- Lubania Barbosa dos Santos. Coordinator of the Municipal Women's Council, Jaboatão dos Guararapes, Pernambuco; May 22, 2017.
- Lúcia Teixeira. Lawyer and public employee – Secretariat of Health, Camaragibe, Pernambuco; May 17, 2017.
- Marta, Garanhuns, Pernambuco. May 30, 2017.

- Maria Selma Melo. Former public employee in the Secretariat of Education in Jaboatão dos Guararapes, – Secretariat of Education, Olinda, Pernambuco; June 5, 2017.
- Maria do Carmo Mendes de Oliveira. Former Executive Secretary of Education in Jaboatão dos Guararapes, Olinda, Pernambuco; June 5, 2017.
- Moisés Gomes dos Santos. Member of the Municipal Health Care Council and Community Leader, Jaboatão dos Guararapes, Pernambuco; May 22, 2017.
- Raquel Miranda. Coordinator of Drug Policies, Jaboatão dos Guararapes, Pernambuco; May 30, 2017.
- Renata Cristina Lopes. High school teacher and employee of the *Fundação Joaquim Nabuco*, Jaboatão dos Guararapes, Pernambuco; June 5, 2017.
- Ricardo Souza. Tutelary counselor, Garanhuns, Pernambuco; May 29, 2017.
- Rosa Rodrigues. Managed federal grants for education in Jaboatão dos Guararapes, Olinda, Pernambuco; June 5, 2017.
- Shisneyida Furtado. Acting Secretary of Health, Garanhuns, Pernambuco; June 3, 2017.
- Silvia, Garanhuns, Pernambuco; May 30, 2017.
- Socorro Araújo. State Executive Secretary of Social Assistance, Recife, Pernambuco; June 8, 2017.
- Vera Leão. President of the Municipal Education Council, Camaragibe, Pernambuco; May 16, 2017.
- Yacy Novaes. President of the Municipal Council of Children’s and Youth’s Rights, Garanhuns, Pernambuco; May 31, 2017.
- Washington Silva Vieira. President of the Municipal Education Council, Garanhuns, Pernambuco; May 30, 2017.

Abbreviations

| | |
|---------------|---|
| BF | Bolsa Família Family Grant |
| BPC | Benefício de Proteção Continuada Social Protection Benefit |
| CCT | Conditional Cash Transfer |
| CEDAW | Convention on the Elimination against All Forms of Discrimination against Women |
| CGU | Controladoria Geral da União Comptroller General of the Union |
| CRAS | Centro de Referência da Assistência Social Social Assistance Reference Centers |
| CREAS | Centro de Referência Especializado de Assistência Social Specialized Social Assistance Reference Centers |
| CSO | Civil Society Organization |
| DEM | Democratas Democrats |
| DFID | Department for International Development |
| ENEM | Exame Nacional do Ensino Médio National High School Exam |
| FIRJAN | Federação das Indústrias do Estado do Rio de Janeiro Industry Federation of the State of Rio de Janeiro |
| FUNDEB | Fundo de Manutenção e Desenvolvimento da Educação Básica Fund for the Maintenance and Development of Basic Education |

| | |
|-------------------|--|
| FUNDEF | Fundo de Manutenção e Desenvolvimento do Ensino Fundamental e de Valorização do Magistério Fund for Maintenance and Development of the Fundamental Education and Valorization of Teaching |
| GDP | Gross Domestic Product |
| GMM | Generalized method of moments |
| GNI | Gross National Income |
| GOBI | Growth monitoring, oral rehydration, breastfeeding, and immunization |
| HDI | Human Development Index |
| IBGE | Instituto Brasileiro de Geografia e Estatística Brazilian Institute of Geography and Statistics |
| IBGE MUNIC | Pesquisa de Informações Básicas Municipais Survey of Basic Municipal Information |
| IGD | Índice de Gestão Descentralizada |
| INAMPS | Instituto Nacional de Assistência Médica da Previdência Social National Institute of Medical and Social Services |
| MDB | Movimento Democrático Brasileiro Brazilian Democratic Movement |
| MDGs | Millennium Development Goals |
| MDS | Ministério do Desenvolvimento Social e Combate à Fome Ministry of Social Development and Fight against Hunger |
| NGO | Non-governmental organization |
| NOB | Normas Operacionais Básicas Basic Operational Norms |
| OECD | Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development |
| OLS | Ordinary least squares |
| PAHO | Pan American Health Organization |
| PC do B | Partido Comunista do Brasil Communist Party of Brazil PDT Partido Democrático Trabalhista Democratic Labor Party |
| PFL | Partido da Frente Liberal Liberal Front Party |
| PISA | Program for International Student Assessment |
| PMDB | Partido do Movimento Democrático Brasileiro |

List of Abbreviations

xix

| | |
|--------|--|
| PSB | Brazilian Democratic Movement Partido Socialista Brasileiro |
| PSDB | Brazilian Socialist Party Partido da Social Democracia Brasileira |
| PSF | Brazilian Social Democracy Party Programa Saúde da Família |
| PT | Family Health Program Partido dos Trabalhadores |
| PTB | Workers' Party Partido Trabalhista Brasileiro |
| SDGs | Brazilian Labour Party Sustainable Development Goals |
| SERNAM | Servicio Nacional de la Mujer National Women's Service |
| SPM | Secretaria Nacional de Políticas para Mulheres National Women's Secretariat |
| SUS | Sistema Único de Saúde Unified Health System |
| SUAS | Sistema Único de Assistência Social System of Unified Social Assistance |
| TPA | Transparency, Participation, and Accountability |
| USAID | United States Agency for International Development |
| UN | United Nations |
| UNICEF | United Nations International Children's Emergency Fund |
| UNDP | United Nations Development Program |
| WHO | World Health Organization |

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-49314-7 — Democracy at Work
Brian Wampler , Natasha Borges Sugiyama , Michael Touchton
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)
