

## Signs of Difference

How are people's ideas about languages, ways of speaking, and expressive styles shaped by their social positions and values? How is difference, in language and in social life, made – and unmade? How and why are some differences persuasive as the basis for action, while other differences are ignored or erased? Written by two recognized authorities on language and culture, this book argues that ideological work of all kinds is fundamentally communicative, and that social positions, projects, and historical moments influence, and are influenced by, people's ideas about communicative practices. Neither true nor false, ideologies are positioned and partial visions of the world, relying on comparison and perspective; they exploit differences in expressive features – linguistic and otherwise – to construct convincing stereotypes of people, spaces, and activities. Using detailed ethnographic, historical, and contemporary examples, this outstanding book shows readers how to analyze ideological work semiotically.

SUSAN GAL is Mae and Sidney G. Metzl Distinguished Service Professor of Anthropology and Linguistics at the University of Chicago. She is author of *Language Shift* (1979) and *The Politics of Language* (in Hungarian, 2018) as well as coauthor with Gail Kligman of *Politics of Gender After Socialism* (2000), and coeditor with Kathryn Woolard of *Languages and Publics: The Making of Authority* (2001).

JUDITH T. IRVINE is Edward Sapir Collegiate Professor of Linguistic Anthropology at the University of Michigan. Author of many articles and chapters in linguistic anthropology, she is coeditor with Jane H. Hill of *Responsibility and Evidence in Oral Discourse* (1993), coeditor with Regna Darnell et al. of the *Collected Works of Edward Sapir* (1999), and Associate Editor of the journal *Language in Society*.

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-49189-1 — Signs of Difference  
Susan Gal , Judith T. Irvine  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

# Signs of Difference

*Language and Ideology in Social Life*

---

Susan Gal

*University of Chicago*

Judith T. Irvine

*University of Michigan, Ann Arbor*



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-49189-1 — Signs of Difference  
Susan Gal, Judith T. Irvine  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom  
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,  
New Delhi – 110025, India  
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781108491891](http://www.cambridge.org/9781108491891)

DOI: 10.1017/9781108649209

© Susan Gal and Judith T. Irvine 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd. Padstow Cornwall

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

ISBN 978-1-108-49189-1 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-74129-3 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

## Contents

---

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> vii
<i>List of Tables</i>	ix
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xi
Introduction	1
<b>Part I Ethnography</b>	<b>27</b>
1 Wolof in Senegal	29
2 German-Hungarians in Hungary	58
<b>Part II Semiotics</b>	<b>85</b>
3 Ingredients: Signs, Conjectures, Perspectives	87
4 Comparison: The Semiotics of Differentiation	112
5 Dynamics of Change in Differentiation	138
<b>Part III Sites</b>	<b>165</b>
6 Situating Ideological Work	167
7 Among and Between Sites	190
8 Scales and Scale-Making: Connecting Sites	217
<b>Part IV Pasts</b>	<b>243</b>
9 Library to Field: Ideologies in Nineteenth-Century Linguistic Research	245
Coda: Avenues of Inquiry	270
<i>Notes</i>	277
<i>References</i>	289
<i>Index</i>	311

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-49189-1 — Signs of Difference  
Susan Gal , Judith T. Irvine  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

## Figures

---

- |     |   |                 |
|-----|---|-----------------|
| 7.1 | Baltimore, readers sitting on bench, 1990s<br>(drawing by J. Krcmarik from photo) | <i>page</i> 192 |
| 7.2 | Baltimore, reader sitting on bench, 1990s<br>(drawing by J. Krcmarik from photo)  | 192             |
| 7.3 | Baltimore, bus stop bench, 2012 (photo J. T. Irvine)                              | 194             |

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-49189-1 — Signs of Difference  
Susan Gal , Judith T. Irvine  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---



## Tables

---

1.1	Wolof register contrasts in prosody	<i>page</i> 40
1.2	Wolof register contrasts in phonology	40
1.3	Wolof register contrasts in morphology and syntax	41
1.4	Wolof sociolinguistic recursions	48
2.1	Phonological differences between Bäuerisch/Schwäwisch and Handwerkerisch	66
2.2	Morphological and pragmatic differences between Bäuerisch/Schwäwisch and Handwerkerisch	67
2.3	Examples of Lexical differences between Bäuerisch/Schwäwisch and Handwerkerisch	68
2.4	Percentage of Bäuerisch/Schwäwisch and Handwerkerisch features in storytelling by four speakers	68
4.1	An East/West axis in the nineteenth-century United States	120
4.2	The East/West axis in a nineteenth-century narrative	122
5.1	Thomas Jefferson's "Characters of the Several States"	144

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-49189-1 — Signs of Difference  
Susan Gal , Judith T. Irvine  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

## Acknowledgments

---

We thank our colleagues, especially fellow members of the Michiganian Faculty Seminar, for their commentary and lively discussion: Dick Bauman, Summerson Carr, Hillary Dick, Matt Hull, Webb Keane, Alaina Lemon, Michael Lempert, John Lucy, Bruce Mannheim, Barbra Meek, Lesley Milroy, Costas Nakassis, Sue Philips, Justin Richland, Michael Silverstein, and Kristina Wirtz. In addition, thanks to Andy Abbott, Susan Crane, Victor Friedman, Miyako Inoue, Katalin Kovács, Paul Kroskrity, Rick Parmentier, Kit Woolard, Erzsébet Varga, and Viviana Zelizer – good friends and intellectual partners. The people at our field sites gifted us with their collaboration, for which we are grateful. The graduate students in Judy's Language Ideologies seminars and Sue's Language in Culture seminars contributed with quizzical looks and stimulating discussions, and we thank them, as we do the many audiences that have listened, responded, and challenged us, when we presented versions of our chapters.

Special gratitude goes to the Rockefeller Foundation's Bellagio Center for its unmatched beauty and welcoming calm. The Guggenheim Foundation encouraged each of us with a fellowship; the National Endowment for the Humanities awarded one to Judy, the Social Science Research Council's International Scholar Program to Sue. Further financial support, for which we are grateful, came from the Lichtstern Fund of the Department of Anthropology at the University of Chicago and the University of Michigan's College of Literature, Science and the Arts. It is a pleasure to acknowledge Sue's fellowship at what was once the wonderful Collegium Budapest, and Judy's Mellon Foundation Fellowship at the University of Cape Town.

To our families, we owe special thanks. Judy thanks Becky and Deb Pastner and their families for support and patience; and to the late Steve Pastner, special remembrance, in gratitude for many things. From Sue to Anna Hamburg-Gal, a message just for you: Naturally, one says thanks repeatedly in life. And to Sam Hamburg, thank you, as ever, for musical accompaniment.

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-49189-1 — Signs of Difference  
Susan Gal , Judith T. Irvine  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---