

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-48655-2 — New Perspectives on Pakistan's Political Economy  
Edited by Matthew McCartney, S. Akbar Zaidi  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

## New Perspectives on Pakistan's Political Economy

This volume makes a major intervention in the debates around the nature of the political economy of Pakistan, focusing on its contemporary social dynamics. This is the first comprehensive academic analysis of Pakistan's political economy after thirty-five years, and addresses issues of state, class and society, examining gender, the middle classes, the media, the bazaar economy, urban spaces and the new elite.

The book goes beyond the contemporary obsession with terrorism and extremism, political Islam, and simple 'civilian–military relations', and looks at modern-day Pakistan through the lens of varied academic disciplines. It not only brings together new work by some emerging scholars but also formulates a new political economy for the country, reflecting the contemporary reality and diversification in the social sciences in Pakistan.

The chapters in this volume dynamically and dialectically capture emergent processes and trends in framing Pakistan's political economy and invite other scholars to engage with and move beyond these concerns and issues.

**Matthew McCartney** is former Director of South Asian Studies (2011–2018) and Associate Professor in the Political Economy and Human Development of South Asia, University of Oxford. His two most recent books are *Economic Growth and Development: A Comparative Introduction* (2015) and *Pakistan: The Political Economy of Growth, Stagnation and the State, 1951–2008* (2011).

**S. Akbar Zaidi** is Professor at Columbia University, New York, and is also an Adjunct Professor at the Institute of Business Administration, Karachi. His most recent books are *Issues in Pakistan's Economy: A Political Economy Perspective* (2015) and *Military, Civil Society and Democratization in Pakistan* (2011).

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-48655-2 — New Perspectives on Pakistan's Political Economy  
Edited by Matthew McCartney, S. Akbar Zaidi  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

## SOUTH ASIA IN THE SOCIAL SCIENCES

South Asia has become a laboratory for devising new institutions and practices of modern social life. Forms of capitalist enterprise, providing welfare and social services, the public role of religion, the management of ethnic conflict, popular culture and mass democracy in the countries of the region have shown a marked divergence from known patterns in other parts of the world. South Asia is now being studied for its relevance to the general theoretical understanding of modernity itself.

*South Asia in the Social Sciences* will feature books that offer innovative research on contemporary South Asia. It will focus on the place of the region in the various global disciplines of the social sciences and highlight research that uses unconventional sources of information and novel research methods. While recognising that most current research is focused on the larger countries, the series will attempt to showcase research on the smaller countries of the region.

General Editor

Partha Chatterjee

*Columbia University*

Editorial Board

Pranab Bardhan

*University of California at Berkeley*

Stuart Corbridge

*Durham University*

Satish Deshpande

*University of Delhi*

Christophe Jaffrelot

*Centre d'études et de recherches internationales, Paris*

Nivedita Menon

*Jawaharlal Nehru University*

Other books in the series:

*Government as Practice: Democratic Left in a Transforming India*

Dwaipayan Bhattacharyya

*Courting the People: Public Interest Litigation in Post-Emergency India*

Anuj Bhunia

*Development after Statism: Industrial Firms and the Political Economy of South Asia*

Adnan Naseemullah

*Politics of the Poor: Negotiating Democracy in Contemporary India*

Indrajit Roy

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-48655-2 — New Perspectives on Pakistan's Political Economy  
Edited by Matthew McCartney , S. Akbar Zaidi  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

*South Asian Governmentalities: Michel Foucault and the Question of Postcolonial Orderings*

Stephen Legg and Deana Heath (eds.)

*Nationalism, Development and Ethnic Conflict in Sri Lanka*

Rajesh Venugopal

*Adivasis and the State: Subalternity and Citizenship in India's Bhil Heartland*

Alf Gunvald Nilsen

*Maoist People's War and the Revolution of Everyday Life in Nepal*

Ina Zharkevich

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-48655-2 — New Perspectives on Pakistan's Political Economy  
Edited by Matthew McCartney, S. Akbar Zaidi  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

**New Perspectives on**  
**Pakistan's Political Economy**  
*State, Class and Social Change*

*Edited by*  
Matthew McCartney  
S. Akbar Zaidi



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-48655-2 — New Perspectives on Pakistan's Political Economy  
Edited by Matthew McCartney, S. Akbar Zaidi  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom  
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, vic 3207, Australia  
314 to 321, 3rd Floor, Plot No.3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi 110025, India  
79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781108486552](http://www.cambridge.org/9781108486552)

© Cambridge University Press 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

Printed in India

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

ISBN 978-1-108-48655-2 HB

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

# Contents

<i>Preface</i>	
Matthew McCartney and S. Akbar Zaidi	<i>ix</i>
Introduction	
<i>Matthew McCartney and S. Akbar Zaidi</i>	1
1. In a Desperate State: The Social Sciences and the Overdeveloped State in Pakistan, 1950 to 1983	25
<i>Matthew McCartney</i>	
2. The Overdeveloped Alavian Legacy	56
<i>Aasim Sajjad Akhtar</i>	
3. Institutions Matter: The State, the Military and Social Class	75
<i>Aqil Shah</i>	
4. Class Is Dead but Faith Never Dies: Women, Islam and Pakistan	93
<i>Afiya Shehrbano Zia</i>	
5. The Amnesia of Genesis	110
<i>Adeem Suhail</i>	
6. The Political Economy of Uneven State-Spatiality in Pakistan: The Interplay of Space, Class and Institutions	130
<i>Danish Khan</i>	
7. An Evolving Class Structure? Pakistan's Ruling Classes and the Implications for Pakistan's Political Economy	153
<i>Rosita Armytage</i>	
8. The Segmented 'Rural Elite': Agrarian Transformation and Rural Politics in Pakistani Punjab	176
<i>Muhammad Ali Jan</i>	
9. Ascending the Power Structure: Bazaar Traders in Urban Punjab	199
<i>Umair Javed</i>	

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-108-48655-2 — New Perspectives on Pakistan's Political Economy  
Edited by Matthew McCartney , S. Akbar Zaidi  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

viii	Contents
10. Democracy and Patronage in Pakistan <i>Hassan Javid</i>	216
11. From Overdeveloped State to Praetorian Pakistan: Tracing the Media’s Transformations <i>Farooq Sulehria</i>	241
<i>About the Contributors</i>	256
<i>Index</i>	261

## Preface

The genesis of this book lies in teaching a course on the economic development of South Asia, at both Oxford University and the School of Oriental and African Studies (SOAS) at the University of London, and in trying to assess and explore ideas about the political economy of regions and states other than those of India. Unlike the rich academic literature on studying India and other countries of the Global South across a variety of schools of thought in economics, politics and political economy, the limited focus on Pakistan has largely been dominated by a single framework, one proposed by Hamza Alavi, which focused on the notion of an overdeveloped state, with regard to Pakistan and, later, Bangladesh, in a paper published in the *New Left Review* in 1972. One option for teaching such a course was to use the comparative nature of scholarship, primarily one based on the Indian academic and social science tradition and historical context, and consider its relevance for Pakistan. However, as academics, researchers and scholars of India, or the other countries which constitute South Asia realise, that while this is how much of the academic teaching and research in and on South Asia usually functions, it is a very suboptimal choice of teaching and scholarship, given the specificities of the different countries. Pakistan, like the other South Asian countries, differs substantially from India, given its political economy and history, and requires an examination based on its own terms and in its own context. While exceptional scholarship of social scientists from India and those who work on India is now increasingly providing theoretical and empirical evidence redefining numerous theoretical paradigms – as we find in this volume as well – what has been lacking for at least four decades now is rigorous assessment of Pakistan's political economy, which, until recently, has continued to be dominated by the work and influence of Hamza Alavi.

In February 2016, Professor Matthew McCartney and his student Muhammad Ali Jan organised a workshop in Oxford sponsored by Wolfson College and the Contemporary South Asian Studies Programme (CSASP) to address this problem and to assess the state of scholarship in the social sciences and of the political economy of Pakistan, almost four-and-a-half decades after Alavi's thesis. Their suggestion was to engage with the call to academic arms made by S. Akbar Zaidi in an essay published in *Economic and Political Weekly* in 2014, in which he argued



that one needs to go well beyond the Alavi thesis and considerably re-think Pakistan's political economy in a much changed world and in a very different Pakistan. Soon after publication, Zaidi's *Economic and Political Weekly* essay was critiqued and responded to in the journal by five, mostly younger, scholars from Pakistan in a symposium organised by Majed Akhter, then Assistant Professor in the Department of Geography, Indiana University, Bloomington. Akhter invited Aasim Sajjad Akhtar, Fahd Ali, Umair Javed and Adeem Suhail to engage with Zaidi's intervention. Zaidi responded to the critiques by suggesting they were not 'ruthless enough' and that many of his arguments went 'uncontested'. The five participants in the symposium in the *Economic and Political Weekly* were invited to contribute to this volume, three of whom eventually did, and they have considerably expanded on their original insight as is evident in this collection.

The workshop held in Oxford in February 2016 had ten papers presented for discussion, five of which have been included in this volume. S. Akbar Zaidi delivered the keynote address to the participants in a public lecture around the workshop. Those who presented papers included Adeel Malik and Masooda Bano, both teaching at Oxford University; Faisal Siddiqi, an advocate of the Supreme Court of Pakistan, based in Karachi; Umair Javed, who was just finishing his PhD at the London School of Economics; Afiya Shehrbano Zia, a feminist scholar from Karachi; Farooq Sulehria and Matthew Nelson (whose paper was presented in absentia), both from SOAS; Adnan Rafiq and Ali Jan, both of whom were completing their PhDs at Oxford; and Matthew McCartney, who teaches at Oxford University and is responsible for organising the Oxford workshop. Subsequently, Aqil Shah, Danish Khan, Hassan Javid, Aasim Sajjad Akhtar, Rosita Armytage and Adeem Suhail were invited to contribute to this collection in response to the Alavi and Zaidi papers.

Both of us, as editors to this volume, have since negotiated the shoals of getting feedback from the reviewers and going through various iterations of editing. We would like to thank all who participated in the Oxford University Workshop, as well as all the final contributors to this volume. We are delighted to see the stimulating contradictions, debates and rigorous arguments emerging in these chapters. We asked the question whether Pakistan needed a new political economy to go beyond the one originally provided by Alavi. Our contributors have answered this question in a wonderful variety of ways and we see this as the start of a new debate about Pakistan and its political economy.

16 February 2019

**Matthew McCartney**  
 University of Oxford

**S. Akbar Zaidi**  
 Columbia University and IBA, Karachi