

GENOCIDE NEVER SLEEPS

Accounts of international criminal courts have tended to consist of reflections on abstract legal texts, on judgements and trial transcripts. Genocide Never Sleeps, based on ethnographic research at the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda, provides an alternative account, describing a messy, flawed human process in which legal practitioners faced with novel challenges sought to reconfigure long-standing habits and opinions while maintaining a commitment to 'justice'. From the challenges of simultaneous translation to collaborating with colleagues from different legal traditions, legal practitioners were forced to scrutinise that which normally remains assumed in domestic law. By providing an account of this process, Genocide Never Sleeps not only provides a unique insight into the exceptional nature of the ad hoc, improvised ICTR and the day-to-day practice of international criminal justice, but also holds up for fresh inspection much that is naturalised and assumed in unexceptional, domestic legal processes.

NIGEL ELTRINGHAM is a Reader in Social Anthropology at the University of Sussex. He has written extensively on the aftermath of the 1994 Rwandan genocide. He is the author of Accounting for Horror: Post-Genocide Debates in Rwanda (2004); contributing editor of Identity, Justice and "Reconciliation" in Contemporary Rwanda (2009) and Framing Africa: Portrayals of a Continent in Contemporary Mainstream Cinema (2013); and contributing co-editor of Remembering Genocide (2014). He served as Executive Secretary and then Vice-President of the International Network of Genocide Scholars, and has held visiting lectureships at the universities of Gothenburg and Cornell.



CAMBRIDGE STUDIES IN LAW AND SOCIETY

Founded in 1997, Cambridge Studies in Law and Society is a hub for leading scholarship in socio-legal studies. Located at the intersection of law, the humanities, and the social sciences, it publishes empirically innovative and theoretically sophisticated work on law's manifestations in everyday life: from discourses to practices, and from institutions to cultures. The series editors have longstanding expertise in the interdisciplinary study of law, and welcome contributions that place legal phenomena in national, comparative, or international perspective. Series authors come from a range of disciplines, including anthropology, history, law, literature, political science, and sociology.

Series Editors

Mark Fathi Massoud, *University of California*, *Santa Cruz* Jens Meierhenrich, *London School of Economics and Political Science* Rachel E. Stern, *University of California*, *Berkeley*

A list of books in the series can be found at the back of this book.



GENOCIDE NEVER SLEEPS

Living Law at the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda

Nigel Eltringham

University of Sussex





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108485593

DOI: 10.1017/9781108757195

© Nigel Eltringham 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd. Padstow Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Eltringham, Nigel, author.

Title: Genocide never sleeps: living law at the international criminal tribunal for Rwanda / Nigel Eltringham.

Niger Ettinigham.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom; New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2019. | Series: Cambridge studies in law and society | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2019019493 | ISBN 9781108485593 (hardback)

Subjects: LCSH: Genocide – Rwanda. | Rwanda – History – Civil War, 1994 – Atrocities. | Tutsi (African people) – Crimes against – Rwanda – History – 20th century. | International Criminal Court. | BISAC: POLITICAL SCIENCE / Political Freedom & Security / Human Rights.

Classification: LCC KTD454 .E47 2019 | DDC 345/.0251–dc23 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2019019493

ISBN 978-1-108-48559-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



CONTENTS

List of Figures		page vi vii
Acknowledgements		
	Introduction: Judging the Crime of Crimes	1
1	'When We Walk Out; What Was It All About?'	26
2	'Watching the Fish in the Goldfish Bowl'	56
3	'Who the Hell Cares How Things Are Done in the Old Country'	84
4	'They Don't Say What They Mean or Mean What They Say'	118
5	'We Are Not a Truth Commission'	152
	Conclusion	181
Bibliography		189
Index		216

V



FIGURES

1.1	Wanted for genocide (Courtesy of the ICTR)	page 30
2.1	The Public Gallery (Courtesy of the ICTR)	62
2.2	The Arusha International Conference Centre (Courtesy	
	of the ICTR)	67
2.3	Inside a courtroom at the Tribunal (adapted from ICTR	
	2005a:16)	73
2.4	Judges' Bench from the defence end showing ICTR	
	Emblem (Courtesy of the ICTR)	74
2.5	The UN Emblem and Seal of the ICTR	75
2.6	The Courtroom from the prosecution end (Courtesy	
	of the ICTR)	78

vi



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I am grateful to the Nuffield Foundation (SGS/32034) and British Academy (SG-47168) for the generous support of the research for this book conducted under COSTECH (Tanzania Commission for Science and Technology) Research Permit No. 2006–304-CC-2006–122.

I am indebted to colleagues for invitations to present early versions of chapters at various seminars, including Johan Pottier (School of Oriental and African Studies), Lars Waldorf (School of Advanced Study), David Pratten (University of Oxford), Jens Meierhenrich (London School of Economics), Dan Rosengren (University of Gothenburg), Fredrik Söderbaum (University of Gothenburg), Gerhard Anders (University of Edinburgh), Barrie Sander and Jakob v. H. Holtermann (University of Copenhagen) and Maja Gudim Burheim (University of Oslo). Likewise, for invitations to present at conference panels, including Suzanne Chenault (ICTR Legacy Conference), Alexander Hinton (American Anthropological Association), and Gerhard Anders and Olaf Zenker (European Conference on African Studies). Thanks to all those who participated in the seminars for their questions, observations and suggestions. Thanks also to those who have invited me to contribute to publications, including Barrie Sander and Jakob v. H. Holtermann (Humanity), Cody Henson (New England Journal of International and Comparative Law), Alexander Hinton (Transitional Justice: Global Mechanisms and Local Realities after Genocide and Mass Violence) Julie Billaud and Luigi Achilli (Allegra), Alasdair Mckay (E-International Relations) and Gerhard Anders and Olaf Zenker (Development and Change).

I am particularly grateful to colleagues who read drafts of various articles that have contributed to this book, including Simon Coleman, Jane Cowan, Jon Mitchell, Filippo Osella, Zdenek Kavan, Anthony Good and Richard Wilson.

Special thanks go to Marita Eastmond and Joakim Öjendal for the invitation to be a visiting researcher at the School of Global Studies, University of Gothenburg. The period of time spent in Gothenburg was immensely productive and a wonderful experience for myself and my family. Final edits of the book were completed whilst I was a visiting lecturer at Cornell University and I am thankful to Lori Leonard and Fouad Makki for the invitation and support.

vii



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Those who deserve my thanks at the ICTR are too numerous to mention. The research in Arusha would not, however, have been possible without the initial and on-going support and guidance of Moustapha Hassouna and Straton Musonera to whom I am very grateful. Special thanks also to Aatsa Atogho, a former interpreter at the ICTR, for clarifying details of the simultaneous interpretation system.

Finally, and most of all, I thank my wife, Anna, and our daughters for their unswerving support.

Parts of this book were previously published, in a different form, in the following places: (2010) 'Judging the "Crime of Crimes": Continuity and Improvisation at the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda' in Hinton, A. (ed.) Transitional Justice: Global Mechanisms and Local Meanings in the Aftermath of Genocide and Mass Atrocity (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press), 206–26; (2008) "A War Crimes Community": The Legacy of the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda Beyond Jurisprudence', in New England Journal of International and Comparative Law, Vol. 14, No. 2, 309– 18; (2009) "We are not a Truth Commission": Fragmented Narratives and the Historical Record at the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda', in Identity, Justice and "Reconciliation" in Contemporary Rwanda, Special Issue of Journal of Genocide Research, Vol. 11, No. 1, 55-79; (2012) 'Spectators to the Spectacle of Law: The Formation of a "Validating Public" at the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda', in Ethnos: Journal of Anthropology, Vol. 77, No. 3, 425–45; (2014) "When we walk out; what was it all about?": Views on "new beginnings" from within The International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda', in Development and Change, Vol. 45, No. 3, 543–64; (2014) 'A legacy deferred?: The international criminal tribunal for Rwanda at 20 years', in E-International Relations; (2015) 'Rescuing (cosmopolitan) locals at the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda', in Allegra: A Virtual Lab of Legal Anthropology; (2017) "The judgement is not made now; the judgement will be made in the future": "politically motivated" defence lawyers and the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda's "historical record", in Humanity: An International Journal of Human Rights, Humanitarianism and Development.

viii