

EUROPEAN UNION - MEASURES AFFECTING TARIFF CONCESSIONS ON CERTAIN POULTRY MEAT PRODUCTS

Report of the Panel
 WT/DS492/R and Add.1

*Adopted by the Dispute Settlement Body
 on 19 April 2017*

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
1. INTRODUCTION	1083
1.1 Complaint by China.....	1083
1.2 Panel Establishment and Composition	1083
1.3 Panel Proceedings.....	1084
1.3.1 General	1084
1.3.2 Requests for enhanced third-party rights	1084
1.3.3 Requests for preliminary rulings	1085
2. FACTUAL ASPECTS.....	1085
3. PARTIES' REQUESTS FOR FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....	1089
4. ARGUMENTS OF THE PARTIES	1094
5. ARGUMENTS OF THE THIRD PARTIES	1094
6. INTERIM REVIEW	1094
6.1 Factual Aspects and General Overview of China's Claims and Horizontal Arguments	1095
6.2 The Tariff Rate Quotas and the SPS Measures	1096
6.3 Terms of Reference Issues.....	1097
6.4 Claims under Article XXVIII:1 of the GATT 1994	1099
6.5 Claims under Article XXVIII:2 Read in Conjunction with Paragraph 6 of the Understanding on Article XXVIII of the GATT 1994	1103
6.6 Claims under Article XIII:2(d) of the GATT 1994	1106

Report of the Panel

6.7	Claims under the Chapeau of Article XIII:2 of the GATT 1994.....	1107
6.8	Claims under Article XIII:1 of the GATT 1994	1109
6.9	Claims under Article I:1 of the GATT 1994.....	1110
6.10	Claims under Article XIII:4 of the GATT 1994	1111
6.11	Claims under Article II:1 of the GATT 1994.....	1112
7.	FINDINGS	1113
7.1	General.....	1113
7.1.1	General overview of China's claims and horizontal arguments.....	1113
7.1.2	Order of analysis.....	1116
7.1.3	Function of the Panel	1117
7.1.4	Interpretation of the GATT 1994.....	1118
7.1.5	Burden of proof.....	1121
7.1.6	Request for enhanced third-party rights.....	1122
7.2	The Tariff Rate Quotas and the SPS Measures	1128
7.2.1	The First Modification Package.....	1128
7.2.2	The Second Modification Package	1133
7.2.3	The SPS measures applicable to poultry products from China	1141
7.2.4	Import statistics.....	1146
7.3	Terms of Reference Issues	1156
7.3.1	Introduction.....	1156
7.3.2	The scope of China's claims under Article XIII of the GATT 1994.....	1157
7.3.2.1	China's contention that the European Union violated the chapeau of Article XIII:2 because it did not set the shares of the TRQs allocated to the "all others" category at sufficient levels	1157
7.3.2.2	China's contention that the European Union violated the chapeau of Article XIII:2 and Article XIII:4 because it failed to disclose the trade data it used to determine the TRQs	1161
7.3.2.3	China's contention that the European Union violated Article XIII:1 and the chapeau of Article XIII:2 by failing to annually review and reallocate the TRQ shares	1165

	7.3.3	The scope of China's claims relating to certification.....	1170
	7.3.3.1	China's contentions that the European Union did not respect paragraph 7 of the Procedures for Negotiations under Article XXVIII and paragraph 1 of the Procedures for Modification and Rectification of Schedules.....	1171
	7.3.3.2	China's contention of a possible violation of Article II:1 in the period 2007-2009 arising from the European Union applying new rates prior to notifying all Members of the completion of the negotiations	1177
7.4		Claims under Article XXVIII:1 of the GATT 1994.....	1179
	7.4.1	Introduction.....	1179
	7.4.2	Relevant provisions.....	1180
	7.4.3	Analysis by the Panel.....	1186
	7.4.3.1	Whether the SPS measures at issue constitute "discriminatory quantitative restrictions"	1187
	7.4.3.1.1	Main arguments of the parties	1187
	7.4.3.1.2	Findings of the Panel.....	1190
	7.4.3.2	Whether the European Union was obliged to re-determine which Members held a supplying interest to reflect changes in import shares that took place following the initiation of the negotiations.....	1196
	7.4.3.3	Whether the European Union's decision not to recognize China as a Member holding a supplying interest was justified by the timing of China's claim.....	1206
	7.4.4	Conclusion	1209
7.5		Claims under Article XXVIII:2 Read in Conjunction with Paragraph 6 of the Understanding on Article XXVIII of the GATT 1994	1209
	7.5.1	Introduction.....	1209
	7.5.2	Relevant legal provisions	1210
	7.5.3	Analysis by the Panel.....	1213
	7.5.3.1	Whether different reference periods can be used for the determinations under Article XXVIII:1 and Article XXVIII:2	

Report of the Panel

	read in conjunction with paragraph 6 of the Understanding	1213
7.5.3.2	Whether the total amount of the TRQs is consistent with paragraph 6 of the Understanding	1215
7.5.3.2.1	Whether the European Union was obliged to calculate the total amount of the TRQs on the basis of an estimate of what import levels would have been in the absence of the SPS measures	1216
7.5.3.2.2	Whether the European Union was obliged to calculate the total amount of the TRQs on the basis of import levels over the three years preceding the conclusion of the Article XXVIII negotiations	1218
7.5.3.2.3	Whether the European Union was required to account for poultry imports into Romania, Bulgaria and Croatia in the years before they acceded to the European Union	1223
7.5.3.3	Whether the allocation of the TRQs is inconsistent with Article XXVIII:2 read in conjunction with paragraph 6 of the Understanding	1225
7.5.4	Conclusion	1230
7.6	Claims under Article XIII:2(d) of the GATT 1994	1231
7.6.1	Introduction	1231
7.6.2	Relevant provisions	1232
7.6.3	Analysis by the Panel	1235
7.6.3.1	Separate analysis of China's claims under Article XIII:2(d) and the chapeau of Article XIII:2	1235
7.6.3.2	Relevance of "special factors" to the determination of which Members hold a "substantial interest" within the meaning of Article XIII:2(d)	1236
7.6.3.3	Whether different reference periods can be used for the determinations under Article XXVIII:1, Article XXVIII:2, and Article XIII:2(d)	1238

	7.6.3.4	Whether the European Union was obliged to determine which Members were substantial suppliers based on an estimate of what their import shares would have been in the absence of the SPS measures	1239
	7.6.3.5	Whether the European Union was obliged to determine which Members were substantial suppliers taking into account changes in import shares following the initiation of the negotiations on TRQ allocation	1244
7.7		Claims under the Chapeau of Article XIII:2 of the GATT 1994	1257
	7.7.1	Introduction	1257
	7.7.2	Relevant provisions	1259
	7.7.3	Analysis by the Panel	1260
	7.7.3.1	Separate analysis of China's claims under Article XIII:2(d) and the chapeau of Article XIII:2	1261
	7.7.3.2	Relevance of "special factors" in the determination of whether the allocation of TRQ shares to "all others" complies with the general rule in the chapeau of Article XIII:2	1262
	7.7.3.3	Whether the European Union was obliged to allocate a greater TRQ share to "all others" based on an estimate of what their import shares would have been in the absence of the SPS measures	1264
	7.7.3.4	Whether the European Union was obliged to allocate a greater TRQ share to "all others" taking into account changes in import shares following the initiation of the negotiations on TRQ share allocations ...	1265
	7.7.3.5	Whether the European Union was under an obligation to allocate an "all others" share of at least 10% for each of the TRQs under the First and Second Modification Packages	1267
7.8		Claims under Article XIII:1 of the GATT 1994	1273
	7.8.1	Introduction	1273
	7.8.2	Relevant legal provisions	1275

Report of the Panel

7.8.3	Analysis by the Panel.....	1275
7.8.4	Conclusion	1279
7.9	Claims under Article I:1 of the GATT 1994	1279
7.9.1	Introduction.....	1279
7.9.2	Relevant legal provisions.....	1280
7.9.3	Analysis by the Panel.....	1281
7.9.4	Conclusion	1284
7.10	Claims under Article XIII:4 of the GATT 1994	1284
7.10.1	Introduction.....	1284
7.10.2	Relevant legal provisions.....	1285
7.10.3	Analysis by the Panel.....	1286
7.10.3.1	Whether Article XIII:4 applies in cases where TRQ shares are allocated among supplying countries by agreement with substantial suppliers pursuant to Article XIII:2(d) first sentence.....	1286
7.10.3.2	Whether China had a substantial interest in supplying the products concerned at the time of its request under Article XIII:4	1289
7.10.3.3	Whether Article XIII:4 imposes an obligation to reallocate TRQ shares upon request from a Member with a substantial interest in supplying the product.....	1292
7.10.3.4	Whether the European Union refused to consider the need for an adjustment of the TRQ shares or the reference period or reappraisal of special factors.....	1297
7.10.4	Conclusion	1302
7.11	Claims under Article II:1 of the GATT 1994.....	1302
7.11.1	Introduction.....	1302
7.11.2	Factual background.....	1303
7.11.3	Paragraph 1 of the Procedures for Modification and Rectification of Schedules and paragraph 7 of the Procedures for Negotiations under Article XXVIII.....	1305
7.11.4	Analysis by the Panel.....	1306
7.11.5	Conclusion	1325
8.	CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATION	1325

LIST OF ANNEXES

ANNEX A

WORKING PROCEDURES

Contents		Page
Annex A-1	Working Procedures of the Panel	1329
Annex A-2	Amended Working Procedures of the Panel	1336

ANNEX B

ARGUMENTS OF THE PARTIES

Contents		Page
Annex B-1	First executive summary of the arguments of China	1343
Annex B-2	Second executive summary of the arguments of China	1354
Annex B-3	First executive summary of the arguments of the European Union	1365
Annex B-4	Second executive summary of the arguments of the European Union	1376

ANNEX C

ARGUMENTS OF THE THIRD PARTIES

Contents		Page
Annex C-1	Executive summary of the arguments of Argentina	1389
Annex C-2	Executive summary of the arguments of Brazil	1395
Annex C-3	Executive summary of the arguments of Canada	1399
Annex C-4	Executive summary of the arguments of the Russian Federation	1405
Annex C-5	Executive summary of the arguments of Thailand	1552
Annex C-6	Executive summary of the arguments of United States	1418

Report of the Panel

WTO CASES CITED IN THIS REPORT

Short title	Full case title and citation
<i>Argentina – Poultry Anti-Dumping Duties</i>	Panel Report, <i>Argentina – Definitive Anti-Dumping Duties on Poultry from Brazil</i> , WT/DS241/R, adopted 19 May 2003, DSR 2003:V, p. 1727
<i>Argentina – Textiles and Apparel</i>	Appellate Body Report, <i>Argentina – Measures Affecting Imports of Footwear, Textiles, Apparel and Other Items</i> , WT/DS56/AB/R and Corr.1, adopted 22 April 1998, DSR 1998:III, p. 1003
<i>Canada – Dairy</i>	Panel Report, <i>Canada – Measures Affecting the Importation of Milk and the Exportation of Dairy Products</i> , WT/DS103/R, WT/DS113/R, adopted 27 October 1999, as modified by Appellate Body Report WT/DS103/AB/R, WT/DS113/AB/R, DSR 1999:VI, p. 2097
<i>Canada – Pharmaceutical Patents</i>	Panel Report, <i>Canada – Patent Protection of Pharmaceutical Products</i> , WT/DS114/R, adopted 7 April 2000, DSR 2000:V, p. 2289
<i>Canada – Wheat Exports and Grain Imports</i>	Appellate Body Report, <i>Canada – Measures Relating to Exports of Wheat and Treatment of Imported Grain</i> , WT/DS276/AB/R, adopted 27 September 2004, DSR 2004:VI, p. 2739
<i>China – Auto Parts</i>	Appellate Body Reports, <i>China – Measures Affecting Imports of Automobile Parts</i> , WT/DS339/AB/R / WT/DS340/AB/R / WT/DS342/AB/R, adopted 12 January 2009, DSR 2009:I, p. 3
<i>China – Publications and Audiovisual Products</i>	Panel Report, <i>China – Measures Affecting Trading Rights and Distribution Services for Certain Publications and Audiovisual Entertainment Products</i> , WT/DS363/R and Corr.1, adopted 19 January 2010, as modified by Appellate Body Report WT/DS363/AB/R, DSR 2010:II, p. 261
<i>China – Rare Earths</i>	Appellate Body Reports, <i>China – Measures Related to the Exportation of Rare Earths, Tungsten, and Molybdenum</i> , WT/DS431/AB/R / WT/DS432/AB/R / WT/DS433/AB/R, adopted 29 August 2014, DSR 2014:III, p. 805
<i>China – Rare Earths</i>	Panel Reports, <i>China – Measures Related to the Exportation of Rare Earths, Tungsten, and Molybdenum</i> , WT/DS431/R and Add.1 / WT/DS432/R and Add.1 / WT/DS433/R and Add.1, adopted 29 August 2014, upheld by Appellate Body Reports WT/DS431/AB/R / WT/DS432/AB/R / WT/DS433/AB/R, DSR 2014:IV, p. 1127
<i>Colombia – Textiles</i>	Appellate Body Report, <i>Colombia – Measures Relating to the Importation of Textiles, Apparel and Footwear</i> , WT/DS461/AB/R and Add.1, adopted 22 June 2016
<i>Dominican Republic – Import and Sale of Cigarettes</i>	Appellate Body Report, <i>Dominican Republic – Measures Affecting the Importation and Internal Sale of Cigarettes</i> , WT/DS302/AB/R, adopted 19 May 2005, DSR 2005:XV, p. 7367
<i>EC – Bananas III</i>	Appellate Body Report, <i>European Communities – Regime for the Importation, Sale and Distribution of Bananas</i> , WT/DS27/AB/R, adopted 25 September 1997, DSR 1997:II, p. 591
<i>EC – Bananas III</i>	Panel Reports, <i>European Communities – Regime for the Importation, Sale and Distribution of Bananas</i> , WT/DS27/R/ECU (<i>Ecuador</i>) / WT/DS27/R/GTM, WT/DS27/R/HND (<i>Guatemala and Honduras</i>) / WT/DS27/R/MEX (<i>Mexico</i>) / WT/DS27/R/USA (<i>US</i>), adopted 25 September 1997, as modified by Appellate Body Report WT/DS27/AB/R, DSR 1997:II, p. 695 to DSR 1997:III, p. 1085

EU - Poultry Meat (China)

Short title	Full case title and citation
<i>EC – Bananas III (Article 21.5 – Ecuador)</i>	Panel Report, <i>European Communities – Regime for the Importation, Sale and Distribution of Bananas – Recourse to Article 21.5 of the DSU by Ecuador</i> , WT/DS27/RW/ECU, adopted 6 May 1999, DSR 1999:II, p. 803
<i>EC – Bananas III (Article 21.5 – Ecuador II) / EC – Bananas III (Article 21.5 – US)</i>	Appellate Body Reports, <i>European Communities – Regime for the Importation, Sale and Distribution of Bananas – Second Recourse to Article 21.5 of the DSU by Ecuador</i> , WT/DS27/AB/RW2/ECU, adopted 11 December 2008, and Corr.1 / <i>European Communities – Regime for the Importation, Sale and Distribution of Bananas – Recourse to Article 21.5 of the DSU by the United States</i> , WT/DS27/AB/RW/USA and Corr.1, adopted 22 December 2008, DSR 2008:XVIII, p. 7165
<i>EC – Bananas III (Article 21.5 – Ecuador II)</i>	Panel Report, <i>European Communities – Regime for the Importation, Sale and Distribution of Bananas – Second Recourse to Article 21.5 of the DSU by Ecuador</i> , WT/DS27/RW2/ECU, adopted 11 December 2008, as modified by Appellate Body Report WT/DS27/AB/RW2/ECU, DSR 2008:XVIII, p. 7329
<i>EC – Bed Linen (Article 21.5 – India)</i>	Panel Report, <i>European Communities – Anti-Dumping Duties on Imports of Cotton-Type Bed Linen from India – Recourse to Article 21.5 of the DSU by India</i> , WT/DS141/RW, adopted 24 April 2003, as modified by Appellate Body Report WT/DS141/AB/RW, DSR 2003:IV, p. 1269
<i>EC – Chicken Cuts</i>	Appellate Body Report, <i>European Communities – Customs Classification of Frozen Boneless Chicken Cuts</i> , WT/DS269/AB/R, WT/DS286/AB/R, adopted 27 September 2005, and Corr.1, DSR 2005:XIX, p. 9157
<i>EC – Export Subsidies on Sugar (Australia)</i>	Panel Report, <i>European Communities – Export Subsidies on Sugar, Complaint by Australia</i> , WT/DS265/R, adopted 19 May 2005, as modified by Appellate Body Report WT/DS265/AB/R, WT/DS266/AB/R, WT/DS283/AB/R, DSR 2005:XIII, p. 6499
<i>EC – Fasteners (China)</i>	Appellate Body Report, <i>European Communities – Definitive Anti-Dumping Measures on Certain Iron or Steel Fasteners from China</i> , WT/DS397/AB/R, adopted 28 July 2011, DSR 2011:VII, p. 3995
<i>EC – Hormones</i>	Appellate Body Report, <i>EC Measures Concerning Meat and Meat Products (Hormones)</i> , WT/DS26/AB/R, WT/DS48/AB/R, adopted 13 February 1998, DSR 1998:I, p. 135
<i>EC – IT Products</i>	Panel Reports, <i>European Communities and its member States – Tariff Treatment of Certain Information Technology Products</i> , WT/DS375/R / WT/DS376/R / WT/DS377/R, adopted 21 September 2010, DSR 2010:III, p. 933
<i>EC – Poultry</i>	Appellate Body Report, <i>European Communities – Measures Affecting the Importation of Certain Poultry Products</i> , WT/DS69/AB/R, adopted 23 July 1998, DSR 1998:V, p. 2031
<i>EC – Tariff Preferences</i>	Panel Report, <i>European Communities – Conditions for the Granting of Tariff Preferences to Developing Countries</i> , WT/DS246/R, adopted 20 April 2004, as modified by Appellate Body Report WT/DS246/AB/R, DSR 2004:III, p. 1009
<i>EC and certain member States – Large Civil Aircraft</i>	Panel Report, <i>European Communities and Certain Member States – Measures Affecting Trade in Large Civil Aircraft</i> , WT/DS316/R, adopted 1 June 2011, as modified by Appellate Body Report, WT/DS316/AB/R, DSR 2011:II, p. 685
<i>Guatemala – Cement II</i>	Panel Report, <i>Guatemala – Definitive Anti-Dumping Measures on Grey Portland Cement from Mexico</i> , WT/DS156/R, adopted 17 November 2000, DSR 2000:XI, p. 5295

Report of the Panel

Short title	Full case title and citation
<i>India – Additional Import Duties</i>	Panel Report, <i>India – Additional and Extra-Additional Duties on Imports from the United States</i> , WT/DS360/R, adopted 17 November 2008, as reversed by Appellate Body Report WT/DS360/AB/R, DSR 2008:XX, p. 8317
<i>India – Patents (US)</i>	Appellate Body Report, <i>India – Patent Protection for Pharmaceutical and Agricultural Chemical Products</i> , WT/DS50/AB/R, adopted 16 January 1998, DSR 1998:I, p. 9
<i>India – Solar Cells</i>	Appellate Body Report, <i>India – Certain Measures Relating to Solar Cells and Solar Modules</i> , WT/DS456/AB/R and Add.1, circulated to WTO Members 16 September 2016, adopted 14 October 2016
<i>Indonesia – Autos</i>	Panel Report, <i>Indonesia – Certain Measures Affecting the Automobile Industry</i> , WT/DS54/R, WT/DS55/R, WT/DS59/R, WT/DS64/R, Corr.1 and Corr.2, adopted 23 July 1998, and Corr.3 and Corr.4, DSR 1998:VI, p. 2201
<i>Japan – Alcoholic Beverages II</i>	Appellate Body Report, <i>Japan – Taxes on Alcoholic Beverages</i> , WT/DS8/AB/R, WT/DS10/AB/R, WT/DS11/AB/R, adopted 1 November 1996, DSR 1996:I, p. 97
<i>Korea – Alcoholic Beverages</i>	Appellate Body Report, <i>Korea – Taxes on Alcoholic Beverages</i> , WT/DS75/AB/R, WT/DS84/AB/R, adopted 17 February 1999, DSR 1999:I, p. 3
<i>Korea – Dairy</i>	Appellate Body Report, <i>Korea – Definitive Safeguard Measure on Imports of Certain Dairy Products</i> , WT/DS98/AB/R, adopted 12 January 2000, DSR 2000:I, p. 3
<i>Russia – Tariff Treatment</i>	Panel Report, <i>Russia – Tariff Treatment of Certain Agricultural and Manufacturing Products</i> , WT/DS485/R, Corr.1, Corr.2, and Add.1, adopted 26 September 2016
<i>US – 1916 Act</i>	Appellate Body Report, <i>United States – Anti-Dumping Act of 1916</i> , WT/DS136/AB/R, WT/DS162/AB/R, adopted 26 September 2000, DSR 2000:X, p. 4793
<i>US – 1916 Act (EC)</i>	Panel Report, <i>United States – Anti-Dumping Act of 1916, Complaint by the European Communities</i> , WT/DS136/R and Corr.1, adopted 26 September 2000, upheld by Appellate Body Report WT/DS136/AB/R, WT/DS162/AB/R, DSR 2000:X, p. 4593
<i>US – 1916 Act (Japan)</i>	Panel Report, <i>United States – Anti-Dumping Act of 1916, Complaint by Japan</i> , WT/DS162/R and Add.1, adopted 26 September 2000, upheld by Appellate Body Report WT/DS136/AB/R, WT/DS162/AB/R, DSR 2000:X, p. 4831
<i>US – Anti-Dumping and Countervailing Duties (China)</i>	Appellate Body Report, <i>United States – Definitive Anti-Dumping and Countervailing Duties on Certain Products from China</i> , WT/DS379/AB/R, adopted 25 March 2011, DSR 2011:V, p. 2869
<i>US – Carbon Steel (India)</i>	Appellate Body Report, <i>United States – Countervailing Measures on Certain Hot-Rolled Carbon Steel Flat Products from India</i> , WT/DS436/AB/R, adopted 19 December 2014, DSR 2014:V, p. 1727
<i>US – Certain EC Products</i>	Appellate Body Report, <i>United States – Import Measures on Certain Products from the European Communities</i> , WT/DS165/AB/R, adopted 10 January 2001, DSR 2001:I, p. 373